



City of Santa Barbara
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MINUTES
MARCH 17, 2017

1:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Bill Mahan
Fermina Murray
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

An archived video of this meeting is available at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:05 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Drury, Grumbine, La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Suding (until 4:00 p.m.), and Veyna
Members absent: Murray
Staff present: Limón (until 2:08 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **February 22, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 5/0/2. (La Voie abstained from Item 2; Suding abstained from Items 3-4. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 8, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Suding/Veyna, 6/0/1. (Suding abstained from Item H. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that the El Prado Inn project at 1601 State Street will be reviewed at the Planning Commission (PC) meeting of April 6. Chair La Voie stated that HLC comments from the March 22 review will be forwarded to the PC.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced the following:

a. Regarding the new Accessory Dwelling Unit state law, until a local ordinance is adopted, local ordinances on Accessory Dwelling Units are null and void. The implications of this are on single-family homes that are owner-occupied with one additional unit only. Until the new local ordinance is written and adopted, there is no design review required for historic resources proposing Accessory Dwelling Units, and no additional parking required in historic districts; these currently include El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Brinkerhoff Landmark District, and the Lower Riviera Special Design District. It is possible that a local ordinance may be able to require design review only on buildings listed on the California Register of Historic Resources. Santa Barbara currently only has 50 buildings listed on the California Register of Historic Resources, and it is an arduous process to nominate buildings to the register, as the State Historic Preservation Office requires a National Register nomination form to be completed.

Staff and Chair La Voie will draft a letter of concern to the City Council, asking that historic preservation be made a top priority in the local ordinance; the draft will be shared with the Commission.

b. The City Council Ordinance Committee will meet on March 28 to review an outline of changes to the Historic Structures segment of the Municipal Code. Subsequently, a subcommittee of the HLC will be formed for input on the ordinance.

c. The California Preservation Foundation Conference will be held in Pasadena on May 10-13. Any Commissioners interested in attending should notify staff.

3. Mr. Limón announced that the Sign Committee will be reconstituted this year.

4. Commissioner Suding announced the following:

a. He will step down from Item 5, 11 W. Pedregosa Street.

b. He and Commissioner Veyna met with the applicant from the open space area at State and Micheltorena Streets and discussed strategy for removal of coral trees and thinning of other trees; the proposal will be reviewed by the HLC.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Drury reported on the Arts Advisory Committee meeting of March 16. The Funk Zone mural at 10 E. Yanonali Street was accepted.

- F. There will be an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting on Wednesday, March 22, 2017 at 10:00 a.m. at 630 Garden Street in the Community Development 2nd Floor Conference Room.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. CITYWIDE****(1:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number:	099-MS-0PD
Application Number:	MST2017-00059
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	Planning Division

(Infill Design Guidelines to be inserted into existing HLC General Design Guidelines & Meeting Procedures.)

(Recommendation to the City Council for adoption of proposed guidelines.)

Actual time: 1:30 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner and Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest spoke in support of the guidelines and asked about the definition for the term "adjacent."
2. Greg Reitz stated that Floor-to-Lot Area Ratio (FAR) is not well defined, and he emphasized the importance of private open space on balconies; the guidelines seem to favor open space on the ground floor.
3. Correspondence from Virginia Rehling was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 1:53 p.m.

Motion: Recommend to City Council the adoption of the proposed guidelines, with comment:

1. The Historic Landmarks Commission intends that the guidelines will always be interpreted with reference to the power and duty of the Historic Landmarks Commission under City Charter Section 817.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

Additional comments:

1. The Commission requested a method of notification to the HLC for projects adjacent to historic resources. The Urban Historian will provide written recommendations for such projects to the Architectural Board of Review, and the HLC will be copied on this memoranda and notified of the outcome.

2. Chair La Voie expressed concern about staff approvals of porches and recommended that these appear as Consent agenda items. Staff responded that this would be addressed in a future review of design guidelines.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

2. 1703 CHAPALA ST

R-4 Zone

(1:35)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	027-092-014
Application Number:	MST2016-00274
Applicant:	Justin Hendrix
Owner:	Well Being and Capital Funds Trust
Architect:	Bryan Murphy

(This property is listed on the City's Potential Historic Resources List, eligible as a Landmark as a Queen Anne Free Classic style building constructed in 1903. Proposal for a new multi-family residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. The proposal includes three new dwelling units to be constructed partially below grade in the basement of an existing three-story (basement plus two stories above grade), 2,610 net square foot single-family dwelling unit. The residential unit mix will include 3 new one-bedroom units at the basement level totaling 1,374 square feet and 1 2,760 square foot five-bedroom unit on the existing ground- and second-floor levels. Also proposed is a 60 square foot one-story addition to the existing 328 square foot detached garage, and a 72 square foot laundry room attached to the garage. The average unit size will be 1,034 square feet. The proposed density on the 9,750 square foot parcel will be 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium High Density Residential of 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be two covered and two uncovered parking spaces, one Americans with Disabilities accessible isle and parking space, and bicycle parking. Grading excavation from the current 6 feet below surface to approximately 10 feet below surface will occur under the main building footprint, and the existing structure will be lifted upwards by 30 inches. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for zoning modifications to allow the garage addition to encroach into the required interior setbacks and front setback, and for the Americans with Disabilities accessible isle and parking space to encroach in the interior setback.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for requested Zoning Modifications. Project was last reviewed on February 22, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: Bryan Murphy, Architect; Rob Fowler, Landscape Architect; and Tim Hazeltine, Historian, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m.

