



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 5, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is available at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 3:10 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding, and Veyna
Members absent: Shallanberger
Staff present: Limón (at 1:36 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 21, 2016, as presented.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Julio Veyna.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

a. Commissioner Shallanberger will be absent; Commissioner Grumbine will be late.

b. The applicants for Paseo Nuevo plan to appear for concept review at the next HLC meeting.

2. Chair Suding announced that public comment has been received in opposition to the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program from the following people: Paulina Conn, Michael Mullin, Scott Grafton, Mimi Hildbrand, Edward Behrman, Bettina Barrett, Fran Galt, Pamela Boehr, Barbara Lyon, Bryan Dinkins, and Sylvia Sykes.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported on the AUD ad hoc subcommittee meeting of October 4. The subcommittee has produced a draft of "Historic Landmarks Commission Recommended Infill Design Guidelines" and will be ready to present it to the Full Commission soon.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 414 & 420 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-023
Application Number: MST2016-00174
Owner: 414 East Carrillo Properties, LLC
Architect: DesignARC

(Proposal for a new mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The proposal includes a voluntary lot merger of 414 and 420 E. Carrillo Street, the demolition of a 4,903 square foot building at 414 E. Carrillo Street, and the construction of a new four-story mixed-use building including 21 residential rental apartments and a 850 square foot addition of commercial floor area. An existing 11,700 square foot commercial building will be maintained. The residential unit mix will include six studio units, 6 one-bedroom units, and 9 two-bedroom units, with an average size of 768 square feet. The proposed density on the combined parcels totaling 34,981 square feet will be 27 dwelling units per acre, which is the maximum allowed on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Commercial/Medium High Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. There will be a total of 57 parking spaces, including 37 spaces in a ground floor parking garage and 20 uncovered spaces in a surface lot. There will be 3,145 square feet of landscaping. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to provide less than the required number of parking spaces. A shared parking analysis will be provided.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:36 p.m.

Present: Heather McDaniel, Dudek

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. Specifically, he agrees that a qualified archaeologist should monitor earth-moving activities during the proposed construction in light of the possibility that significant historic archaeological remains may be present.

Public comment opened at 1:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted, with Dr. Glassow's comment.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:38 P.M. TO 1:49 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 821 CORONEL ST****E-1 Zone**

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-243-013
 Application Number: MST2016-00292
 Owner: Adam Ross
 Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal to construct a 589 square foot first-story addition, a 527 square foot second-story addition, and a new 500 square foot two-car garage at an existing 2,450 square foot single-family residence. The project includes 108 square feet of covered porches and 27 square feet of storage. The proposed total of 4,093 square feet of development on a 16,970 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 93% of the guideline maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This structure is a designated City Landmark: "Hunt-Stambach House.")

(A. Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on August 10, 2016.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Architect; Julia Ross, Owner; and Pamela Post & Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the original residence had no carriage house; to retain the character of the building, it should not have any structures around it, or they should be subordinate.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The gabbling of the proposed structure does not relate to the existing historic resource.
2. The hyphen needs to be more diminutive from the main elevation.
3. The north element of the east elevation, including the octagonal bay window and decorated portion matching the façade, should not be obscured by the addition.
4. The proposed addition should be less symmetrical, following the Italianate style.
5. The proposed addition should recede more from the rest of the house.
6. The carriage house idea is supportable, but should be smaller and reduced in height; perhaps connect it to the house instead of using the hyphen, or use a breezeway.
7. Consider eliminating the proposed porch.
8. The Commission appreciates the need for the garage and more living space, but the historic resource must be respected.
9. The Commission suggests that the space behind the hyphen be enlarged to accomplish the desired square footage.
10. The tree removal seems appropriate.
11. The Commission appreciates the owners' care and diligence as stewards of the historic resource.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

(B. Review of Historic Sites and Structures Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that the Urban Historian has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if a Historic Structures Report was done when the house was moved to this site.

