



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 11, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (absent 2:26-2:59 p.m.), Grumbine (absent 2:26-2:59 p.m.), Drury, Hausz, Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Hernandez, Plummer, and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **June 27, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Postpone Item C two weeks.

Action: Lenvik/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 11, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Item 4, 800 Santa Barbara Street, has been postponed at the applicant's request and item times were changed. Ms. Plummer proceeded to list the new item times.
 - b. Public comment submitted for 214 E De La Guerra Street concerning a flag pole, was actually in regards to 800 Santa Barbara Street.
 - c. Ms. Plummer discussed Structure of Merit and Landmark findings required for project approvals and announced that, in the future, the findings to be announced will be included as part of the action requested on the agenda.
 - d. Ms. Plummer requested that a Commissioner attend the appeal hearing scheduled at City Council on July 17, 2018 regarding the Commission's approval of a dark green awning at 1295 Coast Village Road; it was suggested that both a commissioner who voted in support and a commissioner who voted in opposition of the motion attend.
 - e. Commissioner Orías requested staff provide copies of the Historic Specimen Trade Drought Action Plan.
 - f. Story poles for the project at 226 E Anapamu Street are currently going up. The Planning Commission hearing will be on Thursday, July 19, 2018 and a Planning Commission scheduled site visit will be held on Tuesday, July 17, 2018 at 7:30 a.m.
2. Commissioner Lenvik requested a copy of the packet containing reports for the next fifty potential Structures of Merit.

Commissioner Lenvik requested a status update on the Draft Historic Resources Design Guidelines, and asked for clarification about Sign Guidelines listed in the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines and if those would be replaced in the Historic Resources Design Guidelines.

Chair La Voie clarified that the Sign Guidelines were not included in the Draft Historic Resources Design Guidelines because they were thought to be adequately included in other documents.

3. Commissioner Orías announced the elementary school's fence on Las Positas Road is covered in signs, which is against sign ordinance. The Commissioner requested that staff investigate.

Ms. Plummer stated that schools have a different sign policy than commercial buildings.

4. Commissioner La Voie announced that he would step down from Item 3, 9 E De La Guerra Street, due to a conflict of interest.
5. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he would step down from Item 3, 9 E De La Guerra Street, due to a conflict of interest.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Grumbine reported on the intention to request from City Council the expansion of the number of Mills Act Projects accepted per year from the limit of eight going forward.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT BUILDING CODE REQUIREMENTS**

(1:50) Staff: Andrew Stuffer, Chief Building Official
(Presentation by the City of Santa Barbara Chief Building Official on common building code accessibility requirements that significantly affect project design.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Andrew Stuffer, Chief Building Official

Discussion held.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 428 CHAPALA ST**

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP

- A. (Rescind Historic Landmarks Commission resolution 2018-1 from January 24, 2018 based on the acceptance of the Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on June 27, 2018.)
- B. (Public Hearing to adopt a revised resolution of the Structure of Merit designation of the building located at 428 Chapala Street based on the findings of the Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on June 27, 2018.)

(Adopt Resolution 2018-108 to designate as a Structure of Merit, the designation boundary includes the entire building because the resource remains significant in its ability to connect to the social history of the Casa de Sevilla Restaurant, however the north, east and west elevations do not convey their original appearance as detailed in the accepted Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report, Exhibit B.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the new resolution reflects the actions of the Commission at the last meeting designating the entire building as the boundary of the Structure of Merit, not just the sandstone wall. The owner has filed an appeal of the designation due to concerns about the triggering of an EIR should they desire to make changes to the other three walls. Ms. Hernandez stated that she supports the conclusions of the accepted Historic Structures/Sites Report that only the sandstone wall is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 2:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Rescind the Historic Landmarks Commission resolution 2018-1 from January 24, 2018 based on the acceptance of the Historic Structures Site Addendum Report accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on June 27, 2018.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/1/0. Motion carried.

