



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

MAY 3, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Bill Mahan
Fermina Murray
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: La Voie, Suding, Drury, Grumbine (from 1:32-4:30 p.m.), Mahan (absent 5:31-5:37 p.m.), Orías, and Veyna
Members absent: Murray
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **April 19, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/1. (Suding abstained. Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Postpone Item B on the Consent Calendar of **May 3, 2017**.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **May 3, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan (Items A-D) and Commissioner Suding (Item A).
- Action: Suding/Mahan, 5/1/1. (Orías opposed. Grumbine abstained. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Item 8, 517 Chapala Street, is postponed two weeks at the applicant’s request.
 - b. Commissioner Grumbine will leave early.
2. Ms. Hernandez announced that Item 1, the Landmark designation of 901 N. Milpas Street, is postponed indefinitely.
3. Chair La Voie referred the Commission to the posted Public Meeting Procedures and stated that rebuttals from the applicant are not part of the meeting process and should not be encouraged.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

There will be an HLC Historic Structures Ordinance subcommittee meeting on May 4, 2017 at 10:00 a.m. in the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:38 TO 1:45 P.M. ***

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 901 N MILPAS ST

(1:45) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-313-015
 Owner: Philindia Properties

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy building located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue).)

- Motion: Postpone the item indefinitely.**
- Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 1301-1303 A STATE ST

(1:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-131-015, 039-131-014, 039-131-013
 Owner: First Church/Christ SCI/SB, Bosse Toy Train Museum, Inc., Koch Family Trust

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the Kem Weber building located at 1301-1303 A State Street.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m.

- 1. Kellam de Forest inquired if there was another building on this site before the current one.
- 2. Fermina Murray, historian, expressed support for the designation.
- 3. Correspondence from Fran Galt in support was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:52 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-5 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the Kem Weber Building located at 1301-1303 A State Street.

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST

(2:05) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-082-002

Owner: The Betty Jo Lauritson Trust

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the Ygnacio House located at 214 East De La Guerra Street.)

Actual time: 1:56 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

- 1. Fermina Murray
- 2. Mary Louise Days
- 3. Correspondence from Fran Galt and Susette Naylor was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-6 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the Ygnacio House located at 214 East De La Guerra Street, with comments:

- 1. The Commission desired the restoration of the widow’s walk and appropriate replication of the original roofing material as part of the construction of the adjacent building.
- 2. In the Staff Report, credit the source material of Mary Louise Days.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 600 OLIVE ST

(2:15) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-171-006

Owner: Jeanette Arnoldi-Schall Irrevocable Trust

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the Arnoldi’s Restaurant located at 600 Olive Street.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

- 1. Fermina Murray
- 2. Mary Louise Days
- 3. Jeanette Arnoldi, owner, stated that the designation is an honor for her grandparents.
- 4. Correspondence from Fran Galt was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-7 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the Arnoldi’s Restaurant located at 600 Olive Street.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

5. MULTIPLE HISTORIC RESOURCES PER ATTACHED EXHIBIT A

(2:25)

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on July 26, 2017 to consider designating the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A as Structures of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-9 to hold a Public Hearing on July 26, 2017 to consider Structure of Merit designations of the multiple historic resources per attached Exhibit A.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:17 TO 2:25 P.M. ***

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1809 MIRA VISTA AVE

(2:30) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 019-090-026

Owner: John and Daryl Stegall

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report and Public Hearing to consider designation as a Structure of Merit of the Tudor Revival style Phillips House designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings in 1925 located at 1809 Mira Vista Avenue as a Structure of Merit.)

(A. Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report. The report found the Phillips House at 1809 Mira Vista Avenue is eligible for designation as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Historians, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agreed with the conclusions of the report that the project meets CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:31 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

(B. Public Hearing and consideration of Structure of Merit designation.)

Actual time: 2:39 p.m.

Public comment opened at 2:39 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2017-8 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Tudor Revival style Phillips House constructed in 1925 located at 1809 Mira Vista Avenue.

1. Add the front steps and walkway to the designation as contributing historic elements of the property.

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW**7. 1809 MIRA VISTA AVE****E-1 Zone****(2:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-026
 Application Number: MST2016-00575
 Owner: John & Daryl Stegall
 Architect: Tom Henson

(This is a revised project description. The residence is proposed for Structure of Merit designation on May 3, 2017, designed by architects by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings in the Tudor Revival style in 1925. The proposal includes a 170 square foot addition to an existing 408 square foot one-car garage, an interior remodel for a new kitchen and family room that includes a 405 square foot first-floor addition, and a 35 square foot second-floor addition. Also proposed is the addition of an 805 square foot rear terrace, new dormers, new French doors, and a new pool. Project includes raising the existing driveway footprint and adjacent retaining wall. The proposed total of 5,235 square foot on the 23,997 square foot lot is 110% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:43 p.m.