Public comment closed at 2:19 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely, pending redesign of the project, with comments:

1. The addition obscures the primary character-defining features of the existing resource, specifically the existing bay window on the north elevation; the conclusion of the report needs to address this impact.
2. The report should address the current spatial relationship of the house since it has been located on the property for 50 years.
3. The report should address that there are simplified architectural elements that are appropriate on the back of house and not appropriate on the front of the house.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Grumbine and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. 2758 LAS ENCINAS RD****County Zone****(2:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-250-066
 Application Number: MST2016-00440
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: Dwight Gregory
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(Proposal to demolish a total of 1,334 square feet, of which 686 square feet are unpermitted improvements, from the existing 1,934 square foot Western Residence located on a 2.2 acre lot as directed by City Council condition of approval. The proposed demolition and remodel of the residence will result in the retention of the historic remnant [garden storage] and two garage bays. The proposal also includes the removal of seven trees. Reconstruction of a replacement residence will be pursued under a separate application and permit.)

(A. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Applicant; Dwight Gregory, Architect; and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Public comment opened at 3:04 p.m.

1. Chair Suding acknowledged a letter of support from Karl Hutterer of the Mission Canyon Association.
2. Kellam de Forest asked about the historical background of the residence and accessory structures.

Public comment closed at 3:06 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with the comment that this approval does not include a future residential unit.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(B. Review of Historic Sites and Structures Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that the Urban Historian has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with conditions:

1. On page 27, either remove the paragraph pertaining to a future residential unit, or rework to clarify that today's review did not include evaluation of such a unit.
2. Remove the word "Draft" in the page footer.

Action: Murray/_____. Motion failed.

Motion: To accept the report with conditions:

1. On page 27, amend the paragraph to note that the acceptance of this report is not an approval of a future residential unit.
2. Remove the word "Draft" in the page footer.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:20 P.M. TO 3:45 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 225 CALLE MANZANITA****E-3/SD-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-272-004
 Application Number: MST2016-00321
 Owner: Mark & Maren Johnston
 Applicant: Dale Pekarek

(Proposal for 60 square feet of additions to an existing 1,218 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with a 324 square foot detached two-car garage. Proposed alterations include the relocation of an existing fireplace and chimney from the east elevation to the south elevation, a new oriel bay window and roof form at the east elevation, enclosure of a covered side porch off of the dining room, a new roof over a raised entry porch, and replacement of existing windows. The project includes a remodel and reconfiguration of interior spaces. The proposed total of 1,602 square feet on a 6,920 square foot lot is 53% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project will address a violation identified in Zoning Information Report #18732. The structure is listed on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was reviewed on September 21, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Dale Pekarek, Architect; and Mark Johnston, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that the chimney on the front façade makes this house unique, and it does not have to support a fireplace.

Public comment closed at 3:53 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the chimney as proposed as being acceptable to the design? 3/5 Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The bracket on the porch is too close to the window as seen on the east elevation.
2. Some Commissioners consider the spacing of the windows on the east elevation to be appropriate to the style.
3. Rework the bay window to be more rectangular.
4. More than a few Commissioners consider Scheme B to be the most appropriate for the English Vernacular style.
5. Study shifting the chimney and bay window to the east and possibly connecting to each other in an attempt to be less symmetrical and more whimsical.
6. The attempt at symmetry is not appropriate for this style of architecture.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/1/0. (Drury opposed. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 214 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-015
 Application Number: MST2016-00409
 Owner: Peter Mangurian
 Applicant: Kevin Moore, Architect

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 3,125 square foot commercial building on a 22,108 square foot lot. The project includes the following: converting 280 square feet of floor area to outdoor covered patio, hardscape alterations, removal of an existing 50 foot tall Queen palm tree, new landscaping, two new parking spaces, and pedestrian path. The property is located in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and requires Coastal Review.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 4:18 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:27 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the project is not approvable as presented within the El Pueblo Viejo district.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:36 P.M. TO 4:43 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 227 E ARRELLAGA ST****R-3 Zone****(4:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-192-026
 Application Number: MST2016-00413
 Owner: Unity Church
 Agent: Susette Naylor, Thompson-Naylor Architects

(Proposal for site improvements including a new outdoor pavilion, an interior remodel of existing church offices, and new landscaping and impervious paving. The structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List: Unity Church, constructed in 1958.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:43 p.m.

Present: Susette Naylor & Dennis Thompson, Thompson-Naylor Architects; and Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that it would be helpful to have a Historic Structures Report for this building.

Public comment closed at 4:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposal is acceptable and appropriate to the building.
2. The connection of the proposed walkway to the existing covered walkway needs further consideration.
3. The pathway to the office needs consideration.
4. The landscape plant choices are appropriate; study the landscape plan to respond to the architecture and be more structured as appropriate to the period of significance.
5. Continue developing the color of the steel posts of the pavilion.
6. Study ways to prevent blocking views into the building from the sidewalk, perhaps raising the height of the pavilion.
7. Study a different way to address the design and location of the kiosk.
8. The Commission requests a site visit.

