



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
DECEMBER 13, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Vice Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Suding, Drury, Grumbine, Hausz, Mahan, and Orías

Commissioners absent: La Voie and Veyna

Staff present: Unzueta (until 2:10 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 29, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **December 13, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that at the City Council meeting of December 12, Commissioner Mahan was re-appointed to the HLC, and Ed Lenvik was appointed as a new Commissioner.
2. Ms. Hernandez requested that the HLC review the "Santa Barbara Colors" guide for potential changes and consider adding awning colors, as staff is making more copies. Commissioners Hausz and Drury will review the guide with staff.
3. Commissioner Orías requested copies of the booklets from the State Street design charrette presentation at City Council. Commissioner Grumbine will provide the booklets from the charrette event. The booklet from the presentation at City Council is available from the American Institute of Architects (AIA).
4. Ms. Unzueta announced that due to a membership vacancy, the Sign Committee will have an ongoing quorum issue in 2018, and staff is requesting that the Architectural Board of Review and HLC rotate their alternates for two-month periods of service. This time commitment should be kept in mind when making Sign Committee appointments in January.
5. Commissioner Mahan presented a Resolution recognizing Philip Suding, landscape architect and outgoing Commissioner, for his many years of valuable service to City advisory boards.
6. Commissioner Drury expressed concern about lengthy, complex projects being heard at the end of long meetings and suggested that they be placed earlier on the agenda.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Drury reported on the Design Awards subcommittee; estimates are coming in the new year for a metal plaque.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 924 ANACAPA ST

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-018
Owner: 924 Group, LLC

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of the Margaret Baylor Inn/Lobero Building, designed by noted architect Julia Morgan in 1926 and located at 924 Anacapa Street.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

Correspondence in support from Paulina Conn and Travis Logue, attorney for the owner, 924 Group, LLC, was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:07 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-116 recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark the Margaret Baylor Inn/Lobero Building located at 924 Anacapa Street.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 901 N MILPAS ST (AKA 900 PHILINDA AVE)

(2:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-313-015

Owner: Old Dairy Partners, LLC

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy Building, designed by Alex D’Alfonso in 1939 and located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue).

Actual time: 2:10 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

Correspondence in support from Paulina Conn, Pamela Boehr, Susette Naylor, Fran Galt, and Laura Wilson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-117 recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark the Live Oak Dairy Building located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue).

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1110-1114 STATE STREET

(2:10) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-232-009

Owner: La Arcada Investment Corporation

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council the City Landmark designation of the La Arcada Building, designed by Myron Hunt in 1926 and located at 1110-1114 State Street.)

Actual time: 2:17 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m.

Correspondence in opposition from Gregory Faulkner, attorney for the owner, La Arcada Investment Corporation, was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 2:24 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-118 recommending that City Council designate as a City Landmark the La Arcada Building located at 1110-1114 State Street.

Action: Grumbine/Hausz, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 101 S CANADA ST

R-2 Zone

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-231-016
Application Number: MST2016-00536
Owner: Edward St. George
Applicant: On Design, LLC

(Proposal to construct a 4,176 square foot, two-story duplex and a 631 square foot three-car garage on a 13,153 square foot lot. An existing 1,046 square foot single-family residence would remain, and would be remodeled to include a 754 square foot second-story addition above a new 457 square foot two-car garage and one-car carport. Total development on site will be 7,064 square feet. There will be 525 cubic yards of grading excavation and 635 cubic yards of fill dirt. Also proposed is to demolish two unpermitted sheds and two-car garage. This proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2016-01675.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**5. 1425 LAS POSITAS RD****SP-9/S-D-3 Zone****(2:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-064
 Application Number: MST2017-00773
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Erin Markey, Creeks Restoration Planner

(Proposal to restore 1,400 linear feet of Arroyo Burro. Project components include removal of pipe and wire bank revetment, concrete and other debris removal, restoration of hydraulic function, creation of over an acre of floodplain habitat. Project includes over 8,000 native plantings, including 475 trees. Project involves four parcels (047-010-064, 047-010-009, 047-010-065, and 047-061-026.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Heather McDaniel, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:33 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel, Dudek; and Erin Markey, Associate Planner/Creeks Division, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report with comment to reorient Figures 2A and 2B to fit the full page.

Action: Drury/Hausz, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 100 BLK STATE ST****(2:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-066
 Application Number: MST2017-00821
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Teri Green

(Proposal to remove the existing bus bench and shelter within the public-right-of way adjacent to the Harbor View Inn project located at 101 State Street. The existing Lockheed Mural will remain, but the adjoining wall will be removed as a part of the project. All bricks affected would be replaced to match the existing sidewalk brick in color and pattern.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:41 p.m.

Present: Victor Garza, Parking Superintendent and Teri Green, Associate Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:43 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Rick Amescua, security manager for the Hotel California, is in favor of removal as the public is not using the bus shelter and bench. The homeless are established there, and vandalism has been an issue.
2. Correspondence from Tamara Erickson, Hotel Santa Barbara and Ken Oplinger, Santa Barbara Chamber of Commerce was acknowledged.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Correspondence from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:46 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The structure is nicely designed but does not fit with the design of the new building, the Harbor View Inn.
2. The relocation of the structure and bench is highly recommended and preferred; perhaps coordinate with the original designer on a relocation plan.
3. The utility boxes and their history need to be explained to the Commission.
4. Since the structure does not serve its intended purpose, the Commission supported the removal or relocation of the structure and bench.

