



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 28, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine, Drury, Hausz, Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna (until 4:55 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Hernandez (until 5:13 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 14, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continue Item A (813 Anacapa Street) on the **November 28, 2018** Consent Calendar.

Action: Drury /Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 28, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Veyna (Item A) and Mahan (Items B, C, and D).
Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. City Council is scheduled to make design board appointments on December 11, 2018. New members will begin their term on Historic Landmarks Commission at the January 9, 2019 meeting. There is one vacancy, and three terms ending. Commissioners Veyna, Orías, and La Voie reapplied for another term.
 - b. The Planning Commission will review the project at 809 De La Vina on December 6, 2018 at 1:00 p.m., and Commissioner Grumbine will attend. The applicant will install the story poles on December 3, 2018.
 - c. Tava Ostrenger is absent but will attend the next meeting on December 12, 2018.
2. Commissioner Orías announced that Bob Cunningham informed her that Architectural Board of Review requested that staff post project plans online prior to meetings. She requested that Historic Landmarks Commission make the same request. Ms. Plummer clarified that this practice has not yet been implemented.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 1500 STATE STREET

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-232-008
Owner: Trinity Episcopal Church

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of Trinity Episcopal Church, a sandstone, Gothic Revival style building designed in 1912 and completed in 1919, located at 1500 State Street.)

Ex parte communication: Chair La Voie disclosed that he had a prior association with the Trinity Episcopal Church, but that his affiliation ended five years ago.

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-115 recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark the Trinity Episcopal Church located at 1500 State Street.

Action: Grumbine/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 841 CIMA LINDA AVENUE

(1:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 015-202-030
Owner: Zeus Trust

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style house, designed by Carleton Monroe Winslow, in 1926 located at 841 Cima Linda Avenue.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-116 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival style house, designed by Carleton Monroe Winslow, in 1926 located at 841 Cima Linda Avenue.

Action: Grumbine/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Individual Comments: The commission asked that the applicant consider modifying the integrity statement to include *“the Historic Landmarks Commission is not aware if the color scheme is original”*; and also include *“the mature landscaping”* as part of the character defining features.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 1330 CHAPALA ST

C-G Zone

(2:05) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-131-001
Application Number: MST2013-00169
Owner: Metropolit Theatres Corporation
Architect: Peikert RRM Design Group
Business Name: Arlington Village

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new, three-story, 41'-5" tall mixed-use development on a 91,000 square foot parcel located at the corner of W. Sola and Chapala Streets. The project will comprise 33 residential apartments (totaling 28,049 square feet) and two commercial units (895 square feet). The new building will total 61,456 square feet, including a 665 square foot exercise room and a 13,884 square foot partially below-grade parking garage. The parking garage will contain 41 spaces, and a surface lot will contain 50 spaces for a total of 91 spaces, with 33 spaces allocated to the residential units, two spaces allocated to the commercial units and 56 spaces allocated to the Arlington theatre. Also proposed is the removal of nineteen mature trees, with twelve existing trees to be protected on site and six mature palm trees to be relocated on site. Grading excavation will total 3,400 cubic yards. A detached trash enclosure for the theater is proposed to replace an existing trash enclosure and will be constructed near the northwest corner of the Arlington theatre. A waiver of parking lot interior planter requirements is requested. This parcel is within the 10% Parking Zone of Benefit and contains a designated Structure of Merit: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch.")

(Review After Final is requested for the Arlington Hotel Golden Arch plaque. Project was last reviewed on November 15, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: Katie Kline, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:17 TO 2:27 P.M. ***

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 809 DE LA VINA ST

C-G Zone

(2:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-041-009
Application Number:	MST2017-00017
Owner:	815 De La Vina LLC
Applicant:	Trish Allen
Architect:	Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains a Structure of Merit: Ott House, constructed 1888 in the Queen Anne style. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041- 010), the demolition of 2 one-story buildings and 2 two-story buildings and the construction of one new three-story residential building, with the Ott House proposed to be relocated to the corner at De la Vina and De la Guerra Streets (addressed as 208 W. De la Guerra). The overall unit mix will be 14 studio apartments, 22 one-bedroom apartments, and 1 two-bedroom apartment ranging from 291 square feet to 901 square feet with an average unit size of 567 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,275 square foot parcel is 57 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). Also proposed are 40 vehicle parking spaces and 40 bicycle parking spaces.)

