



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 6, 2016

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
ANTHONY GRUMBINE
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

JASON DOMINGUEZ

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNANDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Commissioner La Voie.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 1:37 p.m.), La Voie, Mahan (until 3:50 p.m.), Murray, Orías (until 5:02 p.m.), and Veyna
Members absent: Shallanberger and Suding
Staff present: Limón, Hernandez, Kaufman, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 23, 2016, with corrections.

Action: Drury/Orías, 6/0/0. (Grumbine, Shallanberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A-J) and Julio Veyna (Items A-B, D-J).

Action: Drury/Murray, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Shallanberger and Suding will be absent; Commissioner Grumbine will leave at 5:30 p.m.; Commissioner Mahan will step down on Items 6-8.
- b. Item 4, Waterfront Pay Stations, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.
- c. The Joint Planning Commission/City Council meeting will take place tomorrow, April 7, at 9:30 a.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.
- d. The April 20 HLC agenda is full, and staff would like to poll the Commission on the possibility of a meeting that would end past 6:00 p.m.

The Commission agreed to an extended April 20 meeting.

2. Mr. Limón announced that the letter requested by the Commission urging prioritization of the Historic Element of the General Plan was sent to the Planning Commission, Mayor, and Councilmembers in advance of the April 7 joint meeting. He requested that a representative of the HLC attend the meeting to support that request.

Commissioner La Voie volunteered to attend.

3. Commissioner Orías shared a Noozhawk.com article about walking Sola and Micheltorena Streets, which included history of the area and exploration of some of its features.

4. Ms. Hernandez provided an update on The Californian building window restoration. The windows were found to be deteriorated beyond repair. Each window was evaluated in detail using the National Park Service's Preservation Briefs as a guideline to determine if beyond repair and was documented as to why replacement is necessary. Ms. Hernandez and Alexandra Cole, historical consultant, worked with the contractors on finding new windows that match originals in size, profile, material, and configuration so the State Street façade will retain its historic integrity.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 3780 FOOTHILL RD****COUNTY Zone**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-020-034
 Application Number: MST2016-00108
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Erin Markey, Creeks Restoration Planner
 Applicant: George Johnson, Creeks Supervisor

(Proposal to restore approximately 2,200 linear feet of riparian habitat along upper Arroyo Burro Creek in Barger Canyon. The area of work will comprise 4.95 acres of a 14.19 acre, City-owned parcel located within the County. The proposal includes creek restoration, 8,700 cubic yards of grading excavation to be relocated on site, creek widening, demolition of structures within the creek, removal of non-native plant species, removal of one native tree, relocation of 24 native trees, and planting of 4,600 native plant species. A portion of the project is located at 3742 Foothill Road, an adjacent, privately owned parcel with a recorded Conservation Easement.)

(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:50 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Division Manager, and Erin Markey, Creek Restoration Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Heather McDaniel, Dudek

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comment:

1. Though the Commission understands the limitations faced by the preparer, certain parts of the report were not entirely readable; documents impacting the specific project area should be fully transcribed for the Commission's benefit in the future.

Action: Orías/Drury, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 1130 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(1:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00237
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: Kupiec Architects
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Art

(Proposed addition and alterations to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art, consisting of a 7,944 net new square foot one- and two-story addition [primarily within the existing building volume] and the renovation of an existing four-story 64,511 net square foot building. Also proposed are a new, approximately 1,420 unenclosed square feet public rooftop pavilion; garden and terrace area with associated access elevator and stairway; and new rooftop mechanical equipment and skylights. A new art receiving facility will add 402 square feet to the building footprint, and a five foot long low curb wall at the northerly corner of the building will encroach onto City Central Library grounds. Miscellaneous site structure demolition will occur to support implementation of the proposed design. Two oak trees are proposed for removal, with replacement of one oak tree on site and two others off site. A new electrical power transformer would be located on City property at Public Parking Lot No. 7. The net new square feet of new floor area will result in 72,455 net square feet of development. Construction staging would occur on the adjacent City Library property. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Santa Barbara Museum of Art.)

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report by Post/Hazeltine Associates. Report concludes that the proposed cornice preservation plan would have a less than significant impact on the historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that she has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines; this is a better solution than previously proposed, as the cornice will be reused on the building.

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

Kellam de Forest expressed concern about where the remains of the cornice will be placed in the Santa Barbara Historical Museum and suggested that a backup location be proposed.

Public comment closed at 2:08 p.m.

