



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 16, 2016 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at approx. 1:40 p.m.), La Voie (absent 2:23-2:25 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding, and Veyna

Members absent: Shallanberger

Staff present: Limón (at 3:30 p.m.), Hernandez (left at 3:48 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

1. Danae Liechti, Heather Unterman, and Ernestine Ygnacio-DeSoto ceded their time to Anna Campbell.
2. Anna Campbell spoke regarding 129 E. Anapamu Street, explaining that there is another proposal for the site of the trash enclosure.

*** Items B and D were tabled until 3:30 p.m.; Item C was tabled until after Item 1. ***

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 2, 2016, as amended.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 4/0/4. (Murray [Items 10, 13, 14], Suding [Items 3, 11, 12], Veyna [Items 3-14], and Drury abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Grumbine and Julio Veyna.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Pilar Plummer is the new HLC Planning Technician.
- b. There will be a special meeting of the HLC on December 7.

2. Mr. Limón stated that the draft guidelines related to the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program, which the HLC requested to discuss on this week's agenda, are still ongoing. Staff is working with the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) subcommittee for its draft of guidelines, which will be shared with the HLC subcommittee before both variations are presented to Planning Commission on December 8 for its input.

3. Commissioner Mahan noted that Kellam de Forest recently celebrated his 90th birthday.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. 2758 LAS ENCINAS RD****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-250-066

Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History

(Add the Western Residence to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit in the Historic Structures/Sites Report that was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on October 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 1:43 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:44 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To add the structure located at 2758 Las Encinas Road to the City's Potential Historic Resources List as it is eligible for Structure of Merit designation.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM**2. CITYWIDE STREETLIGHTS****(1:50)** (Discussion to replace the existing "cobra-head" style City standard streetlight with new LED alternatives.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Derrick Bailey, Supervising Transportation Engineer; and Jim Dewey, Facility & Energy Manager, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Discussion held.**Commissioner comments:**

1. Commissioner Drury stated that he has no objection to the proposed style of lighting.
2. Commissioner Mahan stated that he does not find the cobra-head style appropriate for El Pueblo Viejo.
3. Commissioner Murray stated that it would be good to differentiate from the cobra-head style in the theater district.
4. Commissioner Grumbine stated that the fixture near the remnants of the historic Arlington Hotel should be studied carefully, and he agreed that the theater district fixtures should be differentiated from the cobra-head style.
5. Commissioner La Voie supported the double fixture on the corner of Chapala and Sola Streets, and the State Street lantern style for the two mid-block Sola Street fixtures.
6. Commissioner Orías favored as warm a light as possible and a fixture more appropriate for the theater district.
7. Commissioner Veyna stated that he is not in favor of the proposed style of lighting, as charm in El Pueblo Viejo should be preserved.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:08 P.M. TO 2:22 P.M. ***

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. 1720 BATH ST

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-091-019
Owner: Bath Street Inn, Inc.

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on December 14, 2016 to consider designating the Fairbanks House, constructed in c. 1890 in the Shingle style, located at 1720 Bath Street as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:23 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if the property merits Landmark status.

Ms. Hernandez responded that it does not meet all the criteria to qualify for a City Landmark. The City Landmark status is reserved for the most important historic resources that typically meet four or more criteria, were designed by a significant architect, or are associated with an important person in the community. 1720 Bath Street qualifies as a Structure of Merit as it only meets two criteria for designation and demonstrates a significant style, but no architect is associated with the building.

Public comment closed at 2:24 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2016-13 to hold a Public Hearing on December 14, 2016 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Fairbanks House located at 1720 Bath Street.

