



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
JUNE 13, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine (at 1:32; absent 2:00-2:18 p.m.); Drury, Hausz (at 1:34 p.m.) Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Hernandez (absent from 2:49-3:48 p.m.), Plummer, and Goo

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **May 16, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/2. (Hausz and Veyna abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continuance of Item C, 806 Vine Ave., and Item D, 607 State St., on the Consent Calendar of **May 30, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Orías/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the remaining items of the Consent Calendar of **May 30, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Postponement of Item A, 1020 Chapala St., and Item C, 1114 Garden St., on the Consent Calendar of **June 13, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Orias, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the remaining items of the Consent Calendar of **June 13, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan (Item B, 607 State St.).

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Agenda Item 2, 222 E. Canon Perdido Street has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request, with subsequent time adjustment changes to the remainder of the agenda.

Motion: Postponement of Item 2, 222 E. Canon Perdido Street, with subsequent time adjustment changes to the remainder of the agenda.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Board comment: Chair La Voie requested that a cultural landscape study of the neighborhood be provided when the item returns.

- b. Commissioner Grumbine will be stepping down from Item 3, 2014 Garden Street.
- c. Before starting Item 4, 520 Plaza Rubio, there will be a staff presentation by Senior Planner Danny Kato regarding the Design Review Exceptions.
- d. Commissioner Mahan requested information on a project at 7 E Anapamu Street, regarding the black awning and white exterior of the building. The project was reviewed by the Full Commission on April 6, 2016 and it was indicated in the motion that the black awning color was acceptable, as well that the white of the building. The awning was approved prior to awnings colors being included in the Santa Barbara Color Guide.
- e. Commissioner Mahan requested information on a project at 701 Anacapa Street. Ms. Plummer stated that the building façade color was approved administratively from pink to white in 2014 with colors from the Santa Barbara Color Guide.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced:

- a. Reviewing distributed photographs of the Carrillo Street Bath House, previous approval direction was given to restore the columns to the stoa; however, it was later discovered that the columns had no drip caps under the roof and therefore water leaked in and rusted out the interior of the columns and will have to be reconstructed and replaced. Archival photographs will be taken and measured drawings will be created and the same method, materials, and design will be used to match the original columns and meet the Secretary

of Design Standards. The original wood roof and clay tiles will be salvaged and restored to the building.

- b. The Mission Canyon study to widen the bridge has been funded by City Council. This will return to the Full Commission at a future time, to see if it is possible to keep the bridge with the same appearance; Council has requested more information regarding future safety and accessibility of the bridge.
 - c. At the June 12, 2018 Consent appeal hearing of 428 Chapala Street as a Structure of Merit, Council remanded the Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum of the south wall to the Commission for review at the June 27, 2018 hearing.
 - d. The new Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) Ordinance was passed. All designated historic resources (Only Structures of Merit and Landmarks, but nothing from the Potential's List) will be forwarded to the Urban Historian to ensure they meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards or returned to the applicant for redesign to ensure they are in-line with the Standards as a protection procedure for Historic Resources that previously didn't exist under the State Ordinance.
 - e. The revised Structures Report regarding the Ignacio House addressing the widow's walk to be reconstructed to match a submitted photograph has been resubmitted to the Urban Historian for review at Consent.
3. Commissioner Grumbine announced he will be leaving the meeting at 6:30 p.m.
 4. Commissioner Drury announced that he observed an inappropriately placed signage for "Mission Historical Park" at the corner of Laguna and Los Olivos Streets which has not been reviewed by the Commission.
 5. Commissioner Lenvik reported on a closed "Max's" restaurant on upper State Street that is an inappropriate green color and currently under review by the Architectural Board of Review.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 24 W GUTIERREZ ST**

M-C Zone

(1:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-020
Application Number: MST2017-00303
Owner: Susan Mart Trustee of Susan Budinger Loncki
Applicant: Ryan Jeffrey

(The proposal involves relocation or salvage of historic materials and demolition of the existing one-story house, one-story cottage, and detached three-bay garage, and construction of a new three-story mixed-use building, containing two residential condo units. The ground floor will include approximately 812 square feet of commercial space, a lobby, and a covered parking garage with 5 spaces. The two condo units will be located on the second and third floor of the building. Each unit will contain 3 bedrooms, and the unit size will range between approximately 3,532 and 3,445 square feet.)

(Review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by David Stone, Amec Foster Wheeler.)

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Ryan Jeffrey, Applicant; and David Stone, Agent

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

HLC-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**2. 222 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-G Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-025
 Application Number: MST2018-00250
 Owner: 222 East Canon Perdido St. LLC
 Applicant: Trish Allen

(One-Time Pre-Application Consultation for a new residential project using the Average Unit Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/High Residential (28-36 du/ac). The project will include eight new one-bedroom units ranging in size from 920 to 1,004 square feet, with an average of 975 square feet. The units will be configured as townhomes, stacked above single-car garages and contained in two buildings. The site is currently developed with a three-story 13,183 square foot commercial building and 40 surface parking spaces. The project proposes to provide a total of 34 spaces, eight within single-car garages, 17 spaces within a 3-tier puzzle lift to serve the commercial building, and nine surface parking spaces including two Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) van accessible stalls.)

