



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 25, 2017

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair*
PHILIP SUDING, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
PILAR PLUMMER, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:37 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Suding (absent 4:13-4:18 p.m.), and Veyna

Members absent: Murray and Orías

Staff present: Limón (until 2:20 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest stated that City Council voted that the temporary pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek at Cabrillo Boulevard remain permanently, and he expressed concern that this bridge is in conflict with El Pueblo Viejo design guidelines. On behalf of the Pearl Chase Society, he asked that the bridge be removed.

Mr. Limón responded that it is expected that Public Works will come to the HLC to request that the bridge be made permanent.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 11, 2017, as amended.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 4/0/2. (Grumbine abstained; Suding abstained from Items 5-7. Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Plummer announced that Commissioner Orías will be absent from today's meeting.

2. Mr. Limón announced the following:

- a. The Ordinance Committee will meet on February 14 to work on post-disaster regulations for historic buildings. The draft ordinance will come before the HLC for review.
- b. Regarding two vacancies on the HLC, the next open recruitment will occur mid-year. Staff is pursuing the possibility of Commissioner Grumbine serving in the capacity of architectural historian.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Limón reported on the AUD Program/Infill Design Guidelines Subcommittee meeting of January 19. The subcommittee considered the ABR's version of the guidelines and melded them with the HLC's version. The HLC will see a revised draft after discussion at the Planning Commission.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. STORY POLES AS A DESIGN REVIEW TOOL**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

(Discussion and a recommendation to City Council on an appropriate trigger to require story poles for review of development projects.)

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commented that story poles are the best way to alert the public of the impact of a project and recommended that they be mandatory for certain projects, especially those with four stories.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Discussion held.**Commission comments:**

1. The Commission in its majority agreed to accept ABR trigger 2 for story poles: “AUD projects with three stories or 30 feet in height (whichever is lower), and a) where proposed in a residential neighborhood (R-3 or R-4), or b) proposed in a location where other three-story, or 30-foot tall, buildings do not currently exist within 300 feet of the project site.”
2. The Commission in its majority agreed to accept ABR trigger 3 for story poles: “Projects that require Planning Commission comments pursuant to SBMC §28.20.080.”
3. The Commission in its majority agreed to accept ABR trigger 4 for story poles: “At the discretion of the [Design Review Board/Commission] in other instances that warrant the installation of story poles due to the project’s potential to substantially exceed the height of surrounding buildings or block or reduce important public scenic views.”
4. The Commission opposed ABR trigger 1, the requirement for story poles for all AUD projects with four stories. The Commission accepted the following revised wording of this trigger: “For projects within El Pueblo Viejo, story poles will be required for all AUD projects with four stories when the Commission is having difficulty making Project Compatibility Analysis findings.”
5. The Commission emphasized that it has the ability to request story poles for any project.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 1300 BLK E YANONALI ST 1095 SEG ID****(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-095
 Application Number: MST2015-00317
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Craig Drake, Principal Engineer
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Public Works
 Engineer: Matt Burgard

(Proposal for the E. Montecito Street - E. Yanonali Street Bridge and Pedestrian Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on E. Montecito Street from Canada Street to the Five Points Roundabout and along N. Salinas Street from E. Mason to Clifton Streets. Improvements will include the installation of 270 linear feet of sidewalk along E. Montecito Street between E. Yanonali Street and Montecito Place and 700 linear feet of sidewalk along N. Salinas Street between E. Mason and Clifton Streets, the widening of the E. Montecito Street - E. Yanonali Street Bridge to include sidewalk along the east side, and shoulders for cyclists on both sides of the bridge. Existing sandstone will be used. An all-way stop will be installed at the intersection of E. Montecito and E. Yanonali Streets to improve pedestrian safety at a blind corner. Pedestrian scale lighting will be added along E. Yanonali, E. Montecito, and N. Salinas Streets to increase safety on pedestrian routes to the adjacent schools.)

