



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 14, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:29 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (until 4:58 p.m.), Grumbine (until 4:58 p.m.), Drury, Hausz, Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna
Commissioners absent: None
Staff present: Unzueta (at 2:59 p.m.), Hernandez (until 2:49 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 31, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 4/0/4. (Lenvik, Veyna, Mahan, and Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Postpone Item G (29 E Cabrillo Blvd) on the **November 14, 2018** Consent Calendar.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Continue Item E (500 Blk State St) to Full Commission on the **November 14, 2018** Consent Calendar.

Action: Orías /Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 14, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Grumbine (Item A) and Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that the appeal for the project on 428 Chapala Street, that went before City Council on Tuesday, November 13, 2018, was upheld with a vote of 5/2. Commissioner Grumbine added that City Council designated the south, sandstone wall only as a Structure of Merit. Ms. Hernandez emphasized to City Council that even if the entire building is designated, the interior is not under the Historic Landmark Commission's jurisdiction and not reviewed under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA.)

2. Commissioner Mahan announced the following:

a. The Courthouse Legacy Foundation received the Governor's award in Sacramento on October 31, 2018. for the Conservation and Restoration of the Courthouse Mural Room

b. He attended the Riviera Association meeting on Monday, November 12, 2018 concerning the demolition of the Franceschi House. He requested that staff keep him updated on the proceedings of the demolition and the time schedule. Ms. Hernandez replied that City Council approved the commencement of the Environmental Impact Report process as the demolition will be considered a negative impact to a Structure of Merit. The Environmental Impact Report will come back to the Historic Landmarks Commission for review.

3. Commissioner La Voie announced that he will be stepping down from Item 6, 433 E Cabrillo Blvd, due to a conflict of interest.

4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he will be leaving at 5:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported that the Fonts Committee now has a draft of the list of acceptable typefaces for the El Pueblo Viejo district from Alison Grube, City of Santa Barbara Graphic Designer. The list will be brought to the Historic Landmarks Commission once it has been completed and refined.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

1. 841 CIMA LINDA LANE

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-030
Owner: Zeus Trust

(Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.035.(d)(2), the permit request of a possibly historic structure shall be scheduled at the Historic Landmarks Commission for a hearing on the application concurrently with a duly noticed hearing to allow the Commission to decide among the following options: 1) Listing on the Potential Historic Resources List, 2) Structure of Merit designation, or 3) City Landmark designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style house, designed by Carleton Monroe Winslow, constructed in 1926 located at 841 Cima Linda Lane.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2018-15 to hold a Public Hearing on November 28, 2018 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed by Carleton Monroe Wilson in 1926 located at 841 Cima Linda Lane.

Action: Grumbine/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 35 W HALEY ST

M-C Zone

(1:50) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-211-028
Application Number: MST2018-00583
Owner: Bee Cal, LLC

(The building, constructed in 1926 by Soule, Murphy and Hastings is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to convert the second floor of the historically significant building from commercial to two residential units. Open yard and parking Modifications are required.)

(Review of a Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that if alterations are made to the building to adhere to the required open yard and parking requirements for residential projects, there would be significant impacts to the Structure of Merit building.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; and John Kuykendall, Dudek, Agent

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets CEQA guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with comments:

1. Label the rooms and street names for clarity on the site plan.
2. Identify plans by floor.
3. Add a graphic scale and North arrow.
4. The Commission supports parking and open space modifications so that the exterior of the building will not be changed and the historic character-defining elements will remain.

Action: Grumbine/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 809 DE LA VINA ST

C-G Zone

(2:00)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-041-009
 Application Number: MST2017-00017
 Owner: 815 De La Vina LLC
 Applicant: Trish Allen
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains a Structure of Merit: Ott House, constructed 1888 in the Queen Anne style. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041- 010), the demolition of 2 one-story buildings and 2 two-story buildings and the construction of 2 new three-story residential buildings, with the Ott House proposed to be relocated to the corner at De la Vina and De la Guerra Streets (addressed as 208 W. De la Guerra). The unit mix will be 16 studio apartments and 22 one-bedroom apartments ranging from 283 square feet to 910 square feet with an average unit size of 550 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,275 square foot parcel is 57 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). Also proposed are 39 parking spaces to be housed in two first-floor parking garages and 39 bike parking spaces.)

(Review of a Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that the proposed project impacts to the historic resources are Less than Significant (Class III). After the implementation of the proposed project the Ott House would maintain its status as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates; and Trish Allen, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets CEQA guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
2. Ms. Plummer stated that this item is going to Planning Commission for concept review on December 6, 2018 at 1:00 p.m., and requested that a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission attend the hearing. Story poles will be going up on December 3, 2018. Commissioners Grumbine and Orías tentatively agreed to attend.

