



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES JULY 12, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Steve Hausz
Bill Mahan
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: La Voie (absent 2:34-3:15 p.m.), Suding (absent 2:25-3:15 p.m., left at 6:09 p.m.), Drury, Grumbine, Hausz (until 5:08 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Limón (until 2:32 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest stated that at the Pearl Chase Society meeting on July 6, concern was raised about the large, tall, bulky buildings approved under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The Society requests that new applications be halted pending evaluation of the program.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **June 28, 2017**, as submitted.

Action: Drury/Suding, 6/0/2. (Hausz abstained; Suding abstained from Item 4.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 12, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioners Mahan and Veyna.

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/1. (Suding abstained from Item B.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Chair La Voie announced that Steve Hausz is attending today as a new Commissioner.
2. Renee Brooke, City Planner, announced that Irma Unzueta is the new Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor, succeeding Jaime Limón, who is retiring.
3. The Commission recognized Jaime Limón and his 34 years of service to the City, and conferred upon him honorary designation as a City of Santa Barbara historic resource.
4. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. The appeal of the HLC denial of 101 W. Anapamu Street, a vacation rental conversion, will be heard by City Council on July 18. Mr. Grumbine volunteered to attend as representative of the HLC.
 - b. Chair La Voie will step down from Items 3-4.
 - c. Commissioner Suding will step down from Items 2-4.
 - d. Item 5, 1424 State Street, is changed to a comments-only review because environmental review is not complete.
5. Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission that at the July 26 meeting, the HLC will review the Structure of Merit designation of 49 properties on the Potential Historic Resources List.
6. Commissioner Hausz announced that he will step down from Item 7, 809 & 815 De La Vina Street.
7. Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, announced that an updated Infill Design Guidelines handout, which includes supplemental submittal requirements, is available for the HLC's use.
8. Commissioner Grumbine announced that he attended an American Institute of Architects (AIA) meeting, also attended by Councilmember Randy Rowse, about revitalizing retail on State Street. Commissioners Grumbine, Drury, Mahan, La Voie, and Veyna volunteered to attend future meetings.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting of July 12. The subcommittee reviewed 8 Mills Act applications, which will appear at the Full Commission in August.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. URBAN TREES & THE CHALLENGES THEY FACE

(1:40) (Presentation by Commissioner Suding.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Discussion held. Larger planter areas, appropriate plant selection, effective permeable paving, planting location, and soil type are important considerations in ensuring that urban trees grow and are healthy.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1220 & 1222 SAN ANDRES ST

R-3 Zone

(1:55)

Assessor’s Parcel Number:	039-151-010
Application Number:	MST2016-00211
Owner:	Edward St. George
Applicant:	Interdisciplinary Architects
Architect:	Interdisciplinary Architects

(Proposal for a multifamily residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD) and a voluntary lot merger of the parcels at 1220 and 1222 San Andres Street (APNS 039-151-010 and -011). The proposal includes the demolition of an existing duplex and three single-family dwellings totaling 4,831 square feet, and construction of seven new buildings comprising five duplexes and two single-family dwellings, for a total of 12 new dwelling units. Six buildings will have two stories and one building will have three stories. The unit mix will include 10 three-bedroom units, 1 two-bedroom unit, and 1 one-bedroom unit, ranging in size from 673 to 1,184 square feet with an average unit size of 995 square feet. The proposed density on this 29,291 square foot merged parcel will be 20 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be 18 uncovered and 3 covered parking spaces, for a total of 21 spaces, and 12 covered and secured bicycle parking spaces. Grading excavation and fill of 1,196 cubic yards will be balanced on site. Also proposed is the removal of nine trees. Total development on site will be 13,313 square feet. This project will address zoning violations identified in Zoning Information Reports ZIR2016-00211 and ZIR2015-00389 and Enforcement cases ENF2014-000621, ENF2015-00771, and ENF2016-00718.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report’s conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: **Accept the report with comment that the Commission requested that the Urban Historian examine the historic significance of the house.**

Action: Drury/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 1015 ORILLA DEL MAR

(2:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-322-015
 Application Number: MST2016-00053
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Carson Wollert, Project Engineer

(Proposal for Coastal Exemption for a 6,000 linear foot water main replacement located along E Cabrillo Blvd. and Orilla Del Mar.)

(Review After Final is requested for the design of the air release valve at 1015 Orilla Del Mar. Project was last reviewed at HLC Consent on June 28, 2017 and was referred to the Full Commission.)

Actual time: 2:34 p.m.