Action: Drury/Murray, 7/0/0. (La Voie stepped down. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 121 BURTON CIR

R-4/SD-3 Zone

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-073-007
Application Number: MST2015-00519
Owner: Smooch Reynolds
Architect: Sheri Peters

(Proposal for a new drought-tolerant landscape plan for an existing four-unit apartment complex including plant and irrigation replacement. Also proposed is to demolish an existing wall in the front yard ranging in height from four to six feet and to construct a new wall ranging in height from four to six feet in a location closer to the street near Unit 1. The new wall will require approval of an Administrative Exception. Coastal Review is required for this parcel located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review of Phase I and Extended Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich.)

Actual time: 2:25 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations, with the requirement for archaeological monitoring during ground disturbance.

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Return with Wackenrueder or Sanborn Fire maps of the total site showing the footprint of the Potter Hotel and the development of the property.
2. Correct the pagination in Section 4.
3. Correct misspellings.

Action: La Voie/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

5. 1116 SAN PASCUAL ST

R-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-202-016
 Application Number: MST2016-00359
 Owner: Edward St George
 Architect: On Design, LLC

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The proposal includes demolition of an existing, detached, 720 square foot garage and 176 square foot shed and construction of a new 1,629 square foot two-story duplex. An existing 675 square foot single-family dwelling on site will remain unchanged. The residential unit mix will include one, 2-bedroom unit (existing dwelling) and a new 1,629 square foot duplex with two, 2-bedroom, 2-bath units. New Unit B will be 705 square feet and new Unit C will be 925 square feet, with an average unit size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on this 6,880 square foot parcel is 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Private outdoor living space for the new units will be provided in two second floor decks totaling 173 square-feet. There will be a total of three parking spaces provided, two in a 420 square foot, attached two-car garage, and one uncovered space. No grading is proposed. Total development on site will be 2,304 square-feet of floor area. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2016-00345.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with comment:

1. Staff should communicate with the applicant the following notes: that this is a floodplain area, and any construction that occurs should try to avoid the floodplain; and that air quality should be considered if the development is close to the freeway.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**6. 217 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone****(2:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-260-016
 Application Number: MST2016-00291
 Architect: Keith Rivera
 Owner: Jon Sarad & Simmons Family Trust

(Proposal for a new multi-family development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project will include the demolition of an existing 691 square foot one-story dwelling unit, 421 square foot detached garage, and 85 square foot shed, and the construction of a 2,204 square foot two-story duplex and a 2,854 square foot two-story triplex. An existing 1,072 square foot (3-bedroom) dwelling unit is proposed to remain unchanged. The proposed unit mix will include four, 2-bedroom units and one, 1-bedroom unit. The project will result in six dwelling units totaling 6,145 square feet, with an average unit size of 1,024 square feet. The proposed density on this 12,500 square foot parcel will be 21 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of five parking spaces provided in attached garages totaling 1,088 square feet, and one uncovered space. Two fruit trees will be removed and new landscape, hardscape, fencing, and trash enclosure is proposed. Grading will consist of 140 cubic yards of excavation and 25 cubic yards of fill. This project will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00485.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:34 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**7. 9 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
Application Number: MST2014-00359
Owner: 1221 Victoria Ct
Architect: Richard Six
Engineer: John Maloney

(Proposal for site alterations to the north courtyard to include revised stairs and landings, new railings to match existing, new potted plants, a new wall fountain, resurfacing of various areas of courtyard, and revised site lighting in various courtyards and paseos.)

(Review After Final is requested for additional string lights over a second-floor dining terrace, to match lighting approved elsewhere on the site. Project was referred from Consent Review on November 2, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: Jeff Gorrell, LMA Architects

Public comment opened at 2:41 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked about the visibility of the lights from the parking lot and if other lighting can be used.

