



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES NOVEMBER 15, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Suding, Drury, Grumbine (at 1:35 p.m.), Hausz (until 5:45 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (from 5:18-6:05 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Chair La Voie read a letter from Bob Cunningham, landscape architect, discussing the removal of 44 public benches on the 400-1200 blocks of State Street, mostly without HLC approval. The letter outlined the reasons why benches are necessary and urged restoration of public seating as an integral feature of State Street.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **November 1, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 6/0/2. (Drury and Orías abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Continue Items C and D.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 7/0/1. (Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 15, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

Ms. Plummer announced that the appeal of the HLC denial of artificial turf at 35 State Street will be heard at the City Council meeting of November 21. Commissioner Hausz will attend.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Grumbine stated that the State Street design charrette presentation is expected to take place at the City Council meeting of December 5.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

1. 924 ANACAPA ST

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-291-018
Owner: 924 Group, LLC

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the Margaret Baylor Inn/Lobero Building, designed by noted architect Julia Morgan in 1926 and located at 924 Anacapa Street.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

- 1. Kellam de Forest asked if it is known when landscaping was installed on the site.
- 2. Correspondence from Francesca Galt in support was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-20 to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the Margaret Baylor Inn/Lobero Building located at 924 Anacapa Street, with comment:

- 1. The landscaping is to be evaluated for possible inclusion in the designation as a character-defining feature.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

2. 901 N MILPAS ST (AKA 900 PHILINDA AVE)

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-313-015

Owner: Old Dairy Partners, LLC

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy Building, designed by Alex D’Alfonso in 1939 and located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue.).

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m.

- 1. Kellam de Forest stated that the Pearl Chase Society is in support of the designation.
- 2. Correspondence from Francesca Galt in support was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:56 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-21 to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy Building located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue).

Action: Suding/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. 1110-1114 STATE ST

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-232-009

Owner: La Arcada Investment Corporation

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the La Arcada Building, designed by Myron Hunt in 1926 and located at 1110-1114 State Street.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Correspondence from Francesca Galt in support was acknowledged.

Motion: Adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-22 to hold a Public Hearing on December 13, 2017 to consider a recommendation to City Council for City Landmark designation of the La Arcada Building located at 1110-1114 State Street.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 219 E HALEY ST****M-C Zone**

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014
Application Number: MST2016-00078
Owner: Price Living Trust
Architect: Greg Christman

(This is a one-time pre-application consultation. Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units totaling 3,416 square feet and the construction of a four-story (previously three-story) mixed-use development. The new residential unit mix will include 14 two-bedroom units (8 townhomes, 5 flats), 16 one-bedroom units, and 5 studios, totaling 35 residential units and 26,093 square feet, with an average unit size of 732 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 1,816 square feet. Total development on site will be 52,055 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,541 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 35 covered parking spaces for the residential units and 7 covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 38 spaces required. Grading is yet to be determined. Planning Commission review is required.)

(Architectural Board of Review (ABR) project. Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather McDaniel McDevitt and David Stone.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest requested a report on the history of the existing cottages and an evaluation of their significance.

Ms. Hernandez responded that in her opinion, based on a street view assessment, most of the buildings have been altered and do not qualify as historic resources as they do not convey their original appearance. A Historic Structures/Sites Report is being prepared to fully evaluate this bungalow court and the adjacent bungalow court for historic significance. Both of the bungalow courts on this block of East Haley were surveyed in 1978. This one was not chosen at that time for inclusion on the Potential Historic Resources List; however, the property next door was listed.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted with comment that the Commission expressed dismay that the cottages will be demolished.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**5. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST****C-G Zone**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-082-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00447
 Owner: Betty Jo Lauritson Trust
 Applicant: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(The project contains a City Landmark: the Louisa Ygnacio House, an Italianate house constructed in 1875. The proposal consists of a 26-unit mixed-use development to be developed on three parcels under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. The project proposes to demolish an existing two-story, 2,464 square foot, four-unit apartment complex (226 E. De La Guerra St.), three sheds, and a surface parking lot. The project proposes to construct a four-story (subterranean parking plus three stories fully above grade), 30,835 square foot mixed-use building that includes 14,004 square feet of residential area and 4,749 square feet of commercial floor area. Forty-four parking spaces will be provided by a partially subterranean parking garage. The residential component comprises 26 AUD rental apartments with an average unit size of 539 square feet. The three parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential (28-36 dwelling units per acre). The proposed density on the total of .44 acres will be 60 units per acre, as allowed by the AUD Priority Housing Overlay. The project includes Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet, and a Development Plan. The Louisa Ygnacio House and duplex at 214 E. De La Guerra will be preserved and renovated. The existing residences are part of the 26 unit count.)

(In-Progress Review. Comments Only. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-17. Project was last reviewed on September 6, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Jeff Hornbuckle, and Laura Benard, Architects, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Katie Klein, Landscape Architect, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended the owner for saving the Ygnacio House and expressed concern about the view of it from the intersection of De La Guerra and Santa Barbara Streets, stating that it should be celebrated. He also recommended a plaque describing its history.