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m.

Matt Williams spoke with concerns about damages to the structure during the moving process.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Provide accurate photos of all elevations.
2. Provide accurate documentation of existing elevations as documentation provided is not accurate.
3. Clearly indicate the porch portions to be removed.
4. Correct mislabeled figures 8, 9, 10, and 11.
5. The Commission accepts the move of the building to the corner with the direction that the changes to the rear addition need to be appropriate for the West De La Guerra streetscape.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioner Mahan provide discussion of items previously in the rear of the building now on the street face with the relocated resource.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:49 TO 2:59 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 24 W GUTIERREZ ST

M-C Zone

(2:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-211-020
Application Number:	MST2017-00303
Owner:	Susan Martin Budinger Trust
Applicant:	Ryan Jeffrey

(The proposal involves relocation or salvage of historic materials and demolition of the existing one-story house, one-story cottage, and detached three-bay garage, and construction of a new three-story mixed-use building, containing two residential condo units. The ground floor will include approximately 812 square feet of commercial space, a lobby, and a covered parking garage with 5 spaces. The two condo units will be located on the second and third floor of the building. Each unit will contain 3 bedrooms, and the unit size will range between approximately 3,532 and 3,445 square feet.)

(Sixth Concept Review. No appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Staff Hearing officer review is required for a Tentative Subdivision Map. Project was last reviewed on March 21, 2018.)

Actual time: 2:59 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Planner, Vanguard Planning LLC; and Ryan Jeffrey, Applicant

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project went to the Staff Hearing Officer on Wednesday, November 7, 2018 where the Tentative Subdivision Map and Open Yard Modification received approval. Although the plans are ready for Project Design Approval,

because the project was noticed as “no appealable decision”, the Commission cannot grant Project Design Approval today.

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project’s design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. Retain 3D model views and plans of the building.
3. Provide more working drawings including important exterior detailing.
4. Resolve chamfering on tower.
5. Resolve porches on Southeast elevation.
6. Resolve the garage door in the opening and as a credible traditional wood panel door.
7. The Commission requests a canopy tree at the front of the building, not necessarily at the driveway.
8. Provide a landscape plan that responds to drought tolerant requirements.
9. Show the configuration of the solar panels on the roof.
10. Bring examples of blind “window” and look at the pattern of a pierced grill.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/1/0. (Lenvik opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Commissioners Orías and Veyna raised concerns about the location of trash cans on the street for collection.

FINAL REVIEW**5. 651 PASEO NUEVO****C-G Zone****(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00464
 Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
 Applicant: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for renovation of Paseo Nuevo Shopping Center including the replacement of all existing paving, new hardscape elements, new paint on all existing building elevations, replacement of existing light fixtures and addition of new decorative pendant fixtures, patterned pole lights, and ambient lighting.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect, J M Holliday and Associates Inc; Erin Lilly, Architect, The Gensler Group; Ann Kale, Lighting Architect, Ann Kale Associates Inc; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Designer, Van Atta Associates; and Nathaniel Bartos, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates Inc

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Commissioners who will be abstaining from this item are allowed to ask questions but not make comments.

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the comment that the Commission accepts that this is a final approval and commends the applicant team on both presentation and design in architecture, lighting, and landscape, and with the following conditions:

1. The Commission likes the conversion of the entire project to a white plaster color scheme.
2. Tile benches are each to have one pattern of tile.
3. The Commission commends the use of the banded tile patterns matching the Courthouse on the steps.
4. The Commission has concerns about the slip resistance of the tiles.
5. The Commission requests that the Projection Committee view the gobos before they are finally installed.
6. Add a border in the tile of the rug pattern.
7. Match the shrouds for the projections lights with the pattern and color of the other light fixtures.
8. The Commission would accept a decorative brass skateboard stop.
9. Conserve and repurpose the angel column and statue.
10. The Projection Committee should examine the lighting levels at the Canon Perdido entrance.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/2. (Hausz and Lenvik abstained.) Motion carried.

*** The item was re-opened at 5:31 p.m. ***

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00284
 Owner: American Tradition LLC
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Robert Glazier

(Proposal for a 60 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on October 17, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair La Voie recused himself from hearing this item as he was paid by a potential investor in the property for an alternate plan.

Actual time: 4:58 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Robert Glazier, Architect, Fess Parker Enterprises; and Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that this item has received an exemption from Water Resources for all the lawn areas and is eligible for Project Design Approval.

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.

- b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. The proposal is generally residential in scale, appropriate for the topography of the surrounding area, and the architecture is compatible with El Pueblo Viejo guidelines and neighboring buildings.
 3. Return in progress with details of fountains, mechanical equipment screening, sample board of materials and colors, and columns.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:31 P.M. ***