



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

APRIL 4, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 2:10 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (absent 2:41-3:37 p.m.), Grumbine (until 6:07 p.m.), Drury, Hausz (absent 3:49-4:14 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Orías (absent 3:37-6:07 p.m.), and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Chair La Voie acknowledged a petition received from Roseanne Crawford with multiple signers titled "Help Us Save the Historic Mission Canyon Creek Bridge."

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **March 21, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/2. (La Voie abstained. Orías abstained from Items 6-8.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continue Item G to the Full Commission.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 4, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. There will be a joint City Council-Planning Commission meeting on April 13 at 9:00 a.m. at 630 Garden Street. Commissioners are welcome to attend.
 - b. Item 10, 1732 Chapala Street, is postponed at the applicant's request.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. The California Preservation Conference will be held May 17-20 at Stanford University. Any Commissioners interested in attending should let her know.
 - b. The "Santa Barbara Colors Guide" has been printed and is available for use.
3. Commissioner Hausz announced the following:
 - a. He will step out of the meeting at 4:00 p.m.
 - b. Tomorrow, on April 5, illustrations from the "Coloring Santa Barbara" coloring book produced by the Santa Barbara Conservancy will be shown at the Channing Peake Gallery.
4. Commissioner Grumbine announced he will leave the meeting early.
5. Chair La Voie announced that he will step down on Item 3, 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard, as he has provided professional advice to a potential partner in the project.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Orías reported on the Five-Year Historic Resources Work Program subcommittee meeting of March 22.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. 1325 STATE ST

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-017

Owner: Almond Holdings, LLC

(Add the postwar interpretation of the Spanish Colonial Revival/Mediterranean style building designed by Soule and Murphy in 1946 to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found to be eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report reviewed by the HLC on March 21, 2018. The building will be added to the next round of designations as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:37 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked for clarification of the boundaries of the historic building.

Public comment closed at 2:38 p.m.

Motion: Add the structure located at 1325 State Street to the City's Potential Historic Resources List.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 806 VINE AVE

R-M Zone

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-023-009
Application Number:	MST2017-00528
Owner:	Jack Delano Family Limited Partners
Architect:	Keith Rivera

(The residence located at 415 Old Coast Highway is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit. Proposal to relocate the historic 1,631 square foot single-unit residence from 415 Old Coast Highway to the lot at 806 Vine Avenue. The project includes constructing a new understory consisting of a 1,096 square foot four-car common garage and 608 square feet of habitable area, resulting in a new cumulative 2,239 square foot single-unit residence. No work is proposed on the existing 1,283 square foot single-unit residence also on the lot. The proposal will involve new associated site paving, landscaping, utilities, and a new 24" inch retaining wall. Project requires a Modification by the Staff Hearing Officer for the reduced area of qualifying open yard.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Amec Foster Wheeler.)

Actual time: 2:38 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeological Consultant, Amec Foster Wheeler

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:39 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with comment that the lower floorplan be included in the report.

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone**

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00284
 Owner: American Tradition, LLC
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Robert Glazier

(Proposal for a 56 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two- and three-story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 88,000 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot Site.)

(Seventh Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Substantial Conformance Determination will be made by the Community Development Director. Project was last reviewed on October 18, 2017.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Chair La Voie recused himself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 2:41 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent; Bob Glazier, Architect, Hill Glazier Architects; and Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project has not yet gone to Planning Commission. The purpose of this review is for additional feedback to get the proposal as close to Project Design Approval as possible.

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked how the buildings will be seen from Cabrillo Boulevard and Calle Cesar Chavez, if they will have a presence or will be hidden.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. This is a beautiful project and is in very good hands.
2. The Commission carries forward its previous finding that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria have generally been met.
3. The computer drawings should be more in line with the renderings.

4. Show property line walls and perspectives from Cabrillo Boulevard and Calle Cesar Chavez.
5. Develop the landscaping throughout to tie more into the Andalusian or Spanish Colonial Revival style.
6. Restudy a new tree in the center of the entry court instead of the ficus.
7. Provide more variety of palm trees.
8. The fountain needs to better fit the Andalusian or Spanish Colonial Revival style.
9. Reduce the variety of columns.
10. The new entry building is acceptable, and the Commission looks forward to seeing it in perspective.
11. The Commission likes the broken-up trellises.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 226 E ANAPAMU ST

O-R Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	029-162-006
Application Number:	MST2017-00092
Owner:	Barranca Enterprises, Inc.
Architect:	DesignARC

