



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 8, 2017

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair*
PHILIP SUDING, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
PILAR PLUMMER, Planning Technician
JULIE RODRIGUEZ, Planning Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine, La Voie, Mahan, Orías, and Suding (absent 2:48-3:10 p.m. and 4:10-4:19 p.m.)

Members absent: Murray and Veyna

Staff present: Limón (until 2:24 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Rodriguez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 25, 2017, as amended.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 5/0/1. (Orías abstained. Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Commissioner Drury requested that a comment made during the story pole discussion item be included in the minutes to reflect that the HLC has the ability to require story poles. Mr. Limon clarified that it is understood that the boards and commissions can require story poles on any project. The focus of the discussion had been to consider whether story poles should be a mandatory requirement for AUD projects.

Commissioner Orías stated that story poles provide a true display of what the structure will look like, and she strongly recommended them.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Continue Item F, 100 Block State Street, indefinitely.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan (Items A-G) and Commissioner Suding (Items A and G).

Action: Suding/Drury, 5/0/1. (La Voie abstained from Item C. Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Commissioner Veyna will be absent from today's meeting.
- b. The project description for Item 3, 809 De la Vina Street, contains a clerical error. The correct number of units for the project is 34.
- c. The project at 1601 State Street, consisting of additions and alterations to the existing El Prado Hotel, will be reviewed at the Planning Commission meeting of March 16, 2017. Commissioners Orias and Drury will attend. Commissioner Suding will be a backup.

2. Mr. Limón announced the following:

- a. The Ordinance Committee will discuss proposed Post-Disaster Regulations on Tuesday, February 14, 2017 at 12:30 p.m. in Council Chambers. Chair La Voie will attend.
- b. The Planning Commission will discuss the proposed Infill Design Guidelines on Thursday, February 16, 2017.
- c. City Council will be considering temporary restrictions on AUD projects at the meeting of Tuesday, February 28, 2017.
- d. Staff is moving forward with additional submittal requirements for AUD projects and plans to have them take effect in March after presentation before City Council.
- e. Staff will return to the Ordinance Committee on March 14, 2017 for a proposed outline of the historic districting ordinance. Once the outline is accepted, then the complete ordinance will be drafted and circulated to the Full Commission sometime in June.

- f. City Council will consider the Infill Design Guidelines in April for adoption.
- g. The New Zoning Ordinance (NZO) draft has been completed and will be distributed to the Planning Commission on Thursday, as well as posted at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/NZO. Open houses will be held on February 18, 2017 and February 23, 2017 at the Faulkner Gallery. Full discussion will be held with the Planning Commission in early March.

3. Commissioner Suding announced he will be stepping down on Item 5, 35 State Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Mahan reported on the AUD Program/Infill Design Guidelines subcommittee, stating that he and Commissioners Orias and Grumbine reviewed the Infill Design Guidelines with Tony Boughman, Associate Planner, and expressed the following concerns:

1. Insufficient protection of historic resources
2. Qualifications of any future potential historians
3. Notice of projects potentially affecting historic resources
4. Clear identification of thresholds of resource
5. Adjacency to historic resources

Mr. Limon acknowledged the concerns and invited the Commissioners to provide comments to make the guidelines inclusive of all input.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. SANTA BARBARA URBANISM

(1:45) Presenter: Commissioner Anthony Grumbine
(Understanding of the historic city block using 3D modeling.)

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Commissioner Anthony Grumbine

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Discussion held.

Chair La Voie acknowledged Commissioner Grumbine's excellent presentation and recommended that it be shared with City Council and the Architectural Board of Review.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 1029 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-012
Application Number: MST2016-00549
Owner: Cold Spring Re, LLC

(This is a City Landmark: Janssens/Orella/Birk Building designed by Edwards, Plunkett, and Howell in 1927. The building is also listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Proposal is to change the exterior courtyard of the building. Changes include new paint to El Pueblo Viejo approved colors, patio tile to brick, lighting, repairing an existing reconstructed fountain, altering existing iron windows to operable folding units, and the opening of non-original window to have an open space with wooden folding doors.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed at Consent on January 11, 2017 and continued to the Full Commission.)

