



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 5, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine (at 1:34 p.m., until 5:30 p.m.), Drury (until 6:36 p.m.), Hausz (absent 4:05-4:08 p.m., until 6:46 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna (at 1:32 p.m.)

Staff present: Hernandez (absent 3:10-3:36 p.m.), Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Brian Barnwell presented pictures and expressed concerns about the visual scarring of the sidewalk outside the art museum and library.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 22, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continue Item I (101 E Victoria St) and Item F (2932 Hermosa Rd) on the **September 5, 2018** Consent Calendar.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 5, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan (Items A, B, D, E, F, G, H), Grumbine (Items E and F), and Veyna (Items C and I).
- Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
1. Ms. Plummer announced that the Planning Commission will review the proposed Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) at 226 E Anapamu Street on September 6, 2018.
 2. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he will be leaving at 5:30 p.m.
 3. Commissioner Drury announced that he will be leaving at 6:15 p.m.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:
- No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 1440 SANTA ROSA AVENUE

(1:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-132-019

Owner: Donna and Robert Bernard

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1921 out of adobe material located at 1440 Santa Rosa Avenue.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-114 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1921 out of adobe material located at 1440 Santa Rosa Avenue.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 317 E VALERIO ST****R-2 Zone**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-121-015
Application Number: MST2018-00205
Owner: Suzanne Kaljian Cohen
Architect: NMA Architects
Contractor: Kifer Construction

(Proposal to demolish an existing 723 square foot detached accessory building and construct a new 795 square foot detached accessory building comprising a two-car garage for the main dwelling unit and a one-car garage bay for a 638 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above. The proposed project includes a new trellis, pool, spa and associated equipment to be located in the rear yard. Approximately 490 cubic yards of cut and 220 cubic yards of fill will occur on site, of which 200 cubic yards will be exported off site.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by A. Jaqua Consulting.)

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Mary Andrulaitis, Architect, NMA Architects; Michael Cohen, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Ex parte communication: Chair La Voie disclosed that he personally knows Allison Jaqua but that this does not influence his evaluation of this report.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Grumbine/Orias, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. 803 BATH ST****R-MH Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-032-014
Application Number: MST2017-00714
Owner: Michael B. Furst Revocable Trust 12
Applicant: SEPPS
Architect: John Beauchamp

(The two-story Craftsman Residence constructed in 1906 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish a portion of the unpermitted L-shaped accessory building comprising a garage and accessory space, and constructing a new conforming single-car carport. The proposal includes relocating a portion of the northerly site wall onto the existing foundation as part of the accessory building alteration and constructing a new infill wall adjacent to the proposed carport. Project includes replacement of the unpermitted upper window sashes to match the original diamond pane configuration, permitting two driveway gates, a skylight, HVAC equipment, and removing gutters that encroach onto the adjacent property to the west. Project requires Staff Hearing officer review for an Outdoor Living Space Modification to allow the reduction of the required 800 square feet of open yard on lots less than 5,000 square feet, and two Interior Setback Modifications to allow the carport to encroach into the required three foot interior setback for covered parking, and to allow the accessory storage building to encroach into the required six foot interior setback. This project will address violations listed in ENF2016-01512, ENF2017-00969, and ZIR2016-00467. The proposed total of 2,267 square feet on a 4,097 square foot lot is 102% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing officer for an Outdoor Living Space Modification to allow the reduction of the required 800 square feet of open yard on lots less than 5,000 square feet, and two Interior Setback Modifications to allow the carport to encroach into the required three foot interior setback for covered parking, and to allow the accessory storage building to encroach into the required six foot interior setback.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect; Tish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; and Michael Furst, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project will address violations listed in ENF2017-00969 regarding the replacement of unpermitted windows. She later clarified that the project requires two Interior Setback Modifications for the accessory building comprised of a carport and storage, and an Outdoor Living Space Modification for the reduction of the required open yard. Staff is not supportive of the Interior Setback Modification for the storage portion of the accessory building, however the discretionary approval for the modification request will be decided by the Staff Hearing Officer.