Public comment closed at 2:25 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 2:47 p.m.

Ernestine Ygnacio-DeSoto expressed concern about the location of the trash area.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The location of the trash enclosure and bike area on the property behind the historic resource is not acceptable. These areas should also be placed at a more convenient location to the majority of the residents.
2. The architect addressed most HLC requests; however, the Commission is looking for a greater reduction of the roof on the east element through reducing the eave height, to bring the roof height down in a significant way.
3. Lowering the roof pitch on such a tall building is a mistake; the roof needs to be restored to what was originally proposed.
4. The mechanical equipment needs to be screened, as is typically requested by the Commission, from a horizontal plane.
5. The Brisbane tree is not appropriate for this building site; use a Lombardi Poplar or Sweetshade in a 36" box.
6. The raised planters along the east elevation are to be planted with substantial plant material, a shrub and/or tree.
7. Add trailing plants on top of the planter wall at the back of the sidewalk at De La Guerra Street.
8. The wood fencing is to be more rustic.
9. The chimneys on the south elevation need more poetry.
10. The design of the first horizontal bar down from the railing needs to be more traditional. It was suggested that the long horizontal expanse of the secondary horizontal railing be removed or articulated.
11. For the historic resource, the Commission must see a work plan for the entire structures on the site, including proposed restoration methods and materials for the original elements.
12. The stone walls should terminate with a return in a traditional manner; stepping was suggested.
13. The arch over the entrance to the garage should be less contemporary.
14. The Commission looks forward to seeing traditional light fixtures, further detailing, and signage.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:13 TO 3:24 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 809 DE LA VINA ST****C-G Zone**

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-009
 Application Number: MST2017-00017
 Owner: 809 De La Vina Street, LLC
 Owner: Jeremy Bassan
 Architect: DesignARC

(The project site contains a Queen Anne historic building eligible to be designated as a City Landmark: Ott House. This is a revised project description. The total proposed floor area has been reduced from 40,820 square feet to approximately 34,018 square feet. The project has 42 residential units. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels: APNs 037-041-009, 037-041-008, 037-041-010 (809 and 815 De La Vina Street, and 208 W. De La Guerra Street). The project involves the demolition of all existing improvements, except the Ott House, and constructing 2 new three-story apartment buildings. The unit mix will be approximately 18 studio apartments, 20 one-bedroom apartments, and 4 two-bedroom apartments, with an average unit size of approximately 550 square feet. A ground-level parking garage with stackers is proposed under one of the new three-story buildings that will provide approximately 43 parking spaces and approximately 42 bike spaces. Project is within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac.).)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Planning Commission review is required. Project was last reviewed on July 12, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:24 p.m.

Present: Jeremy Bassan, Owner; Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she sent a memo to the Commission summarizing the comments staff made in a meeting with the applicant evaluating the project's compatibility to the historic Queen Anne house. The memo included examples of original large Craftsman style buildings to illustrate how the style was expressed in large buildings. There will be a Historic Structures/Sites Report with further analysis after the HLC accepts a design concept.

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Matt Williams, neighbor, stated the proposal is too large and tall for this neighborhood of one- and two-story buildings. He expressed concern about the area being overparked, and the proposed stacked parking impacting traffic at the intersection of De La Vina and De La Guerra Streets. Also, proposed trees appear to overhang his parking lot on two sides, and he expressed concern about upkeep.
2. Donald Sharpe, neighbor, read a letter expressing concerns about the density and height; that the proposal does not respect the character of the surrounding one- and two-story residential neighborhood; does not meet Municipal Code compatibility requirements and the Infill Design Guidelines with respect to the historic resource; and will exacerbate a dire parking situation with the potential construction of three AUD projects within a half block.

3. Kellam de Forest stated that it is projects like this, where parcels are merged to accommodate large apartment buildings, that worry many Santa Barbara residents. He stated that they exacerbate the City's parking and traffic problems, and he questioned the compatibility of having two apartment buildings on this residential block.

The following people expressed support:

1. Shannon Batcher, of the Coastal Housing Coalition, read a letter in support of the proposal as it provides affordable workforce housing. The Coalition also applauded the transportation alternatives supplied for residents who are car-free. Jonathan Standing ceded his time to Ms. Batcher.
2. Paulette Rainbolt stated that the downtown area has become deteriorated, and this new project will help revitalize the area, and that it is positive for workforce housing.
3. Kasey Kepp supported the project due to Santa Barbara's housing shortage. He also stated that the existing structures are aging and the new proposal would be an improvement to the street in this regard.
4. Ariel Hojar emphasized that the proposal would be beneficial to commuters with more housing availability downtown.
5. Corey Perez stated that there is little availability downtown for apartments like this proposal, and that it is well thought out and good for the area.
6. Danielle Kunkleman stated that the proposal fits the area and is cohesive with the historic resource, with no views obstructed. She also stated that parking has been considered, and more housing in this area will revitalize economic activity downtown.
7. Wolfgang Stuckenberger stated that the existing buildings are in bad condition. He explained that stacked parking is available in Germany and New York and is fast and safe.
8. Wesley Wilson emphasized that the project will bring foot traffic to State Street.
9. Correspondence from Joe Perreira; Kian Mitchum; Wesley Wilson; and Mary Lynn Harms-Romo, Paseo Nuevo, was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:19 p.m.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission greatly appreciated the reduction in bedroom count, recognizing the necessary balance of providing housing and neighborhood compatibility.
2. The majority of the Commission found the size, bulk, and scale are improved by this reduction on the rear building, making it more compatible with the neighborhood.
3. The Craftsman architectural style is appropriate and has improved but requires further study.
4. Additional ways to reduce the apparent height and length of the De La Vina Street corner building are necessary.
5. Break up the building mass of the De La Vina Street elevation so that it does not appear so monolithic, with the addition of chimneys, stepping down more at the corners, etc.
6. The landscape expression around the historic resource should be differentiated from the rest of the project.
7. Continue to maintain the De La Vina setback, which is appropriate to the neighborhood.
8. Consider incorporating children's play areas, both active and passive.

