



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES MARCH 7, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine, Drury, Hausz (until 5:32 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: Orías

Staff present: Unzueta (1:43-3:54 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **February 21, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 5/0/2. (Grumbine abstained. Lenvik abstained from Item 8. Orías absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continue Items B, E, F, G.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 7, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Drury/Lenvik, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Commissioner Orías is absent from today's meeting.
 - b. Item 5, 813 Anacapa Street, is postponed, and Item 6, 701 Anacapa Street, will be heard in its place.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. The City Landmark recommendations from the HLC were heard at the City Council meeting of March 6. The La Arcada designation was tabled while staff seeks the owner's consent.
 - b. City Council considered alternatives for the Franceschi House at its meeting on February 13 and directed the Parks and Recreation Department to pursue the demolition of the structure and construction of a pavilion. The HLC will review the project when it occurs.
 - c. The Pepper tree at City Hall, a City Landmark tree, has a cracked branch that has been addressed.
 - d. The Cabrillo Pavilion restoration project is underway. About 20% of the roof tiles are able to be salvaged. The new tile has been matched with the original. The salvaged tile will all be placed on the front gable for visibility. Also, all the windows will be replaced, which was on the plans the HLC approved but not in the Historic Structures Report. Ms. Hernandez asked that the report be revised to include the windows, and she will ensure they match the originals.
 - e. The Montecito Street Bridge project begins construction in April. Ms. Hernandez has reviewed the masonry contractor's qualifications and the deconstruction plan to ensure the preservation of the historic stones. The project will return to the HLC for review of a commemorative plaque.
3. Commissioner Hausz announced the following:
 - a. He will leave the meeting at 5:30 p.m.
 - b. He recommended that the HLC convey support to Council for a proposal to widen the sidewalks at the State Street undercrossing.
4. Commissioner Grumbine announced that the scanning company OGO has offered to do a complete scan of the Franceschi House before it is demolished for a digital archive.
5. Commissioner Mahan stated that he saw construction work taking place at 200 E. Anapamu Street, which will be returning to the HLC for a proposed pergola, and he expressed concern that the form of the roof is being changed.

Ms. Hernandez responded that the roof is only being resurfaced.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Drury reported on two meetings of the Cabrillo Roundabout subcommittee.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 3014 PASEO DEL REFUGIO****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-201-011

Owner: Nancy Tuomey

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1927 located at 3014 Paseo Del Refugio.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if there is any indication that this is a plan house with a design from a magazine; he also asked, since this is a tract house, if all houses in the tract are to be designated.

Public comment closed at 1:51 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Lenvik stated that this is a poor direction to take for this house; there are better examples in the San Roque neighborhood that may warrant identification as Structures of Merit. If we decide that this is a good enough piece of architecture to designate, then it will be a model for architects to follow, and its only redeeming values are that it is plaster and white. We need to look carefully at the definitions of "exemplify" and "embody" when examining architectural style.
2. Commissioner Mahan stated that this neighborhood is important and perhaps should be designated in some way, but this particular house does not rise to the level of the Spanish Colonial Revival style.
3. Commissioner La Voie suggested a brief paragraph in the Staff Report of how the house contributes to the character of the neighborhood and a potential historic district.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2018-3 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Spanish Colonial Revival style house located at 3014 Paseo Del Refugio.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 5/2/0. (Lenvik and Mahan opposed. Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 3014 PASEO DEL REFUGIO****RS-7.5 Zone****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-201-011
 Application Number: MST2018-00044
 Owner: Nancy Tuomey
 Architect: Jonathan Villegas

(The Spanish Colonial Revival residence, constructed in 1927, is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal for a 1,345 square foot addition and interior remodel to the one-story, single-unit residence. The existing 476 square foot detached garage is proposed to be demolished and will be replaced with a new detached accessory building, consisting of a two-car garage and second floor Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU); per state legislation (AB 2299 and SB 1069), the ADU is exempt from Design Review and the FAR calculation. Other improvements include a new trellis, outdoor fireplace, new ribbon driveway, and alterations to the front façade and entry patio. The proposed total of 2,748 square feet of development on an 8,959 square foot lot is 80% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 21, 2018.)

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Architect; and Nancy Tuomey, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:12 p.m.

Bruce McIver, adjacent neighbor, spoke with concern about the property lines between this house and his house, stating that the surveyor's interpretation of the lot lines is different from the original surveyor's for the neighborhood; that should be taken into consideration when a fence is built. Setbacks should be clarified and fairly observed. He also commented that this is a nice design, and he is glad it isn't two stories.

