



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

AUGUST 9, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (absent 3:12-3:38 p.m.), Suding (absent 3:12-3:38 p.m.), Drury, Grumbine, Hausz, Mahan, Orías, and Veyna (at 1:34 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta (until 2:41 p.m.), Hernandez (until approx. 6:15 p.m.), Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

1. Kellam de Forest reported that the Live Oak Dairy building at 901 N. Milpas Street, a Landmark-eligible structure, is for sale and is being promoted as a potential AUD site. He also expressed concern about administrative reviewers of Accessory Dwelling Units considering the historic status of the properties.
2. Anna Marie Gott requested that the HLC ask the City Council to discuss residential conversions to short-term vacation rentals for properties under 1000 square feet, which do not require discretionary review. She also asked that one such property at 414 Ruth Avenue, which received approval for its design review on today's HLC Consent agenda, be continued.
3. Correspondence from Virginia Rehling objecting to spotlights on signs in El Pueblo Viejo was acknowledged. The Chair asked that the letter be forwarded to the Sign Committee.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 26, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/2. (Grumbine and Veyna abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Postpone Items B and F.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 9, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Suding, as amended.

Action: Suding/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that the appeal of the HLC approval of 1809 Mira Vista Avenue will appear at the September 12 City Council meeting. Commissioner Mahan will attend as representative of the HLC, and Chair La Voie will send a letter.
2. Ms. Hernandez asked for the Commission's preference for historic survey report format for the next batch of mass Structure of Merit designations. The HLC preferred a printout from the City's Historic Resource Database. She also announced the release of an updated version of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.
3. Renee Brooke, City Planner, reported a discussion at the City Council meeting of August 8 about a six-month pilot program for enhanced services to State Street businesses from Cabrillo Boulevard to Sola Street. One service will be a designated staff member and phone number available to tenants interested in occupying retail spaces. Planning will also designate two staff members to serve as State Street liaisons, including the HLC Planning Technician. Applications will receive priority placement on HLC agendas, and Building & Safety will offer advanced assessment for a fee.
4. Commissioner Suding announced he will step down from Item 10, 1015 Orilla del Mar. He also disclosed a phone call from the applicant, Jan Hochhauser, for Item 12, 800 Santa Barbara Street. Mr. Hochhauser indicated that he would bring a model to today's meeting and asked if color was required; Commissioner Suding said no.
5. Chair La Voie will also step down from Item 10, 1015 Orilla del Mar.
6. Commissioner Drury disclosed a discussion with Planning Commissioner Deborah Schwartz about Item 12, 800 Santa Barbara Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM – REQUEST FOR RECONSIDERATION

1. 25 W ANAPAMU ST

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-231-003
Owner: Catherine G. Cavaletto Trustee Rev Trust Agreement
(Discussion of request by Commissioner Hausz for possible reconsideration of the July 26, 2017 Structure of Merit designation based on its lack of historic integrity. Debate is limited to the question of whether there is a majority of the Commission interested in reconsidering the matter.)

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that Commissioner Hausz visited the building and expressed concern about its eligibility as a Structure of Merit based on alterations.

Motion: Reconsider the item on August 23, 2017.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM

2. MILLS ACT PROGRAM

(1:50) Staff: Nicole Hernandez
(Presentation by the Urban Historian about the Mills Act program.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Discussion held.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 205 & 209 NATOMA ST, 115 BURTON CIR

(2:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-063-006
Owner: 205 Natoma, LLC
Owner: Jerry D. Stark

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Hirte triplex residence, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house constructed in 1940 located at 205 Natoma Street, 209 Natoma Street, and 115 Burton Circle.)

Actual time: 2:12 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if the property is eligible for City Landmark status.

Public comment closed at 2:15 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-58 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Hirte Triplex Residence, a Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed in 1940 located at 205 Natoma Street & 209 Natoma Street and 115 Burton Circle, with comment:

- 1. Note that the form of the building and its response to the site is one of its character-defining features.

Action: Suding/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

4. 205 & 209 NATOMA ST, 115 BURTON CIR

(2:05) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-063-006
Owner: 205 Natoma, LLC
Owner: Jerry D. Stark

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the designated Structure of Merit, the Hirte triplex residence, a Spanish Colonial Revival style residence constructed in 1940 located at 205 Natoma Street, 209 Natoma Street, and 115 Burton Circle. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 205 & 209 Natoma Street and 115 Burton Circle, and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:17 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Structure of Merit located at 205 & 209 Natoma Street and 115 Burton Circle.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

5. 212 CANON DR

(2:10) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 053-162-002
Owner: Edelheit Family Revocable Trust

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the designated Structure of Merit, the Tudor Revival style residence constructed in 1928-1929 located at 212 Canon Drive. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 212 Canon Drive, and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Valerie Edelheit, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the Structure of Merit located at 212 Canon Drive.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

6. 232 EAST LOS OLIVOS ST

(2:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002

Owner: Sean Black, Trustee of the Sean Black Trust

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the designated City Landmark, the Frothingham House, designed by George Washington Smith in 1922 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style located at 232 East Los Olivos Street. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated City Landmark property at 232 East Los Olivos Street, and recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara; and Sean Black, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the status of the garden remodel at the property.

