



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, December 2, 2015**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER  
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian  
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician  
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Interim Commission Secretary

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Suding, Veyna, and Winick  
Members absent: Murray and Shallenberger  
Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Sanchez

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 18, 2015, as presented.

**Action:** Orías/Mahan, 4/0/3. (La Voie and Suding abstained on Item 3; Orías abstained on Item 9/Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

## C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A, C) and William La Voie (Item B).

**Action:** Drury/Winick, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced that Commissioner Murray will be absent, and Commissioner Shallanberger will be late.
2. Commissioner Orías requested that the HLC receive reports from Commissioner Shallanberger about the work of the Sign Ordinance Review Committee.
3. Mr. Limón announced that the Citywide Wayfinding Sign Program was presented to the City Council on November 24. Council approved the project, with the change of a blue background color for the public parking signs instead of green.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****1. HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING & DISCUSSION PROTOCOL**

**(1:45)** Staff: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

Actual time: 1:35 p.m.

Present: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, City of Santa Barbara; and Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, City of Santa Barbara

**Discussion held.****Commissioner consensus:**

1. A third of total agenda item time should be allocated to applicant presentation, with this information reflected in the agenda.
2. PowerPoint presentations are allowed but will be included in the applicant's presentation time.
3. The existing order of public comment before Commissioner questions is preferable.

**Additional comments:**

1. Commissioner Orías emphasized that the Chair should use discretion when initiating straw votes and limiting speaking times for meeting participants. She suggested that the Commission be provided complex plans in advance. She also recommended that Commissioners watch reruns of HLC meetings for better understanding of what the viewing public sees and hears.
2. Commissioner La Voie stated that employees or members of a board of directors of an organization proposing a project do not constitute public comment.

3. Commissioner Mahan requested that a final copy of the meeting and discussion protocol be provided to the Commission.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

### **2. 1300 BLK E YANONALI ST 1095 SEG ID**

**(2:00)** Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-095  
 Application Number: MST2015-00317  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Agent: Craig Drake  
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Public Works  
 Engineer: Matt Burgard

(Proposal for the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge and Pedestrian Improvements Project, which will consist of street improvements on E. Montecito Street from Canada Street to the Five Points Roundabout, and along N. Salinas Street from E. Mason to Clifton Streets. Improvements will include the installation of 270 linear feet of sidewalk along E. Montecito Street between E. Yanonali Street and Montecito Place, 700 linear feet of sidewalk along N. Salinas Street between E. Mason and Clifton Streets, the widening of the E. Montecito Street-E. Yanonali Street Bridge to include sidewalk along the east side, and shoulders for cyclists on both sides of the bridge. Existing sandstone will be used. An all-way stop will be installed at the intersection of E. Montecito and E. Yanonali Streets to improve pedestrian safety at a blind corner. Pedestrian scale lighting will be added along E. Yanonali, E. Montecito, and N. Salinas Streets to increase safety on pedestrian routes to the adjacent schools.)

**(Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc. Report concludes that the ashlar cut sandstone Montecito-Yanonali Street Culvert constructed in 1923 is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit for the City of Santa Barbara and is a historical resource for the purposes of CEQA.)**

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Andrew Grubb, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara; Steven Greer, Environmental Analyst, City of Santa Barbara; and Colleen Hamilton, Senior Architectural Historian, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

#### **Staff comments:**

1. Ms. Hernández stated the following:
  - a. Staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the minimally visible sandstone Culvert is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit and does not rise to the level of significance for listing as a City Landmark, or for listing on the California Register of Historic Resources or the National Register of Historic Places. Staff recommends that the HLC find that the proposed project's measures to minimize the impacts will reduce the impact to "less than significant" based on Municipal Code 22.22.090, Finding 4.
  - b. Staff reviewed the City's Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites and found that although Measures 1-6 were not feasible for this project, Measures 7, 10, 11, and 12 minimize the potential project impacts.
  - c. Sheila Lodge, the Planning Commission liaison to the HLC, sent comments clarifying some historical facts in the report; the revisions will be included in the final draft.

- d. In the report, the suggestion by the historian to designate other stone bridges in the City will protect those that may be in jeopardy in the future.
2. Mr. Greer stated that the conservation program will require approval by the HLC prior to the removal and reuse of any historic material. Mr. Greer further stated that the finding before the Commission is that the proposed project will have a less than significant impact. Relocating the bridge is infeasible due to economic constraints, and the requested finding reflects this. The specific measure of the MEA Guidelines being referenced mandates that the historic material be reused at the existing site, not a different location. If the HLC wishes to relocate the bridge, Measure 6 would be utilized. Mr. Greer also explained that integrating the existing stone arch design into the new structure was investigated but found problematic due to reduction in the volume and flow of water that the bridge can accommodate during flood conditions.

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orías questioned several items in the report that she found insufficiently explained, including future bus stops, discrepancy in sidewalk measurements, future channel widening, eminent domain, and details of tree trimming and removal. She expressed strong disfavor of ambiguous conditional wording in the document shown in phrases like “if feasible” and “if appropriate,” stating that the Commission needs more specific information about what is proposed. She also requested page numbers and tree photographs in the report.
2. Commissioner Veyna expressed concern about tree trimming from an aesthetic standpoint, recommending that the landscape architect work with the arborist to address this issue.
3. Commissioner La Voie asked for the source of the use of the name “Estado Street” for State Street on page 8 of the report. Commissioner La Voie also stated that he understands the need for the project, but he would strongly prefer that the stone arch bridge material be conserved and placed at a City park for better preservation of the artifact.
4. Commissioner Drury is very concerned about City stone resources being in jeopardy and disagrees with the conclusions of the report.
5. Commissioner Winick expressed that the character of the reused material should more closely resemble its original use.
6. Chair Suding suggested a plaque with historical information about the bridge to memorialize its alteration.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. The applicant and historian should prepare a report that explores relocation of the resource in its current configuration as a stone arch bridge, reutilizing the stone facing only, at a different public location yet to be determined.
2. Commissioner questions are to be answered in the new report, and ambiguous conditional wording is to be clarified.
3. The Commission accepts the design of the new bridge with the exception of the reuse of the existing stone but recommends that native stone be used on the piers as indicated in the design.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/1/0. (Drury opposed/Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED****3. 1317 STATE ST****C-2 Zone****(2:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-007  
 Application Number: MST2015-00364  
 Owner: Arlington Theatre Property, LLC  
 Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal to apply a waterproof coating over the existing stucco of the tower on the Arlington Theatre. Existing cracks will be cleaned and repaired. No other exterior alterations are proposed. This structure is a designated City Landmark: Arlington Theatre.)

