



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
JANUARY 10, 2018

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Commissioner Mahan.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Drury, Hausz (at 1:32 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna
Commissioners absent: Grumbine and La Voie
Staff present: Unzueta and Plummer

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. 2018 Election of Chair and Vice Chair:

Item postponed to the next meeting.

B. 2018 Appointment of Consent Review Representatives and Subcommittees:

Item postponed to the next meeting.

C. Public Comment:

Paulina Conn stated that she has presented a City Landmark nomination for the Mission Canyon corridor, from Laguna Street to Foothill Road, to the HLC Designations Subcommittee, and to the County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission. She asked that the two Commissions coordinate on this effort, and she presented a synopsis of the nomination for the subcommittee members.

Ms. Conn also expressed concern about signage near the Mission, stating that there are too many signs on the 400 block of East Los Olivos Street for the Museum of Natural History.

D. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **December 13, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 5/0/1. (Lenvik abstained. Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

E. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 10, 2018**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan (Items A-F) and Veyna (all items).

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. The Urban Historian and the Commission Secretary are absent from today's meeting due to the freeway closure.
- b. Item 5, 35 State Street, is postponed at the applicant's request due to yesterday's site visit cancellation.
- c. The appeal of the HLC Project Design Approval of 800 Santa Barbara Street will be heard at the City Council meeting of January 23. Commissioners Drury and Mahan volunteered to attend.

2. Earlier in the meeting, Commissioner Mahan announced the following:

- a. He welcomed the HLC's new Commissioner, Ed Lenvik.
- b. He expressed sympathy on behalf of the Commission to Montecito for its losses from the mudslide tragedy.
- c. For the project at 206 E. Anapamu Street, last reviewed on November 1, 2017, the architect was to return in two months with a design solution for the removed trellis structure. Staff will follow up on this item.

3. Commissioner Orías reminded staff that work on the Historic Districts Ordinance was to be resumed at the beginning of the year. Ms. Unzueta responded that she will contact the City Attorney's office.

G. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

H. There will be a meeting of the HLC Designations Subcommittee on Wednesday, January 24, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. in the Community Development 2nd Floor Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 100 BLK STATE ST**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-066
 Application Number: MST2017-00821
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Teri Green

(Proposal to remove the existing bus bench and shelter within the public-right-of way adjacent to the Harbor View Inn project located at 101 State Street. The existing Lockheed Mural will remain, but the adjoining wall will be removed as a part of the project. All bricks affected would be replaced to match the existing sidewalk brick in color and pattern.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on December 13, 2017.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Teri Green, Associate Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the bus shelter is well designed and appropriate for El Pueblo Viejo, and a site for its relocation should be found.

Public comment closed at 1:53 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Provide a history of the utility boxes and explain the HLC's purview on the utility boxes.
2. Continue to research the relocation or recycling of the removed materials.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 5/0/1. (Lenvik abstained. Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 1202 DIANA RD**

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-008
 Owner: McGough Family Trust

(Pursuant to Municipal Code Section 22.22.035.(d)(2), the Historic Landmarks Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing to consider 1) listing on the Potential Historic Resources List, 2) Structure of Merit designation, or 3) City Landmark designation of the adobe house constructed in the Spanish Colonial Revival style in 1922 located at 1202 Diana Road.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing to consider designation of the adobe house constructed in the Spanish Colonial style in 1922 located at 1202 Diana Road, with comment:

1. Provide more information about the historic significance of all structures on the site.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1202 DIANA RD

RS-6 Zone

(2:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	031-190-008
Application Number:	MST2017-00217
Owner:	McGough Family Trust
Applicant:	Shaun Lynch
Contractor:	Vernon Construction