Present: Kathy Taylor, Water System Manager and Carson Wollert, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that this is the site of a designated Structure of Merit, designed by the same architect who designed the Courthouse. The installation was brought to Planning staff's attention by the property owner.
2. Ms. Plummer stated that the Commission should comment only on the design of the valve cover, as there are constraints on the location.

Public comment opened at 2:37 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest asked about the size of the cover.
2. Steve Ridgeway, representing the owner, stated that there was no notice that this installation was to take place, and he emphasized concern about its location near a historic property. He also requested that it be secured properly.

Public comment closed at 2:40 p.m.

Motion: **Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. Return with samples of the material, and consider other colors.
2. Research other shape options.
3. Provide accurate dimensions.
4. Ensure the current installation is secured.

Action: Veyna/Hausz, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(2:20) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 017-313-018
 Application Number: MST2017-00415
 Owner: Richard & Margaret Gunner Trust
 Architect: William La Voie
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn/Convivo

(Proposal for minor alterations to the Santa Barbara Inn consisting of the addition of a stone surround/arch at the Milpas Street porte cochere entrance, and for iron fencing and gates with stone piers at the Orilla Del Mar property line.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:55 p.m.

Present: William La Voie, Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer read the following State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory statement regarding William La Voie:

The City Attorney’s office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they serve on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Public comment opened at 3:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. Use cast stone on the arch; provide a sample.
2. The designs of the arch and the fence are acceptable.

Action: Veyna/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (La Voie and Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 1424 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-072-020
Application Number: MST2015-00442
Owner: 22483 PCH II, LP
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for changes to landscaping plans at an existing commercial parcel including the removal of 20 (10 to 14 inch in diameter) Eucalyptus trees and 6 (20 inch in diameter) Coral trees to be replaced with 6 Southern Magnolia, 3 Atlas Cedar, 2 Mediterranean Fan Palm, 6 Brisbane Box, 5 Chinese Pistache, and 9 Queen Palm. All other landscaping and hardscaping is to remain. No changes are proposed to the existing commercial building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed September 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; Richard Mason and Leigh Christman, Arborists, Arbor Services, Inc.; and Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst, City of Santa Barbara

Note: The applicant delivered the report regarding the removal of the coral trees during the hearing, and the Commission did not have sufficient time to review it.

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Plummer stated that the environmental analysis has not been completed, so this review is comments only.
2. Ms. Shelton noted that landscape design comments from the HLC would inform the environmental review of the project, including for visual impact and whether the tree replacement plan would provide adequate mitigation for the lost environmental value of the removed trees within a reasonable timeframe.

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commented that the coral trees and eucalyptus trees represent a familiar feature of the corner, and their loss will cause a negative visual impact.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission acknowledged the owner's efforts in addressing these trees, which are valuable to the City.
2. The Commission recognized the need to address the trees on this property and was sympathetic with the need for removal; however, the Commission was concerned about the loss of biomass and the negative visual impacts to the community.
3. The majority of the Commission wished to see the coral trees replaced with coral trees as opposed to magnolias, and the adjacent environment,

maintenance schedule, and irrigation schedule corrected to enhance the viability of those trees. The majority of the Commission requested that the proposed trees be planted in a minimum 60" box to mitigate visual impact.

- 4. Measures across the site should be proposed to enhance the viability of the new plant material. Measures may include permeable paving appropriate for oxygen and moisture transfer for the tree roots, root barriers where appropriate to protect adjacent structures, proper irrigation, and proper soil preparation.
- 5. The majority of the Commission requested a warranty bond for the plant material for 5 years.
- 6. The Commission suggested a biomass replacement of a minimum of 25% within 10 years.
- 7. Provide elevation drawings of the trees from the street and parking lot, including the building, showing the projected biomass at the time of installation and in 10 years.
- 8. The majority of the Commission could support the removal of all eucalyptus trees at the same time.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Hausz abstained.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:10 TO 4:19 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 32 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(3:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-028
 Application Number: MST2016-00076
 Owner: Carrillo Pacific, LLC
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP
 Applicant: Laura Benard

(Proposal to demolish an existing 5,917 square foot one-story building (former Greyhound Station) and all associated site development and construct a total of 11,277 square feet of new non-residential buildings, including a two-story 10,268 square foot retail/office building, and a one-story, 991 square foot retail building. The application requires a lot merger and Planning Commission review of a Development Plan. A total of 4 covered and 7 uncovered onsite parking spaces are provided for the proposed 19,468 net square foot parcel located in the 100% Parking Zone of Benefit. The proposal also includes outdoor patios and revised site landscaping, including the removal of two existing trees.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-17. Project was last reviewed on June 14, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Elizabeth Wentling, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Nicole Horn, Landscape Architect, CJMLA

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she is in support of the commemorative sign as a tribute to the memory of the Greyhound station.

