



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 14, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
PILAR PLUMMER, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine, Mahan, Murray (until 5:34 p.m.), Orías, and Suding
Members absent: La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest commented that the HLC should have a representative on the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program task force proposed by City Council.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 30, 2016, as presented.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 5/0/1. (Murray abstained. La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 7, 2016, as presented.

Action: Murray/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Philip Suding.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Plummer announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Shallanberger and Veyna will be absent from today's meeting.
- b. Commissioner Murray will leave at 5:30 p.m.
- c. Staff received an inquiry regarding a yellow directional sign that was placed near the Mission, suggesting that the colors were inconsistent with the approved City's Wayfinding Sign Program. Supervising Transportation Engineer Derrick Bailey confirmed that it is an intersection warning sign, which is a traffic control device, not a wayfinding sign. The purpose of the sign is to alert drivers that they are approaching an intersection. The Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices defines the size, shape, and colors used on this sign.

2. Ms. Hernandez announced that at the City Council meeting of December 13, City Council designated as City Landmarks the Rattlesnake Canyon Bridge, Santa Barbara County National Bank, and the George Edwards House, as recommended by the HLC.

3. Chair Suding acknowledged the long service and dedication of outgoing Commissioners Murray and Shallanberger.

4. Mr. Limón reported on the AUD discussion at the City Council meeting of December 13.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 1720 BATH ST****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-091-019

Owner: Bath Street Inn, Inc.

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider designation as a Structure of Merit of the Fairbanks House, constructed in c. 1890 in the Shingle style, located at 1720 Bath Street.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-13 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Fairbanks House located at 1720 Bath Street.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 121 BURTON CIR****R-4/SD-3 Zone****(1:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-073-007

Application Number: MST2015-00519

Owner: Smooch Reynolds

Architect: Sheri Peters

(Proposal for a new drought-tolerant landscape plan for an existing four-unit apartment complex including plant and irrigation replacement. Also proposed is to demolish an existing wall in the front yard ranging in height from four to six feet and to construct a new wall ranging in height from four to six feet in a location closer to the street near Unit 1. The new wall will require approval of an Administrative Exception. Coastal review is required for this parcel located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review of Phase I and Extended Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich.)

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Brent Leftwich, Archaeologist

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Murray/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 821 CORONEL ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-243-013
 Application Number: MST2016-00292
 Owner: Adam Ross
 Architect: Steve Harrel

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a 432 square foot first-story addition, a 504 square foot second-story addition, a new 500 square foot two-car garage, and 188 square feet of covered porches at an existing 2,450 square foot single-family residence. The proposed total of 3,566 square feet of development on a 16,970 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 81% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This structure is a designated City Landmark: "Hunt-Stambach House.")

(A. Review of revised Phase 1-2 Historic Structures/Sites Report. The report determined that the proposed project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Therefore, potential project impacts to the significant historic resources would be Less than Significant (Class III).)

(B. Project Design Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed November 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Steve Harrel, Architect; and Julie Ross, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation; she also agrees with the suggestion that there be less sandstone used in the addition to be more compatible with the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the addition is too bulky and not subordinate enough to the main house.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposal is very successful.
2. Consider simplifying the east elevation second-story dormers into one dormer.
3. The stone veneer is not appropriate on the east elevation at the porch.
4. Consider vertical siding at the skirt.
5. Consider a stone porch and/or adding a railing.
6. The two dormer windows on the east elevation should have a vertical mullion to divide the glass to match the original house.
7. Slope the proposed porch roof slightly, similar to the existing enclosed porch on the east elevation.
8. Reduce the number of light fixtures on the porch.
9. Move the porch steps to the bay, where the door is, on the east elevation; reduce the width of the steps.
10. Study reducing the size/width of the porch to integrate better into the addition.

11. Study adding windows to the east elevation at the porch level.
12. The architecture seems to mix Craftsman and Italianate styles; please resolve to echo the Italianate style of the house.
13. Study eliminating windows on the cupola at the proposed addition.
14. Slide the second-story balcony to the west, away from the edge, and study sliding the door as well; symmetry on this elevation is not necessary.
15. The Commission found the project consistent with required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings:
 - a. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood;
 - b. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood;
 - c. The proposed building and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside;
 - d. The proposed project does not include the removal of or significantly impact any designated Specimen Tree, Historic Tree, or Landmark Tree. The proposed project, to the maximum extent feasible, preserves and protects healthy, non-invasive trees with a trunk diameter of 4" or more measured 4' above natural grade;
 - e. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved;
 - f. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting; and
 - g. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

Motion: To accept the report with comments:

1. On page 10, correct the statement that John Alexander purchased the house, as the house was not sold; also, include the names of those who facilitated its relocation.
2. On page 5, indicate to where the window is being relocated.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 2205 OAK PARK LN****R-3 Zone**

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00391
 Owner: William Fischer
 Architect: Marbletecture

(This is a revised project description and is no longer under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Proposal for a second-story addition to an existing 930 square foot one-story residence. The project includes the demolition of 321 square feet. The proposed total of 1695 square feet on a 4,635 square foot lot is 72% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This house is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a Spanish Colonial Revival Residence. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00245.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed October 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:44 p.m.

