



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 19, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury (until 5:16 p.m.), La Voie (absent 4:00-4:24 p.m.), Mahan, Murray (until 5:16 p.m.), Orías, Suding (absent 2:40-3:00 p.m.), and Veyna
Members absent: Grumbine and Shallanberger
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

The following people commented on a former project located at 129 E. Anapamu Street:

1. Elie Genadry, owner, addressed complaints from neighbors about the property.
2. Robert Mann voiced concerns about the trash enclosure and disabled access.
3. Anne Campbell, owner of the adjacent building, summarized concerns about the trash enclosure and wheelchair lift.

4. John Campbell ceded his time to Anne Campbell.
5. Adelaide Ortega, of the Access Advisory Committee, requested more information about the project.
6. Danae Liechti, neighbor, expressed concern about the trash enclosure.
7. Amy Dutch, neighbor, expressed concern about the trash enclosure and wheelchair lift.
8. Bryan Murphy, architect for the project, provided a brief summary of the project.

The Commission requested that this case be placed on a future agenda for further discussion and public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 5, 2016, as amended.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced that Commissioner Murray will leave the meeting early.
2. Commissioner Drury announced that he will leave the meeting early.
3. Commissioner Mahan requested information from staff about Commissioner Shallanberger's participation on the Commission.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Drury reported that he and other subcommittee members reviewed the plans for the Paseo Nuevo project.
2. Mr. Limón reported that the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program ad hoc subcommittee's Recommended Infill Design Guidelines are being finalized for review by the Full Commission before recommendation to the City Council for adoption. Mr. Limón suggested that a representative from the HLC attend the joint City Council and Planning Commission meeting on October 27 to convey the HLC's request that the guideline adoption be prioritized.

Commissioner Mahan volunteered to attend.

Commissioner Orías emphasized that the new review tools developed by the subcommittee should move forward as quickly as possible.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. 1819 LAS CANOAS RD, SKOFIELD PARK****(1:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-040-024

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the sandstone Rattlesnake Canyon Bridge, constructed in 1919 and located at 1819 Las Canoas Road, in Skofield Park.)

Actual time: 2:07 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged public comment previously submitted for this item from Paulina Conn, Michael Mullin, Scott Grafton, Mimi Hildbrand, Edward Behrman, Bettina Barrett, Fran Galt, Bryan Dinkins, and Sylvia Sykes.

Public comment closed at 2:12 p.m.

Commission comments: Clarify in the staff report that the bridge is stone-faced, with form concrete underneath.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-10 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the Rattlesnake Canyon Bridge located at 1819 Las Canoas Road, Skofield Park.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. 1000 STATE ST****(1:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-014

Owner: Quincy/1000 Associates, LP

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the Santa Barbara County National Bank [now known as Montecito Bank & Trust], designed by noted architect Myron Hunt in 1919 and located at 1000 State Street.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.

Janet Garufis, CEO of Montecito Bank & Trust, spoke in support of the Landmark designation.

Public comment closed at 2:28 p.m.

Commission comments: Include the planter on the Carrillo Street elevation in the boundary of the Landmark designation.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-11 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the Santa Barbara County National Bank (now known as Montecito Bank & Trust) located at 1000 State Street.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

3. 1721 SANTA BARBARA ST

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-005

Owner: WGH Ventures, Inc.

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to the City Council the Landmark designation of the George Edwards House, designed by noted architect Thomas Nixon in 1887 in the Queen Anne style and located at 1721 Santa Barbara Street.)

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-12 recommending that the City Council designate as a City Landmark the George Edwards House located at 1721 Santa Barbara Street.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 6210-6290 HOLLISTER AVE

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-042

Application Number: MST2016-00022

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.