Action: Hausz/Drury. Motion substituted.

*** The motion was substituted. ***

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue four weeks with comments:

1. The structure is nicely designed but does not fit with the design of the new building, the Harbor View Inn.
2. The relocation of the structure and bench is highly recommended and preferred; perhaps coordinate with the original designer on a relocation plan.
3. The utility boxes and their history need to be explained to the Commission.
4. Since the structure does not serve its intended purpose, the Commission supported the removal or relocation of the structure and bench.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:00 TO 3:07 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 1732 CHAPALA ST****R-MH Zone****(2:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-001
 Application Number: MST2017-00781
 Owner: Daniel Mark Heckman
 Applicant: Craig Shallanberger

(The Craftsman style triplex building constructed in 1913 is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, as it is eligible to be designated a Structure of Merit. Proposal for additions to develop a four-unit residential project under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolishing the detached 612 square foot three-car garage and constructing approximately 870 square feet of garages, with an approximately 665 square foot second-floor studio unit above. The residential units will be located in the existing triplex and in the studio unit, with an average unit size of 565 square feet. The proposed density on the 7,509 square foot parcel will be 27 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium High Density Residential of 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Additional site improvements include removing over-height fencing and hedges, and constructing a 116 square foot laundry room and 74 square foot mechanical room attached to the new garage structure. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback.)

(Concept Review. Comments Only. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the new garage-studio building to encroach into the required front and interior setback.)

Actual time: 3:07 p.m.

Present: Craig Shallanberger, Architect; and Dan Heckman, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m.

1. Marshall Thomas, adjacent neighbor, expressed concern about the removal of fencing and hedges on his property, and about his privacy being affected by the proposed upper deck.
2. Correspondence in opposition from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

Motion: Continue six weeks with comments:

1. The architecture is pleasing and appropriate to the neighborhood.
2. The project mostly seems a good use of site, and encroachments seem supportable.
3. Address the concerns of the neighbor to the east to ensure compatibility, particularly with respect to the setback.
4. Study reorienting the garage and structure to reduce encroachment into the setbacks, particularly the west setback.
5. Remove the non-circulation second-floor deck above the first-floor laundry.
6. Study the configuration of the garage footprint; perhaps slide two of the bays toward the alley to increase open space and reduce paving.
7. Study the large picture window on the south elevation, finessing the proportions of the window to wall areas.

- 8. Study the dimensions and depth of the pop-out projections on the second floor.
- 9. Verify easements to ensure that the proposed design and orientation of the garages are feasible.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

8. 1424 STATE ST

C-G Zone

(3:40)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-072-020
 Application Number: MST2015-00442
 Owner: 22483 PCH II, LP
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for changes to landscaping plans at an existing commercial parcel including the removal of 20 (10 to 14 in diameter) Eucalyptus trees to be replaced with 3 Atlas Cedar, 2 Mediterranean Fan Palm, 6 Brisbane Box, 5 Chinese Pistache, and 9 Queen Palm. All other landscaping and hardscaping is to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing commercial building.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 15, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:50 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Richard Mason, Arborist

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that this revised project description has eliminated removal of the coral trees; only eucalyptus removal is proposed.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

- 1. The owner is to be commended for not removing the coral trees at this time.
- 2. Permeable paving is appropriate, and if damaged curbs or paving occurs, permeable paving should be installed. However, the layout of permeable paving should be cohesively designed, which may not be possible, considering the tree replacement strategy.
- 3. Larger planting pits than what is detailed in the American Standard for Nursery Stock (ANSI) standard would be appropriate and useful.
- 4. The conditions of the arborist report shall be included in the implementation of this project.

Action: Hausz/Drury. Motion substituted.

*** The motion was substituted. ***

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

- 1. The owner is to be commended for not removing the coral trees at this time.
- 2. Permeable paving is appropriate, and if damaged curb or paving occurs, permeable paving should be installed. However, the layout of permeable

paving should be cohesively designed, which may not be possible, considering the tree replacement strategy.

3. Larger planting pits than what is detailed in the American Standard for Nursery Stock (ANSI) standard would be appropriate and useful.
4. The conditions of the arborist report shall be included in the implementation of this project.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:15 TO 4:32 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW

9. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST

C-G Zone

(4:25)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	031-082-002
Application Number:	MST2016-00447
Owner:	Betty Jo Lauritson Trust
Applicant:	The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(The project contains a City Landmark: the Louisa Ygnacio House, an Italianate house constructed in 1875. The proposal consists of a 26-unit mixed-use development to be developed on three parcels under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. The project proposes to demolish an existing two-story, 2,464 square foot, four-unit apartment complex (226 E. De La Guerra St.), three sheds, and a surface parking lot, and construct a four-story (subterranean parking plus three stories fully above grade), 30,835 square foot mixed-use building that includes 14,004 square feet of residential area and 4,749 square feet of commercial floor area. Forty-four parking spaces will be provided by a partially subterranean parking garage. The residential component comprises 26 AUD rental apartments with an average unit size of 539 square feet. The three parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential (28-36 dwelling units per acre). The proposed density on the total of .44 acres will be 60 units per acre, as allowed by the AUD Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 dwelling units per acre). The project includes Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet, and a Development Plan. The Louisa Ygnacio House and duplex at 214 E. De La Guerra will be preserved and renovated. The existing residences are part of the 26 unit count.)

