



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
MARCH 20, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Hausz, Drury, Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, Ooley, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: Grumbine

Staff present: Ostrenger, Hernandez (until 3:30 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Kellam de Forest

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **March 6, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/ Drury, 7/0/1. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 20, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley / Mahan, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that City Council reviewed the appeal for the 500 block of State Street, adjacent to Hotel Santa Barbara, and upheld the appeal to remove the fountains.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. Revisions to the Mills Act Program went to the Finance Committee of City Council, who was supportive of raising the property value cap so more properties can participate in the program, as well as an annual cap limit to how much the city revenue loss because of the program. Staff will continue to meet with the Finance Department and will meet with City Council in May for final revisions to the program.
 - b. The owners of 830 De La Guerra Terrace requested a postponement from the mass designation on today's agenda.
3. Commissioner Drury announced that he attended the Planning Commission meeting on March 7, 2019 and answered questions regarding the project at 517 Chapala Street.
4. Commissioner Hausz announced that he and Commissioner Mahan represented the Historic Landmarks Commission at the City Council appeal for the fountains on the 500 block of State Street. Commissioner Mahan added that City Ordinance 22.22.145b requires the HLC to consider whether a project will debase or compliment an adjacent historic structure, and Hotel Santa Barbara is on the list of potential historic landmarks. Commissioner Hausz also added that he was contacted by Victor Garza, to whom he suggested moving the fountains, but the suggestion was not pursued.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan updated the Commission on the committee to review the new state courthouse and requested that staff agendaize a decision to replace the current architect on the committee with Commissioner Ooley. Commissioner Ooley reported on the changes to the proposed design.

(1:50) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A**

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

(Review of Staff Reports and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of historic resources per attached Exhibit A.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest
2. Gregory A. Dahlen
3. Jonathan Stein

Written correspondence from Jonathan Stein was received.

Public comment closed at 2:07 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 225 Los Aguajes Avenue from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 8/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 211 West Micheltorena Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 5/3 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 233 West Micheltorena Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 1/7 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 231 Los Aguajes Avenue from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 8/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 500 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 7/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 502-504 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 3/5 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 506 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 7/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 512 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 8/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 605 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 1/7 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 606 North Milpas Street from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 8/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 215 Los Aguajes Avenue from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 2/6 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 119 Los Aguajes Avenue from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 2/6 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support removing 230 Los Aguajes Avenue from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit? 4/4 Failed

Motion: Remove the following properties from the list to be designated as a Structure of Merit: 225 Los Aguajes Avenue, 211 West Micheltoarena Street, 231 Los Aguajes Avenue, 500 North Milpas Street, 506 North Milpas Street, 512 North Milpas Street, and 606 North Milpas Street.

Action: Ooley / Nemec, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Postpone 830 De La Guerra Terrace indefinitely at the owner's request.

Action: Ooley / Veyna, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Adopt Resolutions to designate as Structures of Merit the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A.

Action: Ooley / Drury, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(2:50PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 302 W MONTECITO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-002
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2016-00426
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Agent: Sepps
 Applicant: On Design LLC
 Architect: Kirk Gradin, Architect

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a three-story development consisting of a hotel and commercial space. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of two lots at 302 & 308 W. Montecito Street (APNs 037-232-011 & 037-232-002). All existing development on the two lots, consisting of four residential apartments totaling 2,540 square feet and 517 square feet of office space, will be demolished. New development on this merged 18,927 square foot parcel will be a 26,818 square foot, three-story building containing a 15,210 square foot, 34-room hotel and 464 square feet of commercial floor area. Also proposed are 38 parking spaces of which 33 are to be provided in a 3-story stacker system, and 2 covered bicycle parking spaces. Planning Commission approval is required, as this project involves a Transfer of Existing Development Rights from the Sandman Hotel located at 3714-3744 State Street for 24 hotel rooms, and a Development Plan for commercial square footage allotments from the Minor and Small Additions categories on both parcels.)

Review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Heather McDaniel McDevitt, Dudek.

Actual time: 2:43 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel McDevitt, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report’s conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan / Ooley, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:46 TO 2:53 P.M. ***

(2:55PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

3. 1900 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-391-014
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2019-00023
Owner: Goerner, John D
Architect: Justin Harmin

(Hopkins House "El Nido" is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is eligible for designation as a Landmark. Proposal for improvements to the non-historic carport, including removing the pitched tile roof structure to be replaced with a flat roof, and constructing 40 square feet of unconditioned storage area with a concealed EV charging station. Project includes a Minor Zoning Exception request for the location of the trash enclosure in the required interior setback.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Historic Resource Findings are required. Project requires Minor Zoning Exception findings for the location of the trash enclosure. Project was last reviewed at Consent on February 20, 2019, and continued to the Full Commission at the applicant's request.

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Justin Harmin, Designer; Goerner, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the property is on the list of Potential Historic Resources so if the Commission grants Project Design Approval and Final Approval, they will need to make Historic Resource findings. The project was reviewed twice on the consent calendar for the carport and the Minor Zoning Exception. It was continued to the Full Commission at the applicant’s request. The Minor Zoning Exception is related to the trash bins only; the storage area is a permitted location.

Public comment opened at 3:06 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource.
2. The Commission finds that the following Minor Zoning Exception criteria have been met:
 - a. The improvements are sited such that they minimize impact next to abutting properties.
 - b. The project generally complies with applicable privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting standards in the Single Family Design Board Good Neighbor Guidelines.
 - c. The improvement will be compatible with the existing development and character of the neighborhood.
3. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC 22.69.050) as follows:
 - a. Consistency and Appearance. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. Compatibility. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale is appropriate to the site and neighborhood.
 - c. Quality Architecture and Materials. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. Trees. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree or Landmark Tree.
 - e. Health, Safety, and Welfare. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. Good Neighbor Guidelines. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
 - g. Public Views. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Drury / Veyna, 7/1/0. (Mahan opposed. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(3:25PM) IN-PROGRESS REVIEW HEARING

4. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-680-009
Zone:	HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3
Application Number:	PLN2016-00284
Owner:	American Tradition LLC
Applicant:	Suzanne Elledge
Architect:	Robert Glazier

(Proposal for a 52-60 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV

and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

In-Progress Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project was last reviewed and received Project Design Approval on November 14, 2018.

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Robert Glazier, Architect, Fess Parker Enterprises; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; Steve Nuhn, The Cearnal Collective

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that when the Commission granted Project Design Approval on November 14, 2018, they requested an in-progress review.

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

Action: Drury / Mahan, Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission is pleased with the progress of the project.
2. The air intake grilles on the north elevation should be flush with the wall surface and the Commission is in agreement with the photographic examples presented.
3. The staircase on the grand court east elevation is supportable but the railing detail needs to be resolved.
4. The Commission encourages roofing material to have a lot of character including staggered butts, texture, variety, and pitches.

Action: Drury / Mahan, 5/0/3. (Edmunds, Nemec, and Ooley abstained. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:55 P.M. ***