Architect: Flex Designs

(Proposal to construct two new buildings on a vacant six-acre parcel. The project will include a 22,282 square foot, two-story auto dealership building for Chrysler, with 91 parking spaces and 48 inventory spaces. Also proposed is a 21,087 square foot, one-story auto dealership building for Infiniti and another franchise, with 89 parking spaces and 57 inventory spaces. There will also be a sales lot for Airstream trailer sales. Total development on site will be 43,369 square feet. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Development Plan.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:36 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:36 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Drury/Oriás, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC SURVEY REPORT/ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

5. 1200 BLK LAS POSITAS RD 2943 SEG ID

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-943

Application Number: MST2014-00055

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Derrick Bailey, Supervising Traffic Engineer

Applicant: Jessica Grant, Project Planner

(Proposal for the Las Positas Road Multiuse Path Project. The proposal involves the design of a 2.6-mile-long separated multiuse pathway for bicyclists and pedestrians in City right-of-way along Modoc Road from Calle de Los Amigos to Las Positas Road, and along Las Positas Road from Modoc Road to Cliff Drive. The project will provide key connections among Santa Barbara's regional Cross-town and Coastal Bike Routes, the neighborhoods adjacent to the path, Elings Park, Arroyo Burro Beach County Park, and the Douglas Family Preserve. A portion of the project is located within the Coastal Zone and will require Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Review of Memorandum and Historic Survey Report/Archaeology Report, which together constitute a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Eric Nocerino, Applied Earthworks, Inc.)

Actual time: 2:40 p.m.

Present: Eric Nocerino, Applied Earthworks, Inc.; and Ashley Shue, Supervising Engineer, and Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest wondered if the location of the former Veronica Springs Water Company in this area was considered in the report.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Clarify the prior ground disturbance of existing paths, with areas of disturbance labeled on the plan.
2. Include the history of the asphalt sidewalk.
3. The project description should mention safe passage to the junior high school from the adjacent neighborhoods.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 651 PASEO NUEVO****C-2 Zone**

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00464
 Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
 Applicant: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for renovation of Paseo Nuevo Shopping Center, including the replacement of all existing paving, new hardscape elements, new paint on all existing building elevations, replacement of existing light fixtures, and addition of new decorative pendant fixtures, patterned pole lights, and ambient lighting.)

(Review of ad hoc subcommittee recommendations. Project Design Approval is requested.)

Actual time: 3:00 p.m.

Present: Michelle Swanitz, DMHA Architecture; Ann Kale, Lighting Designer; Annmarie Brintnall, Gensler; and Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:03 P.M. TO 3:07 P.M. ****

Public comment opened at 3:45 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged public correspondence in support from Paulina Conn.

Public comment closed at 3:46 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission appreciates the design team's work and progress.
2. Consider the control of birds and the damage they can create.
3. Consider a gentle arch or other element such as corbels to soften the existing rectangular entrance at Canon Perdido Street.
4. Plans should show the current merchant kiosks and any design changes proposed.
5. The center court and other spaces should have more seating.
6. Bricks should not have beveled edges and should be subtly variegated, like the State Street sidewalk bricks; brick patterns should also be varied throughout.
7. Provide mosaic examples.
8. Pay more attention to smaller, narrower passages.
9. Give more design consideration to the ADA ramp off Canon Perdido Street.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:50 P.M. TO 4:00 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. CABRILLO BALL PARK****P-R/SD-3 Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-311-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00144
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(Proposal for renovations to the Cabrillo Ball Park. Renovation project includes redesigned park entries, outdoor fitness equipment stations, and a new pathway. Also proposed are new landscaping improvements, accessibility improvements, renovation of the ball field turf and irrigation, exterior lighting at the existing restrooms, and pedestrian lighting. Three Calle Puerto Vallarta street parking spaces will be removed to provide space for an accessible sidewalk improvement. Approximately nine [9] trees will be removed, one palm relocated, and 12 new trees installed. The project will be reviewed by Planning Commission for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. Project was last reviewed on May 4, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Parks Associate Planner, and George Thomson, Parks Capital Projects Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara; and Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:12 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with comments and findings:

1. The project has come a long way and is in keeping with the HLC comments from the last review.
2. Consider adding benches to the path loop.
3. Consider a more curvilinear path along Cabrillo Boulevard.
4. The Commission appreciates the openness with respect to safety and security.
5. The Commission approves the use of a brown color paint for the fence rather than the typical Malaga green.
6. The Commission finds the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) are generally met as follows:
 - a. This project is in compliance with the City Charter and Municipal Code and is consistent with HLC design guidelines.
 - b. This project is compatible with the architectural character of the City and the neighborhood.
 - c. This project is appropriate in size, mass, bulk, height, and scale.
 - d. This project is sensitive to adjacent City Landmarks and historic resources.
 - e. This project does not impede public views of the ocean or mountains.
 - f. This project makes appropriate use of open space and has appropriate landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 6/0/0. (La Voie stepped down. Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.)
 Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**8. CITYWIDE-VARIOUS CITY LOCATIONS**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-000-944
 Application Number: MST2016-00475
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Southern California Edison

(Proposal to add various new electrical equipment, underground vaults, conduit, and cable to be completed in phases for the SCE Downtown Service Reliability Improvement Project. This phase consists of [5] pad mounted, above ground SCE electrical transformers at various downtown locations in public right of way and on private property. The project also includes [1] pad mounted gas switch equipment on the 800 Block of State Street.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: John Eccles, Technical Planner, and Carolina Gonzales, Project Manager, Southern California Edison

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:27 P.M. TO 4:32 P.M. ****

Public comment opened at 4:40 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if there is a way to house equipment in places other than the street.

Public comment closed at 4:41 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 4:49 p.m.

Maggie Campbell, of Downtown Santa Barbara, expressed concern about the units on State Street and adjacent to the post office, and asked that the Commission address landscaping.

Public comment closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The visual impacts of the transformers and gas switch equipment need to be ameliorated, especially at the Canon Perdido Street and State Street locations.
2. The Canon Perdido Street unit may have too many significant, negative impacts on adjacent historic resources (e.g., the Presidio, the Post Office, and the Lobero Theatre). Pursue alternate locations.
3. Study moving the Canon Perdido Street unit further away from the historic guard house.
4. Use a design professional to assist with screening of all locations to meet El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.
5. For locations besides those on Canon Perdido Street and State Street, screen the equipment with landscape or paint.
6. The pads need to be better hidden and disguised, possibly put at grade.
7. A sandstone-painted solution may be acceptable.
8. The bollards are problematic and need to be designed.

9. The pad reduction is a possible solution, but it is a placebo to greater impacts.
10. The unit at the Police Department needs to be located away from the proposed memorial statue.
11. In the most sensitive locations (e.g., Canon Perdido Street and State Street), it would be appropriate to locate equipment underground.
12. Provide examples of how other cities treat this equipment in their historic districts.
13. Provide information about the decibel level of the “hum” of the equipment at high-peak demand.
14. Provide project information in advance of the meeting.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:16 P.M. TO 5:23 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

9. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:30)

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-082-002
 Application Number: MST2016-00447
 Owner: Betty Jo Lauritson Trust
 Applicant: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Pre-Application Concept Review of a proposal for a 27-unit mixed-use project to be developed on three parcels under the Average Unit-Size Density [AUD] Program. The project proposes to demolish three existing residential buildings totaling 4,599 square feet, three sheds, and all associated paving. The project proposes the construction of a 3-story, 33,437 square foot mixed use building that includes 14,459 square feet of residential area and 4,182 square feet of commercial floor area. Forty-one parking spaces will be provided by a 14,289 square foot partially subterranean parking garage. The residential component comprises 27 AUD rental apartments with an average unit size of 536 square feet. The three parcels have a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial/High Residential [28-36 dwelling units per acre]. The proposed density on the total of .44 acres will be 62 units per acre, as allowed by the AUD Priority Housing Overlay. The project includes Planning Commission review for a proposal under the AUD Priority Housing Overlay with a combined net lot area of more than 15,000 square feet.)

(Comments only; one-time Pre-Application Concept Review.)

Actual time: 5:23 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Alberto Valner, Kibo Group

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that 214 E. De La Guerra Street, the Ygnacio residence, has been nominated for City Landmark designation, and the HLC Designations Subcommittee has prioritized the building to be designated in the next round in early 2017. Once the applicant was notified of the upcoming Landmark designation, the design changed to incorporate the property into the development, not demolish it.

Public comment opened at 5:29 p.m.