(The project consists of a proposal to subdivide an existing one (1) acre parcel into four (4) lots in the RS-6, Single Residential Zone and Low Density Residential (Max 5 Dwelling Units/Acre) General Plan designation. The proposed lots vary in size from 9,004 to 15,444 square feet. Proposed lot 4 includes an existing one-story adobe residence. The application includes alterations to the existing adobe residence to include demolition of the "as-built" non-permitted additions, resulting in an 817 square foot residence to remain. The existing adobe residence is deemed eligible to be designated a historic resource by the City Urban Historian. Demolition of the existing detached garage and detached accessory buildings is also proposed. Site improvements for the subdivision include site grading (1,240 cubic yards of cut and 250 cubic yards of fill), removal/relocation of six existing Oak trees, replacement Oak trees, and approximately 8,300 square feet of paving to create a new shared driveway easement connecting the proposed four lots to Cota Street. The existing driveway to Diana Road will remain. The proposal includes development of one new primary dwelling unit on three of the four proposed lots. Proposed lot four (4) includes the 817 square foot residential adobe. The proposal includes two new uncovered parking spaces and a request of the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) for an exception to the covered parking requirement. Proposed vacant lots 1, 2, and 3 will be reviewed by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB). The project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map (TSM) and includes a request for a Public Street Waiver and Street Frontage Modifications. This application will address all violations identified in enforcement case ENF2017-00868.)

(Concept review. Comments Only. Project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and includes a request for a Public Street Waiver and Street Frontage Modifications.)

Actual time: 2:18 p.m.

Present: Shaun Lynch and Scott Smith, Applicants; and Michelle Bedard, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Tom Signorelli, neighbor, expressed concern about increased traffic on Diana Road and

- asked if access could be provided on Cota Street for units other than the adobe house.
2. Kellam de Forest stated that a Historic Structures/Sites Report is needed for this property.
 3. Paul Fletcher, neighbor, discussed the history of the property, and he emphasized concern about the subdivision's effect on traffic on Cota Street.
 4. Ric Grandcolas, neighbor, inquired about oak tree removal, grading, and sewage.
 5. Kirsten Sidoti, neighbor, expressed concern regarding the new shared driveway impacting the quiet of the neighborhood and views from the neighboring properties.

Public comment closed at 2:48 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission requested a Historic Structures/Sites Report.
2. Provide more information via an arborist report about the existing oak trees (including photographs) and proposed tree removal; preserve as many trees as possible.
3. Neighborhood compatibility and traffic/access on both Diana Road and Cota Street will be important considerations for HLC and Planning Commission.
4. The Commission would like to see a covered parking option for the existing structure.
5. The cut and fill is excessive and needs to be carefully considered by the Planning Commission; the design of it should be appropriate to the aesthetics of the HLC guidelines (e.g., natural contours).

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:04 TO 3:11 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 517 CHAPALA ST

C-G Zone

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2017-00151
 Owner: Ed St. George
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Applicant: Shelby Messner
 Architect: Keith Nolan
 Architect: On Design

(Project is adjacent to a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish an existing 1,300 square foot office building and construct a new 3-story, 15-room hotel and two-unit apartment building. The first level of the project will include a hotel lobby, retail commercial space, and a parking garage with 21 parking spaces and 3 bike spaces provided. The 15 hotel rooms will be on the second and third level of the building, and the two apartment suites on the third level. The project includes a voluntary lot merger of two parcels, and the use of minor and small addition non-residential square footage. A transfer of existing development rights will be taken from 3714-3744 State Street. Project requires Development Plan approval by Planning Commission for the new nonresidential square footage.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by the Planning Commission for the new nonresidential square footage. Project was last reviewed on June 28, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect; Lynn Robinson, SM Mesa Rentals; Philip Suding, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:39 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Tony Vassallo, neighbor, stated that the three-story building hangs over the one- and two-story Brinkerhoff properties, making it incompatible with the neighborhood, and asked about elimination of balconies that would look over Brinkerhoff. He also discussed elimination of the ingress/egress on the alley to avoid traffic problems. Caroline Vassallo ceded her time to Mr. Vassallo.
2. Kellam de Forest suggested consideration of a Victorian design for the building, so that it blends with the surrounding historic resources.
3. Elizabeth Olson, neighbor, suggested that for the exit on the alley, a gate be installed on an angle, forcing outgoing traffic onto Haley Street rather than toward the daycare facility.
4. Brad Hodges, neighbor, requested more architectural detail on the drawings.
5. Carlo Sarmiento, neighbor, expressed concern about the mass in the middle of the building and the lack of open space in the front. He also inquired about road improvements for the ingress/egress on the alley to deal with increased traffic.
6. Leon Olson, neighbor, expressed concern about possible disparity between sketches and what is actually built, providing examples of nearby structures that appear to be constructed differently from HLC approved designs.