(Project site contains twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes constructed in 1905 that are eligible to be designated as Structures of Merit. Proposal for a new mixed-use apartment/commercial structure using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project includes a voluntary lot merger of eight parcels (APNs 029-162-006, 029-162-007, 029-162-008, 029-162-009, 029-162-010, 029-162-012, 029-162-020, 029-162-021). The proposal includes demolishing all existing improvements, except the twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes, which will be relocated to the Garden Street frontage, and constructing a new four-story mixed-use building. The unit mix will be 24 one-bedroom apartments, 22 two-bedroom apartments, and 6 three-bedroom apartments, for a total of 52 residential units, with an average unit size of 802 square feet per unit. Approximately 6,084 square feet of commercial space is proposed. The project includes 72 parking spaces provided in a new 11,545 square foot basement parking garage, and 52 bike parking spaces. The project site is designated office/High Density within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). A Historic Structures/Sites Report will be required to evaluate all structures on the site and to evaluate the impacts of the proposed project on the potential historic resources. Project also requires concept review by Planning Commission.)

(A. Review of a Cultural Landscape Study prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The Cultural Landscape Study did not identify a substantially intact cultural landscape covering the entire study area; however, clusters of substantially intact resources were identified that have a direct association with the late 19th and early 20th century settlement of the Laguna neighborhood and contribute substantially to the neighborhood's streetscape. The Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra Cole concluded that cottages 228 and 230 East Anapamu Street, and 223A, 223B, 223D, and 223F East Figueroa Street are considered eligible for listing as Structures of Merit. Cottage 226 East Anapamu Street, building at 232 East Anapamu Street, and cottages 1117 and 1121 Garden Street and 223C, E, G, and H East Figueroa Street are not considered significant. The report was last reviewed on August 23, 2017. Staff will note

on all the parcels of the properties found significant in the reports that are not on the subject parcel that they are eligible to be designated historic resources and will notify the owners.)

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Commissioner Orías recused herself from hearing this item.

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Pamela Post, and Tim Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez clarified that both the Cultural Landscape Study and Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR) are being reviewed today. If properties are found significant in an HSSR accepted by the HLC, they must be added to the Potential Historic Resources List. If the HLC accepts the report, properties owned by the applicant can be added today. However, for other properties identified as significant, the City will need to send a 60-day notice to the owners. The next step would be a Phase 2 HSSR on the impacts of the project on all historic resources identified. Based on those conclusions, a California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) exemption or necessity for an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) will be determined.

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest thanked the preparers of the Cultural Landscape Study for a very thorough report. To adhere to new state laws related to intensification of use, we are going to have to lose this intimate block. It is up to Commission to decide what to save.
2. Steve Hoegerman, owner of 223D & 223F E. Figueroa Street, stated that the historical low-rise livability of this block should be preserved, particularly the bungalow court. Do not save just clusters and individual historic houses, but the whole. We need more time to examine the report and get neighbors involved.
3. Nancy Weiss, neighbor, stated that the Cultural Landscape Study contains a lot of good information and speaks to a critical issue of how we want this neighborhood to look over the next 50 years. She requested that the HLC consider the report gradually and allow for more community engagement. She commented that based on the report, an EIR for the project seems warranted.

Public comment closed at 3:56 p.m.

Motion: Accept the Cultural Landscape Study and the Historic Structures Report as submitted.

Action: Grumbine/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:23 TO 4:35 P.M. ***

(B. Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission. Project design was last reviewed on April 19, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:35 p.m.

Present: Greg Reitz, Developer, Rethink Development; and Mark Shields and Melisa Turner, DesignARC

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Steve Harrel, neighbor

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Nancy Weiss, neighbor, stated that it would be better to preserve all the bungalows in the court. She asked that the HLC consider the impact on views and stated that the bulk and scale are still large; the Queen Anne buildings will be dwarfed and out of sync with the size and style of the new building. She also emphasized the importance of story poles.
2. Josephine DiLoreto reiterated Ms. Weiss' comments and opposes demolishing any of the bungalows.
3. Steve Hoegerman stated that this is a mostly residential area, and that the existence of buildings of similar bulk and scale in the area does mitigate adding another. He also spoke in favor of story poles.

Public comment closed at 5:03 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners support a more Craftsman expression of the terminus to the motor court as opposed to a Spanish Colonial Revival expression?
7/0 Passed

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The majority of the Commission does not support the size, bulk, and scale, and cannot make findings for neighborhood compatibility.
2. The building and architecture need to be simplified to be more residential in scale and expression.
3. The building footprint should be modulated to accommodate tall trees, with sustainable root structure, to mitigate the building mass.
4. The massing of the building at the corner needs to be modulated to be more residential in expression.
5. The Commission opposes the fourth story on the commercial corner and also opposes a reintroduction of a fourth floor of residential development in the proposal.
6. The majority of the Commission would like to see story poles eventually, unless the building is drastically reduced.
7. The Commission would like to see the pedestrian perspective from the sidewalk across the street (i.e., five-foot eye-level perspective of the building along Garden and Anapamu Streets).
8. Give consideration to reducing the width of the loading archway.
9. The Commission supports a more Craftsman expression of the terminus of the motor court as opposed to a Spanish Colonial Revival expression.
10. The garage entrance off Garden Street is supportable.
11. The 3-D model and neighborhood graphics provided were helpful in understanding the project.
12. Return with a further 3-D massing model.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