Actual time: 2:24 p.m.

Present: Tom Mead, Architect; and Charles Valle, Representative, Cold Spring Re, LLC

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that Edwards and Plunkett added a fountain to the courtyard circa 1932, but only the footprint is on drawings, and no photographs have been found of the original. The fountain was reconstructed in the courtyard in 1986.

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Commission with comments:

1. The fountain shall stay the same and be restored. It is a replication of a 1922 Wallace Neff fountain from the Ojai Inn.
2. The French doors in note three should be more traditionally divided to a double French door with side lights.
3. The iron grills on the State Street frontage should remain in place. A modification of the windows behind the grills to make them operable, even as French doors, is acceptable.
4. The brick wall behind the fountain shall be protected during renovation of the fountain, especially if sandblasting is used; staff recommended a gentler means to remove the paint.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**3. 2205 OAK PARK LN****R-3 Zone**

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00391
 Owner: William Fischer
 Architect: Marbletecture

(This house is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List as a Spanish Colonial Revival Residence. This is a revised project description and is no longer under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Proposal for a second-story addition to an existing 930 square foot one-story residence. The project includes the demolition of 321 square feet. The proposed total of 1695 square feet on a 4,635 square foot lot is 72% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00245.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project received Project Design Approval on December 14, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

Present: Tom Marble, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:51 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

1. Restudy the corner door or a full height window on the north and west elevations.
2. The design of the railing as a solid parapet is acceptable.

Action: Mahan/Orias, 5/0/0. (Murray, Suding, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:02 P.M. TO 3:10 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**4. 809 DE LA VINA ST, 815 DE LA VINA ST, & 208 W DE LA GUERRA ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 037-041-009; -009; -010
 Application Number: MST2017-00017
 Owner: 809 De La Vina Street, LLC
 Owner: Jeremy Bassan
 Architect: DesignARC

(The parcel at 815 De La Vina includes a Queen Anne style building constructed in 1888 that is eligible to be designated a City Landmark. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program. The project will comprise a voluntary lot merger of three parcels (APNs 037-041-008, 037-041-009, 037-041-010). Proposal includes demolishing all existing improvements, except the historic Queen Anne building, and constructing 2 new, three-story apartment buildings. The unit mix will be 4 studio apartments, 21 one-bedroom apartments, and 9 two-bedroom apartments, with an average unit size of 647 square feet. Also proposed are 34 parking spaces to be housed in two first-floor parking garages, and 34 bike parking spaces. The proposed density on this 29,375 square foot parcel is 51 units per acre on a parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay (37-63 du/ac).

(Comments Only. Project requires review by Planning Commission.)

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Mark Kirkhart, Architect, DesignARC; Melisa Cinarli Turner, Designer, DesignARC; and Jeremy Bassan, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez summarized her written evaluation of the project's consistency with the draft Infill Design Guidelines for compatibility with an adjacent historic resource and made suggestions for methods to help the new construction meet the guidelines.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m.

The following people spoke with concerns about the project:

1. Jackie Ellis, neighbor, commented on the challenge of parking in a highly dense area.
2. Mathew A. Williams, speaking on behalf of Mary Williams, adjacent property owner, expressed concern about the project not meeting parking requirements, neighborhood compatibility, and FAR requirements.
3. Don Sharp, nearby building owner, stated that this is a special block and the 1800s homes add to making it unique and should be respected. He is concerned with the lack of parking and children's playing area.