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m.

Brian Kollenborn spoke with concerns about the encroachment of the garage onto his property.

Public comment closed at 2:24 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission requests more information documenting the permit history, location of what has existed, what is existing, and what is proposed.
2. There is support for relief of the open yard space requirement, but indicate alternate open space needs on the plan and can include the side yard and porch.
3. There are concerns about emergency and fire access impairment by the location of the carport.
4. There are concerns about the architecture and design of the accessory building, as well as associated code issues.
5. There is very little support for the storage portion of the accessory building.
6. Remove the substantial amount of paving in the driveway area and second curb cut to minimize the amount of paving.
7. A complete set of plans accurately showing the attic area and the basement area, as well as the configuration of the existing building is desired.
8. The windows should be restored to match the original both in material, profile, and configuration to meet the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:10 TO 3:16 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. CITYWIDE

ROW Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 000-000-0RW
 Application Number: MST2018-00469
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to add new regulatory signage on sidewalks in commercial areas and public parking lots and structures to educate the public and enforce the City's Outdoor Smoking Ordinance.)

(Courtesy Review. Comments Only. Citywide Signage to be approved by Sign Committee. Project was last reviewed on June 27, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Nina Johnson, Senior Assistant to City Administrator, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer reminded the Commission that this is a courtesy review and the project will ultimately be approved by Sign Committee.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend to Sign Committee for approval with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the additional work, research, and response to comments, and supports the project wholeheartedly.
2. Mounting straps to be copper.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**5. 800 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-G Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-028
 Application Number: MST2015-00023
 Owner: 800 Santa Barbara, LLC
 Applicant: Heidi Jones
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser

(Revised proposal to demolish the existing 1,965 net square foot, one-story non-residential building and construct a 19,179 square foot, three-story mixed-use building on an 18,568 square foot lot. The project consists of 1,289 square feet of commercial floor area and 23 residential units. The unit mix will include 8 studios, 10 one-bedroom units, and 5 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 777 square feet. Parking will be provided with a subterranean parking garage containing 29 parking spaces, storage, and service areas. Of the 27 trees on the property, 9 would be retained and protected, 15 removed, 3 relocated, and 17 new specimen trees and palms added. This is an AUD Priority Housing development with a proposed density of 53 dwelling units per acre. Project is within the Commercial/High Residential Priority Overlay (37-63 du/ac).)

(In-Progress Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed on July 25, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:34 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services; Jan Hochhauser, Hochhauser Blatter Architecture & Planning; and Courtney Miller, CJM::LA Landscape Architects

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the Conditions of Approval on the project include hazardous materials mitigation measures.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Steve Dowty with the Pearl Chase Society believes the scale, size, and proximity to parks and schools is inappropriate.
2. Susan Chamberlin opposes the project due to the belief that the process for approval was flawed and spoke on behalf of Kellam de Forest who believes the design and size are not compatible with the neighborhood and historic district.

Public comment closed at 4:12 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support third floor tile? 6/2 Passed

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the architect for working with the Commission.
2. On sheet A.9.20-4, identify the rainwater downspouts as copper.
3. On sheet A9.21 and A17.2, show the awning details with the correct location of the crossbar and fabric drop, and the intended profile of the awning have a swag.
4. On sheet A18, provide details of the muntins in the windows with detailed width and profile and redesign the door to have a more traditional breakup of the glass.
5. On sheet A10.1, details 8 and 5, correctly identify the sizes of the iron, and on detail 5, resolve the difference in scale of the bracket and the iron rail to be more in keeping with each other.
6. On the mechanical plan, indicate all of the exhaust vents, their covering, and treatment for the detail in their covering, as well as on the architectural elevation.
7. On the mechanical plan, show the mechanical equipment on at least one architectural cross section.
8. If the equipment is higher than the parapet, show the line of sight from the adjacent sidewalk.
9. Show the roof vents.
10. Indicate the finish and grade of the wood on the balconies, hidden connections, beams, and rafter tails for all exposed timber.
11. Request for the addition of chimneys.
12. The garage vents still need further resolution. Either omit one or reduce the size.
13. Lightbulbs on the exterior fixtures should have 2700k to 2900k bulbs and indicate as clear, seeded glass.
14. The tile citarilla on detail A9.16 should fill the entire opening.
15. Indicate that the plaster finish will match that of the Lobero building or the adjacent Neighborhood House.
16. The Commission supports the option of tile at the third floor.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/1/0. (Chair La Voie opposed.) Motion carried.

