



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 27, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
DAVID ENG, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC by clicking on Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Grumbine (absent from 2:54 to 3:15 p.m.), La Voie (at 1:43 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger (at 1:32 p.m.), Suding, and Veyna

Members absent: Drury

Staff present: Limón (until approx. 3:00 p.m.), Hernandez (until 3:08 p.m.), Eng, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest commented on the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program, stating that the HLC should recommend that AUD buildings not be allowed on blocks of one-story single-family units, within El Pueblo Viejo, or close to City Landmarks.

Commissioner Orías requested that an ad hoc subcommittee be formed to examine the AUD program as it relates to the Historic Resource Element in order to provide formalized input to the Planning Commission. The Committee was formed to be Commissioners Grumbine, Mahan, and Orías.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 13, 2016, as amended.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 6/0/1. (Grumbine abstained. Drury and La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A-F) and Philip Suding (Item E).

Action: Murray/Shallanberger, 7/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Eng announced the following:

- a. Commissioner Drury will be absent; Commissioner Grumbine will step down from Item 8, 2112 Santa Barbara Street.
- b. On July 21, the Planning Commission held a discussion about the AUD program.
- c. On July 26, the City Council Ordinance Committee received a report from staff on proposed criteria and definitions regarding Historic Districts and Special Design Districts.
- d. There will be a special meeting of the Architectural Board of Review and the HLC to discuss the draft wireless ordinance on July 28 at 3:00 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.

Commissioners Orías, La Voie, and Veyna indicated they would attend; Commissioner Drury will also attend.

2. Mr. Limón summarized the discussion at the July 26 City Council Ordinance Committee meeting. The purpose of the meeting was to educate the Ordinance Committee about Special Design Districts and to outline criteria to be used in forming Historic Districts.

Mr. Limón also discussed the July 21 Sign Ordinance Review Committee meeting. The City Attorney outlined the legal rationale for changing the Sign Ordinance as it relates to sign content to prevent First Amendment issues. The Committee asked the City Attorney to provide suggestions on altering the language while retaining the intent of the regulations. The City Attorney asked the Committee for additional policy discussion about the purpose of certain regulations. Mr. Limón requested that the HLC offer input.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Chair Suding reported on the Parks Sign Program, which was reviewed at the Sign Committee meeting earlier in the day. The guidelines were reviewed, and besides some suggestions regarding color and materials, they are ready to present to City Council in September.

2. Commissioner Mahan reported his and Commissioner Orías' attendance at the July 26 City Council Ordinance Committee meeting, stating that the HLC will watch the drafting of the ordinance carefully. Commissioner Mahan also reported on the July 21 Planning Commission meeting about the AUD program, during which he and Commissioner Orías commented. He reported that the public comment was predominantly negative and mostly related to parking and the intrusion of large developments in single-family neighborhoods.

Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission liaison to the HLC, remarked that she is very concerned about the AUD program, and she is preparing a memo of her suggestions.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 1116 GARDEN STREET

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-172-001

Owner: Kathy Spieler, Paul A. Spieler, and Cory Spieler

(Review Staff Report and designate as a Structure of Merit The Brownsill House, a Queen Anne style house constructed c. 1880 located at 1116 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-4 to designate as a Structure of Merit the house located at 1116 Garden Street.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

2. 1116 GARDEN STREET

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-172-001

Owner: Kathy Spieler, Paul A. Spieler, and Cory Spieler

(Application for Mills Act Contract. The property was purchased in 2016 by the Spieler family, who intends to rehabilitate the house so that it can continue to contribute to Santa Barbara's cultural heritage. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan and make a recommendation to the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract for the house located at 1116 Garden Street, with appreciation to the owner for the rehabilitation work.

Action: Orías/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1919 SANTA BARBARA STREET

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-381-007

Owner: Julia Collier Emerson

(Review Staff Report and designate as a Structure of Merit The Anderson House, a Vernacular American Foursquare style house constructed in 1903 located at 1919 Santa Barbara Street.)

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2016-5 to designate as a Structure of Merit the house located at 1919 Santa Barbara Street, with appreciation to the owner for the rehabilitation work.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

4. 1919 SANTA BARBARA STREET

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-381-007

Owner: Julia Collier Emerson

(Application for Mills Act Contract. The property was purchased in 2016 by Julia Collier Emerson, who intends to rehabilitate the house after years of neglect so that it can continue to contribute to Santa Barbara's cultural heritage. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, and recommend that City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated Structure of Merit property at 1919 Santa Barbara Street and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:17 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if the Mills Act influenced the owner's purchase of the property.

Public comment closed at 2:17 p.m.