9. There is a lack of fenestration on the north elevation on building 3; more articulation is needed.
10. Study the potential of a trash truck blocking De La Vina Street and confirm the proposal with the Transportation Division.
11. This project needs additional guest parking; the guest parking and accessible parking should be at the entrance from De La Guerra Street.
12. Vary the tree palette to ensure that there is sufficient land area to support the mature biomass of the selected trees, particularly along the southwest property line.
13. Provide a 3-D model in either computer or physical form that shows the adjacent buildings.
14. The project is not ready for Planning Commission review.

Action: Hausz/Veyna, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:11 TO 5:17 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 1424 STATE ST

C-G Zone

(4:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	039-072-020
Application Number:	MST2015-00442
Owner:	22483 PCH II, LP
Landscape Architect:	Arcadia Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for changes to landscaping plans at an existing commercial parcel, including the removal of 20 (10 to 14 inch in diameter) Eucalyptus trees and 6 (20 inch in diameter) Coral trees to be replaced with 6 Southern Magnolia, 3 Atlas Cedar, 2 Mediterranean Fan Palm, 6 Brisbane Box, 5 Chinese Pistache, 5 Golden Medallion, and 9 Queen Palm. The Coral trees are proposed to be removed in two phases. All other landscaping and hardscaping is to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing commercial building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 12, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Leigh Christman & Richard Mason, Arborists

Public comment opened at 5:24 p.m.

Correspondence from Kellam de Forest, Penelope Bianchi, Carrie Anderson, Edward Baum, David Baum, Daniel Seibert, Stephanie Overhoff, Ann Dwelley, Joan Vignocchi, and Jayne Sigman was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:28 p.m.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Orías requested that the cited article about the pavement be distributed to the Commission.

Motion: Continue four weeks with comments:

1. The Commission would like to see the new plant material installed with sufficient ground area or permeable paving to sustain the mature biomass.
2. Provide a detail indicating over-excavation and proper root barriers.
3. Provide a complete landscape plan, including all of the understory.
4. The plan should be implemented in one phase.
5. A coral tree species appropriate to the site, location, and climate should replace the existing coral trees, in the same quantity.
6. Groundcover appropriate to the water requirements of the trees is required.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 6/1/0. (Drury opposed. Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Drury stated that he opposed because he finds the Commission’s requirements place too much of a burden on the applicant.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 6:05 TO 6:08 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

8. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00284
 Owner: American Tradition, LLC
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Robert Glazier

(Proposal for an approximately 54-room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site consisting of two- and three-story structures. The proposed square footage on this lot is approximately 84,478 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Sixth Concept Review. Comments Only. Substantial Conformance Determination will be made by the Community Development Director. Project was last reviewed on October 18, 2017.)

Actual time: 6:08 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent; Bob Glazier, Architect, Hill Glazier Architects; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. De Busk stated that the project will go before the Planning Commission for comments and then requires a Substantial Conformance Determination from the Community Development Director. Feedback from the HLC is requested in these decisions.

Public comment opened at 6:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission commended the applicant, architect, and landscape architect for an excellent design and looks forward to in-progress reviews as the design develops.
2. As project is further developed, the Commission would like to see more vertical proportion in the openings.
3. The Commission supported the applicant's proposal for awnings, if not overly horizontal.
4. Provide swatches of the awnings. The awning color needs to have more variety.
5. Where openings approach corners, there should be sufficient wall mass to suggest masonry construction.
6. Enhance the pedestrian experience of the main lawn area; a pergola or some type of shade was suggested.
7. Provide a connection to Cabrillo Boulevard.
8. The fountain at the end of the axis needs to be a traditional form.
9. The exterior spaces should be given as careful design consideration as the building spaces.
10. The Commission found that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project is compatible with the City Charter. The project's renderings are compatible with the architectural guidelines.
 - b. The size, bulk, and scale of the project are appropriate for the neighborhood.
 - c. The design of the project protects public views.
 - d. The project includes sensitive and generous open space and landscaping.

Action: Drury/Suding, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:07 P.M. ***