Public comment closed at 2:29 p.m.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the City Landmark located at 232 East Los Olivos Street.

Action: Grumbine/Suding, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

7. 1029-1031 STATE ST

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-012

Owner: Cold Spring RE, LLC

(Application for a Mills Act contract for the designated City Landmark, the Janssens/Orella/Birk building, designed by Edwards, Plunkett, and Howell in 1927 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style located at 1029-1031 State Street. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, recommendation to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated City Landmark property at 1029-1031 State Street, and recommendation to the City Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contract.)

Actual time: 2:34 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m), and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the proposed Mills Act contract for the City Landmark located at 1029-1031 State Street.

Action: Veyna/Suding, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**8. 707 KIMBALL AVE****M-1/SD-3 Zone**

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-161-006
 Application Number: MST2017-00052
 Owner: Nopal Investment Company, LLC
 Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects

(Proposal for a new commercial addition. Project is comprised a voluntary lot merger of two parcels (APNs 017-161-006 and 017-161-005), the demolition of two single-family residences, and the construction of a 3,000 square foot two-story addition to an existing 3,325 square foot industrial building. Also proposed are four new parking spaces. The two existing single-family dwellings will be demolished under separate permit. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:39 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:39 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.
Action: Suding/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:41 TO 2:50 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**9. CITYWIDE-VARIOUS CITY LOCATIONS**

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-000-944
 Application Number: MST2017-00407

(Proposal for a Citywide upgrade of streetlights from high pressure sodium to light emitting diode.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:50 p.m.

Present: Alelia Parenteau, Energy Analyst, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if this is an upgrade of the streetlight fixture or the bulb.

Public comment closed at 2:56 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposal at 3000 K? 2/6 Failed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposal at 2700 K? 8/0 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with condition that the color temperature be 2700 K in El Pueblo Viejo.

Action: Veyna/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

10. 1015 ORILLA DEL MAR

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	017-322-015
Application Number:	MST2016-00053
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	Carson Wollert, Project Engineer

(The property is a designated Structure of Merit, constructed in 1930 by William Mooser. Proposal for Coastal Exemption for a 6,000 linear foot water main replacement located along E Cabrillo Blvd and Orilla Del Mar. Retention of air release valve design in the public right-of-way.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 12, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Carson Wollert, Project Engineer and Philip Maldonado, Supervising Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest recommended that the installations be landscaped.
2. Correspondence in support from Joe Mezzetta on behalf of Steve Ridgeway was read into the record.

Public comment closed at 3:19 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support either material option if painted an approved color? 6/0 Passed

Motion: Continued two weeks to Consent with comments:

1. The plastic material or steel is acceptable as long as it is painted.
2. Acceptable colors are Malaga green or brown to match those at Cabrillo Ball Park; return with color samples.

Action: Veyna/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**11. 29 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone****(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-112-006
 Application Number: MST2016-00540
 Owner: Hannah Beachside, LLC
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing mixed-use building located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The project proposes a complete remodel of the building façades that includes changes to the building articulation, windows, doors, lighting, and finish details. It also proposes a new attached trash enclosure at the rear, the conversion of 94 square feet of interior space into an outdoor dining patio, and the creation of additional outdoor dining areas. Interior work includes the subdivision and remodel of the existing restaurant into two new restaurant tenant spaces. Proposal includes converting the approximately 681 square foot one-bedroom apartment on the second floor into restaurant and dining area for restaurant B.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on June 14, 2017.)

Actual time: 3:38 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect; and Greg Christman, DMHA

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission supported the project in general as an acceptable design and appropriate for El Pueblo Viejo.
2. The gable window on the south elevation needs further study, with an increase in the amount of plaster in the shoulders.
3. Do not use corten steel.
4. The windows should all be the same color.
5. The carved door element of the design needs further study and perhaps simplification.
6. It was recommended that the doors with the louvers on the rear of the building be wood.
7. The Commission forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review the comment to maximize landscaping in the parking area to the extent possible in compliance with City parking regulations.
8. It was recommended that kentia palms be incorporated into the design.
9. The eave details should be consistent.
10. The stucco screed at the bottom of the wall shown on detail 7, sheet A701, shall have a plaster base.
11. Use a smaller diameter post on the post and chain element.