Public comment closed at 3:52 p.m.

Note: The following motion was made and seconded, but not voted on until after the failure of the substitute motion listed below it.

Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The design is acceptable and much improved.
2. Study the egress on the alley further and provide information on the delay system for vehicles exiting.
3. The balconies on the alley are acceptable, but they might be opened up more.
4. The landscape should have more variety in the trees. Vines are acceptable on the alley façade as long as they are not aggressive.
5. Incorporate solid or perforated masonry for some of the railings.
6. The building to the north will have the benefit of looking into a beautiful two- and three-story building, rather than a parking lot.
7. The Commission found that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with architectural qualities and characteristics of the City and the neighborhood.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.

- d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
- e. There are no established scenic public vistas.
- f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 5/1/0. (Orías opposed. Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments.

Action: Orías/_____. Motion failed for lack of second.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

5. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/S-D-3 Zone

(3:55)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	033-102-018
Application Number:	MST97-00357
Business Name:	Entrada De Santa Barbara
Owner:	35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
Agent:	Ken Marshall
Applicant:	Michael Rosenfeld
Architect:	DesignARC, Inc.
Engineer:	Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
Landscape Architect:	Suding Design

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Barbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area, and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(Review After Final is requested for the light pattern projections on the Area C façade located on the northeast corner of State Street and Mason Street.)

Motion: Postpone two weeks.

Action: Veyna/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 24 W GUTIERREZ ST****M-C Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-020
Application Number: MST2017-00303
Owner: Beatriz V. Rogers Revocable Trust
Applicant: Ryan Jeffrey

(The proposal involves relocation or salvage of historic materials and demolition of the existing one-story house, one-story cottage, and detached three-bay garage, and construction of a new three-story mixed-use building, containing two residential condo units. The ground floor will include approximately 812 square feet of commercial space, a lobby, and a covered parking garage with 5 spaces. The two condo units will be located on the second and third floor of the building. Each unit will contain 3 bedrooms, and the unit size will range between approximately 3,532 and 3,445 square feet.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a Tentative Subdivision Map. Project was last reviewed on October 18, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: Ryan Jeffrey and Rick Jeffrey, Applicants

Public comment opened at 4:33 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about a 3-D model for a better view of the proposal from the surrounding area.

Public comment closed at 4:35 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The relocation efforts of the existing house are appreciated.
2. Provide streetscape elevation drawings showing the adjacent buildings with the proposed project.
3. The Commission desires that the garage be set back from the main façade per the HLC guidelines.
4. Study softening the tower with chamfers.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 214 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-015
Application Number: MST2017-00758
Owner: State Street Mango, LLC

(Proposal for a façade and interior remodel at an existing commercial building. The project includes replacing the existing wood and plaster trellis structure at the State Street entry patio with a steel shade structure, replacing existing doors with bi-fold doors, creating a new outdoor dining window, and replacing the existing black awning with a dark red canvas awning.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 29, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue to Consent with comments:

1. The awning as proposed is acceptable; correct the canvas material on the materials board.
2. Restudy the wall grill to be more traditional.
3. The sandstone caps should be thicker, at least 3 ½ to 4 inches thick.
4. Provide a landscape plan.

Action: Lenvik/Drury, 5/1/0. (Hausz opposed. Grumbine and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:21 P.M. ***