Public comment closed at 2:18 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue to Consent with comments:

1. Verify the property line location and have the surveyor stake it in the field with an official marker.
2. Reorient the front steps to be more direct from the street to the entry.
3. Perhaps use stucco walls rather than iron at the entry steps.
4. Some type of closure of the deck area from the entry area was suggested, such as a gate.
5. Omit the overhang in the middle of the garage where the upper bay is.
6. Finesse the cyma profile in the proposed elevations.
7. The Commission makes the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, with positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance; neighborhood compatibility; quality of architecture and materials; landscaping; protection of public health, safety, and welfare; compliance with good neighborhood guidelines; and preservation of public views.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:35 TO 2:43 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 1700 BLK E CABRILLO BLVD 1693 SEG ID

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-693
 Application Number: MST2017-00526
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(The City of Santa Barbara and the Santa Barbara County Association of Governments (SBCAG) are proposing the Pedestrian and Bicycle Improvements on East Cabrillo Boulevard and Union Pacific Railroad Bridge Replacement Project (Project). The Project would create a safe corridor along East Cabrillo Boulevard for pedestrians and bicyclists through the creation of a new multi-use path, bike lanes, and new sidewalks, thus eliminating a quarter mile infrastructure gap that would allow access and connectivity to and from the coastal recreational areas and to the commercial areas along Los Patos Way and Coast Village Road. To accommodate the new pedestrian and bicycle facilities and standard vehicular lane widths, the existing narrow Union Pacific Railroad Bridge would need to be replaced with a new bridge over the widened roadway. Intersection operations would also be improved with a proposed dedicated right turn lane on northbound Cabrillo Boulevard for the proposed southbound onramp onto Highway 101. There would be a reduction in traffic congestion and improved mobility with the proposed construction of a roundabout at the intersection of East Cabrillo Boulevard and Los Patos Way. The Project requires design review and approval by the Historic Landmarks Commission, a Coastal Development Permit by the Planning Commission, and Parks and Recreation Commission review and approval for the removal of 7 Mexican fan palm trees in the City right of way. Environmental Review will also be conducted.)

(A. Review of the Memorandum evaluating the Historic Resources Evaluation Report prepared by Sharon Carmack, Rincon Consultants, Inc. The Memorandum evaluating the Historic Resources Evaluation Report with the City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological and Historic Structures and Sites concluded that the East Cabrillo Boulevard Historic District is eligible to be designated a City Landmark. The report found the proposed project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and would not result in an adverse effect to the historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:43 p.m.

Present: James Faber, Project Manager, Ty Lin International; David Black, Landscape Architect; Shannon Carmack, Architectural Historian, Rincon Consultants, Inc.; Alex Ubaldo, Project Engineer and Stephanie Diaz, Contract Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project will not have a negative impact to the district. She also agrees that it qualifies as a Landmark district, and with this updated documentation of its significance, the Commission can move forward with designation in the next round of City Landmarks.

Public comment opened at 2:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest objected to a roundabout at this location.

Public comment closed at 2:49 p.m.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

(B. Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on January 24, 2018.)

Actual time: 2:56 p.m.

Present: James Faber, Project Manager, Ty Lin International; David Black, Landscape Architect; Alex Ubaldo, Project Engineer and Stephanie Diaz, Contract Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the historical function of the roadway that runs along the cemetery wall. He also expressed concern about the proposed un-landscaped surfaces.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the considerable amount of effort in the design and the accommodation of the Commission's wishes, and considers the design sufficiently appropriate to the resource to receive Project Design Approval at a future date, with the conditions as follows.
2. There should be some landscaping, such as trees, in the widest portion of the traffic median from the railroad bridge, with sufficient buffer space of rock and cobble as indicated for safety.
3. The location of the trolley stop, specifically that on Los Patos Way, and any bus stop should be carefully considered and coordinated to pedestrian circulation and use areas.
4. The entrance to the cemetery should be more simple; eliminate the pointed shape on the east side.
5. The steel and stone bridge design is generally acceptable, with the request that the steel be a uniform color, either rust or black, and that the stone walls at the bridge and the new stone walls be battered with a stone veneer.
6. Frame the pedestrian view of the fountain as it comes out of the border with the cemetery.
7. The use of boulders in the roundabout and in the median is appropriate, with a variety of boulder sizes.
8. The light fixture as proposed is acceptable. The lighting standard height of 20 feet is acceptable.
9. The stones in all the walls are to be an irregular shape.
10. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project follows the design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.