Present: Tom Marble, Architect, Marbletecture; and William Fischer, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the revised project design is now only an addition to a single-family residence and meets the Historic Resource Design guidelines, so a Historic Structures/Sites Report is not required unless requested by the Commission.

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comment:

1. Study a solid railing on the second-story porch.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 5/0/1. (Drury abstained. La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.)
 Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**5. 29 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
 Application Number: MST2015-00087
 Owner: Tioga Holdings, LP
 Architect: Studio 1030 Architects
 Contractor: Total Heating & Air
 Business Name: Ca' Dario

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to address violations of enforcement case (ENF2014-01029) and permit "as-built" exterior alterations on an existing commercial building including two (2) on-demand water heaters, lot line fence, and additional decorative elements. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Spanish Colonial Revival style building designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings c. 1922.)

(Review After Final to review staff's administrative approval of painted roof equipment and a proposed exhaust fan window vent at rear kitchen area.)

Actual time: 2:56 p.m.

Present: Craig Burdick, Architect, Studio 1030 Architects; and Michael Chenoweth, representing the Owner

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernandez stated that staff tries to accommodate modern uses on historic buildings, and the side and rear elevations have the most flexibility for alterations. The fan in the window is reversible; the only concern is dirt collecting underneath on the original wood mullions and on the wall, possibly deteriorating the original wood mullions, so the area should be kept clean.
2. Mr. Limón provided background of the administrative staff approval.

Public comment opened at 3:02 p.m.

1. Virginia Rehling ceded her time to Ana Citrin.
2. Ana Citrin, attorney, described the concerns of the adjacent neighbor, Virginia Rehling.
3. Kellam de Forest asked about the fan being located on the roof.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Continued thirty days to Consent with comments:

1. Proceed with the existing permit.
2. As a separate permit, remove the louvers and fan, and restore the window; return with a proposal for a new method of ventilation, if any.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shalanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:30 P.M. TO 3:51 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. WATERFRONT PARKING LOTS****HC/SD-3 Zone**

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-011
Application Number: MST2015-00565
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for alterations to waterfront parking lots located at Leadbetter Beach, Harbor West, Garden Street, Chase Palm Park, E. Cabrillo Boulevard., and W. Cabrillo Boulevard to remove existing parking attendant kiosks or honor fee slot systems, ticket dispensers, and traffic arms, and install new automated pay systems with protective bollards. Also proposed are new landscaping in areas where existing kiosks were removed, and six new ADA access ramps. Requires Coastal Review.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on March 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:51 p.m.

Present: Karl Treiberg, Waterfront Facility Manager; and Theresa Lawler, Engineering Tech II, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the project was incorrectly listed on the agenda as In-Progress Review; this is a Concept Review-Continued.

Public comment opened at 3:56 p.m.

Jim Marston, of the Access Advisory Committee, expressed concern about the placement of the equipment on curbs, thereby increasing the height beyond the reach of a wheelchair.

Public comment closed at 3:58 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. This is an approvable proposal.
2. The Lost Atlantis color #8056N is the acceptable color.
3. The metal lattice is a nice solution.
4. Drop the valance within four inches of the surrounding finished surface, making a larger panel at the base.
5. Study adding a parapet around the solar panel units, possibly mimicking the non-solar unit tops.
6. Study adding occasional rivets to the lattice (not in a random pattern) to give the cabinet a hand-wrought appearance.
7. Install landscape wherever possible.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallanberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 631 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone****(4:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-028
Application Number: MST2016-00537
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative

(Proposal to replace an existing chain link fence and construct a new 35 linear foot decorative site wall varying in height from 7 to 10-feet.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:19 p.m.

Present: David Shelton, Artist; and Leon Olson, Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

The following people spoke in support:

1. Ginny Brush, Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative
2. Sarah Rubin, Arts Advisory Committee
3. Robert Adam, Arts Advisory Committee

Public comment closed at 4:28 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comment:

1. The Commission found the decorative wall proposal allowable due to prior approvals of other gates at the Ortega and Garden Street entrances; because it is set back adequately from the street; and because it is not adjacent to a historic resource.

