



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

MARCH 22, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Bill Mahan
Fermina Murray
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

An archived video of this meeting is available at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:32 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Suding (until 4:48 p.m.), and Veyna
Members absent: Murray
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Sheila Lodge, Planning Commissioner, asked for HLC support in making a change to the Average Unit-size Density (AUD) Incentive Program ordinance. The ordinance allows for common open space on any floor, which does not leave space for canopy trees. Ms. Lodge emphasized the benefits that landscaping provides to residents.

B. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 22, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan (Items B-H) and Commissioner Suding (Item A).

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, asked the Commission to confirm the accuracy of the draft minutes for Item 1 on the March 17 special meeting agenda. The Commission confirmed.
2. Mr. Limón announced the following:
 - a. The Joint City Council/Planning Commission meeting will be held on April 6. Chair La Voie will attend, as will Commissioners Drury and Grumbine. This is the time for HLC concerns to be addressed in Planning Division workload, including the concern about the impact of the Accessory Dwelling Unit state law on historic resources.
 - b. On March 28, the Council Ordinance Committee will review the outline of proposed changes to the Historic Structures segment of the Municipal Code; subsequently, a subcommittee of the HLC will be formed to review.
3. Commissioner Orías stated that for the project at 1703 Chapala Street, reviewed at the last meeting, she would like the Building & Safety Department to examine the exit ladder at the window well of the basement, particularly studying the transition of the top of the ladder to the ground surface. Mr. Limón responded that staff will discuss with the Building Official.

D. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Mahan reported on the Designations Subcommittee meeting of March 22. Because of the Accessory Dwelling Unit state law, the subcommittee would like to accelerate and increase designation of properties on the Potential Historic Resources List. The subcommittee also discussed California Register of Historical Resources designations and will request assistance in this from historic preservation groups.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

1. 212 CANON DR

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-162-002

Owner: Edelheit Family Revocable Trust

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider designating the Tudor Revival style house constructed in 1929 located at 212 Canon Drive as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-1 to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Tudor Revival style house located at 212 Canon Drive.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 1306 ALTA VISTA RD****(1:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-100-036

Owner: Jeffrey Sipress

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider designating the Craftsman style house located at 1306 Alta Vista Road as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-2 to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Craftsman style house located at 1306 Alta Vista Road.

Action: Suding/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 1815 LAGUNA ST****E-1 Zone****(1:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-051-009

Application Number: MST2011-00044

Owner: Greg Hesterberg

Designer: Tom Kress

(This structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, eligible as a Structure of Merit: Lockwood de Forest, Sr. Residence, constructed in 1915. Proposal for interior alterations to remove three illegal dwelling units and return the building to its legally permitted use as a single-family residence. Also proposed is to construct a new 709 square foot attached two-car garage and roof deck, enclose an existing 40 square foot stairwell from the garage to the house, replace the gazebo siding with new wood and rebuild the railing at the loggia end to match vintage photos, and replace the three-part living room window facing the loggia with a three-part door with wood base panels that will maintain the height and width of the existing opening. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-01018. The project will result in a residence of 7,421 square feet, which is a guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) of .31 or 140% of the maximum FAR.)

(Review After Final is requested for as-built changes including: the removal of two ficus trees, changes to driveway surfacing, alterations to landscape and hardscape, and removal of non-original, as-built windows on the garage. Concrete paving for the first 100 feet of driveway along the existing footprint for a total 1,248 square feet is requested to address ENF2015-00931. The project also requests the installation of a catch basin and drain to a dispersal ditch. Project was last reviewed on February 22, 2017.)

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Tom Kress, Designer; and Greg Hesterberg, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Kellam de Forest stated that a light on the roof deck at all hours is problematic.
2. Ana Citrin, attorney for adjacent neighbor Gregory Dahlen, spoke of concerns about the light on the roof deck. Correspondence from Ms. Citrin was also acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued to Consent with comments:

1. The lantern light fixture as installed is not acceptable. To be acceptable, the light fixture must be of a style and scale appropriate to the house; be frosted glass with a lower intensity; and light the walking surface, not spread light horizontally, particularly across the property line.
2. The proposal of the jacaranda tree to replace the ficus tree is acceptable, with a 24" box.
3. The sand finish in the driveway is required.
4. Indicate on the drawings that windows will be removed, in standard format.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 226-232 E ANAPAMU ST; 1121 & 1117 GARDEN ST; 223 E FIGUEROA ST H; 223 E FIGUEROA ST G R-O Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 029-162-006, -007, -008, -009, -010, -012, -020
 029-161-021
 Application Number: MST2017-00092
 Owner: Barranca Enterprises, Inc.
 Architect: DesignARC

(Project site contains twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes constructed in 1905 that are eligible to be designated as Structures of Merit. Proposal for a new mixed-use apartment/commercial structure using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of eight parcels (APNs 029-162-006, 029-162-007, 029-162-008,-029-162-009, 029-162-010, 029-162-012, 029-162-020, 029-162-021). Proposal includes demolishing all existing improvements, except the twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes, which will be relocated to the Garden Street Frontage to provide better context for the early 19th century buildings, and constructing a new four-story apartment/commercial building. The unit mix will be 24 one-bedroom apartments, 22 two-bedroom apartments, and 6 three-bedroom apartments, for a total of 52 residential units, and an average unit size of 809 square feet per unit. Also proposed are 87 parking spaces provided in a new 34,079 square foot, two-level basement parking garage, and 52 bike parking spaces. Project is within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac). A Historic Structures/Sites Report will be required to evaluate all structures on the site and to evaluate the impacts of the proposed project on the potential historic resources. Project also requires review by Planning Commission.)