- b. The design of the project is consistent with the architectural character of the City and the cultural landscape.
- c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the bridge and other elements are appropriate to the location.
- d. The adjacent historic resources are protected, and the project is sensitive to them.
- e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/1/0. (Grumbine opposed. Orías absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Grumbine could not support the bridge design.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:15 TO 4:23 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 2932 HERMOSA RD

RS-7.5/USS Zone

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-194-017
 Application Number: MST2017-00668
 Owner: 2932 Hermosa Rd, LP
 Architect: James Mayo Macari
 Contractor: Jacobsen Builders

(The Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, constructed in 1924, is eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions and alterations to the single-unit residence, including changes to the front façade and roofline. Project involves adding a new entry foyer, removing and adding a fireplace, addition of a 34 square foot kit patio, and reconfiguration of the non-conforming one-car garage. The proposed total of 2,152 square feet on a 7,358 square foot lot is 71% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(A. Review of the Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Roy Harthorn. The report concluded that the house at 2932 Hermosa Road constructed in 1924 meets significance criteria to qualify as a Structure of Merit and is also a significant historic resource for the purposes of California Environmental Quality Act review.)

Actual time: 4:23 p.m.

Present: James Macari, Architect; Ray Harthorn, Historian; Fermina Murray, Historian; and Mark Jacobsen, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the project came to her attention due to its location in the Demolition Review Area. The original project proposed to demolish the front of the building, so Ms. Hernandez requested a Historic Structures/Sites Report. Subsequently, the exterior walls were removed without permits. The report evaluates the building prior to this work. Ms. Hernandez agrees with the conclusions of the report and suggested the property be placed on the Potential Historic Resources List, if the Commission accepts the report, for designation consideration after the project is complete.

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

*** The motion was tabled until after the concept review. ***

Motion: Continue the report indefinitely with comments:

1. Provide an analysis of integrity and an analysis of how the proposed design meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Reconstruction of a historic resource.
2. Identify additions, when they happened, and whether they are contributing elements.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

(B. Miscellaneous Action Item. Pursuant to the Municipal Code Section 22.22.030 (D) (3), if the Commission accepts the conclusions of the Historic Structures/Sites Report that the property has the potential for designation as a City Historic Resource, it shall be acted upon by the Commission for listing on the Potential Historic Resources List concurrent with HLC review of the submitted Historic Structures/Sites Report. Consider adding the Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1924 to the City’s Potential Historic Resources List as it was found eligible to be designated a Historic Resource in the Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the HLC on March 7, 2018. Once the project has been completed, the building will have a hearing for consideration of designation as a Structure of Merit.)

(C. Concept Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 4:57 p.m.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if the house as it exists now meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Reconstruction, or if it has changed so much that it is a new project.

Public comment closed at 5:04 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely the B and C portions of this review.

Action: Hausz/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 813 ANACAPA ST

C-G Zone

(4:45)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	037-052-033
Application Number:	MST2018-00075
Owner:	Sima El Paseo, LP
Applicant:	Leland Walmsley

(El Paseo is a designated City Landmark. Proposal for site work and landscaping improvements, including reconstructing a previously removed steel trellis. Project includes hardscape alterations to non-original flagstone paving for new planting areas, existing terracotta pots to be replaced with new decorative pottery, and adding two additional trees and a decorative tree grate.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Motion: Postpone the item.

Action: Hausz/Grumbine, 7/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

6. 701 ANACAPA ST

C-G Zone

(5:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-010
 Application Number: MST2018-00037
 Owner: Roy W. Yeabsley Living Trust
 Architect: Kevin Moore

(This building is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List: "Livingston Arts and Crafts Center," Plunkett design. Proposal for shell and core improvements, including replacement of two existing windows, infilling the wall on the east elevation, and adding a new folding window system and bar-top. Project includes repairing existing pavers, and adding a new fountain at the east side of the building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:19 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission welcomes the restoration and revitalization of this building.
2. All design elements added to this building need to be in the spirit of Plunkett's work.
3. There is a preference for retaining the proportion of window to bulkhead.
4. There is a concern about the bar counter in its design, height, and detailing.
5. The ironwork should match the building and the style of Plunkett.
6. Reconsider a new paving material of the quality of a Plunkett building, specifically terra-cotta.
7. The Commission would like to see the original drawings.
8. The Commission encourages the use of the fountain, particularly at the entrance element.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (Hausz and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:53 P.M. ***