Action: La Voie/Veyna, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 1032 SANTA BARBARA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-212-024
 Application Number: MST2016-00071
 Owner: David Myers
 Applicant: David Watkins, DesignARC

(The proposal is a mixed-use project using the Average Unit Density [AUD] Program [Priority Housing Overlay] on two lots totaling 7,497 square feet with a density of 48 dwelling units per acre [du/ac]. The project is proposed as a three-story building, with eight units and 1,369 square feet of nonresidential development, with 11 covered parking spaces. The units will include 7 two-bedroom units and one studio unit. Existing on the site are a one-story office building and a one-story single-family residence that will be demolished. A zoning modification is requested to allow an enclosed mirador balcony to satisfy the requirement for private outdoor living space.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification. Project was last reviewed on April 20, 2016.)

Actual time: 5:13 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields and David Watkins, DesignARC

Staff comments: Irma Unzueta, Project Planner, reported on the feedback from the Planning Commission on the four issue areas that the HLC identified in its previous review.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The project has come a long way. The Commission appreciates the applicant meeting with the neighbors.
2. The architecture is appropriate and helps reduce the mass.
3. Study reducing the height of the stairwell on the Figueroa Street elevation.

4. The Commission supports the use of the mirador balcony to satisfy the requirement for private outdoor living space.
5. The Commission emphasizes that its comments concerning site-specific issues need more thoughtful consideration by staff.
6. The Commission finds the project generally acceptable, commendable, and worthy of Project Design Approval.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 333 W ORTEGA ST

R-4 Zone

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-001
 Application Number: MST2016-00397
 Owner: John R. Whitehurst
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Architect: Tracy Burnell

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing four-unit apartment building using the Average Unit Density Incentive Program [AUD]. The project proposes the demolition of an existing 760 square foot detached four-car garage, and the construction of 2,017 square feet of first- and second-story additions comprising four new dwelling units. The project also proposes a 1,538 square foot attached garage that will provide eight covered parking spaces using mechanical parking stackers, and includes new landscaping, and 20 cubic yards of cut and fill grading to be balanced on site. The eight units on the property will have an average unit size of 698 square feet, and the proposed density will be 37 dwelling units per acre using the Priority Housing Overlay on a 9,375 square foot parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of High Density Residential, 28-36 dwelling units per acre. The total development on site will be 2,190 square feet. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested Zoning Modifications to allow a second-floor deck to encroach into the interior setback and for a common open yard area that does not meet minimum 20' x 20' dimensions. The existing structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested Zoning Modifications.)

Actual time: 5:43 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Applicant; Tracy Burnell, Architect; and John Whitehurst, Owner

Staff comments: Mr. Limón stated that the Urban Historian has indicated she would like conceptual direction given to the applicant for this project.

Public comment opened at 5:55 p.m.

1. Debbie Hughey, adjacent neighbor, is concerned that the project seems large for the site and that its proximity to her building creates a privacy issue.
2. Kellam de Forest inquired about the height of the building and asked for information about the structure on the Potential Historic Resources List.

Public comment closed at 5:58 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely with comments:**
1. The overall massing seems compatible with the neighborhood.
 2. The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
 3. The architecture does not have Italianate style (asymmetrical, irregular) elements.
 4. Rework the west elevation to be more Italianate in massing.
 5. Do not emulate the style of the 2000 addition.
 6. Study reducing the plate height of the second story; the Commission understands that the plate height on the first story accommodates the parking.
 7. Resolve the large opening into the covered parking, and try to address the appearance of a bridge; perhaps a porte cochere solution would work.
 8. Provide additional information on how the stacked parking will function, including noise generation.
 9. Study adding chimneys to break up the roofline.
 10. Study a different solution for the non-historic flat roof.
 11. Find a different location for the trash enclosure.
 12. Contact and work with the neighbors to reduce the visual impacts.
 13. Study increasing project amenities.
 14. The Commission is concerned about the decrease in the common open yard area.
 15. The Commission requests a site visit to evaluate neighborhood compatibility.
- Action:** Orías/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:25 P.M. ****