(Comments Only.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Present: Greg Reitz, Developer, Rethink Development; and Mark Shields, Melisa Turner, and Mark Kirkhart, DesignARC

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she met with the applicants and historian Alexandra Cole, who will prepare the Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR). The main issue is how to build around the existing twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes in the Spanish Colonial Revival style required in El Pueblo Viejo. They had a preliminary discussion about relocating the homes together on the same lot to face Garden Street, as it contains other late-nineteenth and early-twentieth-century buildings and reads as a residential neighborhood, whereas Anapamu Street has developed with more commercial, Spanish Colonial Revival buildings. Ms. Hernandez recommended moving the houses together, as they read well side-by-side as twins. The HSSR will provide more information in its evaluation of all buildings on the site.

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m.

The following people spoke in opposition or with concerns:

1. Steve Hoegerman, nearby resident, submitted a letter and spoke of concerns about size, bulk, and scale; demolishing the cottages; protection of the courtyard; and parking.
2. Theron Kontos, nearby resident, echoed Mr. Hoegerman's comments about the impact of the project on the area, and expressed concern about foot traffic through the courtyard.
3. Tom Kapernekas, representing the owner of a nearby property, stated that the cottages should remain as a cohesive eight, and commented on the lack of sunlight that the new development will cause.
4. Nonie Hamilton, nearby resident, stated that the proposal is not compatible with the neighborhood, and she is opposed to the encroachment into courtyard and demolishing the two cottages.
5. Josephine Di Loreto's letter with concerns was read into the record, and Ms. Di Loreto emphasized the proposal's size and its encroachment into the cottages.
6. Kellam de Forest wondered about the history of the block and the courtyard, and commented on the height of the project and the canyonization of Anapamu Street.
7. Correspondence from JoAnn Chenovick with concerns was read into the record.

The following people spoke in support:

1. Addison Proctor emphasized the lack of housing in the City and encouraged urban infill.
2. Gilbert Garcia expressed support for high-density housing in the City and stated that the project's massing is sensitive to the surrounding neighborhood.
3. Christos Celmayster emphasized the housing shortage in the City and stated that the proposal fits the AUD design and will help the downtown economy.
4. Ken Oplinger, Santa Barbara Chamber of Commerce, stated that the proposal meets the goals of the AUD program to provide housing to workers and is compatible with the neighborhood.
5. Steve Harrel stated that this project fulfills a housing need and expressed support for the architecture and the relocation of the Queen Anne homes to Garden Street.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. A site visit is important to understand the building and context of the neighborhood.
2. The Commission requested that the Urban Historian evaluate the courtyard at 223 Figueroa Street for its historic significance.

3. The Commission will require a 3-D massing model of both the proposed building and the adjoining structures, and may require story poles to further evaluate impact.
4. The Commission is concerned about neighborhood compatibility and the proposal's overwhelming the neighborhood.
5. A solar access study for the adjoining properties may be required.
6. The Commission expressed general support for relocation of the twin Queen Anne Free Classic style homes and looks forward to review of the HSSR.
7. The Commission expressed concern about the mass and scale of the four-story element.
8. The Commission expressed concern about the mass and scale of the portion adjacent to the bungalows; this two-story mass fills the site to the setbacks, which should be mitigated.
9. The Commission expressed concern about the density in this neighborhood and the livability of both the proposed units and the adjacent properties.
10. Study the composition of the building as it addresses the corner and the four-story element in the center.
11. The Commission expressed concern about the architectural language of portions of the building being appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo.
12. The Commission expressed concern about the lack of randomness, serendipity, and poetry in the building.
13. The motor court should be protected.
14. The Commission supported the amount of open space proposed but would like to see the buildings articulated and separated with generous paseos and perhaps a courtyard.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:49 TO 3:59 P.M. ***

HLC-PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

5. 113 W DE LA GUERRA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-082-027
Application Number:	MST2015-00626
Owner:	John R. Dewilde
Architect:	DMHA

(The building at 113 W. De La Guerra Street is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, eligible as a Structure of Merit: W.D. Smith Building, constructed in 1928. Pre-Application Consultation Review of a proposal for a 23-unit mixed-mixed use project to be developed on two parcels under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. The project proposes the demolition of two existing 1,113 and 923 square foot commercial buildings, two outdoor patios, 15 surface parking spaces, and the near complete demolition of a 4,455 square foot commercial building, of which the historic façade and tile roof will be preserved. The project proposes to construct an 18,298 square foot, two- and three-story mixed-use building that includes 16,669 square feet of residential area and 1,629 square feet of commercial area. Twenty-seven parking spaces will be provided by an at-grade parking garage. The residential component comprises 23 residential units with an average unit size of 724 square feet. The two parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential (28-36 du/ac). The proposed density on the lots totaling 16,325 square feet will be 61 units per acre, as allowed by the AUD Priority Housing Overlay. The project requires Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet, and will require a voluntary lot merger.)