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2018-108 to designate as a Structure of Merit the designation boundaries included in the entire building because the resource remains significant in its ability to connect with the social history of the Casa de Sevilla Restaurant, however the north, east, and west elevations do not convey their original appearance as detailed in the accepted Historic Structures Site Addendum Report Exhibit B.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/1/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

3. 9 E DE LA GUERRA ST C-G Zone

(2:35) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-052-027
 Application Number: MST2018-00142
 Owner: Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation
 Applicant: Michael Imwalle
 Designer: Trevor Zellet

(Parcel contains a designated City Landmark: De La Guerra Adobe. Proposal for a temporary privacy screen for the Casa De La Guerra courtyard, consisting of a black iron frame and fabric. The screen is proposed to be installed and removed before and after events.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on May 2, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine and Chair La Voie recused themselves from hearing this item.

Actual time: 2:26 p.m.

Present: Mike Imwalle, Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that land use based restrictions on the privacy screen are not within HLC purview.

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a post on the interior of the wall with fabric behind? 5/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a range of colors that are in earth tone? 4/2 Passed

Motion: Final Approval with the following findings as required for Landmarks in section 22.22.080 of the Municipal Code:

1. The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

4. 800 SANTA BARBARA ST C-G Zone

(3:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-012-028
 Application Number: MST2015-00023
 Owner: 800 Santa Barbara, LLC
 Agent: Heidi Jones, SEPPS, INC
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser

(Revised proposal to demolish the existing 1,965 net square foot, one-story non-residential building and construct a 19,179 square foot, three-story mixed-use building on an 18,568 square foot lot. The project consists of 1,289 square feet of commercial floor area and 23 residential units. The unit mix will include 8 studios, 10 one-bedroom units, and 5 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 777 square feet. Parking will be provided with a subterranean parking garage containing 29 parking spaces, storage, and service areas. Of the 27 trees on the property, 9 would be retained and protected, 15 removed, 3 relocated, and 17 new specimen trees and palms added. This is an AUD Priority Housing development with a proposed density of 53 dwelling units per acre. Project is within the Commercial/High Residential Priority Overlay (37-63 du/ac).)

(In-Progress Review; Comments Only. Project Design Approval was granted on August 9, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

*** Item 4 postponed indefinitely at the applicant’s request. ***

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:48 TO 2:59 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

5. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST C-G Zone

(3:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-082-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00447
 Owner: Lauritson, Betty Jo Trust
 Applicant: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(The project contains a City Landmark: the Louisa Ygnacio House, an Italianate house constructed in 1875. The proposal consists of a 26-unit mixed-use development to be developed on three parcels under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. The project proposes to demolish an existing two-story, 2,464 square foot, four-unit apartment complex (226 E. De La Guerra St.), three sheds, and a surface parking lot, and construct a four-story (subterranean parking plus three stories fully above grade), 30,835 square foot mixed-use building that includes 14,004 square feet of residential area and 4,749 square feet of commercial floor area. Forty-four

parking spaces will be provided by a partially subterranean parking garage. The residential component comprises 26 AUD rental apartments with an average unit size of 539 square feet. The three parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential (28-36 dwelling units per acre). The proposed density on the total of .44 acres will be 60 units per acre, as allowed by the AUD Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 dwelling units per acre). The project includes Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet, and a Development Plan. The Louisa Ygnacio House and duplex at 214 E. De La Guerra will be preserved and renovated. The existing residences are part of the 26 unit count.)

(Review After Final is requested for final details. Final Approval was granted on December 13, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:59 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Laura Bernard, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Katie Klein, CJM::LA

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Public comment reopened at 3:22 p.m.

Ernestine Ygnacio-Desoto spoke with concerns due to water, landscaping, and paving patterns.