(A. Review of a Letter Addendum to the Historic Structures/Sites Report, prepared by Alexandra Cole.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian; Brian Cearnal and Laura Benard, Architects, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Katie Klein, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; and Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the Urban Historian has read the letter addendum and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m.

Correspondence in support from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:35 p.m.

Public comment opened again at 4:53 p.m.

Ernestine Ygnacio De Soto stated that the widow's walk needs to be restored.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

*** The motion was tabled until after the concept review. ***

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comment:

1. The preparer of the report should study widow walks around the City and return with an appropriate design.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** The motion was substituted. ***

Motion: Accept the report with condition:

1. In Item 4 of the report, address reinstallation of the widow's walk based on photographic evidence in the report; approval by the Urban Historian is acceptable. The Urban Historian shall report the outcome to the Commission.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

(B. Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 15, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:54 p.m.

Public comment opened at 5:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval and continue to the Full Commission as a Review After Final, with comments:

1. The widow's walk should be reconstructed.
2. This is an exceptional project, and the Commission appreciated the changes to the details.
3. Restudy the size of window lights to be more consistent.
4. Provide more information on the lighting, specifically the shape of the LED bulbs.
5. The trash enclosure should have a grape stake fence, using heftier stakes than is typical in contemporary grape stake.
6. Study increasing the distance between the trash enclosure and the historic resource.
7. Study not infilling between the two existing columns at the back of sidewalk on De La Guerra Street.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:34 TO 5:42 P.M. ***

*** Item 9 was re-opened at 5:44 p.m. to announce the ten-day appeal period and to note the approval is subject to Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program conditions. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. 809 DE LA VINA ST		C-G Zone
<u>(5:25)</u>	Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-041-009
	Application Number:	MST2017-00017
	Owner:	809 De La Vina Street, LLC
	Owner:	Jeremy Bassan
	Architect:	DesignARC

(The project site contains a Queen Anne historic building eligible to be designated as a City Landmark: Ott House. This is a revised project description. The total proposed floor area has been reduced from 40,820 square feet to approximately 34,018 square feet. The project has 42 residential units. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels: APNs 037-041-009, 037-041-008, 037-041-010 (809 and 815 De La Vina Street, and 208 W. De La Guerra Street). The project involves the demolition of all existing improvements, except the Ott House, and constructing 2 new three-story apartment buildings. The unit mix will be approximately 18 studio apartments, 20 one-bedroom apartments, and 4 two-bedroom apartments, with an average unit size of approximately 550 square feet. A ground-level parking garage with stackers is proposed under one of the new three-story buildings that will provide approximately 43 parking spaces and approximately 42 bike spaces. Project is within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac.).)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments Only. Planning Commission review is required. Project was last reviewed on November 15, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:42 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Tim Hazeltine, Historian; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:07 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Matt Williams, adjacent neighbor, stated that the size has not been reduced, and the proposal will overstress parking availability in this one- and two-story neighborhood and is not compatible.
2. Donald Sharpe emphasized the parking shortage, and stated that the proposal should be more subservient to the historic resource; the second and third floors and tower are intruding into the space near the Ott House. He also requested verification that rooftop equipment will not exceed the height of the parapet.
3. Correspondence from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:13 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners feel the project as proposed is compatible with the neighborhood? 1/4/1 Failed

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Planning Commission with comments:

1. The project is evolving nicely, but the Commission does not feel the project is compatible with the neighborhood as currently proposed.
2. The project seems to redefine the neighborhood, not respect it.
3. The form and massing of the building along De La Vina Street still seem incompatible with the streetscape, though there have been steps in the right direction. Continue to make such steps.
4. The movements in the reduction of roof forms is helping the mass and bulk.
5. Make an effort to move the elevator tower further back on the property, enhancing the scale and importance of the Queen Anne historic resource.
6. The Commission will be looking for more history in the Historic Structures/Sites Report of the existing boardinghouse that is to be demolished.
7. Continue to refine the east elevation on De La Vina Street.
8. Study varying the window fenestration with more types.
9. The open spaces (corridors) on the east elevation are breaking the horizontality too much.
10. The north elevation at the elevator tower needs more resolution, particularly with respect to the corridor termination treatment.
11. Building 3 could use more elaboration on its elevation, especially on the west elevation.
12. Verify if the parking spaces along De La Vina Street will be opened up with the removal of curb cuts and red curbs.
13. The landscape is developing nicely; the Commission appreciated the diversity in plant material.
14. The Commission supported the story pole requirement.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:44 P.M. ***