**** Action on the report was tabled until after the project review. ****

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comment:

1. The part of the cornice not reused at the Museum of Art should be placed in a visible public location, in particular the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room; other options are the Santa Barbara Historical Museum or the Santa Barbara County Courthouse.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

b) (Review After Final for proposed reuse of cornice on the west elevation of the new second-floor gallery facing State Street. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-14. Project last reviewed on September 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Bob Kupiec, Kupiec Architects

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. The reused portion of the cornice on the second floor of the west elevation shall be painted white.
2. The remaining part of the cornice shall be placed on public display and possibly restored to its original colors.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED

3. 7 E ANAPAMU ST

C-2 Zone

(2:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-041
 Application Number: MST2016-00066
 Owner: Sullivan Goss 2009 Family Trust
 Agent: Ernesto Botello

(Proposal to permit "as-built" changes to the rear courtyard area of an existing 2,245 square foot commercial building comprising of new exterior dining layout and planter areas for trees, and a new three inch CMU/stone rubble veneer wall at the rear property line. Also proposed is the removal of an existing guardrail at the front terrace to be replaced with a 42 inch high stucco pony wall and the replacement of the existing awnings on the front façade. Interior improvements proposed are the addition of a bar and dining areas, accessible restrooms and storage room, a remodel of the existing kitchen area for a proposed restaurant use, and the demolition of restrooms. The project addresses enforcement violations in case ENF2015-00856. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Hitchcock Building.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on February 24, 2016 and referred to the Full Commission.)

Actual time: 2:24 p.m.

Present: Steve Hermann and Jordan Fife, Steve Hermann Design

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that this item was continued to the Full Commission from the Consent calendar. She questioned whether Storm Water Management Program requirements have been satisfied, which depends on the total square footage of impervious surface proposed.

**** The Commission recessed from 2:36 to 2:38 p.m. to view the proposed colors in the sunlight. ****

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended the remodeling of the restaurant. He expressed concern about the olive trees providing enough shade and about the awnings not meeting El Pueblo Viejo guidelines.

Public comment closed at 2:39 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission greatly appreciates the adaptive reuse and continuation of a restaurant at this location.
2. The proposal is generally acceptable and supportable in its design and intent.
3. The light fixtures, particularly those on street, need to be more traditional and in keeping with the awning structural design.
4. Study more traditional outdoor dining furniture.
5. Study some alteration of the wall along Anapamu Street to relieve its mass and mitigate its height, but remove the moldings.
6. Provide an Anapamu Street elevation plan and details consistent with site conditions and the intent of the project, including space heaters and a permeable surface in the patio area to meet Storm Water Management Program requirements.
7. The colors as proposed matching the existing white are acceptable.
8. The black awning color is acceptable.
9. The Commission supports the use of mature olive trees.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. WATERFRONT PARKING LOTS

HC/SD-3 Zone

(2:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00565
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for alterations to waterfront parking lots located at Leadbetter Beach, Harbor West, Garden Street, Chase Palm Park, E. Cabrillo Boulevard, and W. Cabrillo Boulevard to remove existing parking attendant kiosks or honor fee slot systems, ticket dispensers, and traffic arms, and install new automated pay systems with protective bollards. Also proposed are new landscaping in areas where existing kiosks were removed and six new ADA access ramps. Requires Coastal Review.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on March 9, 2016.)

Item postponed at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item.

Action: Murray/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 2535 ANACAPA ST****E-1 Zone**

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-032-003
 Application Number: MST2016-00096
 Owner: Carolyn Butcher Trust
 Architect: Susan Sherwin

(Proposal for an interior remodel to an existing single-family residence to create a new master bath, closet, new guest bathroom, and add interior stairway down to bottom story. Three exterior doors will be replaced with windows. A porch on the east side of residence will be removed, and a new shade trellis is proposed to cover the interior courtyard. An existing circular driveway in the front of the residence facing Anacapa Street will be abandoned, removed, and replaced with site work. An administrative fence height exception is being requested to allow a six foot tall stone wall along both front property lines on Constance Street and Anacapa Street, and an eight foot tall wall along the rear yard property line. The project will address violations identified in ZIR2013-00589. This residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Palmer Residence, constructed 1929.)