Public comment closed at 3:27 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. Awnings need to be dropped below the head of the window.
2. The post on the widows walk should emulate the original corner post.
3. Paving pattern edge should be more natural or evocative of a Chumash pattern.
4. The landscape plan is acceptable, with the condition that the irrigation be maintained for a minimum of three to five years.
5. The fence details need to be corrected.
6. **The Commission made the following findings as required for Landmarks in section 22.22.080 of the Municipal Code:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the Landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Lenvik abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 1202 DIANA RD****RS-6 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
 Application Number: MST2017-00217
 Owner: BLH Properties LLC
 Applicant: Shaun Lynch
 Contractor: Vernon Construction

The project consists of a proposal to subdivide an existing 1.06 acre parcel into four (4) lots in the RS-6, Single Residential Zone and Low Density Residential (Max 5 Dwelling Units/Acre) General Plan designation. The proposed lots vary in size from 9,000 to 15,566 square feet. The proposal includes development of one new primary dwelling unit on three of the four proposed lots, subject to review by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB). Proposed lot three (3) includes an existing one-story residential adobe, subject to review by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC). The existing adobe residence is deemed eligible to be designated a historic resource by the City Urban Historian. The application includes demolition of the "as-built" non-permitted additions, resulting in a 975 square foot residence to remain. An option is included for a new 400 square foot garage. The proposed total of 1,375 square feet, including a two-car garage, located on a 12,648 square foot lot, is 40% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Site improvements for the subdivision include demolition of the existing detached garage and detached accessory buildings, site grading (990 cubic yards of cut and 540 cubic yards of fill), removal/relocation of Oak trees, and paving to create a new shared driveway easement connecting the proposed four lots to Cota Street. The existing driveway to Diana Road will remain. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map (TSM) and includes a request for Street Frontage Modifications and Public Street Waiver. The application will address all violations identified in ENF2017-00868.)

(A. Review of a Phase II Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concluded that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and project impacts would be less than significant (Class III).)

(B. Fourth Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and includes a request for a Public Street Waiver and Street Frontage Modifications. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Shaun Lynch, Designer; and Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project will have a less than significant impact to the Historic Resources and meets the Secretary of Interior Guidelines.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted, omitting page 27 that illustrates the previous proposal.

Action: Grumbine/Mahan, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the reconfigured property lines and finds the current proposal will not cause a negative impact to the Historic Resource.
2. The Commission compliments the applicant on the proposal for the restoration of the Historic Resource.
3. The additions to the Historic Resource are to be subtly differentiated from the original both in plaster and window, however the new addition is to be harmonious with the original.
4. Warning to applicant that a backflow preventer may be required.
5. The Commission appreciates the applicant’s exemplary effort to ensure protection of the Historic Resource.
6. Applicant has modified the plan to the desires of the Historic Landmarks Commission to preserve the alignment of driveway, existing landscaping, and has, by reconfiguration of the lots, minimized any impact on the Historic Resource.
7. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project’s design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. 1000 STEPS (CAMINO AL MAR)

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(4:50)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	045-185-0RW
Application Number:	MST2018-00297
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara Parks & Rec.
Applicant:	George Thomson

(Camino al Mar (1000 Steps) is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal to replace the lower portion of the public beach access stairs located at the end of Santa Cruz Boulevard. The project includes adding nine additional steps to allow for safe access to the beach, replacement of the existing guard-rail at the mid-level landing, addition of handrails from beach to street elevation, and addition of slip-proof tread to all stairs and landings. Project includes Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(A. Review of a Phase I - II Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Camino al Mar possesses sufficient potential historic significance to meet criteria a, d, e, g, and i and Additional Criteria 6 to make it eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit. The report determined that the proposed project to rehabilitate Camino Al Mar meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation provided samples of the final railing and tread types are reviewed and approved by the HLC and project impacts would be Less than Significant (Class III).)

(B. Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 3:54 p.m.

Present: George Thomson, City of Santa Barbara Parks & Rec; and Tim Hazeltine, Post Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the report meets the Secretary of Interior standards, but expressed concerns about the tube railing.

