



# City of Santa Barbara

## HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES AUGUST 22, 2018

1:30 P.M.  
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room  
630 Garden Street  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*  
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*  
Michael Drury  
Steve Hausz  
Ed Lenvik  
Bill Mahan  
Judy Orías  
Julio J. Veyna

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** Dr. Michael Glassow

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** Jason Dominguez

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** Sheila Lodge

### STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor  
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian  
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician  
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

---

### CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

### ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine (absent 1:38 - 1:45 p.m.), Drury, Hausz, Lenvik, Mahan (at 1:31 p.m.), Orías (until 5:30 p.m.), and Veyna (at 1:31 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (until 1:37 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Reidel

### GENERAL BUSINESS

#### A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

#### B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 8, 2018**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Orías, 6/0/0. (Mahan and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

#### C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 22, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Drury/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
1. Ms. Plummer announced that Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney, will be working more closely with the Community Development Department and will introduce herself at an upcoming design review meeting.
  2. Ms. Hernandez, Urban Historian, announced the following:
    - a. The Urban Historian provided Commissioners with a packet containing staff reports for the collective designation hearings of Structures of Merit scheduled for September 19, 2018.
      1. The notice for 1729 Bath Street was returned undeliverable so the designation will be re-noticed and scheduled for a future hearing.
      2. The designation hearing for 2014 Garden Street is scheduled for today as the owners are applying for a Mills Act Contract.
    - b. A meeting is scheduled with Scott Vincent, Assistant City Attorney, Ms. Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor, and Ms. Hernandez, Urban Historian on September 20, 2018 regarding amending the Historic Structures Ordinance.
  3. Ms. Unzueta confirmed that the Community Development Department is now working with Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney; however, Scott Vincent will remain the Assistant City Attorney assigned to amending the Historic Structures Ordinance.
  4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he will be stepping down from Items 1, 2014 Garden Street, and Item 2, 2014 Garden Street, due to conflicts of interest.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:
- No subcommittee reports.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### **1. 2014 GARDEN STREET**

**(1:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-016

Owner: John and Catherine Moore

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Mission Revival style residence designed by noted architect Arthur Page Brown in 1894, located at 2014 Garden Street.)

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 1:38 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:41 p.m.

Kellam De Forest questioned if the Crocker Row houses are of sufficient historical significance to be a historical district.

Ms. Hernandez stated that three others Crocker Row houses are scheduled for consideration as Structure of Merits on September 19, 2018 and the other will be considered once the house sale is finalized and they are noted as important as a collection together.

**Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-109 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Mission Revival style residence, located at 2014 Garden Street.**

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

**2. 2014 GARDEN STREET**

**(1:50)**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-331-016

Owner: John and Catherine Moore

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

**(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 2014 Garden Street, and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contract.)**

**RECUSAL:** To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 1:43 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Mission Revival style house located at 2014 Garden Street.**

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**3. 1703 CHAPALA STREET**

**(1:55)**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-092-014

Owner: Elihu and Jen Bogan

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Queen Anne Free Classic style house constructed in 1903 located at 1703 Chapala Street.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-110 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Queen Anne Free Classic style residence constructed in 1903 located at 1703 Chapala Street.**

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

**4. 1703 CHAPALA STREET**

**(2:00)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-092-014

Owner: Elihu and Jen Bogan

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

**(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)**

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Queen Anne Free Classic style house located at 1703 Chapala Street.**

Action: Grumbine/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Drury expressed his appreciation for the project.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**5. 520 PLAZA RUBIO**

**(2:05)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-281-003

Owner: Molly and Peter Sorensen

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the post World War II Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1951 located at 520 Plaza Rubio.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-111 to designate as a Structure of Merit the post World War II Spanish Colonial Revival style house located at 520 Plaza Rubio.**

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

**6. 520 PLAZA RUBIO**

**(2:10)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-281-003

Owner: Molly and Peter Sorensen

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

**(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)**

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:02 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the post World War II Spanish Colonial Revival style house located at 520 Plaza Rubio.**

Action: Hausz/Lenvik, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**7. 1307 PANCHITA PLACE**

**(2:15)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-092-007

Owner: Jestin St. Peter, Jaime Heer

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Craftsman style house constructed in 1920 located at 1307 Panchita Place.)