Present: Tom Henson, Architect; Amy Blakemore, Landscape Architect; and John Stegall, Owner

Staff comments: Mr. Limón responded to questions regarding the Commission's purview relative to protection of private views. He indicated that the Commission's focus should be on general compliance with the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance (NPO) Good Neighbor Guidelines and Tips, which state that the HLC may evaluate if the applicant considered the degree of private view blockage impacts when designing the project. Design measures such as adjusting the height or location of the addition may be solutions to consider if readily feasible. The Commission may not deny the project solely on the basis that private views are being blocked.

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest inquired if the fireplace and chimneys need to be so radically modified.
2. Trevor Martinson spoke in support of the project.
3. Fleurette Janigian, adjacent neighbor, spoke of concerns about loss of views and privacy with the proposed addition.
4. George Barsom, relative of the adjacent neighbor, expressed concerns about the project's compatibility with design guidelines, particularly views and privacy, and about the noticing process.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The majority of the Commission expressed concern for the blockage of views from the neighboring property and therefore requested story poles for the addition of the family room and the garage, and an organized site visit.
2. Show the actual condition of the chimneys on the drawings, including what is at the top.

3. Study the new chimneys to match the existing more closely in design.
4. Study the paving materials on both horizontal and vertical surfaces in reference to what might be original or is historically appropriate to this style.
5. The landscape design should emulate and be inspired by the original Lockwood de Forest design.
6. The grading required for the pool terrace is to be minimized and carefully addressed; attend to the drainage.
7. The design of the terrace should receive additional consideration in its symmetry or asymmetry, particularly in its termination at the pool terrace.
8. Work with the neighbors as part of a good neighbor policy.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:59 TO 4:09 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW

8. 517 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2017-00151
 Owner: Ed St. George
 Agent: Trish Allen, Sepps
 Applicant: Shelby Messner
 Architect: Keith Nolan
 Architect: On Design

(This is a revised new proposed project. Project is adjacent to a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish an existing 1,300 square foot office building and construct a new 3-story, 15-room hotel and two-unit apartment building, for a total 10,890 square feet of hotel/residential space. Parking will be provided on the first level of the building with a 7,102 square foot covered parking garage, and will allocate 16 spaces for the hotel, 4 for the apartments, 1 additional, and 3 bike spaces. The 15 hotel rooms will be on the second and third level of the building, and the two apartment suites on the third level. The project includes a voluntary lot merger of two parcels, and the use of minor and small addition non-residential square footage. A transfer of existing development rights will be taken from 3714-3744 State Street. Project requires Development Plan approval by Planning Commission for the new nonresidential square footage.)

Motion: Postpone the item two weeks to May 17, 2017.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**9. 333 W ORTEGA ST****R-4 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00397
 Owner: John R. Whitehurst
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Architect: Tracy Burnell

(The structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List as contributing to the Castillo Street Historic District. Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing four-unit apartment building using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project proposes the demolition of an existing 760 square foot detached four-car garage, and the construction of 2,017 square feet of first- and second-story additions comprising four new dwelling units. The project also proposes a 1,538 square foot attached garage that will provide eight covered parking spaces using mechanical parking stackers, and includes new landscaping, and 20 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The eight units on the property will have an average unit size of 660 square feet, and the proposed density will be 37 dwelling units per acre using the Priority Housing Overlay on a 9,375 square foot parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of High Density Residential 28-36 dwelling units per acre. The total residential floor area is 4,791 square feet. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested Zoning Modifications to allow a second-floor deck to encroach into the interior setback and for a common open yard area that does not meet minimum 20' x 20' dimensions.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments Only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for the proposed zoning modification. Project was last reviewed on October 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:09 p.m.

