



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES FEBRUARY 7, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Anthony Grumbine, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Grumbine (at 1:33 p.m.), Drury, Hausz (until 6:01 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (from 1:38-2:44 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 24, 2018**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/2. (Drury and Orías abstained. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **February 7, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Hausz abstained on Item B. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. At the Commission's request, the approved plans for 530 Chapala Street, the Dal Pozzo building, are available to review during recess. The HLC approved the project in 2015, and approved a Review After Final in 2016. Ms. Hernandez added that she and Jaime Limón completed a final inspection to ensure all items matched the HLC approved plans and noted items to correct prior to the final Certificate of Occupancy being issued.
- b. At the Commission's request, Ms. Plummer explained the status of both project applications for 800 Santa Barbara Street. For the condo project, the Planning Commission (PC) was the deciding body and approved a tentative subdivision map and development plan; this approval was appealed to City Council and upheld. The condo project still requires Project Design Approval and Final Approval by the HLC, which will also be appealable to Council. For the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) project, the HLC is the deciding body and granted Project Design Approval; PC provided comments only. This approval was appealed to Council and upheld two weeks ago.
- c. At the Chair's request, there will be a purview and meeting procedures discussion item in March.
- d. In response to an inquiry by Commissioner Orías about the status of the project at 1202 Diana Road, Ms. Plummer stated that the project will be reviewed by both HLC (for the existing adobe building on site) and the Single Family Design Board (for the proposed new development). It will return to HLC with a Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR). Ms. Hernandez added that the HSSR will evaluate the proposed new development for compatibility with the adobe structure.

2. Ms. Unzueta discussed the status of the Historic Structures Ordinance. Assistant City Attorney Scott Vincent is currently working on the Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) Ordinance, which is expected to go to Council in April. Mr. Vincent is aware of the importance of the Historic Structures Ordinance and expects to resume work on it after April.

3. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:

- a. Tim Downey, the Urban Forest Superintendent, has reported that a 50-year-old Stone Pine tree on E. Anapamu Street, across from Santa Barbara High School, is scheduled for removal this weekend. This is not one of the original Stone Pine trees. The tree is leaning due to root failure and must be removed immediately to prevent a catastrophic fall during the next storm.
- b. The HLC's Structure of Merit designation of 428 Chapala Street has been appealed to City Council by the owner; the HLC will be notified of the hearing date.

4. Commissioner Grumbine brought up for future discussion a possible change in process for project applications of a certain size: a requirement to provide a basic 3-D massing model, either digital or physical, with initial project submittal, in order to save review time. Chair La Voie recommended that process improvements be discussed during the purview/meeting procedures discussion item in March.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Hausz reported on a meeting with Ms. Hernandez, Chair La Voie, and Commissioner Drury to discuss updates/additions to the "Santa Barbara Colors" guide.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. STATE OF THE ART GALLERY 2018 EXHIBITION**

(1:45) (Santa Barbara County Office of Arts and Culture staff will present information on a sculpture exhibition planned for installation on the eight designated sculpture pads in Downtown Santa Barbara. Public sculpture by local artists would be displayed on State Street from April-June 2018. Partners include the City Arts Advisory Committee, Downtown Organization, Santa Barbara Museum of Art, Museum of Contemporary Art Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara Beautiful, Santa Barbara Public Library, and Santa Barbara County Arts Commission.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Sarah Rubin, Executive Director and Julia Rutherford Daly, Curator, Santa Barbara County Office of Arts and Culture

Chair La Voie noted that art installations are exempt from HLC guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked how the sculptures will be childproofed.

Public comment closed at 2:17 p.m.

Discussion held. The Commission expressed its support for the exhibition as a delightful addition to downtown.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Hausz noted that the *Story-Catcher Mailbox* sculpture should be made an accessible height.
2. Commissioner Orías recommended an interactive project for children. She also suggested that lighting be carefully considered for safety.

DISCUSSION ITEM**2. CULTURAL LANDSCAPES**

(2:00) (Discussion of evaluating Cultural Landscapes as outlined in the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Cultural Landscapes and Preservation Brief #36, Protecting Cultural Landscapes.)

Actual time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m.

Susan Chamberlin, local landscape historian, discussed that, just like a building, a landscape is an artifact, and pointed to 800 Santa Barbara Street as an example. Since 1973, the site is part of the National Register Presidio Historic District. The spatial relationships of the sandstone walls

and brick walkways make it likely that the parcel is a “designed historic landscape,” or at least a “historic vernacular landscape,” as the view corridor is part of the setting of the City.