(HLC acceptance of the Proposed Conservation Plan was Mitigation Measure 11 in the Historic Structures Sites Report, which recommended the salvage of significant sandstone from the demolished structure for use in new construction according to an approved physical conservation program in order to further reduce the impact of the loss of the Montecito-Yanonali Street Culvert.)

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Andrew Grubb, Project Engineer II, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:25 p.m.

Correspondence in opposition from Paulina Conn was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:26 p.m.

Motion: To accept the Conservation Plan with comments:

1. The Commission expressed appreciation for the graphic representation in the renderings.
2. The pyramid cap at the columns should appear integral to the top course of stone. The joints should wrap into the cap so that it appears to be carved out of a single piece of stone.
3. Fabricate corner pieces to appear at least 12 inches thick, using a solid block of stone cut in an L-shape, if possible. If a solid block is not available, a careful joining of two pieces of veneer is acceptable.
4. Include the creek name in the bridge title.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00477
 Owner: J & J Trust
 Owner: Sean Black
 Applicant: Derrik Eichelberger

(This property is a designated City Landmark: Frothingham House, designed by George Washington Smith in 1922. Proposal is for landscape alterations including a new pool and spa totaling 648 square feet, pool equipment, new paving totaling 1,740 square feet, landscape planting, and 120 cubic yards of site grading.)

(Review of a Phase 1 Archaeological Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel, Co-Author, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the property and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions that the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, and that no mitigation measures are required. The standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources will apply and shall be printed on the plans prior to issuance of a building permit.

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Suding, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00477
 Owner: J & J Trust
 Owner: Sean Black
 Applicant: Derrik Eichelberger

(This property is a designated City Landmark: Frothingham House, designed by George Washington Smith in 1922. Proposal is for landscape alterations including a new pool and spa totaling 648 square feet, pool equipment, new paving totaling 1,740 square feet, landscape planting, and 120 cubic yards of site grading.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided and is subject to acceptance of the Phase 1 Archaeological Report. Project was last reviewed on January 11, 2017.)

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Derrik Eichelberger, Architect, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that in the archive search, no trace of historic plans for the garden beyond the terrace was found.

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired whether any olive trees had been found; he also asked if olive trees had been considered for the site.

Public comment closed at 2:47 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**
1. The Commission commended the applicant for the revised design, specifically the formality and openness.
 2. Study using Italian Cypress trees, inspired by the historic photograph.
 3. The Commission recommended the use of additional olive trees and expressed gratitude for the retention of existing olive trees.
 4. The Commission found the project consistent with required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings:
 - a. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood;
 - b. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood;
 - c. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree, or Landmark Tree;
 - d. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved;
 - e. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting; and
 - f. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:54 P.M. TO 3:03 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 2019 PLAZA BONITA****R-2 Zone**

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-343-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00569
 Owner: D2 Plaza Bonita, LLC
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(The property is listed on the Potential Historic Resources List a contributing property to the proposed Plaza Bonita Historic District. The house was remodeled in the Spanish Colonial Revival Style in 1927 by noted architects Edwards, Plunkett & Howell. Proposal is for minor alterations to an existing 1,705 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached garage and detached studio. Alterations include: removal of doors and windows to replace with new, improvements to landscaping, and construction of a detached accessory structure to be used as a gym. The proposed total of 1,929 square feet on a 6,793 square foot lot is 67% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(A. Review of Project. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(B. Review of a Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report. The report concluded that the proposed project's impacts are Less than Significant (Class III) and that after implementation of the proposed project, the property would maintain its eligibility for listing as a contributing property to the potential Plaza Bonita Historic District.)

Actual time: 3:03 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect; and Pamela Post & Tim Hazeltine, Historians

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she reviewed the report and agreed with its conclusions that the proposal does not have a significant impact on the historic resource and meets CEQA Guidelines.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that he did not see any reference in the report to Lockwood de Forest as a possible contributor to the landscaping. He also asked about the impact of a Plaza Bonita Historic District.