Public comment opened at 4:30 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that a “Bus” commemorative sign would be confusing to the public, and he preferred a memorial plaque.

Public comment closed at 4:31 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. The Commission considered the project a gift to the City in its reduced size, bulk, and scale, and a nice addition to this important corner.
2. The Commission supported the use of slumpstone on certain walls and portions of the building; provide a photograph or sample to show texture.
3. The Commission would like some commemoration of the site as a former Greyhound bus station, but if the signage is not original, it needs to conform to the current sign ordinance.
4. Reconsider the design of the sandstone wall at the restaurant area to better relate to the building and the restaurant area.
5. Study some protection of the restaurant area from microparticles generated from street traffic.
6. The tree grates shall be unfinished and untreated cast iron.
7. Reconsider the flat roofed area for material that looks more natural and is more appropriate to the guidelines.
8. Restudy the columns on the north and south elevations.
9. Restudy the recommendation for a balcony on the corner.
10. Make an effort to improve the planter area surrounding the existing ficus trees and the pruning thereof.
11. The copper trim is to be patinated.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Hausz abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7.	809 & 815 DE LA VINA ST, 208 W DE LA GUERRA ST	C-2 Zone
<u>(3:40)</u>	Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-041-009, -008, -010	
	Application Number: MST2017-00017	
	Owner: 809 De La Vina Street, LLC	
	Owner: Jeremy Bassan	
	Architect: DesignARC	

(The project site contains a Queen Anne historic building eligible to be designated as a City Landmark: Ott House. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels: APNs 037-041-009, 037-041-008, 037-041-010 (809 and 815 De La Vina Street, and 208 W. De La Guerra Street). The project involves the demolition of all existing improvements, except the Ott House, and constructing 1 new three-story apartment building, and 1 new four-story apartment building. The unit mix will be 4 studio apartments, 27 one-bedroom apartments, and 11 two-bedroom apartments, with an average unit size of approximately 685 square feet. A ground-level parking garage with stackers is proposed under the new three-story building that will provide approximately 43 parking spaces and approximately 42 bike spaces. Project is within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 DU/AC.))

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only. Planning Commission review is required. Project was last reviewed February 8, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:08 p.m.

Present: Jeremy Bassan, Owner; and Mark Kirkhart, Architect & Melisa Cinarli Turner, Project Manager, DesignARC

Public comment opened at 5:29 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Wesley Wilson
2. Luis Velazquez
3. Paulette Rainbolt
4. Isabel Campanelli
5. Jestin Gaddy
6. Ellen Bildsten
7. Correspondence from the following people was acknowledged:
Joe Ferreira
Ksenia Sarkisova
Whitney Stuckey
Isabel Campanelli
Karolina Rodriguez
Gillian Conway
Ryan Skrupky
Beau Schmidt
Wesley Wilson
Kayvon Salafian
Maggie Bray
Samantha Friedman
Smokshane West, Zipcar
Kian Mitchum
Sarah Gower
Dan Crawford
Eric Mascheroni
Mandy Taylor-Gratzer
Kristen Weidemann, Paseo Nuevo
Nuria Reed
Home Furnace Company
Steve Markakis
Giuliana Mottin
Laura Bode, Santa Barbara Rental Property Association
Evan Geeb
Kasey Kepp
Ken Oplinger, Chamber of Commerce

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Jackie Ellis, neighbor, expressed concern that the proposal's size is out of scale for the neighborhood, parking will be a problem, and that the project has increased, not decreased, since the last review.
2. Matt Williams, neighbor, stated that the proposal is not appropriate for this one- and two-story neighborhood in its size and scale, creating a canyon effect, and he expressed concern for traffic flow and the use of leased parking spaces.

3. Don Sharpe, neighbor, asked that the Commission give careful consideration to the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria when evaluating the project.

Public comment closed at 5:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission cannot make the finding that the size, bulk, and scale of the project are appropriate to the neighborhood.
2. The Commission was skeptical of, though encouraged by, the offsite amenities qualifying the project to be in this neighborhood.
3. The architecture needs considerable restudy, both in scale and detail. Only two Commissioners could support the design of the building on the corner.
4. Consider the proximity of the garbage area to the living units.
5. Consider the screening and location of points of connection for utilities.
6. The proposal shows an innovative use of parking.
7. The proposal shows acceptable setbacks from the street and the historic resource.
8. The Commission appreciated the elimination of the driveway through the site.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Hausz stepped down. Suding absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:37 P.M. ***