



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
APRIL 17, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Commissioner Mahan.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (at 1:39 p.m.), Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, and Veyna (until 4:00 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: Hausz, Ooley, and Drury

Staff present: Ostrenger (until 6:07 p.m.), Hernandez (absent 1:57-2:31 p.m.; and 4:06-4:34 p.m.; present until 4:37 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Jessica Metzger
2. Sheila Lodge

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **April 3, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Veyna / Edmunds, 5/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Hausz, Ooley, and Drury absent.)
Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 17, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Mahan / Veyna, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Mahan stated that he and Commissioner Veyna approved the black awnings for Item A, 801 Chapala Street, because of City Council's prior decision to approve a black awning on appeal.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Hausz, Ooley, and Drury are absent from today's meeting.
- b. Commissioner Veyna will leave at 4:00 p.m.
- c. Staff will schedule the decision to appoint Commissioner Ooley to the subcommittee reviewing the new state courthouse for the next Historic Landmarks Commission Full Board agenda.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced that the Designation Subcommittee will meet on May 1, 2019 at 8:30 am in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room. The Commissioners on that subcommittee are Chair Grumbine, Commissioner Lenvik, Commissioner Ooley, and Commissioner Veyna.

3. Ms. Ostrenger announced that staff will hold an extensive training, estimated to be at least four hours long, sometime early in the summer; the date is yet to be determined. The Chairs of each design board will meet at the end of the month to discuss the scope of the training, which will cover Project Compatibility Analysis, among other things.

4. Chair Grumbine announced that he went to the opening of the Paseo Nuevo Renovation Project. He brought renderings to share with the Commission.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the committee meeting to discuss the development of objective design review standards.

(1:50PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 525 E YANONALI ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-540-007
 Zone: OM-1/SD-3
 Application Number: PLN2019-00111
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara, owner

(Proposal to install approximately 11,800-linear feet of 24-inch polyvinylchloride (PVC) potable water pipe underground, varying in depth from 5-feet to 17-feet, and through City streets from the Desalination Plant (located at 525 E. Yanonali St) to the intersection at Mission Street and Garden Street. At that point, the new pipe will intercept an existing water main. The existing water main will be repurposed to convey water from that point to the Cater Water Treatment Plant (WTP). A Coastal Exemption has been requested for the approximately 800 linear feet of new potable water main to be installed in the Coastal Zone.)

Acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Heather McDaniel McDevitt, is requested.

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel McDevitt, Dudek; Carlos Sanchez, Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; and Rubi Rajbanshi, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Lenvik / Mahan, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**2. 325 CHAPALA ST, 101 & 123 W GUTIERREZ ST, 324 DE LA VINA ST, (LOWER MISSION CREEK BETWEEN GUTIERREZ & U.S. 101)**

Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 037-245-003, 004, 015, & 018, ROW-002-035, ROW-002-099
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2019-00070
 Owner: Santa Barbara County Flood Control District
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for improvements to Reach 3, part of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project, located between Highway 101 and the Gutierrez Street Bridge. The project includes the removal of concrete sloped embankment, concrete riprap, and non-native vegetation, and the construction of a new vertical concrete wall, natural channel banks with rock slope protection, and installation of native vegetation. Proposal to treat the new concrete channel wall with a faux sandstone form liner pattern to match the Gutierrez Street Bridge project, and install four foot high black ornamental railings on top of the channel wall to match the railing at the Chapala Street Bridge to the south.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Matt Griffin, Santa Barbara County Flood Control District; and Tom Conti, Bengal Engineering Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Scott Vincent
2. Christy Martin

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Show the location of the proposed new trees.
2. Consider 15 gallon trees as opposed to 5 gallon trees.

Action: Lenvik / Mahan, 6/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(2:40PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**3. 1790 SYCAMORE CANYON RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 013-163-018
Zone: RS-1A
Application Number: PLN2019-00128
Owner: Kara Block
Applicant: Kras Design Studio

(This site contains a designated City Landmark: Jack's Trough/Courtney Fountain, constructed in 1926 by Lutah Riggs. The lot is otherwise vacant as the original non-historic residence was demolished. Proposal for a new 1,930 square foot two-story residence and detached 665 square foot garage to be constructed. The project includes new entry gates and restoration of the historic fountain. The proposed total of 2,595 square feet on a 34,309 square foot lot is 54% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Karl Kras, Architect, Kras Design Studio; and Kara Block, Owner

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer stated that the project is subject to review by the Historic Landmarks Commission as the lot contains a designated City Landmark.
2. Ms. Hernandez clarified that the applicant proposes only to restore the fountain, with no alterations.

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest
2. Glen Dorfman
3. Thomas Jayawardene
4. Addison Thompson
5. Claudia McDaniel

Written correspondence from Glen and Irene Dorfman, Lisa Caillet-Bois, and Roger Helkey was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:55 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Provide additional information to the Commission regarding the repairs and painting of the fountain structure and any other intended work around the fountain structure.
2. Provide a conceptual landscape plan that indicates how the proposed development will continue to provide background for the fountain.