Public comment closed at 3:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission found the proposed changes sympathetic to the historic resource.
2. The Commission expressed gratitude for the original drawings for comparison.
3. The accessory building should have a steeper-pitched roof.
4. All additions should have the appropriate two-piece tile roof.
5. The breakup of the new windows is too busy; emulate the original Plunkett drawings.
6. The railing should be a solid plaster wall, 12 inches thick, with a curve at the end.
7. The wrought iron lamps shown are not appropriate for this building; a more Spanish style should be used.
8. At the next presentation, provide a key with species of landscape plants and have the plant symbols shown on the plans.
9. Indicate any existing trees or significant landscaping to be removed.
10. A different variety of palm tree is requested that is more in scale with the building.

Action : Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action : Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

6. 1809 MIRA VISTA AVE

E-1 Zone

(3:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-026
Application Number: MST2016-00575
Owner: Carole Reid Christian Estate
Architect: Tom Henson

(One-Time Pre-Application Consultation Review. The Tudor style residence constructed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings in 1925 may be eligible for inclusion on the City's Potential Historic Resources List. The proposal includes enlarging a one-car garage, interior changes for a new kitchen and family room area, addition of a 768 square foot rear terrace on the south elevation, and modification of dormers on the second floor. The proposed total of 5,212 square feet on the 23,997 square foot lot is 110% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(One-Time Pre-Application Consultation Review. Comments Only.)

Actual time: 3:42 p.m.

Present: Tom Henson, Architect; and Pamela Post, Historian

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she evaluated the proposed alterations according to the Historic Resource Guidelines to provide guidance for the Commission in this pre-application review; a Historic Structures/Sites Report will follow.

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commission comments:

1. The Commission found the proposed addition appropriate to the size, bulk, and scale of the neighborhood; to the style of architecture; and to the historic guidelines, and appreciated that most of the changes are to the rear elevation and not the street elevation.
2. The enlargement of the garage is appropriate to the scale of the house.
3. As the design develops, study the roofline and breaking up of the large roof mass of the garage addition.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**7. 125 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-012
 Application Number: MST2009-00119
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.
 Applicant: Children's Museum of Santa Barbara
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(The project includes a new 16,691 square foot, three-story building to be used as the Children's Museum of Santa Barbara with indoor and outdoor galleries, a courtyard, and roof terrace. The maximum building height would be 45 feet. The project also includes two uncovered parking spaces accessed from Kimberly Avenue and pedestrian access on the south side of the site connecting State Street and Kimberly Avenue. The proposal received a Final Community Priority Designation by City Council on October 25, 2011.)

(Review After Final is requested for the addition of interactive kinetic water and musical exhibit structures, and viewing scopes on the rooftop of the museum. Project was last reviewed on January 11, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:01 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, AB Design Studio; and Steve Hinkley, MOXI - Children's Museum of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Allison De Busk, Project Planner, asked that the Commission focus on the physical, not operational, aspects of the proposal in its review.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

Correspondence in support from Daniel Alvarado, General Manager of the Hotel Indigo, was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:15 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with comment:

1. The Commission expressed support for the project and appreciation for the exhaustive photographic representation and supporting material.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/0/0. (Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 320 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-004
Application Number: MST2015-00438
Owner: Pacific Homes Funding, Inc.
Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to demolish the existing single-family residence and all existing site improvements and construct a new three-story, three-bedroom, 2,719 square foot single-family residence with an attached 624 square foot two-car garage. Other exterior improvements include new site retaining walls, new stone walls and gates, landscaping improvements, and upper-level balconies. The proposed total of 3,343 square feet on the 3,600 square foot lot is 152% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow the new residence to encroach into the required interior setbacks.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments Only. Project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval for requested zoning modifications. Project was last reviewed on May 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

Present: Ted Meeder, Architect

There were no members of the public present who wished to comment.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Commission supported both modifications in that the proposal is appropriate in size, bulk, and scale to the neighborhood; generally appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo guidelines; and generally consistent with development standards in the City.
2. The Commission requested additional landscaping be placed in the driveway to mitigate the appearance of the ground-floor story.
3. The Commission requested two additional tree planting wells in the parkway, and that they be longer than they are wide to maximize air and water exchange.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (Murray and Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:34 P.M. ****