Public comment closed at 2:34 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orias stated that given the drought, we may lose significant landscaping. We would like to keep as much as possible but should recognize the constraints of nature and be flexible.
2. Commissioner Grumbine stated that the guidelines from the Secretary of the Interior provide good strategies for the different approaches of rehabilitation, reconstruction, and preservation.
3. Commissioner Mahan commented that Santa Barbara is always changing, and the HLC attempts to manage that change. We are a city of trees. We are going to see great environmental change, and we can manage it with these guidelines.
4. Commissioner La Voie stated that he requested this discussion item because there has been a change from talking about historical resources as objects, limited to the structure itself, to talking about the site and the landscape. The Commission should start looking for an evaluation of the cultural setting in which these buildings exist; the setting is as important to understanding our history as the constructed buildings.
5. Commissioner Veyna stated that there should be more vigilance about identifying invasive species.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:44 TO 2:56 P.M. ***

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. 1415 DOVER ROAD

(2:20) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-201-001
Owner: Paul and Julie Candau

(Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.035.(d)(2), the Historic Landmarks Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing to consider one of the following: 1) Listing on the Potential Historic Resources List, 2) Designation as a Structure of Merit, or 3) Recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the American Colonial style house designed by architect Leonard Cooke in 1927 and constructed in 1928.)

Actual time: 2:56 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution of Intention 2018-2 to hold a Public Hearing on February 21, 2018 to consider Structure of Merit designation of 1415 Dover Road.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 1732 CHAPALA ST****R-MH Zone****(2:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-001
Application Number: MST2017-00781
Owner: Daniel Mark Heckman
Applicant: Craig Shallanberger

(The Craftsman style triplex building constructed in 1913 is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions to develop a four-unit residential project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolishing the detached 612 square foot three-car garage and constructing approximately 870 square feet of garages, with an approximately 665 square foot second-floor studio unit above. The residential units will be located in the existing triplex and in the studio unit, with an average unit size of 565 square feet. The proposed density on the 7,509 square foot parcel will be 27 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium High Density Residential of 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Additional site improvements include removing over-height fencing and hedges, and constructing a 116 square foot laundry room and 74 square foot mechanical room attached to the new garage structure. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback. Project was last reviewed on December 13, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:00 p.m.

Present: Craig Shallanberger, Architect; and Daniel Heckman, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission that this proposal is behind one of the Hooper bungalows along Islay Street. A Historic Structures/Sites Report has not been requested, though the Commission may request one.

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commented that the proposal should not seek to match buildings in this area that are not aesthetically pleasing. He also suggested a Historic Structures/Sites Report to see what Chapala Street looked like when the building was constructed.

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Continue to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The majority of the Commission finds the proposed modification aesthetically appropriate and not detrimental to the project and neighbors. The modification is supportable as it reduces the square footage of setback encroachment.
2. The majority of the Commission finds this an appropriate development of the site.
3. The majority of the Commission finds the architecture acceptable and appropriate.
4. The Commission supports vines on the building.

- 5. Simplify the detailing of the vents and the pop-out.
- 6. No Historic Structures/Sites Report is required.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 5/1/2. (Lenvik opposed. La Voie and Veyna abstained.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Lenvik stated that he could not support the architecture that supposedly matches the existing, as the merit of the existing is questionable. He commented that the number of windows, the oversized and overscaled large windows, and the louvered windows for ventilation all destroy the elevation and are out of character with the cottage style. There is more window than there is wall. Due to the slope of the roof, there is also more roof than there is wall.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 24 W GUTIERREZ ST

M-C Zone

(3:00)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-211-020
 Application Number: MST2017-00303
 Owner: Beatriz V. Rogers Revocable Trust
 Applicant: Ryan Jeffrey

(The proposal involves relocation or salvage of historic materials and demolition of the existing one-story house, one-story cottage, and detached three-bay garage, and construction of a new three-story mixed-use building, containing two residential condo units. The ground floor will include approximately 812 square feet of commercial space, a lobby, and a covered parking garage with 5 spaces. The two condo units will be located on the second and third floor of the building. Each unit will contain 3 bedrooms, and the unit size will range between approximately 3,532 and 3,445 square feet.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a Tentative Subdivision Map. Project was last reviewed on January 10, 2018.)

Actual time: 3:41 p.m.