Public comment closed at 2:41 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:

1. The Commission approves the light fixture as proposed, with a top shade.
2. String the lights building wall to building wall, with no blank cable.
3. Consider a different wire color that recedes more than the black proposed.
4. Wires shall have a catenary curve.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/1. (Orías abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**8. 1232 DE LA VINA ST****P-R Zone**

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-005
Application Number: MST2016-00489
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(One-time pre-application consultation review for minor exterior building and site changes to an existing one-story masonry Parks and Recreation building. Exterior alterations include replacing selected windows with doors, constructing a new metal pergola and new 6-foot tall weathered corten steel fencing to enclose a new courtyard, and for a new accessible ramp and steps for courtyard access. The project includes the relocation of the primary entry from De La Vina Street to the north elevation facing the parking lot, the removal of the entry steps and site path and installation of balcony railing at the De La Vina Street entrance, and the construction of a new trellis at the new entryway. New landscaping, site lighting, and interior alterations are also proposed. The building is a designated Structure of Merit: "Louise Lowry Davis Center.")

(Comments only; one-time pre-application consultation review.)

Actual time: 2:55 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildstein, Bildstein Architecture & Planning; Katie Klein, CJMLA; and Justin Van Mullem, Associate Planner, Parks and Recreation, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that the applicant provided original drawings and historic photographs of the building. She pointed out that the original windows had been replaced with inappropriate aluminum windows, and that the applicant is proposing to install windows that match the original windows, which will restore historic integrity to the building.

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if any existing trees will be removed.

Public comment closed at 3:09 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orías expressed concern about the trees and requested more information from an arborist report and tree plan. She also expressed concern about the pergola, specifically that the supports appear undersized. She could support the setback modification as long as the pergola is treated appropriately.
2. Commissioner La Voie expressed support for the adaptive reuse of the building and restoration of the windows, but he could not support the rest of the proposal. He stated that the prime interpretive period of the building is 1922, and that the pergola design, use of corten steel, the light fixtures, and wrought iron design do not belong on the building. He could not support the removal of the steps at the former entrance at De La Vina Street, or the use of any 1970s material. He could support the concept of a pergola if it is properly designed.
3. Commissioner Drury also objected to the removal of the steps at De La Vina Street.
4. Commissioner Veyna stated that the permeable pavers appear modern, and he suggested brick with spacers in between.

*** General Business was re-opened at 3:30 p.m. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

9. 116 CASTILLO ST

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-061-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00388
 Owner: Kazali Adi/Santy, Trustees
 Architect: Joe Andrulaitis

(Proposal to demolish the existing 8,612 square foot, one-story hotel and construct a new, 14,475 square foot, three-story, 38 room hotel, with a total of 38 parking spaces (20 covered and 18 uncovered) on the 24,956 square foot lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal requires Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit, Development Plan, and Interior Setback Modifications.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 019-16. Project was last reviewed on July 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued three weeks with comments:

1. The design is commendable.
2. The top of the tower needs more elaboration; chamfering the corners at the top was suggested.
3. The relationship of the columns on the west elevation above the drive entrance needs to be restudied.
4. The relationship of the top of the wall at the second-floor level needs to be restudied.
5. The relationship of the window on the third floor, center wing on the west elevation to the window below needs to be restudied.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:02 P.M. TO 4:18 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**10. 214 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-015
 Application Number: MST2016-00409
 Owner: Peter Mangurian
 Applicant: Kevin Moore

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 3,125 square foot commercial building on a 22,108 square foot lot. The project includes the following: converting 280 square feet of floor area to outdoor covered patio, hardscape alterations, removal of an existing 50 foot tall queen palm tree, new landscaping, two new parking spaces, and pedestrian path. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal Review.)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on October 5, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued three weeks with comments:

1. All that is new to the building (e.g., the trellis, the cement tile) should conform to the El Pueblo Viejo guidelines; pursue a handmade aesthetic instead of machine-made.
2. The plaster proportions need to be wider at the corners.

