



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES OCTOBER 17, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (until 4:47 p.m.), Grumbine (at 1:41 p.m.), Drury (until 4:47 p.m.), Hausz (absent 3:32-4:14 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, and Orías

Commissioners absent: Veyna

Staff present: Hernandez (until 4:14 p.m.), Plummer, Ostringer (absent 4:14-4:47 p.m.), and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Virginia Rehling spoke about an upcoming discussion on Tuesday, October 23, 2018 concerning sign procedures.

Anna Marie Gott expressed concerns about the application of the Architectural Board of Review's guidelines and placing items on an agenda as "Concept Review" but project is allowed to receive Project Design Approval without proper labeling for the public.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 3, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 5/0/2. (Grumbine and La Voie abstained. Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 17, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. The discussion item with Water Resources for landscaping and drought consideration is tentatively set for November 14 or November 28, 2018.
 - b. Commissioner Mahan will not be attending the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting on October 31, 2018, and therefore another Commissioner will need to take his place at the consent meeting that day.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced that the Mills Act exception for 2014 Garden Street that the Historic Landmarks Commission recommended to City Council was approved on Tuesday, October 16, 2018. 1307 Panchita Place has withdrawn their application.
3. Commissioner Lenvik suggested a discussion with staff about adjusting the agenda process in response to concerns that were raised during public comment.

Ms. Ostringer responded that the Commission can ask her specific questions as they arise relevant under the agenda items.

4. Commissioner Drury announced that he will be leaving at 5:00 p.m.
5. Commissioner Hausz announced that he will be stepping down from Item 5, 9 West Anapamu Street.
6. Commissioner La Voie announced the following:
 - a. He will be stepping down from Item 7, 433 East Cabrillo Boulevard.
 - b. Palm Springs recently rewrote their Historic Resource Ordinance to include strict penalties for violations. Char La Voie will provide staff with a copy for their reference.
7. Commissioner Orías announced that the meeting regarding the Historic Ordinance took place on September 20, 2018 and she requested that staff report back to the Commission about the proceedings of the meeting.
8. Ms. Hernandez responded that she gave the requested report at the meeting of October 3, 2018 during the five year plan presentation.
9. Ms. Ostringer stated that the joint meeting between Planning Commission and City Council will be held in two weeks and that she will send the corresponding notice to Commissioner Orías so she may attend as a representative of the Historic Landmarks Commission.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported that he and Commissioner Drury met with Alison Grube, City Graphic Designer, to discuss appropriate fonts for signage in El Pueblo Viejo. They reviewed current material and added additional fonts.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. 2932 HERMOSA ROAD**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-194-017
Owner: 2932 Hermosa Road LP

(Review Staff Report to consider adding the house at 2932 Hermosa Road to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as when it is restored it may be eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Add the structure located at 2932 Hermosa Road to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it may be eligible for Structure of Merit designation.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 7/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. 501 NIÑOS DRIVE**

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-362-005
Owner: CITY OF SANTA BARBARA

(Review staff report to consider removal of Dwight Murphy Field located at 501 Niños Drive from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not meet the criteria to qualify as a historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:06 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; George Thomson, Parks Capital Projects Supervisor, Parks and Recreation

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Remove the Dwight Murphy Field located at 501 Niños Drive from the City's Potential Historic Resources List based on the information provided by staff.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 700 STATE ST****C-G Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-016
Application Number: MST2018-00554
Owner: Ortega Pacific, LLC
Applicant: ASI Development
Business Name: 7-Eleven

(Appeal of a Sign Committee action approving signage proposed under SGN2018-00084. The approved proposal includes an 11.9 square foot reverse channel letter wall sign and 4 square foot non-illuminated wood blade wall sign on a new aluminum bracket that will be painted with a bronze finish. The proposal also includes a 3.19 square foot non-illuminated ATM sign to be hung from the interior of the window frame, a pair of .25 square foot vinyl logos flanking the front door, and a banded stripe across the front window. A total of 19.59 square feet of signage is proposed for the tenant space.)

