



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES OCTOBER 3, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Vice Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine (absent 1:58-2:26 p.m.), Drury, Hausz, Lenvik (at 1:31 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: La Voie

Staff present: Unzueta (at 1:49 p.m., until 2:08 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:58 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 19, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Veyna abstained. La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 3, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/1. (Veyna abstained. La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that resignations for the Historic Landmarks Commission need to be received by the County Clerk's Office no later than 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, October 4, 2018 in order for the position to be included in the next recruitment process. The application deadline for new Historic Landmark Commission members is Tuesday, October 16, 2018 at 5:00 p.m. Interviews by City Council will occur on Tuesday, October 30, 2018 at 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, November 13, 2018 at 4:00 p.m., and Tuesday, November 20, 2018 at 6:00 p.m. Official appointments will occur on December 11, 2018.
2. Commissioner Mahan announced that the restoration of the courthouse mural room by the Courthouse Legacy Foundation received the Governor's award for the Best Restoration Project in the State of California. As a former president, Commissioner Mahan will be missing the consent and full board Historic Landmarks Commission meetings on October 31, 2018, to receive the award.
3. Commissioner Orías requested that the Commission be updated on the proceedings of the Revisions to the Historic Resource Ordinance. She also requested that staff find out if Tava Ostringer, Assistant City Attorney, will be coming to the Historic Landmarks Commission to discuss findings. Ms. Plummer answered that there will be a future discussion on general findings and procedures. Ms. Plummer suggested that Commissioner Orías forward any questions or potential discussion items to staff or Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian for the City of Santa Barbara.
4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he will be stepping down from Item 2, 2010 Garden Street. He also announced that he was asked to be a part of the committee to discuss the redevelopment of State Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported that the Fonts Committee has agreed to meet on Monday, October 8, 2018, with Alison Grube, Graphic Designer for the City of Santa Barbara.

F. The American Institute of Architects announces the 10th Annual ArchitectTour, "Rediscover Downtown," on Saturday, October 6, 2018.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. FIVE YEAR PLAN****(1:50)**

Staff:

Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

(Discussion and Review of the Five Year Historic Resource Work Program based on the Possible Implementation Measures outlined in the Historic Resources Element of the General Plan and provide direction regarding staff's suggested Five Year Historic Resources Work Program and recommendation to City Council for approval.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Discussion held**The main goals of the next five year plan include:**

- Become a Certified Local Government (CLG) (HRE Implementation Item 10.6)
- Revisions to Historic Resources Ordinance 22.22. (HRE Implementation Items 1.1, 1.3, 2.6, 2.7, 5.1, and 5.4)
- Historic Districts Implementation. (HRE Implementation Item 1.1, 2.6, 2.7, 5.1, and 5.4)
- Many of the implementation items are addressed by the design review bodies, Urban Historian and staff on a case by case basis.
- Certain on-going items are part of the regular work of the City's Urban Historian, including: promoting and processing the Mills Act Contracts, providing guidance on the use of the California Historical Building Code, consulting with applicants on complying with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and designation of historic resources.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 2010 GARDEN ST****RS-15 Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:

025-331-015

Application Number:

MST2018-00463

Owner:

Girod Family Trust

Applicant:

Serena McClintick

Architect:

Harrison Design Associates

(The Mission Revival style residence, constructed in 1894, Crocker Row House #1, is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as it is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a new detached two-car garage and approximately 68 square feet of associated hardscape. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for the garage structure to be located in the required 30-foot front setback.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval for the garage to be located in the required 30-foot front setback.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 1:58 p.m.

Present: Barbara Chen Lowenthal, Agent, Harrison Design Associates; Serena McClintick, Applicant, Harrison Design Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that this parcel is a corner lot subject to two, 30 foot front setbacks. The modification request is to have a new garage located in the secondary front setback. The Commission is to consider if the modification is aesthetically appropriate.

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Board comments:

There was a discussion regarding an alternate location and size of the garage.

Motion: Continue indefinitely.

