



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
NOVEMBER 1, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie, Suding, Grumbine, Hausz, Mahan, Orías (until 4:43 p.m.), and Veyna
Commissioners absent: Drury
Staff present: Unzueta (from 1:37-2:04 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 18, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 1, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 6/0/1. (Suding abstained from Items F and G. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. The appeal of the HLC approval of 3 Rosemary Lane will be heard at the City Council meeting of November 14. Commissioner Mahan will attend.
 - b. The appeal of the HLC denial of the artificial turf at 35 State Street will be heard at the City Council meeting of November 21. Commissioner Hausz will attend.
 - c. The “Reimagine the State Street Underpass” event will take place at 631 Garden Street on November 15, 5:00-8:00 p.m. Commissioners Drury, Hausz, and Veyna will attend.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:
 - a. Commissioner packets for the second round of mass Structure of Merit designations, to be heard on November 29, have been distributed.
 - b. The original windows for 203 Chapala Street that were removed and placed in storage have been successfully replaced on the building.
3. Commissioner Orías announced the following:
 - a. Bob Cunningham has resigned from Sign Committee, and Commissioner Orías urged that someone knowledgeable about the sign and historic ordinances should apply for this vacancy.
 - b. At the Joint City Council/Planning Commission Work Session on October 26, Commissioner Orías spoke as an individual about the need for the Historic Districts Ordinance to be completed.
4. Ms. Unzueta announced the following:
 - a. At the City Council/Planning Commission meeting of October 26, the Historic Districts Ordinance was brought up as a priority project. The City Planner indicated that work on the ordinance will resume at the beginning of the year, due to the City Attorney’s Office workload with other ordinances.
 - b. City Advisory Group recruitment is underway; the Historic Landmarks Commission has three vacancies.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Grumbine reported on the Santa Barbara American Institute of Architects (AIA) Design Charrette: Making State Street Work event of October 21. The event went well, with nine groups spending the day coming up with an overview for State Street, as well as developing ideas for a particular four-block area and individual buildings. A presentation will be put together for City Council.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. CITY’S POTENTIAL HISTORIC RESOURCES LIST UPDATE

(1:45) Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
(Consider a proposed removal from the City’s Potential Historic Resources List.)

La Rosa Bungalow Court, 221 East Haley Street, APN 031-202-013

The property will be considered for removal from the Potential Historic Resources List as it does not retain integrity of setting, feeling, and association because this section of Haley Street has become commercial and mixed use, and the property does not convey its significance to qualify as a historic resource.

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m.

1. Robert Hunter, the potential buyer of the property, stated that he is looking for a determination of the building’s historic status prior to closing escrow. He emphasized the deteriorated condition of the building and stated that there are better examples of bungalow courts in the City.
2. Kellam de Forest requested a full Historic Structures/Sites Report for a record of the building's history and current condition before removal from the list.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comment that a Historic Structures/Sites Report for the property is requested.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

2. 206 E ANAPAMU ST

C-G Zone

(1:50) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-162-039
Application Number: MST2015-00342
Owner: Storke, LLC
Applicant: Traci Taitt

(Proposal to demolish the wooden members of an existing 720 square foot trellis for safety measures at the front of an existing commercial development. The existing trellis is failing. The existing stucco columns are proposed to remain. A separate application will be submitted at a later date to replace the trellis with a new design. No new non-residential square footage is proposed.)

(Original approval was granted for the demolition of the 720 square foot trellis structure at Anapamu Street with it to be replaced at a later date. Review After Final is requested to not replace the trellis structure. Project was last reviewed on July 15, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Mahan stated that he referred this item to the Full Commission from Consent because when the project was originally brought before HLC for removal of the trellis, the applicant promised the trellis would be rebuilt at a later date.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest requested a Historic Structures/Sites Report for the property and stated that there is a need to consider the streetscape and whether the trellis is an essential part.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The building as it exists is not acceptable.
2. The Commission’s first preference is restoration to the original Edwards and Plunkett design, with an infill of the openings; or
3. A restoration of the pergola that was installed in 1970; or
4. An alternate architectural solution.
5. The landscaping in any solution needs to be enhanced.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The motion was amended as follows:

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The building as it exists is not acceptable.
2. The Commission’s first preference is restoration to the original Edwards and Plunkett design, with an infill of the openings; or
3. A restoration of the pergola that was installed in 1970; or
4. An alternate architectural solution.
5. The landscaping in any solution needs to be enhanced.
6. The applicant is to return with a proposal within two months.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. 700 E ANAPAMU ST

R-M Zone

(2:10)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	029-180-009
Application Number:	MST2017-00690
Owner:	Santa Barbara High School District
Applicant:	David Hetyonk

(This building is a designated City Landmark: Santa Barbara High School Main Building and Stadium Ticket Booth. Courtesy review of a proposal to replace the deteriorated existing window at Room 205 on the rear elevation of the Main Building with an aluminum clad window. Project is a test to evaluate if this window is an appropriate alternative to a wood window to match the originals. No other improvements are proposed to this historic site.)

(Courtesy review. Comments only.)

Actual time: 2:24 p.m.