Action: Drury/Murray, 5/1/0. (Mahan opposed. La Voie, Shallenberger, and Veyna absent.)
Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009
Application Number: MST2016-00284
Owner: American Tradition, LLC
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge
Architect: Mike Niemann

(Proposal for a 48 room hotel at a project site comprised of two parcels: a 3-acre "Hotel Site" at 433 E. Cabrillo Boulevard (APN 017-680-009), and an adjacent 2.42-acre "Parking Lot Site" at 103 S. Calle Cesar Chavez (APN 017-113-020). The Hotel Site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV) and will be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission; the Parking Lot Site is outside of EPV and will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. The Hotel Site is currently permitted for a 150-room hotel with conference and group facilities. Proposed is a revised design for a smaller development at the Hotel Site and will comprise no less than 26 rooms in two-story attached casitas and no less than 20 rooms configured within a two to three-story "Inn" building complex located along the northern property line. The proposed square footage on this lot is 84,478 square feet. Program elements include a casual and fine dining restaurant, wine cellar and lounge, rooftop swimming pool and pool bar, spa, banquet room, water features, and gardens. Automobile and pedestrian access to the hotel will be from Calle Cesar Chavez via a motor court and accessible sidewalk at a reception pavilion. Back-of-house functions, service areas, and at-grade parking are proposed for the Parking Lot site.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only. Project was last reviewed on July 13, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:40 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant; Mike Niemann, Architect; and Puck Erickson, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that this item requires comments only; no action may be taken.

Public comment opened at 5:04 p.m.

1. Paulina Conn stated that the hotel is too massive and uninviting.
2. Kellam de Forest stated that the proposal is massive and bulky.

Public comment closed at 5:06 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Drury suggested keeping the elevations along Cabrillo Boulevard at one story and manipulating the size and scale to make them recede, similar to the neighboring Fess Parker property.
2. Commissioner Mahan liked the details of the renderings but found the elevations brutal and not appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo. He also stated that the building needs to be less busy in its coloring.
3. Chair Suding stated that the very specialized arch should not repeat so frequently that it becomes mundane; use in places where it makes an impact.
4. Commissioner Murray liked the addition of the landscaping but did not find the proposal recognizable as a cohesive El Pueblo Viejo project; it is without Santa Barbara scale or architectural feeling.
5. Commissioner Grumbine supported the overall massing and scale but suggested simplification and unification of ideas to be more cohesive.
6. Commissioner Orías stated that striped awnings are not appropriate in El Pueblo Viejo.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:34 P.M. TO 5:39 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

9. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL

E-1 Zone

(5:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00511
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.

(Phase 1 of the Master Plan build-out for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This includes compliance requirements for the demo/remodel of the Western Residence and Puesta del Sol pedestrian and right-of-way improvements. Includes replacement of the Butterfly Garden Exhibit, pedestrian access and ADA improvements, trash & recycle enclosure, new fencing, bioswale & native habitat restoration, landscaping, lighting, mechanical equipment replacement, and interior repairs to existing buildings. The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

(Final Approval is requested for the Puesta del Sol public improvements. Project must comply with City Council Resolution No. 15-029 adopted on March 24, 2015. Project was last reviewed on October 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:39 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant; Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; and Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 5:50 p.m.

The following people expressed support:

1. Correspondence from Fred Sweeney, Upper East Association
2. Correspondence from Don Olson
3. Correspondence from Tom Jacobs, Mission Heritage Trail Association
4. Joan Livingston, of the Upper East Association, spoke to reiterate that organization's support.

The following people expressed opposition or concern:

1. Correspondence from Fran Galt
2. Correspondence from Lanny Ebenstein, Coalition to Preserve Mission Canyon
3. Correspondence from Catherine Miller
4. Correspondence from Nik Schiffmann
5. Correspondence from Paulina Conn; Ms. Conn also spoke to reiterate concerns about the light fixtures and Puesta del Sol right-of-way.

Public comment closed at 5:59 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with comments:

1. Request permission from Public Works to substitute a metal light pole painted green, or a concrete pole painted green; if not possible, return to Consent.
2. Research the intensity of the lights; the temperature of the LED bulb should be in the 2700-2800 range.
3. Fifteen agaves are acceptable.

4. Plantings are to be low-level and essentially native.
5. The oak tree shall not interfere with the sycamore.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 4/1/0. (Drury opposed. La Voie, Murray, Shallenberger, and Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:23 P.M. ****