Action: Lenvik / Edmunds, 4/2/0. (Grumbine and Mahan opposed. Hausz, Ooley, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Mahan opposed the motion because he believes the architecture of the proposed building is not compatible with the fountain. Chair Grumbine opposed the motion because he believes the architecture of the proposed building is not compatible with the architectural style of Lulah Riggs.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:23 TO 3:34 P.M. ***

(3:25PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

4. 1700 BLK E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-693
Application Number: PLN2017-00526
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara, owner

(The City of Santa Barbara and the Santa Barbara County Association of Governments (SBCAG) are proposing the Pedestrian and Bicycle Improvements on East Cabrillo Boulevard and Union Pacific Railroad Bridge Replacement Project (Project). The Project would create a safe corridor along East Cabrillo Boulevard for pedestrians and bicyclists through the creation of a new multi-use path, bike lanes, and new sidewalks, thus eliminating quarter mile infrastructure gap that would allow access and connectivity to and from the coastal recreational areas and to the commercial areas along Los Patos Way and Coast Village Road. To accommodate the new pedestrian and bicycle facilities and standard vehicular lane widths, the existing narrow Union Pacific Railroad Bridge would need to be replaced with a new bridge over the widened roadway. Intersection operations would also be improved with a proposed dedicated right turn lane on northbound Cabrillo Boulevard for the proposed southbound onramp onto Highway 101. There would be a reduction in traffic congestion and improved mobility with the proposed construction of a roundabout at the intersection of East Cabrillo Boulevard and Los Patos Way. The Project requires design review and approval by the Historic Landmarks Commission, a Coastal Development Permit by the Planning Commission, and Parks and Recreation Commission

review and approval for the removal of 7 Mexican fan palm trees in the City right of way. Planning Commission approved the Coastal Development Permit on May 17, 2018.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project Design Approval will require compliance with Planning Commission Resolution #016-18, and the Project Compatibility Analysis. Landmark and Historic Resource findings are required. Project was last reviewed on February 20, 2019.

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Eric Goodall, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; James Faber, Project Manager, T.Y. Lin International; and David Black, Landscape Architect, David R. Black & Associates.

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest

Public comment closed at 3:52 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. Provide a perspective rendering of how the landscape architect envisions the boulders to look.

Action: Mahan / Nemec, Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions:

1. Return with rendered drawings showing the median west of the railroad bridge with a variety of boulders, planting, and cobbles.
2. Provide further details of the railroad pier with the side slope and the end step slope.
3. The paving at the front of the historic fountain will be conventional concrete with a scored pattern to match that on the newer paving on Cabrillo Boulevard.
4. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

5. Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource.
6. Landmark Findings are made as follows: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Lenvik / Mahan, Motion failed due to lack of vote.

Motion: Project Design Approval with conditions:

1. Return with rendered drawings showing the median west of the railroad bridge with a variety of boulders, planting, and cobbles. The landscape design in the median will have a variety of boulder size, integrate the boulders with the cobbles as appropriate, and the landscaping will look natural in its relationship to the boulders and cobbles.
2. Provide further details of the railroad pier with the side slope and the end step slope.
3. The paving at the front of the historic fountain will be conventional concrete with a scored pattern to match that on the newer paving on Cabrillo Boulevard.
4. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
5. Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource.
7. Landmark Findings are made as follows: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Lenvik / Mahan, 5/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, Veyna, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:25PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 135 E ORTEGA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-021
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2019-00114
 Owner: Refugio Properties, LLC
 Applicant: LMA Architects

(This site is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and adjacent to a designated City Landmark at 713 Santa Barbara Street. The site is currently developed with commercial office space and a manufacturing/storage building. Proposal to construct a 1,200 square foot ground level office addition at the rear dock under an existing roof canopy, and permit an existing 233 square foot rear utility enclosure. Site improvements include reconfiguration of the existing parking lot paving, including new Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) path of travel walkways, and associated parking lot landscaping. Development Plan Approval findings are required for the construction of new nonresidential floor area.)

Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 4:34 p.m.

Present: Gowdy Mission, LMA Architects; and Robert Adams, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the project is next to a Historic Landmark: the Casa Covarrubias adobes on the Santa Barbara Historical Museum site.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m.

Written correspondence from Rick Closson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Include the footprint and location of the adjacent properties on the site plan.
2. Provide aerial photos and thorough photo boards of the site from multiple angles to give the Commission a better understanding of the site.
3. Provide thorough renderings of the screen from the Casa Covarrubias adobe property.
4. Fencing should be consistent with El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.
5. Consider solutions to meet the required Parking Area Landscape Standards.
6. Identify the as-built utility enclosure existing as "unpermitted" and provide photos of the structure.
7. The office addition needs to fit within El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.
8. The gate needs to fit within El Pueblo Viejo guidelines; the Commission appreciates the removal of the wrought iron.
9. Show and identify existing trees on the landscape plan.