Present: Ryan Jeffrey, Applicant; Henry Lenny, Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that this project is undergoing Development Application Review Team (DART) review, and she has brought up the issue of insufficient open yard area with the applicant.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

- 1. Restudy the composition and massing of the building to simplify the elements and to add poetry to the design.
- 2. Be very careful about the provision for open space.
- 3. The design must address the garage door/entry at the face of the street elevation, which is not acceptable as presented.
- 4. The tower should be significantly reduced in mass.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 20 W FIGUEROA ST****C-G Zone**

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-017
 Application Number: MST2017-00772
 Owner: 2024 Fig, LLC
 Applicant: Valerie Froscher

(This building was designed in 1931 by Windsor, Soule, and Murphy in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposal for façade improvements to the existing commercial building including changes to paint, awnings, tile, lighting, and new windows and doors in the existing openings.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 29, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Valerie Froscher, Architect; and Kevin Boss, Representative of the Owner

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Return the building as much as possible to the 1931 elevation drawings, including the transom division, the base tile height, indication of the scuppers on the elevation, enlargement of the light fixtures or relocation to be lower, and alley light fixtures more appropriate to the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. The Commission accepts the relocation of the door toward the west.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 700 STATE ST****C-G Zone**

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-016
 Application Number: MST2017-00837
 Owner: Ortega Pacific, LLC
 Applicant: Elizabeth Wentling
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing commercial building. The project proposes a complete remodel of the State Street building façade that includes enclosing 425 square feet of the existing covered patio for new nonresidential Growth Management Plan (GMP) floor area, changes to the building and roof articulation, windows, doors, and finish details. The addition of a demising wall is proposed to create two new tenant spaces, and will also include a new accessible ramp.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:56 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective, LLP

Public comment opened at 5:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners find acceptable the modification to the façade as shown on the drawings for the west elevation Tenant A space? 0/8 Failed

How many Commissioners can support retaining significant portions of the Tenant A State Street façade? 7/1 Passed

How many Commissioners can support the modification of the State Street façade in the second bay from the corner, for Tenant B? 0/8 Failed

How many Commissioners can support retaining the arch for Tenant B on the State Street façade? 7/1 Passed

How many Commissioners can support removal of the decorative elements on the State Street façade at the corner? 8/0 Passed

How many Commissioners support the proposal of a tower element on the corner as presented? 3/5 Failed

Motion: Continue two weeks to Consent with comment:

1. Infill the existing arches with storefront glazing at Tenant A with an appropriate traditional design.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/1/0. (Grumbine opposed.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

8. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/S-D-3 Zone

(4:40)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	033-102-018
Application Number:	MST97-00357
Owner:	35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
Agent:	Ken Marshall
Applicant:	Michael Rosenfeld
Architect:	DesignARC, Inc.
Engineer:	Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
Landscape Architect:	Suding Design
Business Name:	Entrada De Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Barbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area, and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(Review After Final is requested for the light pattern projections on the Area C façade located on the northeast corner of State Street and Mason Street. Project was last reviewed on September 6, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:30 p.m.

Present: Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that there was a site visit on February 5 for this item. As a condition of approval of the lighting in 2014, any decorative light projections are to be reviewed on a case-by-case basis via site visit by the HLC.

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comment:

1. Return with the proposed patterns to be projected, a proposal for the limited times the light projection will be in use, the illumination level on the walls, and the locations of the fixtures.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/2/0. (La Voie and Mahan opposed.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

9. 1020 CHAPALA ST

C-G Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-281-040
Application Number:	MST2015-00540
Owner:	Santa Barbara Metropolitan Transit
Architect:	Richard Six

(Proposal for exterior renovations at the existing Metropolitan Transit District bus depot. Proposed changes include resurfacing the asphalt bus driveway, replacing the concrete loading areas, updated landscaping, window glazing replacement, new window configuration, mechanical equipment screening, and new site furnishings.)

(Review After Final is requested for a temporary operations facility during construction duration on the adjoining City Parking Lot including: staff trailer, operations ticket booth and vending machines, portable restrooms, minor fencing, and utilities. Project was last reviewed on April 6, 2016.)

Actual time: 6:01 p.m.

Present: Gowdy Mission, LMA Architects; and Ryan Gripp, Project Manager, MTD Operations

Public comment opened at 6:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final for a duration not to exceed one year.

Action: O'rias/Drury, 7/0/0. (Hausz stepped down.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:13 P.M. ***