5. 228 E ANAPAMU ST

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-007
Owner: Figamu, LLC

(Add the Queen Anne Free Classic house constructed in 1905 to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found to be eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the HLC on April 4, 2018. Once the project has been completed, the building will have a hearing for designation as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 6:07 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:07 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Add the structure located at 228 East Anapamu Street to the City's Potential Historic Resources List.

Action: Mahan/Lenvik, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

6. 230 E ANAPAMU ST

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-008
Owner: Figamu, LLC

(Add the Queen Anne Free Classic house constructed in 1905 to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found to be eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the HLC on April 4, 2018. Once the project has been completed, the building will have a hearing for designation as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 6:08 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Add the structure located at 230 East Anapamu Street to the City's Potential Historic Resources List.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTIONS OF INTENTION

7. 223D & 223F EAST FIGUEROA ST

(4:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-023, -019

Owner: Steve Hoegerman

(At the owner's request, the Commission is requested to adopt Resolutions of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 18, 2018 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the vernacular cottages constructed in constructed in 1925 and 1916 located at 223D and 223F East Figueroa Street as part of a bungalow court.)

Actual time: 6:09 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:09 p.m.

Steve Hoegerman, owner, stated that he is requesting the Structure of Merit designation because he loves his cottages and wants them kept intact, and because the designation is a tool to continue to talk about the cultural landscape and context of the bungalow court.

Public comment closed at 6:11 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolutions of Intention 2018-5 and 2018-6 to hold a Public Hearing on April 18, 2018 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the cottages in the bungalow court located at 223D and 223F East Figueroa Street.

Action: Mahan/Lenvik, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

8. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/S-D-3 Zone

(4:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-102-018
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Business Name: Entrada De Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, formerly Entrada de Santa Barbara, now Hotel Californian, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area, and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(Review After Final is requested for the finalized gobo design patterns to the light pattern projections on the Area C façade located on the northeast corner of State Street and Mason Street. Project was last reviewed on February 7, 2018.)

Actual time: 6:12 p.m.

Present: Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates

Public comment opened at 6:22 p.m.

Correspondence in opposition from Virginia Rehling was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:23 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with comments:

1. The garage elevation is to be lit with four projectors, using the 71045 and 82836 gobos.
2. The café elevation is to be lit with three projectors, using the Henna and 82836 gobos.
3. All lighting is to be controlled by a dimmer.
4. This approval is limited for use on Friday, Saturday, and Sunday nights, and lights are to be turned off by 2 a.m.
5. This approval is valid for one year.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 5/2/0. (La Voie and Mahan opposed. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 701 ANACAPA ST

C-G Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-010
 Application Number: MST2018-00037
 Owner: Roy W. Yeabsley Living Trust
 Architect: Kevin Moore

(This building is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, Livingston Arts and Crafts Center, Plunkett design. Proposal for shell and core improvements, including replacement of two existing windows, infilling the wall on the east elevation, and adding a new folding window system and bar-top. Project includes repairing existing pavers, and adding a new fountain at the east side of the building.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on March 21, 2018.)

Actual time: 6:38 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect; and Barrett Reed, Owner

Public comment opened at 6:50 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:
 1. This approval does not include outdoor furniture, heating, lighting, or umbrellas.
 2. The Commission thanked the applicant for responding to the Commission's concerns in an artful way.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**10. 1732 CHAPALA ST****R-MH Zone**

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-001
Application Number: MST2017-00781
Owner: Daniel Mark Heckman
Applicant: Craig Shallenberger

(The Craftsman style triplex building constructed in 1913 is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions to develop a four-unit residential project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolishing the detached 612 square foot three-car garage and constructing approximately 870 square feet of garages, with an approximately 665 square foot second floor studio unit above. The residential units will be located in the existing triplex and in the studio unit, with an average unit size of 565 square feet. The proposed density on the 7,509 square foot parcel will be 27 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium High Density Residential of 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Additional site improvements include removing over-height fencing and hedges, and constructing a 116 square foot laundry room and 74 square foot mechanical room attached to the new garage structure. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback, and for the reduced area of qualifying open yard. Project was last reviewed on February 7, 2018.)

Motion: Postpone the item.
Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:00 P.M. ***