The following people spoke in support of the project:

1. Jesse Hizenstat spoke in support of the project for bringing an affordable housing solution for young professionals.
2. Correspondence in support of the project from Dan Crawford and Home Furnace Company was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:35 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission appreciated the saving of the Queen Anne historic house, and respecting it with appropriate setbacks from the historic resource.
2. The Commission appreciated the open space and the setback from the corner.
3. The size, bulk, and scale are not appropriate to the historic resource and create a problem with neighborhood compatibility.
4. The parking is inadequate for the neighborhood and should be increased.
5. The adjacency of commercial property needs to be considered in setbacks and building configuration, particularly of open space.
6. The quality of life of the occupants is not adequately addressed, in particular the adjacency of commercial space, lack of parking, and air quality.
7. The architecture is not acceptable. It needs to be a compatible style and more sympathetic to the Queen Anne style of the existing building.
8. The symmetry and regularity of the proposed building are fighting the Queen Anne style and the style of most of the residences in the neighborhood. Study simplifying the massing and details.
9. The Commission supported the use of porches and suggested that balconies are usually stacked on top of porches in traditional architecture.
10. Provide view studies of the Mesa and the mountains from public rights of way.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 35 STATE ST****HRC-2/S-D-3 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-018
Application Number: MST2017-00020
Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC

(Project at Area A of the Entrada De Santa Barbara with no work to impact the Californian Hotel façade, which is on the Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal is to replace a previously approved open beam trellis at the level 4 pool deck with a new 208 square foot bar enclosed service area addition. All wall, window, and roof elements of the addition are to match the approved existing.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:11 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect, Sherry & Associates Architects, Inc.; and Lauren Descent, Project Manager, Sherry & Associates Architects, Inc.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 5/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**6. 1115 GARDEN ST****R-O Zone**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-013
Application Number: MST2016-00170
Owner: Harrel Properties, LLC
Architect: Steve Harrel

(The proposed project is a new three-story building, with four units and four covered parking spaces. The units will include 1 three-bedroom unit and 3 two-bedroom units totaling 3,625 square feet, a roof deck above the third level, and 800 square feet of covered parking (carports). Existing on the site is an office building that will be partially demolished and converted to residential use. The project is being developed using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program (Priority Housing Overlay) on a 4,658 square foot lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project received Project Design Approval on January 11, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m.

Jeff Cohn spoke in support of the project, stating there is a definite need for smaller housing so people can live and work downtown.

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission expressed appreciation for the applicant being responsive to the prior comments and bringing in a 3-D model of the project.
2. The distance from the corner to the window on the west elevation needs to be consistent with the foremost part of the building.
3. The colors are acceptable with the cupola as designed.
4. The Commission found the project consistent with required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings.

Action: Suding/Orías, 6/0/0. (Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:35 P.M. TO 4:40 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
 Application Number: MST2016-00284
 Owner: American Tradition, LLC
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
 Architect: Mike Niemann

(Proposal for a 48-room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The "Hotel Site" is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The "Hotel Site" is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the "Hotel Site" and will comprise no less than 26 rooms in two-story attached casitas, and no less than 20 rooms configured within a two- to three-story "Inn" building complex located along the northern property line. The proposed square footage on this lot is 84,478 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Third Concept Review. Review of conceptual sketches and architectural renderings to obtain feedback on possible design direction for project. Project was last reviewed on December 14, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:40 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, SEPPS; Mike Niemann, Designer; and Brian Cearnal, Architect

Chair La Voie disclosed that he had viewed the video of the previous review of the project and had met with the applicant to clarify the Commission's feedback.

Public comment opened at 5:01 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to March 8, 2017 with comments:

1. The massing is generally acceptable.
2. The site plan is generally acceptable, with careful consideration of the open spaces and their proportion, and the light that some areas may or may not receive.
3. The issues that need to be resolved are the proportions of the fenestration, the broad arches, and the rectilinear forms that are square or more horizontal than vertical.
4. There is perhaps an overuse of the arch.
5. Use round forms or round stairways judiciously in special occasions where you turn a corner.
6. The axis off Cabrillo Boulevard should end in something important architecturally.
7. Compatibility with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines needs to be resolved.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:36 P.M. ****