



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
JANUARY 9, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Wendy Edmunds
Michael Drury
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Ms. Plummer

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Edmunds, Grumbine, Drury, Hausz, Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, Ooley, and Veyna
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Ostrenger, Unzueta (until 2:07 p.m.), Hernandez (until 4:02 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2019 Election of Chair and Vice Chair:

Nominations for Chair: Grumbine. Drury/Mahan. 9/0/0

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Grumbine was elected as Chair.

Nominations for Vice Chair: Hausz. Mahan/Drury. 9/0/0

A vote was taken, and Commissioner Hausz was elected as Vice Chair.

B. 2019 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees:

Appointments were made to the following committees:

	<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Alternate</u>
Consent Calendar		
Architecture	Mahan	Grumbine
Landscape	Veyna	Mahan
Sign Committee	Drury	Hausz
Street Tree Advisory Committee	Veyna	Nemec
Arts Advisory Committee	Drury	Hausz
Subcommittees		
Design Awards	Drury, Lenvik, Mahan	
Designations	Grumbine, Ooley, Veyna, Lenvik	
Events	Hausz, Mahan	
Five-Year Historic Resources Work Program	Drury, Ooley, Mahan, Edmunds	
Historic Surveys	Grumbine, Mahan, Lenvik	
Ad hoc Subcommittees		
Architectural Detail	Grumbine, Ooley, Mahan	
Highway 101 High-Occupancy Vehicle (HOV)	Veyna	Edmunds
Historic Structures Ordinance	Ooley, Mahan, Grumbine	Edmunds
Los Patos/Cabrillo Roundabout & Railroad Bridge Design	Drury, Mahan, Veyna	
Lower Mission Creek Design	Drury, Veyna	
Outdoor Dining Patio Furniture	Drury, Mahan	
Paseo Nuevo	Drury, Lenvik, Mahan	Ooley
Sign Ordinance Review	Drury	Hausz

C. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Mary Louise Days
3. Paulina Conn

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **December 12, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 5/0/0. (Lenvik, Edmunds, Nemec, and Ooley abstained.) Motion carried.

E. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 9, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that the appeal for the 500 Block of State Street fountain will appear before City Council on March 12, 2019. The project was denied by all Commissioners except Commissioner Mahan, and Commissioner Lenvik was absent. Ms. Plummer asked that a Commissioner attend the appeal to state the Commission's reasons for the denial. She also clarified that the deadline for reconsideration of the denial has passed.

G. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. HISTORIC PRESERVATION PROGRAM OVERVIEW

(2:00) Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
(Presentation on the Historic Resources Program.)

Actual time: 2:07 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.

Public comment closed at 2:28 p.m.

Discussion held.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

2. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A

(2:30) Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on March 20, 2019 to consider designating the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A as Structures of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

- 1. Mary Louise Days

Public comment closed at 2:33 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-1 to hold a Public Hearing on March 20, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. 400 STATE STREET

(2:35) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-212-021

Owner: Safina Abraham Trust

(Request to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on January 9, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style commercial building constructed as Woods Garage in 1910 with the rear addition in 1916 located at 400 State Street.)

Actual time: 2:35 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-2 to hold a Public Hearing on January 23, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Woods Garage building, a commercial interpretation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style constructed in 1910 with the rear garage addition in 1916 located at 400 State Street.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 401 SHORELINE DR****HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone**

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
Application Number: MST2018-00493
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(This parcel contains a designated City Landmark and is listed on the National Register of Historic Places: Los Banos del Mar Pool, and is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. Proposal to demolish the non-historically significant and non-operational West Beach Wading Pool, including fencing, picnic areas, hardscape, and the adjacent playground, to be replaced with a new splash pad and playground. The new playground is proposed with interactive play fountains and playground structures designed to mimic harbor and ocean related structures nearby. The project includes new picnic areas, landscaping, fencing, walkways, resilient rubber play surfaces, and a new 400 square foot restroom and mechanical building. Planning Commission review is required for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Wood Group Environmental & Infrastructures Solutions, Inc.)

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:39 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
 Application Number: MST2018-00634
 Owner: KHP IV Santa Barbara LLC
 Applicant: Steve Fort
 Architect: Andrulaitis + Mixon

(The original hotel building is eligible for designation as a City Structure of Merit. Proposal involves reconfiguration of the existing parking to provide for hardscape and landscape improvements, including new green space between the Santa Maria and Santa Cruz building, and an outdoor space and wood trellis at the Santa Clara building lobby. Improvements to the Santa Clara building include removing a portion of the colonnade to reveal the original hotel entry, removal of the stair enclosure at the east end of the parcel to be replaced with a curving exterior stair and deck, outdoor patio areas, and renovations to the pool area with replacement of the existing fencing and relocation of the pool entry.)