Correspondence from Ashleigh Brilliant with concerns was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:25 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners find the modification aesthetically acceptable in order to move it forward to the Staff Hearing Officer? 6/1 Passed

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The proposed landscaping and potential screening of the accessible isle are commendable and aesthetically acceptable.
2. The Commission looks forward to the further development of the fencing and railings throughout the property, compatible with the architecture and broadly referential to the materials and design of the historic period of the house.
3. Give further consideration to paving material that is appropriate to the prime interpretative period of the house.
4. The majority of the Commission found the emergency exit at the window well acceptable.
5. All other elements of the design are acceptable.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 4/3/0. (Orías, Suding, and Veyna opposed. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

Additional comments: Commissioner Orías expressed concern that the ladder proposed as the basement exit is inadequate to provide an accessible exit. She requested that the Building Official pay attention to this issue.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:50 TO 3:04 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. 29 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:00)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-112-006
 Application Number: MST2016-00540
 Owner: Hannah Beachside, LLC
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal for a multi-tenant commercial restaurant tenant improvement. Project involves a façade change along the Cabrillo Street frontage. Improvements will include a new 94 square foot dining terrace, fixed and non-fixed seating, tables and furniture, new lighting fixtures, and a new trash enclosure.)

(Comments Only. Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 3:04 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio; Greg Christman, DMHA Architecture; and Carlos Luna, Owner, Los Agaves Restaurant

Public comment opened at 3:12 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired about the historic integrity of the building and about compatibility with surrounding buildings.

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposal is a great improvement in the design of the building.
2. The breakup, massing, and scale are appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo.
3. The Commission requested further exploration of the round columns, with the

suggestion that they be left a natural wood.

4. The Commission supported the use of an antique wood door and requested a photograph.
5. The Commission would like to see the exterior lighting incorporated into the design, and perhaps any future wind deflector and signage; also, show the relationship of the floor level to the sidewalk level and how it is being resolved in an artistic way.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

4. 518 STATE ST

C-M Zone

(2:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	037-173-046
Application Number:	MST2013-00140
Owner:	Charles & Georgetta Craviotto Survivors Trust
Architect:	Jose Luis Esparza
Business Name:	India Bazaar

(Proposal to remove an unpermitted pole and canvas structure and to construct an approximately 1,000 square foot wood trellis with permanent retractable canvas canopies on slide wires. The project includes five-foot tall wrought iron fencing with plaster columns and an eight inch plaster curb, two plaster entry archways, and a rear wrought iron access gate to enclose an outdoor retail site with an existing storage building. Decorative potted landscaping is also proposed. The project will address violations in enforcement case ENF2012-01002.)

(Comments Only. Project was last reviewed on December 7, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect; and Krishan Gupta, Business Owner

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued to the April 19 Consent calendar with comments:

1. Provide more elaboration on the east elevation.
2. The Commission suggested adding color; adding more detail, perhaps a chamfer, to the piers so that they are not flat; more landscape; and adding an antique Indian gate.
3. The more decorative south and east elevation wrought iron pattern is to be used for the west elevation.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 11 W PEDREGOSA ST****C-2 Zone****(2:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-026
 Application Number: MST2016-00485
 Owner: Emmet J. Hawkes Family Trust
 Architect: Thomas Oschner

(Proposal for a mixed-use commercial and residential project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. The project proposes the demolition of an existing 1,180 square foot single-family residence. In its place will be a 1,492 square foot two-story commercial building, six residential units to be located within two 2-story single-family residences and two 2-story duplexes, and an 86 square foot laundry building. The six residential units, which total 7,278 square feet, will have an average unit size of 1,213 square feet and a density of 14 du/ac. The project proposes six commercial parking spaces and six residential parking spaces, of which two will be covered. The project also includes covered bike parking, new landscaping and hardscape, new curb cuts, and a new trash enclosure. The project proposes a total of 8,856 square feet of development on an 18,548 square foot lot with a land use designation of Medium-High Density (15-27 du/ac).)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 16, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS; Brian Brodersen, Landscape Architect; Thomas Oschner, Architect; and Emmett Hawkes, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:11 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to the April 5 Full Commission meeting with comments:

1. The Commission commended the proposal as the best AUD project it has reviewed, and commended the applicants for providing livability.
2. Restudy the design of the mirador on State Street.
3. Add more palm trees along Pedregosa Street to tie the project together.
4. Make more of a statement with the design of the gate on State Street, to draw attention to it as an important entrance, perhaps with an arch.
5. This approval is subject to Conditions of Approval, including screening of the backflow device, location of any underground utilities, and recycling of any sandstone curbs.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 418 STATE ST & 416 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024, 037-212-023
Application Number: MST2017-00044
Owner: Gregory D. & Cheryl L. Young
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
Agent: Kevin Moore

(Proposal includes a lot tie between 418 and 416 State Street with interior and exterior improvements to occur at both parcels. Site improvements at 418 State Street include a remodel of the front façade, new flooring at the rear to become outdoor dining, and interior improvements. The existing detached storage structure behind 416 State Street will be remodeled to become a kitchen and storage space with exterior improvements to include new windows and doors. The existing parking lot will be adjusted to provide 4 uncovered parking spaces including an Americans with Disabilities Act parking space, a new trash enclosure, and bike parking. The site is within the 50% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Second Concept Review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on February 22, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect; and Ken Hughes, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to the April 5 Full Commission meeting with comments:

1. The Commission supported the retention of the arches and columns on the State Street façade.
2. The current design for the storefront at State Street is acceptable.
3. The increased landscaping in the rear is commendable.
4. The light fixture is acceptable.
5. Restudy the wood trellis and eyebrow awnings to be more traditional.
6. On any gate, the wood board should be vertical.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:46 P.M. ***