Action: Grumbine/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**11. 518 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046
 Application Number: MST2013-00140
 Owner: Charles & Georgetta Craviotto Survivors Trust
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza
 Business Name: India Bazaar

(Revised proposal to remove an unpermitted pole and canvas structure and to construct an approximately 1,000 square foot wood trellis with permanent retractable canvas canopies on slide wires. The project includes five-foot tall wrought iron fencing with plaster columns and an eight inch plaster curb, two plaster entry archways, and a rear wrought iron access gate to enclose an outdoor retail site with an existing storage building. Decorative potted landscaping is also proposed. The project will address violations in enforcement case ENF2012-01002.)

(Fifth concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on June 29, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect; and Harry Gupta, representing the Owner

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the entrance does not seem to fit the structure or the El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued three weeks with comments:

1. The gates need to be more traditional and elaborate.
2. Interruptions of the long runs of railing are necessary, perhaps by posts or landscaping.
3. Some decoration is needed to lessen the simplicity of the proposal.
4. The posts should be 8"x8", not 6"x6"; the timber should be more massive.
5. The cornice on top of the arch should have proper scale.
6. The ironwork needs to be more traditional.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

12. 29 W ANAPAMU ST

C-2 Zone

(4:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00487
 Owner: Stuart Fuss
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal to convert attic area to additional 585 square feet of new office space on an existing 17,395 square foot, four-story office building. Exterior alterations include raising the ceiling and extending the floor of the attic by approximately 10 feet to convert attic to floor area, and adding a third-floor balcony. The overall building height will remain unchanged at 45'.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:50 p.m.

Present: Paul Rupp and Alex Parker, AB Design Studio, Inc.

Public comment opened at 4:56 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued three weeks with comments:

1. A redesign of the proposal is suggested.
2. The building as it exists has charm and appropriate massing for the Monterey style; the proposal is not consistent with that style and is rather unremarkable in its addition.
3. Provide a 3-D computer model of the proposed building, with the massing of the adjacent structures ghosted in.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/1/0. (Drury opposed. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:10 P.M. TO 5:17 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**13. 11 W PEDREGOSA ST & 1829 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(5:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-026
Application Number: MST2016-00485
Owner: Emmet J. Hawkes Family Trust
Architect: Thomas Oschner

(Proposal for a mixed-use commercial and residential project to be developed under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program. The project proposes the demolition of an existing 1,180 square foot single-family residence. In its place will be a 1,492 square foot two-story commercial building, six residential units to be located within two 2-story single-family residences and two 2-story duplexes, and an 86 square foot laundry building. The six residential units, which total 7,278 square feet, will have an average unit size of 1,213 square feet and a density of 14 du/ac. The project proposes six commercial parking spaces and six residential parking spaces, of which two will be covered. The project also includes covered bike parking, new landscaping and hardscape, new curb cuts, and a new trash enclosure. The project proposes a total of 8,856 square feet of development on an 18,548 square foot lot with a land use designation of Medium-High Density (15-27 du/ac).)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 5:17 p.m.

Present: Thomas Oschner, Architect; and Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired about the demolition of the single-family residence and if it was evaluated for historic significance.

Public comment closed at 5:29 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Veyna commented on the nice interplay of the buildings and suggested that the parking have a structural element, instead of leaving it wide open.
2. Commissioner Orías stated that the proposal is designed sensitively to the neighborhood, and she appreciated that open space was taken into account. She favored softening the impact of the parking lot to look more residential.
3. Commissioner La Voie stated that the proposal is a good example of the intent of the AUD program, that the architecture is commendable, and that the wide-open feel of the parking lot should be mitigated, perhaps with more landscaping.
4. Commissioner Grumbine commended the State Street elevation and stated that the Pedregosa Street frontage does not address the street, suggesting the addition of something structural to relieve the long stretch of parking lot.
5. Commissioner Murray agreed, with positive comments.
6. Commissioner Mahan agreed, with positive comments.
7. Commissioner Drury commented that the State Street elevation looks a little busy, and he suggested modeling after Units 5 and 6, which look more poetic.
8. Chair Suding suggested flipping the covered parking toward Pedregosa Street.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:44 P.M. ****