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:**

- 1. Further historical evidence is required on the original appearance and style of the house.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

**8. 1307 PANCHITA PLACE**

**(2:20)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-092-007

Owner: Jestin St. Peter, Jaime Heer

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

**(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)**

**Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:**

- 1. Further historical evidence is required on the original appearance and style of the house, and that the restoration plan will be to the original appearance.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

**9. 2801 VERDE VISTA DRIVE**

**(2:25)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 053-372-006

Owner: Erin and Nicholas Sanchez

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Tudor Revival style house constructed in 1931 located at 2801 Verde Vista Drive.)

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-113 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Tudor Revival style house located at 2801 Verde Vista Drive, noting that the later additions are non-contributing elements.**

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 6/2/0. (Lenvik and Mahan opposed.) Motion carried.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM****10. 2801 VERDE VISTA DRIVE****(2:30)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-372-006

Owner: Erin and Nicholas Sanchez

(Application for a Mills Act contract. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

**(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)**

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Tudor Revival style house located at 2801 Verde Vista Drive.**

Action: Grumbine/Hausz, 6/2/0. (Lenvik and Mahan opposed.) Motion carried.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:31 TO 2:45 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****11. 3 ROSEMARY LN****RS-15 Zone****(2:35)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-093-019

Application Number: MST2018-00332

Owner: Kurt G. Harris

(The English Cottage style residence designed by Harriett Moody in 1940 is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish the attached one-car garage and flower room for a new 516 square foot two-car garage and 1,012 square feet of additions to the first and second floor living space. Exterior improvements to the residence include replacement of the entry and east side doors and abatement of violations listed in ENF2017-00723 by restoring the one set of diamond pane casements on the front elevation to match original. The project also involves demolition of two non-conforming sheds and construction of a 375 square foot detached artist studio, replacement and extension of a six foot high wooden fence on the south lot line, and a new eight foot high wooden fence on the eastern lot line. The proposed total of 3,387 square feet on a 12,289 square foot lot is 84% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

**(A. Review of a Phase 1 & 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that the proposed project's impacts to significant historic resources are Less than Significant (Class III).)**

Actual time: 2:45 p.m.

Present: Kurt G. Harris, Owner; Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates; and Pamela Post, Post Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez provided background that last year there was an application to permit the unpermitted removal of diamond pane casement windows on the front and rear of the residence. The neighbors appealed the project to City Council and is on hold since the windows are character defining features, and the replacement does not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards for California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) categorical exemption. The applicant has since revised his scope of work to replace the diamond pane casement windows on the front elevation to match the original windows, as well as other improvements. Ms. Hernandez made the following comments on the Historic Structures/Sites Report:

- Page 36 needs to note that the diamond shaped panes are character defining features and that the rear window set of diamond casement windows were also removed without permits.
- Under the list of character defining features, the garage doors are not listed as they are not original. However, the Historians should clarify if the garage itself is character defining, since under criterion 1, it is stated to be a component of the Moody scheme and an element of the period of significance.
- On page 51, the recommendations need to be incorporated into the project description and into revised drawings, otherwise they are mitigation measures and will trigger a negative declaration or Environmental Impact Report. The report acceptance will need to be postponed for approval until the recommendations are incorporated into the scope of work and reflected in the drawings.

Ms. Plummer clarified that the original application reviewed on the consent agenda last year, was not subject to a noticed public hearing. The application, specific to the windows, was appealed by the neighbors to City Council and has been put on hold. This is a new application that will replace the first application if the Commission moves the project forward.

Public comment opened at 3:02 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Kellam De Forest spoke in opposition of the addition due to the opinion that the Moody Sister designs are meant to be small and this is not compatible.
2. Laura Bridley stated that she disagrees with the conclusion of the report that the project will not have a significant impact on the streetscape and is of the opinion that the neighborhood should be a design district.
3. Charles Metrebian spoke in opposition of the project due to the opinion that the report does not meet CEQA guidelines and submitted written correspondence.
4. Warren and Margaret Evans gave their time to Mr. Metrebian.

Public comment closed at 3:16 p.m.



- Motion: Continue the Historic Structures/Sites Report indefinitely with comments:**
1. The Commission requests a plan that illustrates what was added over time, rather than just a narrative.
  2. Specific to the recommendations on pg. 51 of the report:
    - a. The Commission finds that the addition as currently presented is incompatible in size, bulk, and scale and overwhelms the original structure.
    - b. The detached artist studio does have an effect on the resource, and should be in a style compatible with the Moody's work.
    - c. The spatial relationships that characterize the property are changed by this addition.
    - d. Consider moving the artist studio off to the side to allow for the introduction of landscape elements as a spatial relationship compatible with the resource.
    - e. Strengthen language on pg. 51 to speak to the efficiency and integrity of the design.
    - f. Incorporate the recommendation on pg. 51 into the plans.
  3. The report should consider the cultural landscape of Rosemary Lane and comment on the project's compatibility with that landscape.
  4. On page 36, bullet point three, should read "should emulate" not "does emulate."