(A. Review of a Phase I Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded the original hotel building (1927-1931), excluding its post-1945 additions and alterations, retains enough integrity to be eligible for designation as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. The property is eligible to be listed on the California State Register of Historic Resources and is not eligible to be listed on the in National Register of Historic Places.)

(B. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Environmental assessment is required.)

Actual time: 2:42 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Steve Fort, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting; Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Andrulaitis + Mixon; Courtney Miller, Landscape Designer, CJM::LA

Staff comments:

Ms. Plummer stated that the review is limited to the Historic Structures/Sites Report, and that the Concept Review would be postponed to the next available agenda.

Ms. Hernandez stated that the Commission should decide if they want to designate the building as a Structure of Merit based on the conclusions of the report. She later stated that conclusions of Historic Structures/Sites Reports are binding and remain with the property, so if the Commission does not agree with the Conclusions, they should not vote to accept the report.

Public comment opened at 3:02 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Kellam De Forest

Public comment closed at 3:04 p.m.

Motion: Accept the report with comments:

1. Correct the first sentence to include an end parenthesis.
2. Add the historical connection to President Reagan.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/1/0. (Edmunds opposed) Motion carried.

Individual Comment: Commissioner Edmunds opposed the motion because too many changes have been made to the structure for it to convey its original appearance to qualify as a Structure of Merit.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:29 TO 3:39 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 2948 SERENA RD

RS-7.5/USS Zone

(3:30)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 051-202-022
 Application Number: MST2017-00399
 Owner: Francis C. Thompson
 Applicant: Tony Tomasello

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, constructed in 1925 is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions and alterations to the existing one-story 1,017 square foot single-family dwelling with a 169 square foot detached accessory building and one-car garage. The project proposes demolition of 79 square feet of habitable space from the dwelling and removal of the existing one-car garage, and the addition of 451 square feet to the ground floor of the residence, 1,220 square feet for a new partial basement level, and 401 square feet for a partially subterranean garage with two tandem parking spaces. The project will also address violations listed in ZIR No. 18473 by removing the existing rear deck and cover, for a new replacement deck. The proposed total of 3,109 square feet (of which 1,220 square feet on the partial basement level and 401 square feet on the subterranean garage is receiving a 50% FAR reduction) on a 7,637 square foot lot is 76% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Historic Resource findings are required. Project was last reviewed on December 12, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Gordon Brewer, RRM Design Group; Frank Thompson, Owner; and Carrie Thompson, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer clarified the voting process and the instances where a commissioner should abstain from voting and making comments.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the details to come back to Consent for Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC 22.69.050) as follows:
 - a. The consistency and appearance of the proposed project is compatible with the neighborhood.
 - b. The proposed development is appropriate to the site and the neighborhood.
 - c. The proposed development is designed with quality architectural details and materials, and there is no impact to the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. The public health, safety, and welfare is protected and preserved.
 - e. The Good Neighbor Guidelines are met as the Commission believes the project is good for the neighborhood.
 - f. The public views are not an issue.
2. Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.
3. Add a cowl over the fireplace vent.
4. Study alternate solution for tile roof supported by iron brackets.
5. Reduce the height of the second stack of the trellis on the east elevation.
6. Study different material for eyebrow.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/4. (Lenvik, Edmunds, Nemec, and Ooley abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 24 W GUTIERREZ ST

M-C Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-211-020
Application Number:	MST2017-00303
Owner:	Susan Martin Budinger Trust
Applicant:	Ryan Jeffrey

(The proposal involves relocation or salvage of historic materials and demolition of the existing one-story house, one-story cottage, and detached three-bay garage, and construction of a new three-story mixed-use building, containing two residential condo units. The ground floor will include approximately 812 square feet of commercial space, a lobby, and a covered parking garage with 5 spaces. The two condo units will be located on the second and third floor of the building. Each unit will contain 3 bedrooms, and the unit size will range between approximately 3,532 and 3,445 square feet.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing officer Resolution 054-18. Project was last reviewed on December 12, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Planner, Vanguard Planning LLC; Ryan Jeffrey, Applicant; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the applicant screened the backflow preventer in response to the condition made by the Staff Hearing Officer and that the Commission will need to make the Project Compatibility Criteria if Project Design Approval is granted.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Judith Hopkins

Public comment closed at 4:17 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and return to Consent for Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. The tower does not need further embellishment.
3. Use an off-white for the tower rather than a stark white.
4. Draw the weather vane to scale
5. Change the palms on the street elevation to Kentia.
6. Include a good, accurate description of the plaster finish.
7. For Final Approval include the mechanical equipment screening and vents.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 6/0/3. (Edmunds, Nemec, and Ooley abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:29 P.M. ***