Present: Tracy Burnell, Architect; Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; and Tim Hazeltine, Historian, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposed modifications are aesthetically appropriate and do not pose consistency issues with El Pueblo Design Guidelines or the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance.
2. The current proposal is an improvement to the previous design.
3. The size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the historic resource and the neighborhood.
4. The Commission applauded the retention of the jacaranda tree and the significant landscaping on the site.
5. Restudy the west elevation, second-floor porch to be more compatible with the architectural style.
6. Concerns were expressed about the appropriateness of the proposed site walls and paving materials to the prime interpretive period of the historic resource.
7. Provide more information about the mechanical parking system, including cut sheet, motor noise, motor locations, and backup power.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

HLC-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**10. 1220 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-059
 Application Number: MST2016-00555
 Owner: Nassau Land Company, LP
 Applicant: The Towbes Group, Inc.
 Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP
 Engineer: Stantec Engineers

(Pre-Application Consultation proposal for exterior improvements to the existing public paseo north of the Granada Theatre. The project includes the demolition of an existing pedestrian ramp and repaving of an existing parking lot. Construction of two new residential garages of 476 and 535 square feet are proposed, as well as a new trash and recycling enclosure. Improvements to the public paseo will include a new stair, ramp, and lighting, and new 8'-6' foot high walls to enclose bus/truck parking service to the Granada Theatre. Access to the parking garages, bus/truck parking and trash/recycling enclosure will be off Paseo De Las Granadas with no changes to occur to Paseo De Las Granadas. The paseo connecting State Street to Paseo De Las Granadas will be enhanced with a new site wall, landscaping, lighting, and paving to match Paseo De Las Granadas.)

(Pre-Application Consultation Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 4:50 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Craig Minus, Applicant, Towbes Group

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer read staff comments from Allison De Busk, Project Planner, regarding concerns about the proposed wall.

Public comment opened at 4:58 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired about ingress and egress at the garage structure for trucks and buses.

Public comment closed at 4:59 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission supported the garages and their location and the consolidation of the trash enclosure.
2. Study the aesthetics of the emergency exit at the Granada and Tupelo.
3. Consider this as part of the parking structure plaza, and provide an enhanced paving experience and more landscaping.
4. The Commission expressed concern about the balkanization and internal divisions caused by the wall.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**11. CITYWIDE****(4:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-084
Application Number: MST2015-00392
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Crown Castle/NG West, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Proposed wireless facilities in the right-of-way at three separate site locations in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. 1) 100 Block W. Gutierrez Street: Removal of an existing parking sign pole to be replaced with a 19' tall decorative street pole with a canister antenna and an adjacent electrical meter cabinet containing Radio Remote Units (RRUs). 2) 100 Block W. Cota Street: Proposed installation of a canister antenna atop an existing 33'-9" service pole with a below grade equipment vault containing RRUs. This proposal is in the Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District. 3) 100 Block Chapala Street: Proposed removal of a streetlight to be replaced with a 29'-6" decorative light standard with a canister antenna. Also proposed are a new service meter pedestal, pad, and equipment cabinet containing RRUs. This proposal is in the potential West Beach Historic District.)

(Review After Final is requested to change the design of the current antenna at 100 Block of Cota Street.)

Actual time: 5:28 p.m.

Present: Sharon James and Jim Hoffstaff, Applicants, Crown Castle

Public comment opened at 5:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with condition that the exposed conduit be painted to match the pole.

Action: Drury/Suding, 5/0/0. (Mahan stepped down. Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**12. 1032 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-2 Zone****(4:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-212-024
 Application Number: MST2016-00071
 Owner: David Myers
 Applicant: David Watkins

(The proposal is a mixed-use project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program (Priority Housing Overlay) on two lots totaling 7,497 square feet with a density of 48 dwelling units per acre (du/ac). The project is proposed as a three-story building, with eight units and 1,369 square feet of nonresidential development, with 11 covered parking spaces. The units will include 7 two-bedroom units and one studio unit, with an average unit size of 970 square feet. Existing on the site are a one-story office building and a one-story single-family residence that will be demolished. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a zoning modification to allow development of one dwelling unit without providing the required private outdoor living space. A Voluntary Lot Merger to merge parcels APN 029-212-002 and APN 029-212-024 to create a single lot will be required.)

(Comments Only. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 072-16. Project was last reviewed and received Project Design Approval on December 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:37 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields and David Watkins, DesignARC; and Kim True, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:48 p.m.

The following people expressed opposition or concerns:

1. Darcy Cornwall, neighbor, spoke of concerns about the roof deck and height of the stairwell.
2. Mark Cornwall, neighbor, emphasized concerns about the roof deck and height of the stairwell.

Public comment closed at 5:52 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Commission with comments:

1. The majority of the Commission found the size, bulk, and scale appropriate to the site and the neighborhood.
2. Continue to study the corner stairway and any negative impacts on the adjacent property's view.
3. The Commission supported the reduction of the deck area and its setback from the property lines as currently acceptable.
4. The landscape palette is commendable; maximize use of sculptural plants as a way to accent the architecture.
5. One Commissioner expressed concern about the availability of play areas on the ground level for children.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:05 P.M. ***