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/1. (Orías abstained.) Motion carried.

**(B. Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Structure of Merit and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings are required.)**

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Correspondence from Josiah Hamilton, Jim Williams, Winston Cenac and Minerva Nagel, Cindy Mayer, and Kurt Harris was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Kellam De Forest gave his time to Laura Bridley.
2. Laura Bridley objected to the size, bulk, and scale of the project and submitted written correspondence.
3. Rose Thomas believes the project will alter the appearance of the house, affect the quality of neighborhood, and set a dangerous precedent for others to make changes.
4. Warren and Margaret Evans and Holly Sherwin gave their time to Charles Metrebian.
5. Charles Metrebian discussed street visibility and hedge height, as well as the spatial relationship of the garage and submitted written correspondence.
6. Cynthia Goena objected to the style of the proposal and discussed concerns over construction noise and storm water drainage.
7. Christine Hoehner presented photographs of the Moody cottages and shared the opinion that the style is not compatible and submitted written correspondence.
8. Correspondence from Warren and Margaret Evans and Paul and Lyn Krieger was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:52 p.m.

Public comment reopened at 4:58 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Correspondence from Kurt Huffman and Pamela Stafford Huffman, Martin and Jane Tait, Carmen Martinez and Arthur Lee, John and Lorraine LeConte, Margaret Lazarus, Christine Fredericks, Jan Karbach, Helene Willey, Paul Livacz, Karen Valle, Sharon Hughes, Carole Ozark, Nancy Hassett, Heidi Epps, Davie Bregante, Merle and Eustacchio Guadagnini, Bill Howard, Ian Duncan, Lisa Aviani, and Kurt Harris was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Correspondence from John Berk, Christine Hoehner, Laura Bridley was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:07 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support keeping the original garage as is? 0/7 Failed

**Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:**

1. The architecture needs further study, so that the addition and artist studio are compatible with the original Moody design, for example using a steeper roof pitch.
2. The gable end of the addition attracts attention, and is not recessive or subordinate to the original structure.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:47 TO 5:53 P.M. \***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

<b>12. 809 DE LA VINA ST</b>	<b>C-G Zone</b>
<b><u>(3:25)</u></b>	
Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-041-009
Application Number:	MST2017-00017
Owner:	815 De La Vina LLC
Applicant:	Trish Allen
Architect:	Cearnal Collective LLP

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains a Queen Anne historic building, Ott House, listed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041-010), the demolition of 2 one-story buildings and 2 two-story buildings and the construction of 2 new three-story residential buildings, with the Ott House proposed to be relocated to the corner at De la Vina and De la Guerra Streets (addressed as 208 W. De la Guerra). The unit mix will be 16 studio apartments and 22 one-bedroom apartments ranging from 283 square feet to 910 square feet with an average unit size of 550 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,275 square foot parcel is 57 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). Also proposed are 39 parking spaces to be housed in two first-floor parking garages and 39 bike parking spaces.)

**(Seventh Concept Review. Comments Only. Planning Commission review is required. Project was last reviewed on June 27, 2018.)**

Actual time: 5:53 p.m.

Present: Jeremy Bassan, Owner; Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Collective LLP; and Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 6:07 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Shannon Batchev spoke on behalf of the Coastal Housing Coalition in support of the project
2. Izzy Savage read a letter from Elliott McDougal.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Matt Williams will not be able to support the project due to concerns over the size and parking. He is also concerned that the Zipcars and tokens are not a guarantee.
2. Correspondence from Paulina Conn and Laura Bode was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 6:16 p.m.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:**

1. The Commission greatly appreciates the response to comments and the effort to provide reasonable housing.
2. The Commission appreciates the effort to address the most recent comments given by the HLC to be forwarded to the Planning Commission. The Commission believes the project has achieved a sufficient reduction in size, bulk, and scale to make it compatible with the neighborhood, site, and HLC expectations.
3. Reduction in ceiling heights is desirable.
4. Reduction of the third floor door and window head height is desirable.
5. Provide some elaboration in the decoration of the building; miradors, surrounds and chimneys are suggested.
6. Add vertical deciduous trees to mitigate the mass of the building.
7. Reduction of driveway opening width on De La Vina Street is desirable.
8. Remove the hedge along the front setback.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:40 P.M. \***