(Comments Only; One-Time Pre-Application Consultation Review.)

Actual time: 3:59 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills and Ed de Vicente, DMHA

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest asked about the height of the building and tenant entrances.
2. Nancy Parker, neighbor, spoke of concerns about setbacks and the proposal's impacts on light, noise, and privacy.

Public comment closed at 4:29 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The proposal is an excellent example of infill in the City, with an excellent design, site response, and neighborhood compatibility response.
2. The Commission commended the designers for being careful about the architectural style and scale of the proposal, which are very Santa Barbara and appropriate to the guidelines.
3. The Commission supported the use of the brick echoing the brick on the Hazard Cycle Building, and the preservation of the Hazard Cycle Building.
4. The response of the building to the open spaces and light and air of adjoining buildings was commended.
5. Lowering the roof of the stairwell with a shed roof was suggested to provide more variety and light.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:47 TO 4:51 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 1601 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(3:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	027-181-009
Application Number:	MST2015-00524
Owner:	1601 State Street Hotel Investors, LP
Agent:	Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
Architect:	The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(This is a revised project. The El Prado Inn main building, constructed in 1959, is a designated Structure of Merit as a Mid-Century Modern Motor Inn. The proposal consists of additions and alterations at the site of the existing "El Prado" La Quinta Inn and Suites, including demolition of the existing 6,399 square foot annex (14 rooms), and the construction of a 38,052 square foot addition to the existing hotel of a new 3-story hotel addition, with 66 new hotel rooms. The ground level will have at-grade garage parking, the second level will have garage parking and 6 hotel rooms, and the second and third floors will house 60 hotel rooms that average 375 square feet. Along with the hotel rooms, the building will include 4,985 square feet of support space for hotel functions. Uncovered parking spaces are to be demolished and replaced with 122 covered parking spaces. The new vehicle entry and check in will be at the rear of this addition, and the present entrance shall be reconfigured to include a putting green, low landscaping, and a new porte-cochère modeled on the original 1959 plans that were not executed. The new development area will total 73,707 square feet (this includes a 3,000 square foot small additions credit for each lot). Two interior setback modifications are required to allow the non-residential addition to encroach into the 20' required interior setback along the south property lines. The additional non-residential square footage will be acquired through a Transfer of Existing Development Rights (TEDR) with the former Sandman Hotel site.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments Only; project requires Environmental Assessment and review by Planning Commission for requested Zoning Modifications. Project was last reviewed on June 15, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Laura Benard, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Brodison stated that interior setback modifications are required because the building is adjacent to an R-4 lot. The project is returning to HLC for its comments on the modifications before proceeding to Planning Commission.

Public comment opened at 5:02 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Commission found the proposed modifications aesthetically appropriate and that they do not pose consistency issues with HLC Guidelines.
2. The Commission supported the balconies remaining and found their removal regrettable.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (Murray and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

7. 29 W ANAPAMU ST

C-2 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00487
 Owner: Stuart Fuss
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal to convert attic area to additional 585 square feet of new office on an existing 17,395 square foot, four-story office building. Exterior alterations include raising the ceiling and extending the floor of the attic by approximately 10 feet to convert attic to floor area, and adding a third-floor balcony. The overall building height will remain unchanged at 45'.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project received Project Design Approval on January 11, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:05 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, AB Design Studio; and Stuart Fuss, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition that the chimney on the north elevation shall have a depth of 4 ½ feet.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 6/0/0. (Murray and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00284
 Owner: American Tradition, LLC
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Mike Niemann

(Proposal for a 48-room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site and will comprise no less than 26 rooms in two-story attached casitas and no less than 20 rooms configured within a two to three-story "Inn" building complex located along the northern property line. The proposed square footage on this lot is 84,478 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Fourth Concept Review; Comments Only. Substantial Conformance Determination will be made by the Community Development Director. Project was last reviewed on February 8, 2017.)

Actual time: 5:14 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:31 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission found that in general, the site plan is aesthetically appropriate and an improvement to the previous plan.
2. The size, bulk, and scale are improved.
3. The simplification of the architecture is improved but needs further study.
4. The Commission wished to see a more Santa Barbara expression of architecture, particularly in the use of stone and arches.
5. The Commission supported the grouping of rooms and village approach to the design. Continue to pursue the village feel.
6. The Commission supported the landscape concept and design.
7. A concern for micro environments and the impact of salt air on plant material was expressed.
8. The Commission found the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The proposed development project's design is compatible with the City Charter and Municipal Code.

- b. The proposed design is compatible with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood, as developed further.
- c. The size, bulk, and scale of the proposed development are appropriate.
- d. The design of the proposed project is sensitive to and an improvement upon public views.
- e. The design of the proposed development has an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:53 P.M. ***