(Concept review; comments only. Applicant is requesting an exception to the fence and screen height standards per SBMC 28.87.170. Determination required for consistency with neighborhood character.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Susan Sherwin, Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Hernandez stated that this building is on the Potential Historic Resources List and is a wood-shingle building, and a stucco wall is not appropriate.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments, with final details continued to the Consent calendar:

1. The Commission expresses appreciation to the applicant for maintaining and restoring the building and providing original plans.
2. The Commission supports the four-foot sandstone wall at Constance and Anacapa Streets, citing the compatibility with existing walls of similar design and height in the neighborhood.
3. The Commission supports the removal of the deck and doors and addition of the windows as proposed.
4. The Commission supports the removal of the existing driveway and restoration of the original walkway configuration and material. It is recommended to reuse the brick in the existing driveway.
5. Refine the detail of the stone cap on the columns at the entry gate.
6. Provide the design of the stone wall in more detail.
7. Resolve the use of a veneer wall to give the appearance of solid stone, particularly the cap stone, which should be a minimum of 8" thick material.
8. Restudy the design of the courtyard trellis to be more consistent with design elements of the house. It is recommended that the courtyard not be fully covered; explore alternative methods of providing shade.

Action: Mahan/Grumbine, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:50 P.M. TO 3:59 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. VARIOUS LOCATIONS

(3:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-776
Application Number: MST2015-00391
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Crown Castle/NG West, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Proposed installation of new small cell wireless antennas and radios in the right-of-way at six separate site locations in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Project sites include the intersection of State and De La Guerra Streets, the 400 block of State Street, State and Anapamu Streets, Ortega and Anacapa Streets, Anacapa and Carrillo Streets, and the 900 block of Chapala Street. Proposed designs include underground vaults, canister antennas on new street poles, and new antennas on existing streetlights.)

(Third concept review; comments only. No Visual Impact findings are required. Project last reviewed on January 27, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:59 p.m.

Present: Sharon James and Heidi Payne, Crown Castle

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman summarized some of the installation proposals, including co-locations, which are located on a piece of existing infrastructure; new poles with an antenna unit atop, which have not typically been seen before; and some locations proposing new cabinets in the right-of-way.

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent calendar with comments:

1. The Commission approves the locations in concept, with the direction that whatever pole is appropriate to the street be used, and that the finial begin at the bottom with a Cavetto shape, and that moldings inspired by the State Street standard be used in all locations.
2. As proposed, the Gutierrez Street installation is not feasible.
3. The Commission finds that to the extent possible, the visual impacts have been mitigated.

Action: Drury/Grumbine, 6/0/0. (Mahan, Shallenberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. VARIOUS LOCATIONS**

(4:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-084
 Application Number: MST2015-00392
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Crown Castle/NG West, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Proposed wireless facilities in the right-of-way at three separate site locations in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. 1) 100 Block W. Gutierrez Street: Removal of an existing 35' wooden street pole to be replaced with a 19' tall street pole with a canister antenna. 2) 100 Block W. Cota Street: Proposed installation of a canister antenna atop an existing 33'-9" service pole with a below grade equipment vault containing RRUs. This proposal is in the Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District. 3) 100 Block Chapala Street: Proposed removal of a streetlight to be replaced with a decorative light standard with a canister antenna. Also proposed are a new service meter pedestal, pad, and equipment cabinet containing RRUs. This proposal is in the potential West Beach Historic District.)

(Third concept review; comments only. No Visual Impact findings are required. Project last reviewed on March 9, 2016.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Sharon James and Heidi Payne, Crown Castle

Public comment opened at 4:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent calendar with comments:

1. The Commission expresses appreciation to the design team for responding to feedback in an imaginative and appropriate way.
2. In every location, the pole is to match those immediately adjacent, and the top should have a similar design as suggested.
3. All the equipment cabinets are to be matte painted to match those in the vicinity.
4. In the location adjacent to 176 Chapala Street, a four-foot antenna is approved in order to minimize pole locations in the neighborhood.
5. Ensure that equipment boxes do not intrude on neighbors.
6. The Commission finds that to the extent possible, the visual impacts have been mitigated.

Action: Drury/Veyna, 6/0/0. (Mahan, Shallenberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**8. 28 W FIGUEROA ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-019
Application Number: MST2016-00111
Owner: Laxman Perera
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,386 square foot one-story commercial building with two parking spaces and construct a new 4,360 square foot two-story commercial building. The proposal includes new rooftop HVAC equipment and 200 cubic yards of grading excavation under the building footprint. This 3,045 square foot parcel is within the 100% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings.)

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that there needs to be potential area for backflow devices and fire sprinklers, and that the project will trigger Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program requirements, which may present design challenges because the proposed building footprint will cover the entire parcel.

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Grumbine suggested examining the plaster corbels, perhaps adding a crossbeam so that they appear to support the span.
2. Commissioner Veyna suggested restudying the chimney top detail on the rear elevation.
3. Commissioner La Voie suggested repeating the front entrance element in the rear and eliminating the awning.

Motion: Continued four weeks with positive comments.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 5/0/0. (Mahan, Orías, Shallanberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:19 P.M. ****