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m.

Bernie Bernstein spoke in support and read correspondence from Teri Jory into the record.

Public comment closed at 4:03 p.m.

Public comment reopened at 4:15 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Je Goolsby
2. Alice San Adres-Callega.
3. Correspondence in support from Elain Daugherty, Jim Malcom, Ellen Schipper, Michael Gott, Jonathan Stein, and Jami Gott were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:21 p.m.

Motion: Accept the Phase I report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Add the project to the Potential Historic Resource list.

Action: Drury/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission supports the restoration of the Historic Resource.
2. As currently proposed, the Commission finds that elements of the proposal have a negative impact on the resource, especially the stair treads, which are non-historic and a non-historic appearing material, creates use hazards, and is not appropriate.
3. Pipe rail at the landing, as indicated in the report, is appropriate to the period but the Commission would prefer a restoration of the original handrail design in concrete and restoration of the redwood pergola as part of this proposal.
4. The Commission is requesting a reconsideration of the details.
5. The Commission recognizes the difficulty of the retrofit.
6. Consideration needs to be made of both loss of cliff edge, erosion, and potential rising water levels.

Action: Veyna/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

8. 1000 STEPS (CAMINO AL MAR)

(5:30) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 045-185-0RW

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Parks & Rec.

(Pursuant to the Municipal Code Section 22.22.030 (D) (3), if the Commission accepts the conclusions of the Historic Structures/Sites Report that the property has the potential for designation as a City Historic Resource, it shall be acted upon by the Commission for listing on the Potential Historic Resources List concurrent with HLC review of the submitted Historic Structures/Sites Report. Consider adding the Camino Al Mar to the City’s Potential Historic Resources List as it was found eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the HLC on July 11, 2018. Once the project has been completed, the HLC will have a hearing for consideration of designation as a Structure of Merit.)

(To add the Camino Al Mar to the City’s Potential Historic Resources List as it is eligible for Structure of Merit designation.)

*** The item was heard concurrently with Item 7 above ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

9. 806 VINE AVE

R-M Zone

(5:35) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-023-009

Application Number: MST2017-00528

Owner: Jack Delano Family Limited Partners

Architect: Keith Rivera

(The residence located at 415 Old Coast Highway is designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal to relocate the historic 1,631 square foot single-unit residence from 415 Old Coast Highway to the lot at 806 Vine Avenue. The project includes constructing a new understory consisting of a 1,096 square foot four-car common garage and 608 square feet of habitable area, resulting in a new cumulative 2,239 square foot single-unit residence. No work is proposed on the existing 1,283 square foot single-unit residence also on the lot. The proposal will involve new associated site paving, landscaping, utilities, and a new 24" inch retaining wall. Project requires a Modification by the Staff Hearing officer for the reduced area of qualifying open yard.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing officer Resolution 025-18. Project was last reviewed on May 30, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:58 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The brackets to not extend beyond the pop-out at a forty-five degree angle..
2. The Commission supports the Design Review Waiver for the front step encroachment, and considers the proposal to be a superior aesthetic since it is consistent with the original porch design.
3. Gratitude to the applicant and owner for the relocation and restoration of this Historic Resource.
4. **The Commission made the following findings as required for Structures of Merit in section 22.22.090 of the Municipal Code:**
 - a. The exterior alterations being made for the purposes of restoring the Structure of Merit to its original appearance, in order to substantially aid its preservation, enhancement, and maintenance as a Historic Resource.
 - b. The Commission has determined that the proposed changes to the Structure of Merit do not constitute a demolition as defined by this Chapter and constitute alterations which are not incompatible with the goal of long-term preservation or enhancement of the Structure as a City Historic Resource.
 - c. The relocation of the Structure of Merit will substantially aid in its long-term preservation or enhancement as a Historic Resource.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:13 P.M. ***