(Pre-Application Consultation. Comments Only.)

Item postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 2014 GARDEN ST**

RS-15 Zone

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-016
 Application Number: MST2018-00103
 Owner: John & Catherine Moore
 Agent: Serena McClintick
 Applicant: Adele Goggia

(The Mission Revival style residence, constructed in 1894, Crocker Row House #2, is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal for a remodel and site alterations to the single residential unit, including demolition of the existing two-car garage, for a new 745 square foot two-car garage and storage structure. Project involves removal of the sunroom off the second story to be replaced with a first-floor breakfast room, alterations to windows and doors, re-roofing, and improvements to the existing covered porch. Additional site alterations include changing the gravel driveway to permeable pavers, changes to hardscape and landscape, removal of 10 non-specimen trees, and relocation of two fruit trees. This project will address Building Violation BLD2016-02590 by removal of the existing fountain from the rear yard. The proposed total of 4,154 square feet on a 13,900 square foot lot is 99% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings are required. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2018.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Grumbine recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design, Architect and Agent for Owners; Serena McClintick, Designer, Harrison Design; and Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.

Correspondence with concerns from Bronwen L. Jones was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:12 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission greatly appreciates the restoration efforts made by the applicant.
2. The Commission makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project’s consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; protection of public health, safety, and welfare; compliance with good neighborhood guidelines; and preservation of public views.
3. The design is appropriate to both the guidelines and the specific resource.
4. The Commission supports the proposed landscape plan and the rear east wall at the property line.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/1. (Grumbine absent, Hausz abstained) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 520 PLAZA RUBIO

RS-15 Zone

(3:05) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-281-003
 Application Number: MST2018-00109
 Owner: Peter & Molly Sorensen

(This residence is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit as a contributing structure in the Potential Mission Gardens Historic District. Proposal for a new air conditioning unit to be located 4'-1" from the interior property line.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Design Review Waiver is required.)

Actual time: 2:18 p.m.

Present: Danny Kato, Senior Planner; and Molly Sorensen, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

- 1. A Design Review Exception for the AC unit is acceptable as the encroachment has a negligible impact, there are site constraints, and the location is a superior aesthetic.

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:38 TO 2:44 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

5. 402 PLAZA RUBIO

RS-15 Zone

(3:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-001
 Application Number: MST2017-00354
 Owner: Evan B. Jones Living Trust

(This is a revised project description. The Spanish Colonial residence constructed in 1925 by Mary Craig is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to replace an aluminum garage door with two 7'9" wood carriage doors and jalousie window with window to match original. Project includes adding an air conditioning unit 3'5" from the property line at the southwest side of the residence, behind an existing site wall.)

(Review After Final is requested for a condenser unit to be located 3'5" from the property line. Design Review Waiver is required.)

Actual time: 2:44 p.m.

Present: Jacob Niksto and Morgan Saurio, Becker Hensen Niksto Architects ; and Danny Kato, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

- 1. A Design Review Exception for the AC unit is acceptable due to site constraints, as the location abuts a street, is a superior aesthetic to the historic resource, and there are no negative impacts to the resource or the neighborhood.

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:49 TO 2:53 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 9 W FIGUEROA STREET**

C-G Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
 Application Number: MST2018-00248
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to close off the existing Lot 3 pedestrian paseo and relocate the paseo west, adjacent to the existing vehicular entrance to Lot 3. The current paseo would be blocked off by installing decorative walls with operable gates at the north and south points of entry. The existing eight columns within the current paseo are proposed to be removed, lighting upgraded, and an above ground transformer installed by Southern California Edison (SCE). The project would direct pedestrian traffic to a new walkway which would connect to a new mid-block crossing between Lot 3 and the north side of Figueroa Street.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Heather Beck, Project Planner, Transportation Planning; Victor Garza, Downtown Parking Superintendent; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

Correspondence with concerns from Charles Valle was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 3:23 p.m.,

Lisa Eckerstrom Pergante spoke with concerns regarding the open iron-gate.

Public comment closed at 3:26 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission reluctantly agrees to the abandonment of the paseo, but wishes to see some amelioration of the loss with a pocket park.
2. The wrought iron proposed must comply and be appropriate to the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Design Guidelines.
3. Restudy the walkway adjacent to the parkway to be redesigned for more user interest, with a pergola, fountain, and seating.
4. Provide more modulation of the path and widening of the landscape area.
5. Careful consideration of the turn into the parking lot from both east and west.
6. The Commission supports the connection between the two parking lots, and suggests the path across the street be paved in brick, preferably to match the brick found on State Street.
7. The Commission supports the removal of the columns in the existing paseo, however the use of columns or gate elements at the end of the paseo is supportable.
8. To locate the proposed gate south of the existing large window at the paseo.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Commission comment: Commissioner Hausz could not support the closing off of the paseo.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