Individual Comments: Chair La Voie stated that he opposed the motion, as he voted against the project at Project Design Approval, because he could not make the applicable findings for size, bulk, and scale, compatibility with the neighborhood and the adjacent historic resources, and found the architecture unacceptable considering its location.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:05 TO 5:15 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 3 ROSEMARY LN****RS-15 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-093-019
Application Number: MST2018-00332
Owner: Kurt G. Harris

(The English Cottage style residence designed by Harriett Moody in 1940 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish the attached garage and flower room for a new 516 square foot two-car garage and 1,012 square feet of additions to the first and second floor living space. Exterior improvements to the residence include replacement of the entry and east side doors and abatement of violations listed in ENF2017-00723 by restoring the one set of diamond pane casements on the front elevation to match original. The project also involves demolition of two non-conforming sheds and construction of a 375 square foot detached artist studio, replacement and extension of a six foot high wooden fence on the south lot line, and a new eight foot high wooden fence on the eastern lot line. The proposed total of 3,387 square feet on a 12,289 square foot lot is 84% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Project was last reviewed on August 22, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:15 p.m.

Present: Kurt Harris, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Pamela and Kurt Huffman

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Lyn Krieger believes the studio should be board and batten to match the materials on the rest of the street instead of stucco and objects to the amount of paving in the proposal.
2. Charles Metrebian reiterated Ms. Krieger's comments and voiced concerns about the faux-Tudor element of the accessory structure.
3. Christine Hoehner wished to speak but left before public comment opened.
4. Steve Dowty wished to speak but left before public comment opened.
5. Susan Chamberlin spoke on behalf of Kellam Deforest who opposes the project due the belief that it is not appropriate for a Moody cottage or the site. Ms. Chamberlin shared her own concerns about incompatibility.
6. Cynthia Goena opposes the size and bulk of the project, landscaping, the rear casita, and the use of stucco.
7. Correspondence from Charles and Jeanette Metrebian, Paul and Lyn Krieger, Christine Hoehner, Warren and Margaret Evans, Larry and Donna Mason, Francesca Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:57 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the applicant's response to Commission comments and finds the project has greatly improved, but needs more finessing.
2. Differentiate the addition and accessory structure from the original building while being compatible to address the Secretary of the Interior Standards so that the original house is the prominent feature on the site.
3. Use a different color for the garage. Paint the doors, especially the garage doors.
4. Study adding a front dormer in the garage roof.
5. Remove as much paving as possible to enhance both the visual and the experience of the building, and place significant landscaping to mitigate the mass of the new addition building, particularly the addition.
6. Use board and batten in the Accessory building.
7. Make the roof form, form of building, and composition of the accessory building more organic and quirky. Study a jerkinhead roof in the gable and set it askew on the site.
8. Add a chimney on the accessory building.
9. Restore the reflecting pond.
10. Pergola is too modern, consider prior pergola design.
11. The Commission requires the applicant to submit the revised Historic Structures/Sites Report with a Cultural Landscape study of Rosemary Lane as a whole with the next project review hearing in order for them to have enough information that the project will not have any negative impacts to the historic resources.
12. Title the drawings to clearly indicate each elevation.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 5/0/0. (Grumbine, Drury, and Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:52 P.M. ***