Action: Grumbine/Suding, 6/1/1. (Orías opposed. Hausz abstained.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioner Orías stated that she opposed due to the item returning to Consent rather than the Full Commission for Final Approval.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:22 TO 4:32 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**12. 800 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-028
 Application Number: MST2015-00023
 Owner: 800 Santa Barbara, LLC
 Applicant: Jan Hochhauser
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser

(Revised proposal to demolish the existing 1,965 net square foot, one-story non-residential building and construct a 19,179 square foot, three-story mixed-use building on an 18,586 square foot lot. The project consists of 1,289 square feet of commercial floor area and 23 residential units. The unit mix will include 8 studios, 10 one-bedroom units, and 5 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 778 square feet. Parking will be provided with a subterranean parking garage containing 29 parking spaces, storage, and service areas. Of the 27 trees on the property, 9 would be retained and protected, 15 removed, 3 relocated, and 17 new specimen trees and palms added. This is an AUD Priority Housing development with a proposed density of 53 dwelling units per acre. Project is within the Commercial/High Residential Priority Overlay (37-63 du/ac).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on June 14, 2017. Project requires CEQA Exemption 15183.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect; Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect; Steve Amerikaner, Attorney; and Megan Arciniega, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Arciniega outlined the staff memo, project description letter, Conditions of Approval, and arborist report submitted to the HLC.
2. Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission that the Historic Structures/Sites Report Letter Addendum, finding the size, bulk, and scale of the proposal compatible with the site per CEQA, was accepted by the HLC on June 14, 2017.

Public comment opened at 5:28 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Gordon Sichi, Headmaster of the adjacent Anacapa School, stated that the school is not closing. He emphasized that this is not a good site for an AUD project on this historic corner.
2. Christine Neuhauser ceded her time to Anna Marie Gott. Ms. Gott commented that the proposal is too large for this area.
3. Mary Louise Days emphasized that this is a highly sensitive site, and high density housing should not be placed here. She also stated that cultural resource conditions of approval should be delineated today, and that conditions of approval should prohibit the combining of units on the third floor.
4. Kellam de Forest stated that an AUD project should never have been allowed for this site and expressed concern for the height, as the view from De La Guerra Street is important.
5. Steve Dowty, of the Pearl Chase Society, stated that this proposal is inappropriate for the site, as it is surrounded by historic resources.

6. Anne Petersen, of the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation, emphasized that the size, bulk, and scale are not compatible for a project adjacent to the founding site of our community. She also requested that any archaeological work be done in communication with the Trust.
7. Correspondence from Dee Duncan was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:41 p.m.

Note: The applicant's legal representative, Mr. Amerikaner, demanded that the Commission take action to either approve or deny the project.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments.

Action: Orías/_____. Motion failed for lack of second.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Commission accepted this as an AUD project.
2. The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
3. The Commission is grateful for the model and the progress made in the design.
4. The Commission supported the design as two separate buildings.
5. The loss of view is acceptable.
6. The setbacks are generous.
7. The paseo is acceptable, though there is a desire for additional sunlight.
8. Reduce the balconies on the southwest and southeast corners.
9. Pull back the third floor from the northeast corner.
10. Allow more sunlight in the open space; however, there is adequate open space provided in the plan, both private and common.
11. Give more attention to the architecture as it faces the end of De La Guerra Street.
12. Add a traditional fountain to the courtyard, perhaps in the middle as opposed to the side.
13. Add charm and poetry to the design, while keeping it rustic.
14. Study eliminating the third-floor studio.
15. The roof forms should be simplified.
16. The Commission wished for the historic flagpole to remain.
17. The Commission made the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
18. The Commission reviewed the proposed project and found that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project complies with the City Charter and Municipal Code. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its neighborhood.

- d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources, and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established public views.
 - f. The design of the project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.
19. The Conditions of Approval are approved, with the following amendments:
- a. On page 1, item 1, correct 53 dwelling units per acre to 54 dwelling units.
 - b. On page 2, item 6, specify that the arborist will be notified seven days in advance of construction activities.
 - c. On page 3, item 8, replace “applicant may provide” to “has the option to provide”; add “or amount determined by the Public Works Director” after the in lieu payment amount listed.
 - d. On page 4, item 2b, after “if feasible,” add “as determined by the Community Development Director or designee.”
 - e. On page 5, item 2c, specify that reporting to the school shall occur 14 days prior to commencement of work.
 - f. On page 5, item 4a, replace “whenever possible” with “shall be encouraged to be used.”
 - g. On page 5, item 4f, note that the phone number of the APCD contact for dust control regulation shall be included on the construction contact sign posted at the site.
 - h. Add a disclaimer that Condition 2, Notification to Residents and Condition 4, Construction Noise shall be applicable only if there is an active school adjacent to the project site.

Action: Suding/Drury, 4/3/1. (Grumbine, La Voie, and Orías opposed. Hausz abstained.)
Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Individual comments: Chair La Voie and Commissioners Grumbine and Orías opposed because they could not find the size, bulk, and scale compatible with the neighborhood, nor the appropriateness of the architecture.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:04 P.M. ***