7. 111 E ARRELLAGA ST

O-R Zone

(4:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-191-006
 Application Number: MST2018-00242
 Owner: Folk Inn Santa Barbara LLC
 Applicant: Dana Severy
 Architect: DMHA

(The Craftsman style building constructed in 1906 is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal to convert an existing 4,688 square foot mixed-use building into a bed and breakfast. Project includes an interior remodel for seven suites, as well as minor exterior improvements to the building with new dormers and skylights on the roof, and replacement of two non-original second floor windows on the street façade. Also proposed is a new 1,167 square foot sandstone hardscaped terrace and entry stair with landscaping, a plunge pool with lounge area and trellis at the rear of the property, site upgrades to meet Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements, and new on-site parking with 10 standard spaces, and one ADA van space. Project requires review by Planning Commission for a Conditional Use Permit.)

(Concept Review; Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission for a Conditional Use Permit.)

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Edward DeVicente, Architect, DMHA Architects; Dana Severy, Applicant; and Paul Hoyle, Agent for Owner, H. Parker Hospitality

Public comment opened at 4:02 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. Restudy the location of the dormers to be more traditional, setback from the perimeter wall.
2. The abandonment of later edition windows, particularly aluminum and/or the restoration of the windows appropriate to the period of the building is supported.
3. Include additional landscaping to the parking lot area.
4. A more careful examination and reduced size of the front terrace for a more formal shape.
5. Suggest correspondence with Building and Safety early on regarding accessibility requirements.
6. Confirm that gravel parking lots are acceptable with Public Works as there is concern with gravel in gutters.
7. Clarify the location of the trash enclosure.
8. Retention of the historic sandstone walls to the extent possible.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:23 TO 4:28 P.M. ***

* Item re-opened at (4:28) p.m. *

The motion was amended to the following:

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. Restudy the location of the dormers to be more traditional, setback from the perimeter wall.
2. The abandonment of later edition windows, particularly aluminum and/or the restoration of the windows appropriate to the period of the building is supported.
3. Include additional landscaping to the parking lot area.
4. A more careful examination and reduced size of the front terrace for a more formal shape.
5. Suggest correspondence with Building and Safety early on regarding accessibility requirements.
6. Confirm that gravel parking lots are acceptable with Public Works as there is concern with gravel in gutters.
7. Clarify the location of the trash enclosure.
8. Retention of the historic sandstone walls to the extent possible.
9. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project complies with all City Regulations and is consistent with the design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the proposed development is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk and scale of the project are appropriate for its neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks and other nearby historic resources.
 - e. Public views of the ocean and mountains are not affected.
 - f. The use of open space and landscaping is appropriate.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 111 E ARRELLAGA ST

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-191-006
 Owner: Glyn Davies

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Craftsman style house constructed in 1906 located at 111 East Arrellaga Street.)

(Adopt Resolution 2018-57 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Craftsman style house located at 111 East Arrellaga Street.)

Actual time: 4:30 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that designation as a Structure of Merit will qualify this property to make the conversion to a Bed & Breakfast. The building qualifies as a Structure of Merit under three criterion in the municipal code. Ms. Hernandez outlined the criterion under which the building qualifies.

Present: Glyn Davies, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2018-57 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Craftsman style house located at 111 East Arrellaga Street.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

9. 29 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	033-112-006
Application Number:	MST2017-00543
Owner:	Hannah Beachfront, LLC
Architect:	Henry Lenny

(Proposal for tenant improvements for a new café consisting of exterior and interior alterations to an existing commercial building located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project proposes a remodel of the building façades that includes changes to the building articulation, windows, doors, lighting, and finish details. It proposes a new attached trash enclosure at the west elevation off Helena Street and the creation of an outdoor dining area facing Cabrillo Boulevard, including landscaping.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on April 18, 2018.)

Actual time: 4:33 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio; Edward DeVicente, Architect, DMHA Architects; Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; and Ted Ellis, Agent

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the glass wall as proposed? 1/7 Failed
 Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the wood fence as proposed? 2/6 Failed
 Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the use of a stucco wall? 8/0 Passed
 Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a glass wall with a different support system? 1/7 Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval as submitted, excluding the glass wall enclosure, and continued two weeks to the Full Commission.

Action: LaVoie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**10. 418 STATE ST**

M-C Zone

(5:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024
Application Number: MST2017-00044
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
Agent: Kevin Moore

(Proposal includes a lot tie between 418 and 416 State Street with interior and exterior improvements to occur at both parcels. Site improvements at 418 State Street include a remodel of the front façade, new flooring at the rear to become outdoor dining, and interior improvements. The existing detached storage structure behind 416 State Street will be remodeled to become a kitchen and storage space with exterior improvements to include new windows and doors. The existing parking lot will be adjusted to provide 4 uncovered parking spaces including an Americans with Disabilities Act parking space, a new trash enclosure, and bike parking. The site is within the 50% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Review After Final is requested for improvements to the State Street façade, including changes to the arch openings and pillars. Project was last reviewed on May 2, 2018.)

Actual time: 5:20 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final and continued two weeks Consent for the final working drawings.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:27 P.M. ***