Action: Mahan / Edmunds, 5/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, Veyna, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:18 TO 5:29 P.M. ***

(5:10PM) IN-PROGRESS REVIEW HEARING

6. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
 Zone: HRC-1/SD-3
 Application Number: PLN2018-00634
 Owner: KHP IV Santa Barbara LLC
 Applicant: SEPPS, Inc.
 Architect: Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal for improvements at the Hyatt Centric Santa Barbara. The original hotel building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is eligible for designation as a City Structure of Merit. Proposal involves reconfiguration of the existing parking with valet spaces to provide for hardscape and landscape improvements, including new green space between the Santa Maria and Santa Cruz buildings, and an outdoor space and wood trellis at the Santa Clara building lobby. Improvements to the Santa Clara building include removing a portion of the colonnade to reveal the original hotel entry, and providing outdoor patio areas connecting to the meeting room and restaurant.)

In-Progress Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed and granted Project Design Approval on April 3, 2019.

Actual time: 5:29 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis + Mixon

Public comment opened at 5:42 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Consider a post smaller than 3 inches for the wrought iron trellis at the pool bar.
2. Consider adding beams or a lattice to the wood trellis to shorten the wood span.
3. Ensure that all columns match the column on detail 14 on A601.
4. Correct detail 3 on A501 to show the depth of the wall and the inset of the window.
5. Built-up moldings above or below the bank of windows on the second floor of the south elevation to add more mass.
6. The Commission finds the change from the exterior door on the south elevation to an opening is acceptable.
7. The Commission understands that the new landing and railing on the east end at the stair tower are still in the process of being studied.
8. The Commission finds that the railings as shown are acceptable.
9. Continue to study and develop the bar area trellis.
10. The Commission finds that the ironwork in general is acceptable but still needs development.
11. Provide samples of tile, colors, materials, awnings samples, and plaster scrolls.
12. The Commission finds that the cartouche on the south elevation is acceptable, but would like to see a section detail.
13. Return with details of new mechanical equipment screening and new penetrations through the walls for vents.

Action: Mahan / Nemec, 5/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, Veyna, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(5:40PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

7. 522 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046
 Zone: M-C
 Application Number: PLN2019-00127
 Owner: Charles C Craviotto & Georgetta M Surv'S Trust
 Applicant: Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal for a new outdoor Beer Garden associated with Institution Ale located adjacently at 516 State Street. Project involves renovating an existing 120 square foot storage structure, constructing a new 150 square foot shed and installing new bike racks at the rear of the parcel adjacent to the City Parking Lot. Project includes perimeter wrought iron fencing, gates and pilasters, new string lighting hung from decorative posts, landscaping, associated outdoor furniture, and amenities including a fire pit and grass corn hole play surface.)

Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed on April 3, 2019.

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis + Mixon

Public comment opened at 6:17 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Consent for Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The column light fixtures should be more Spanish in style.
2. Simplify the decorative features on the wrought iron to be in line with El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.
3. Tile should be reexamined for its appropriateness in the broad field.
4. Show a perspective of the entry gate itself including the location of the piers.

Action: Mahan / Lenvik, 5/0/0. (Hausz, Ooley, Veyna, and Drury absent.) Motion carried.

(6:10PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

8. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013
Zone: HRC-1/SP-1/SD-3
Application Number: PLN2019-00141
Owner: Fess Parker Doubletree Hotel
Applicant: Ideation Design Group

(Proposal for improvements at the Hilton Santa Barbara Beachfront Resort, located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. Project includes a remodel to the existing bar patio area, including hardscape and landscape improvements, removal and replacement of a low site wall, addition of a new low site wall, gates, a glass windscreen, and pergola.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis is required. Project was last reviewed on April 3, 2019.

Actual time: 6:32 p.m.

Present: Carl Schaffer, Ideation Design Group

Public comment opened at 6:42 p.m.,

Written correspondence from Rick Closson was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 6:44 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with details to continue indefinitely to Consent for Final Approval and with conditions:

1. Provide additional landscaping at the planter area outside of the low wall.
2. On A5, the plaster piers, columns, girders, and beams are to match those existing.
3. Adjust the lattice to be 3 x 6 or 4 x 6 flat located on top of the trellis beams.
4. Return with a dark brown color for the steel support.
5. Return with details showing soft corners, both vertical and horizontal.
6. The Commission desires a minimal steel support for the angled glass.
7. All fixtures are to be Spanish in style, similar to or matching the existing fixtures.
8. Make the connection of the girder to the column as invisible as possible.
9. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan / Edmunds, 4/0/1. (Lenvik abstained. Hausz, Ooley, Veyna, and Drury absent.)
Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:10 P.M. ***