(Consider the appeal of Virginia Rehling, of the Sign Committee's Final Approval on September 11, 2018.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Virginia Rehling, Appellant; David Eng, Planning Technician, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: To comments about the Historic Landmark Commission's purview over sign approvals, Ms. Ostranger stated that when Sign Committee was formed, City Council established specific procedures and levels of review for how signs are reviewed and approved, and that they fall with the Sign Committee. Ms. Rehling submitted her appeal through the proper channels and in a timely manner; her objections to the stripe are sufficient for appealing the Sign Committee's approval to the Historic Landmarks Commission. When the Commission considered eliminating ATM signage that did not identify the business, Ms. Ostranger cautioned that the Supreme Court has ruled that content cannot be a basis of denying a sign, and that if the ATM sign were removed, findings would need to be made identifying inconsistency with sign guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Virginia Rehling explained that she was not opposed to the overall sign proposal but did have objections to the colored stripe. She requested that the Historic Landmarks Commission review this proposal, and noted she would be satisfied with whatever decision the Commission made.

Anna Marie Gott spoke in support of the appeal.

Public comment closed at 2:33 p.m.

Motion: Accept the decision of the Sign Committee and deny the appeal on the condition that the applicant make the following changes:

1. There shall not be any frosted glass in the proposal.
2. On the blade sign, remove the bottom scroll, with only the top bracket to remain, and specify the bracket to be wrought iron and 3/4 inch square in thickness.
3. Remove the multi-colored stripe from the windows.

Action: Lenvik/Orias, 4/3/0. (Veyna absent. Hausz, Mahan, and Drury opposed) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:59 TO 3:08 P.M. ***

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

4. 809 DE LA VINA ST C-G Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-009
 Application Number: MST2017-00017
 Owner: 815 De La Vina LLC
 Applicant: Trish Allen
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains a Queen Anne historic building, Ott House, listed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041-010), the demolition of 2 one-story buildings and 2 two-story buildings and the construction of 2 new three-story residential buildings, with the Ott House proposed to be relocated to the corner at De la Vina and De la Guerra Streets (addressed as 208 W. De la Guerra). The unit mix will be 16 studio apartments and 22 one-bedroom apartments ranging from 283 square feet to 910 square feet with an average unit size of 550 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,275 square foot parcel is 57 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). Also proposed are 39 parking spaces to be housed in two first-floor parking garages and 39 bike parking spaces.)

(Consider the applicant's request to exempt the project from the requirement that story-poles be installed prior to Planning Commission Concept Review Hearing, per City Council Resolution #17-006.)

Actual time: 3:08 p.m.

Present: Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Trish Allen, Agent, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Jeremy Bassan, Applicant; and Steve Nuhn, Architect, Cearnal Collective LLP

Staff comments: Kathleen Kennedy stated that the Planning Commission concept review requires story poles and the review is tentatively scheduled for December 6, 2018. The Historic Landmarks Commission may grant an exemption if they make findings that apply to the project.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Matt Williams believes story poles are needed based on the building’s size, mass, and scale.
2. Anna Marie Gott believes story poles are needed so residents can be made more aware of the project.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

Motion: Deny the applicant’s request to exempt the story poles.
Action: Mahan/Orias, 7/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1119-1131 STATE STREET AND 9-15 WEST ANAPAMU STREET C-G Zone
(2:40) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-231-037
 Application Number: MST2018-00497
 Owner: 1129 State Street
 Applicant: Jeff Gorrell

(This is designated City Landmark: San Marcos Building, constructed in 1926 in the Churrigueresque Spanish Style, by architect Myron Hunt and HC Chambers. Proposal for entry upgrades to allow for new and relocated entries. Project includes, at 1131 State Street demolishing the recessed patio, pushing the storefront towards State Street, and adding entry storefronts leading into 1131 and 1127 State Street at Paseo #1. At 1119 State Street converting a window bay to a new storefront, and at 1123 State Street converting the existing window walls to two new entries off the existing courtyard.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Landmark Findings are required.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Hausz recused himself from hearing this item due to the fact that he has done work with the applicant’s architect in the last year.