Present: David Hetyonk, Director of Facilities and Operations and Richard Whirty, Project Manager, Santa Barbara Unified School District

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that this is a designated City Landmark. There is a Memorandum of Understanding with the School District that while the HLC is only provided a courtesy review, the Commission's expertise will guide decision-making. It is Ms. Hernandez's opinion that original wood windows should be replaced with wood, in order to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Ms. Hernandez also clarified that the building qualifies for use of the California Historical Building Code, which allows for window replacement with materials that match the original, without having to meet Title 24 California Energy Code requirements.

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest questioned if the window meets the state standards and if it will look enough like a wood window.
2. Correspondence from Addison Thompson in opposition was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:34 p.m.

Commission's comments:

1. The Commission appreciated the opportunity for the courtesy review.
2. The Commission expressed skepticism regarding how an aluminum clad window would visually resemble the original wood window.
3. The Commission requested full architectural drawings and details to illustrate the profile of the proposed mullions and how the new sash will fit into the frame.
4. The Commission requested to be invited to review the test windows installation on site.
5. The Commission requested a formal inventory of the windows to be replaced to show the scope of the project.

The applicant clarified that the test is proposed for five windows (one bay) for one classroom, not one window.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 721 E COTA ST

R-M Zone

(2:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-110-004
 Application Number: MST2017-00689
 Owner: Santa Barbara High School District

(This building is a designated City Landmark: Santa Barbara Junior High School. Courtesy review of a proposal to replace the existing multi-purpose room and locker room buildings with one new structure.)

(Courtesy review. Comments only.)

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: David Hetyonk, Director of Facilities and Operations, Santa Barbara Unified School District; and Steve Key, Project Architect, LPA, Inc.

Public comment opened at 3:19 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the history of the building to be replaced.

Public comment closed at 3:20 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission appreciated the opportunity for the courtesy review.
2. The Commission was comfortable with the removal of the non-contributing buildings, and encouraged the replacement with a building in the appropriate Spanish Colonial Revival style that is compatible with the junior high school.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:43 TO 3:51 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 113 W DE LA GUERRA ST

C-G Zone

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-082-027
Application Number:	MST2015-00626
Owner:	John R. Dewilde
Architect:	Ed De Vicente

(The building at 113 W. De La Guerra Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, eligible as a Structure of Merit: W.D. Smith Building, constructed in 1928. Proposal for a 23-unit mixed-use project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program on two parcels known as 113-115 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-027) and 117 W. De La Guerra Street (APN 037-082-003). The project proposes the demolition of two existing 1,113 and 923 square foot commercial buildings, two outdoor patios, 15 surface parking spaces, and the near complete demolition of a 4,455 square foot commercial building, of which the historic façade and tile roof will be preserved. The project proposes to construct a 19,767 square foot, three- and four-story mixed-use building that includes 16,907 square feet of residential area, 1,162 square feet of commercial area, and 1,698 square feet of circulation. Twenty-six parking spaces will be provided by an at-grade parking garage. The residential component comprises 23 residential units with an average unit size of 735 square feet and a unit mix of studios, one-bedroom, and two-bedroom units. The two parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential/Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). The proposed density on the lots totaling 16,273 net square feet will be 62 units per acre. One existing Queen Palm in the right of way is proposed to be relocated. The project requires Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet, and will require a voluntary lot merger.)

(A. Review of Addendum to the Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alex Cole. The report found that because the proposed project meets the relevant Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the impact will be less than significant (Class III). Because the front historic section will be retained, there will be no direct, indirect, or cumulative project effects on the historic character-defining features and site.)

(B. Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission for AUD concept review.)

Actual time: 3:51 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills and Ed DeVicente, Architects, DMHA; Katie Kline, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; Alexandra Cole, Historian; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Arciniega stated that this project requires Planning Commission (PC) concept review. The HLC's comments regarding design and project compatibility are appreciated by the PC. Also, the project triggers the story pole requirement, so the HLC should comment on whether story poles are needed or if another visual aid will suffice. Lastly, the HLC will review an Addendum to the Historic Structures Report accepted in 2005.
2. Ms. Hernandez stated that she reviewed the Addendum and agrees with the conclusions that the proposal preserves the original structure and integrates the new addition appropriately into the setting.

Public comment opened at 4:19 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Gayla Visalli, neighbor, stated that the project has a worthy design and concept, but she has concerns about it depriving residents of adjacent buildings of light and privacy. The proposal is antithetical to the Santa Barbara style by trying to squeeze a large building between other large buildings.
2. Ana Sullivan, neighbor, commented about close lot lines of the project and adjacent buildings, the lack of design attention to the east side of the building, and inadequate parking. Ms. Sullivan also presented written comments to the Commission.
3. Susan Winn-Rogers, neighbor, stated that the building at 121 W. De La Guerra needs to be addressed, as the balconies of that building and the proposed building are too close. Also, Unit 13 on the proposed building blocks light and air to Units 2 and 14 on the neighboring building.

Public comment closed at 4:26 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission requested a computer-generated 3-D model to better understand the impacts to the adjoining structures and the context of the immediate neighborhood.
2. The Commission found the design exemplary in its current form, with minor alterations.
3. The size, bulk, and scale are appropriate but require further study by the Commission.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 4/2/0. (Hausz and Veyna opposed. Drury and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioners Hausz and Veyna opposed because they did not find the size, bulk, and scale appropriate.

Motion: Postpone the report.

Action: Suding/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (Drury and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:08 P.M. ***