(Review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Orías/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**5. 809 DE LA VINA ST****C-G Zone****(2:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-009
 Application Number: MST2017-00017
 Owner: 815 De La Vina LLC
 Applicant: Trish Allen
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains a Structure of Merit: Ott House, constructed 1888 in the Queen Anne style. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041-010), the demolition of 2 one-story buildings and 2 two-story buildings and the construction of one new three-story residential building, with the Ott House proposed to be relocated to the corner at De la Vina and De la Guerra Streets (addressed as 208 W. De la Guerra). The overall unit mix will be 14 studio apartments, 22 one-bedroom apartments, and 1 two-bedroom apartment ranging from 291 square feet to 901 square feet with an average unit size of 567 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,275 square foot parcel is 57 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). Also proposed are 40 vehicle parking spaces and 40 bicycle parking spaces.)

(Review of a Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that the proposed project impacts to the historic resources are Less than Significant (Class III). After the implementation of the proposed project the Ott House would maintain its status as a Structure of Merit. The Historic Structures/Sites Report was last reviewed on November 14, 2018.)

Actual time: 2:30 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; and Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Collective LLP

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m.

Gary McDermott spoke.

Matt Williams spoke with concerns due to potential damage to the Ott House during the moving process.

Correspondence in opposition from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:41 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners believe that the proposed relocation of the house does not cause a significant adverse impact to the existing spatial relationship? 7/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the present proposal? 7/1 Passed

Motion: Accept the report with comments:

- 1. Change page 6 to reflect the removal of the existing conduit.
- 2. The Commission accepts the relocation of the house at its presently proposed location and configuration as identified in this report.

Action: Drury/Orías, 7/1/0. (Lenvik opposed.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:21 TO 4:00 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 3 ROSEMARY LN

RS-15 Zone

(4:05) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 015-093-019
 Application Number: MST2018-00332
 Owner: Kurt G Harris

(The English Cottage style residence designed by Harriett Moody in 1940 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish the attached garage and flower room for a new 581 square foot two-car garage and 935 square feet of additions to the first and second floor living space. Exterior improvements to the residence include replacement of the entry and east side doors and abatement of violations listed in ENF2017-00723 by restoring the one set of diamond pane casements on the front elevation to match original. The project also involves demolition of two non-conforming sheds and construction of a 440 square foot detached artist studio, replacement and extension of a six foot high wooden fence on the south lot line, and a new eight foot high wooden fence on the eastern lot line. The proposed total of 3,417 square feet on a 12,289 square foot lot is 85% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(A. Review of a Phase I & II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. 3 Rosemary Lane is a designated City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. The Phase I component of this report concludes 3 Rosemary Lane meets Criteria a, d, e, f, g, h, i and additional Criterion 6 and 8 that make it eligible for continued listing as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. The property is also eligible for listing at the state level under Criteria 2 and 3d and to the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion c. Because the house at 3 Rosemary Lane is eligible for listing at the local, state, and national level it is considered a significant resource for the purposes of CEQA review.)

(B. Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Hillside Design District findings are required. Project was last reviewed on September 5, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; and Kurt G Harris, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

- 1. Correspondence from Kurt Harris was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Lyn Krieger suggested corrections to the Historic Structures/Sites Report and requested that the Commission deny the report and the project.
2. Laura Bridley asserted that she found mistakes in the Historic Structures/Sites Report and stated that she opposes the project.
3. Correspondence from Warren and Margaret Evans, Christine Hoehner, and Paul and Lyn Krieger was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:19 p.m.

Public comment re-opened for the design review part of the agenda item at 5:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

- Motion: Continue the Historic Structures/Sites Report indefinitely with comments:**
1. Reevaluate the vocabulary of the neighborhood with the size, bulk, and scale.
 2. Define “cottage” and “cottage look”.
 3. Reevaluate the view in figure 7, page 7. Provide a photograph with a view straight down the driveway, and provide an evaluation of that view.
 4. The Commission does not request a retraction of the elimination of the existing garage.
 5. Highlight the original landscape screening.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained.) Motion carried.

- Motion: Continue indefinitely.**
Action: Mahan/Lenvik, 0/0/0. Motion withdrawn.

- Motion: Continue the project two weeks with comments:**
1. The Commission requires a substantial reduction in size, bulk, and scale in the addition to be compatible to the cottage and streetscape.
 2. Study efficient space planning to minimize the size.
 3. The Commission would like to see a more traditional pergola design emulating the design of the front porch.
 4. Keep in mind the quiriness and poetry of the Moody sisters’ design when designing the revised plan for the addition.
 5. Minimize the amount of paving on the site plan.
 6. Add as much landscaping as possible to break down the mass of the proposed additions.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 6/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:45 P.M. ***