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Jeff Gorrell, Applicant, LMA Architects

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m.

Anna Marie Gott gave general public comment.

Public comment closed at 3:47 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 3:55 p.m.

Correspondence in opposition from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:57 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the restoration of the building to its historic level.
2. Because this is a designated City Landmark, in order to restore the building, the following are requested:
 - a. Restore transom at 1131 State Street to a multi-pane to match the original existing.
 - b. Match the storefront setback to that of the original from the face of the pilasters.
 - c. Restore or return to the base material to the original.
 - d. The Commission supports the openings in the paseo as it meets the required finding that it enhances the City Landmark by bringing the life and viability to the building.
 - e. The Commission recommends that the applicant make use of the California Historical Building Code for alternatives to ADA requirements to mitigate changes to the building and the storefronts.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (Veyna and Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 1019 CHAPALA ST****C-G Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-272-009
 Application Number: MST2018-00500
 Owner: Coastal Collective LLC
 Architect: Ken Dickson

(Proposal for façade improvements to an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project includes improvements to windows and doors, replacement of brick with sandstone wainscot below the storefront windows, elimination of the stucco on Chapala Street, and changes to the existing awnings. Also proposed are paint changes to the building, window and door trim, addition of sconces to the Chapala and rear elevation, and a new fence and gate.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Ms. Ostringer recused herself from hearing this item due to her participation in a permit selection process for the cannabis dispensary.

Chair La Voie disclosed that he watched the recording of the previous meeting so he is able to make comments as long as they are substantially compatible with everything else that was said.

Actual time: 4:14 p.m.

Present: Dan Weber, Architect; Ken Dickson, Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that she followed up with Anthony Wagner who reviews all the applications going through the police department for cannabis sites and confirmed that this project is consistent with their policies for lighting requirements.

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support Project Design Approval? 7/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support Final Approval? 1/6 Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval with a two week continuance and with the comment to show any equipment on the outside of the building.

Action: Drury/-----, Motion failed due to lack of second.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

1. Add pigment to the clear coat on the entry doors to bring it to a mid-range brown.
2. Screen the equipment on the roof from public view.
3. Change the hardware on the doors to be a traditional Spanish design.
4. Screen any new backflow valve with landscaping.

Action: Drury/Lenvik, 7/0/0. (Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:45)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	017-680-009
Application Number:	MST2016-00284
Owner:	American Tradition LLC
Applicant:	Suzanne Elledge
Architect:	Robert Glazier

(Proposal for a 52-60 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two and three story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair La Voie recused himself from hearing this item as he was paid by a potential investor in the property for an alternate plan.

Actual time: 4:47 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Robert Glazier, Architect, Hill Glazier Architects; and Puck Erickson, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 5:43 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Adjust the entry court fountain to be more Spanish and tied to the rest of the fountains and landscape within the hotel.
2. Break up the glazing in the main entry of the hotel with a vertical element.
3. Study the visibility of mechanical equipment.
4. Bring off-white samples for curtain colors.
5. Restudy plaster shown above the paired columns on the east elevation in either wood or thicker plaster.
6. Show columns in a larger size and study for capital relationships and proportions.
7. Show precedents for the columns.
8. Raise grills on A202.
9. Study a weather vane or some other element on the tower in lieu of a chimney.
10. Study the height of the arches on A203 and consider elliptical arches as an option.
11. Show the A210 elevation without the trellis.
12. Study the thickness of the arches above the gate building entry court on A212.
13. The awnings should be a traditional height relative to the window.
14. Extend southeast corner entryway to the sidewalk as an additional non-accessible path.
15. The Commission supports fountains and small trellises.
16. The limited use of lawn is acceptable

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 5/0/0. (La Voie, Drury, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:36 P.M. ***