1. John Johnson, of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History, submitted a letter and explained the historical significance of the Ygnacio family and residence.

2. Kristina Foss emphasized the importance of the Ygnacio residence and urged that it be landmarked and protected from development.
3. Samantha Sandoval, representing the Barbareño Band of Chumash Indians, spoke in opposition, explaining Luisa Ygnacio's importance to her descendants and the history of the City.
4. Ernestine Ygnacio-DeSoto, representing the Barbareño Band of Chumash Indians, stated that the house is sacred and historically significant, and expressed concern about the impact of construction.
5. Michael Imwalle, of the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation and Santa Barbara Conservancy, suggested there may be archaeological significance to the site.
6. Sylvia Regalado, chairwoman of the Barbareño Band of Chumash Indians, explained the importance of the Ygnacio family in the preservation of Chumash knowledge and tradition, and stated that the site should be protected.
7. Mary Louise Days, of the Santa Barbara Conservancy, explained the significance of the site and requested that the project description and address be changed.
8. Anne Petersen, of the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation, urged that the home be landmarked and protected.

Public comment closed at 5:46 p.m.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:47 P.M. TO 5:49 P.M. ****

Commission comments:

1. The architecture shall be more appropriate to the El Pueblo Viejo guidelines and the surrounding neighborhood.
2. The mass, bulk, and scale need refinement and development; they are not compatible with the site and do not show sensitivity to the existing, Landmark-eligible single-story building.
3. The third story is especially problematic as currently designed.
4. A Historic Structures/Sites Report will need to address the cultural landscape of the neighborhood.
5. The Commission suggests the applicant pursue a lot line adjustment so that the Landmark-eligible single-story building will be a separate parcel.
6. The Commission requests more photos of the neighborhood.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**10. 2205 OAK PARK LN****R-3 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-012
 Application Number: MST2016-00391
 Owner: William Fischer
 Architect: Marbletecture

(Proposal for a new residential development using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The project will include the demolition of 321 square feet, and 1,014 square feet of first- and second-floor additions to an existing 930 square foot one-story dwelling unit at the front of the parcel. The project also includes a new, two-story, 538 square foot dwelling at the rear of the parcel. Also proposed is to demolish an existing 307 square foot storage building [former garage] in the rear. There will be two uncovered parking spaces provided. The average unit size will be 1,080 square feet and the proposed density will be 19 dwelling units per acre on a 4,635 square foot parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Medium High Density Residential 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Total development on site will be 2,161 square feet. This house is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. This project will address violations in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00245.)

(Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:05 p.m.

Present: Tom Marble, Architect; and William Fischer, Owner

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez reminded the Commission of her memo evaluating the proposal's conformance to design guidelines.

Public comment opened at 6:13 p.m.

1. Karen Martin, neighbor, commented on the cottage feel of the neighborhood, objecting to the looming aspect of a second story, and expressed parking concerns.
2. Chair Suding acknowledged correspondence in opposition received from Nora Gallagher, Scott & Mary Hollock, and Karen Martin.

Public comment closed at 6:19 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The project as submitted is not acceptable for the neighborhood or for the potential historic resource.
2. Follow the recommendations from the Urban Historian's memo.
3. Parking in the front yard is incompatible with this neighborhood.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**11. 414 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone****(5:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-027
Application Number: MST2016-00190
Owner: John & Martha Peterson
Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 3,200 square foot commercial building and construct a new four-story, mixed-use development with 1,354 square feet of commercial area, and 21 rental units on a 14,919 square foot parcel. The residential component is being developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program and proposes a unit mix comprising one studio unit, 17 one-bedroom units, and 4 two-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 808 square feet. There will be a total of 25 parking spaces located within a ground-floor garage.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 6:31 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Christine Pierron, The Cearnal Collective, LLP

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission accepts the design as commendable and would like to see detailing, particularly of the roofline, with the intent of granting Project Design Approval upon completion of the Environmental Assessment.
2. The Commission would support a Zoning Modification to allow a trellis to encroach into the five-foot front setback on the west elevation.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Grumbine, Murray, and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:47 P.M. ****