1. The Commission unanimously rejects the application as submitted.
2. The proposal adversely affects the setting of this Historic Resource as it sits in front of the prominent side elevation facing Mission Street, obscuring the historic resource.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:16 TO 2:26 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. 401 SHORELINE DR

HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2018-00493
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Los Banos del Mar Pool is a City Landmark and listed on the National Register of Historic Places and located in the appealable jurisdiction of the coastal zone. Proposal to replace demolish the non-historically significant and non-operational West Beach Childrens' Wading Pool constructed in 1977, including fencing, picnic areas, hardscape, and the adjacent playground, with a new splash pad and playground. The new playground proposes interactive play fountains and playground structures designed to mimic harbor and ocean related structures nearby. The project includes new picnic areas, landscaping, fencing, walkways, resilient rubber play surfaces, and a new 400 square foot restroom and mechanical building. Planning Commission review required for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Planning Commission review is required for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 2:26 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara; Chris Bradbury, Architect, RNT Architects; and Ying-yu Hung, Landscape Architect, SWA Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the property is a City Landmark on the National Register of Historic Places, but the West Beach Children's Wading Pool is not included in the designation because it was built in 1977 and the Commission wanted to give the Parks and Recreation Department flexibility in proposing new designs within the area subject to the Commission's review and findings.

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Skip Abed
2. Tara Taylor
3. Correspondence from Christina Marshall, Emily Young, Devon Turner, and Karen F. Downs was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Correspondence from Tara Brown was acknowledged concerning the safety of the protected birds and education about the birds.

Public comment closed at 2:59 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the Toy Harbor Boat? 6/1 Passed

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. A majority of the Commission found that the design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
2. The Commission believes the project is generally headed in the right direction.
3. Incorporate more opportunities for shade into the design.
4. Include a covered walkway under the trees housing the protected birds due to concerns of health and environmental safety.
5. The Commission has concerns about the public having to walk across the parking lot to access additional restrooms. The size of the restroom structure needs to be larger to accommodate the use.
6. The Commission is divided on the appropriateness of the restroom architecture.

7. The Commission is concerned regarding the safety of shells being incorporated into the walkways.
8. The Commission has concerns about rising ocean levels.
9. In general, the colors of the play structures should be consistent with colors from the Santa Barbara Colors Guide. Some Commissioners indicated the structures could be more Santa Barbara, and to stay away from primary colors or keep the colors muted.
10. The artificial turf is acceptable as it is a minimal area and appropriate given the use.
11. A wrought iron fence is supportable.
12. There was mixed support by Commissioners of the boat.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

4. 1001 STATE ST

C-G Zone

(3:40)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-281-024
 Application Number: MST2018-00308
 Owner: 1001 State Street Partners, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Collective LLP

(Proposal to remove existing openings at the second floor of an existing commercial building and install new clerestory windows at the perimeter of the building except along the wall that is adjacent to the neighboring building. The project includes reconfiguration of plastered entries to the building, and replacement of plaster eave with wood decking.)

(Review After Final is requested for various facade improvements, including maintaining the existing entrance and reducing the number of windows proposed at the east elevation, reconfiguring the layout of existing corbels, and lowering the plaster feature at the west elevation entrance 36" than originally proposed. Project was last reviewed on August 8, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Collective LLP; Rogelio Solis, Cearnal Collective LLP

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks to Consent with the comment to study the corbels.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1019 CHAPALA ST

C-G Zone

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-272-009
 Application Number: MST2018-00500
 Owner: Coastal Collective LLC
 Architect: Ken Dickson

(Proposal for façade improvements to an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project includes improvements to windows and doors, replacement of brick with sandstone wainscot below the storefront windows, elimination of the stucco on Chapala Street, and changes to the existing awnings. Also proposed are paint changes to the building, window and door trim, addition of scones to the Chapala and rear elevation, and a new fence and gate.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: Julian McCloskey, Owner, Coastal Collective LLC; Dan Weber, Architect, Anacapa Architecture; and Ken Dickson, Architect, Windward Engineering

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Study the exterior lighting to comply with City guidelines and safety.
2. Awnings are to be a color from the Santa Barbara Colors Guide. Black is not acceptable.
3. Storefront design is generally acceptable but raise the bulkhead to approximately 20".
4. The gates are to be done in a more traditional manner with vertical planks.
5. Show detail of plaster.
6. Study existing window and awning height.
7. Show door on east elevation.
8. Provide a material board and color board.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:58 P.M. ***