- Motion:** To recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract for the house located at 1919 Santa Barbara Street.
- Action:** Mahan/Murray, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

5. 2210 HUDSON STREET

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-316-006

Owner: Dylan and China Jones

(Application for Mills Act Contract. The house was designated a City Landmark on November 8, 1989 as the Charles Pressley House. Named after the original owner, the house is an adobe residence constructed in 1924 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The owners intend to complete restoration and maintenance to the house so that it can continue to contribute to Santa Barbara's cultural heritage. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, and recommend that City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated City Landmark property at 2210 Hudson Street and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** To recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract for the house located at 2210 Hudson Street, with appreciation to the owner for the rehabilitation work.
- Action:** Veyna/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**6. 2121 GARDEN STREET**

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003
Owner: Zohar Ziv

(Application for Mills Act Contract. The house was designated a City Landmark on May 17, 2016 as "The Olives" Residence. The owners intend to complete restoration and maintenance to the house so that it can continue to contribute to Santa Barbara's cultural heritage. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plan meets the criteria outlined in Municipal Code 22.22.160.)

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plan, and recommend that City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) for a designated City Landmark property at 2121 Garden Street and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract.)

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m.

Kellam de Forest emphasized the house's importance and commended the owner for the restoration.

Public comment closed at 2:37 p.m.

Motion: To recommend that the City Council grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 22.22.160.C.4(m) and authorize the Community Development Director to execute a historic property contract for the house located at 2121 Garden Street, with comments:

1. The Commission expresses appreciation to the owner for the rehabilitation work.
2. The exemption is based upon the importance of the City Landmark property and the extent of the completed and proposed rehabilitative work.

Action: Orías/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**7. 580 RICARDO AVE****E-1 Zone**

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-131-008
 Application Number: MST2016-00164
 Owner: Bob Kafkis
 Architect: Chris Cottrell

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a 597 square foot, second-story addition with a 75 square foot balcony to an existing 1,270 square foot, one-story, single-family residence with an attached 413 square foot two-car garage. The project includes a new roof cover at the front entry and a new pool, pool equipment, and spa in the rear yard. The proposed total of 2,280 square feet of development on a 9,855 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 63% of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow a conforming second-story addition that changes the basic characteristics of the existing residence, which is non-conforming to front setback.)

(Review of Phase 1 Archaeological Report prepared by Heather McDaniel and David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:49 p.m.

Present: Chris Cottrell, Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Eng stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property and concludes that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:50 p.m. and as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**8. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-008
 Application Number: MST2016-00297
 Owner: SB Restore, LLC
 Applicant: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to permit two new wrought iron driveway gates at Santa Barbara Street and one new wood gate on Padre Street. This is a City Landmark: "Hodges House.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Applicant is requesting an exception to the fence and screen height standards per SBMC 28.87.170. Determination required for consistency with neighborhood character.)

Actual time: 2:54 p.m.

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design Associates

Public comment opened at 2:58 p.m.

Kellam de Forest inquired if something less imposing to the Landmark than the proposed gates had been considered.

Public comment closed at 3:00 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with finding:

1. The Commission finds that the height of the finial is inconsequential.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 7/0/0. (Grumbine stepped down. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:08 P.M. TO 3:15 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 414 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(2:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-027

Application Number: MST2016-00190

Owner: John & Martha Peterson

Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, 3,200 square foot commercial building and construct a new four-story, mixed-use development with 4,002 square feet of commercial area, and 22 rental units on a 15,823 square foot parcel. The residential component is being developed under the Average Unit Density [AUD] program and proposes a unit mix comprising one studio unit, 17 1-bedroom units, and four 2-bedroom units, with an average unit size of 800 square feet. There will be a total of 26 parking spaces located within a ground-floor garage. The project requires a Concept Review by Planning Commission for the AUD development in the priority housing overlay and on a lot greater than 15,000 square feet in size.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires an Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on July 13, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Christine Pierron and Laura Benard, The Cearnal Collective, LLP; and Brad Vernon, Developer

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m.

1. Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission liaison to the HLC, encouraged the HLC to suggest what would make the project acceptable. She also compared the plate and ceiling heights to those of Casa De Las Fuentes, emphasizing that building heights for livability purposes do not need to be maximized.
2. Kellam de Forest stated that the project is too bulky and tall for the site and is not compatible with the neighborhood.
3. Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Daniel and Barbara Maloney.

Public comment closed at 3:27 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The architecture is developing nicely.
2. The awnings on the building are an improvement.
3. The fenestration still needs more variety.
4. Parking does not appear to be a major problem, especially with the proposed tandem parking.
5. The plate heights, particularly on the second, third, and fourth floors, do not appear excessive.
6. The Commission emphasizes that private views are not governed by the City or its review boards.
7. The north and west elevations are successful; the south and east elevations need more variation of roof form.
8. There should be some articulation or breakup of the wall on the north property line, specifically as it relates to the pedestrian's perspective.
9. The eyebrow/skirt roof on the northwest corner needs to be restudied as to its relationship to the wall below; perhaps set the parapet wall back from the building face below the eyebrow/skirt.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:45 P.M. ****