**(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on July 29, 2015.)**

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Edwards-Pitman Architects

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández agrees with the proposal based on the detailed research of the existing and proposed material.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Drury expressed appreciation for the thoroughness of the report.
2. Commissioner Mahan agreed and stated that the currently proposed material is much more acceptable than the material previously proposed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted:**

1. The Commission finds that the repair will not cause substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource and will prolong its life.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:39 P.M. TO 2:53 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW****4. WATERFRONT PARKING LOTS****HC/SD-3 Zone**

**(2:55)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-011  
 Application Number: MST2015-00565  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for alterations to waterfront parking lots located at Leadbetter Beach, Harbor West, Garden Street, Chase Palm Park, E. Cabrillo Blvd., and W. Cabrillo Blvd. to remove existing parking attendant kiosks or honor fee slot systems, ticket dispensers, and traffic arms, and install new automated pay systems with protective bollards. Also proposed is new landscaping in areas where existing kiosks were removed, and six new ADA access ramps. Requires Coastal Review.)

**(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. The Leadbetter and Harbor lots were reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review. Requires Coastal Review.)**

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Karl Treiberg, Waterfront Facilities Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Theresa Lawler, Engineering Technician, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:00 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Cheri Rae McKinney.

Public comment closed at 3:01 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. Restudy the proposal to be more appropriate to HLC Guidelines, Sign Ordinance, and Citywide Wayfinding Sign Program.
2. Present an existing installation for review by the Access Advisory Committee to ensure access for the disabled.
3. The Commission directs staff to list the prior installation of automatic pay systems without design review approvals as a violation.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**Additional comments:**

1. Chair Suding stated that the plans should clarify where curbs will be modified to create ADA access ramps.
2. Commissioner Veyna expressed that the installations lack shelter from adverse weather and may be inconvenient for the public.
3. Commissioner Drury opined that with these automatic pay systems, the City loses human contact, and that they are inconvenient for the beach-going public; a pay program is more acceptable when staffed by people.
4. Commissioner Mahan is opposed to the project, stating that these automated systems are unwelcoming, and he is concerned that they will lead to similar installations on the Wharf and in other City parking structures.
5. Commissioner Orías stated that if these automated pay systems must be installed, they should be placed away from public roadways, and the old kiosks should be recycled.

**FINAL REVIEW****5. 420 E ANAPAMU ST****R-3 Zone**

**(3:20)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-005  
 Application Number: MST2005-00442  
 Owner: Jeffrey Schuman 2009 Trust  
 Architect: RRM Design Group

(Proposal to demolish an existing 259 square foot one-car garage and construct two new residential condominium units above three new two-car garages as an addition to the rear of Unit A. The proposal will result in three residential condominiums: Unit A, an existing 1,382 square foot one-story single-family residence, which will remain unaltered; Unit B, a proposed 1,158 square foot two-story unit; and Unit C, a proposed 1,365 square foot two-story residential unit. The existing residence, Unit A, is listed on the City's Potential Historic Resources List and is eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit; therefore, the project was concurrently reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission.)

**(Final Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 008-07. Project last reviewed on March 7, 2007.)**

Actual time: 3:28 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; Jeff Weinstein, Architect, Halsell Builders; and Suzanne Riegle, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

**Staff comments:**

1. Ms. Riegle provided a brief background of the project, stating that its tentative subdivision map was approved in 2007. Due to time extensions, the project is still viable; the tentative map will expire January 31, 2018.
2. Ms. Hernández mentioned that a Historic Structures/Sites Report was submitted for this project in 2006 and is available for review.

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. Restudy the railing detail, eaves detail, and any elements that would make the building more compatible with the existing structure.
2. Provide paint color information for the elevations. Bring a sample to match to the existing paint color.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 6/0/1. (La Voie abstained/Murray and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**SIGN REVIEW****6. 211 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

**(3:45)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-312-015  
Application Number: SGN2015-00094  
Applicant: Wasantha Mohottige  
Owner: Drake Properties, LTD  
Business Name: Jenny Schatzle

(Proposal for one [1] new 5.6 square foot, non-illuminated, wood projecting sign; one [1] new 5.6 square foot, non-illuminated, wood wall sign; and two [2] new 2.8 square foot, non-illuminated, vinyl, digital print window signs on an existing commercial building. Total proposed signage is 16.8 square feet. Total allowable signage at this location is 45 square feet.)

**(Review After Final is requested for proposed changes to vinyl window signs, paint color, and border trim. Project last reviewed on October 21, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:53 p.m.

Present: Wasantha Mohottige, Applicant

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that the applicant is returning with changes to the approved signage: a blue border on the wood sign and lettering in the windows that is not silhouetted.

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:**

1. The Commission finds that the signage has been modestly done.
2. Window letter size is not to exceed 4.0 inches.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed/Murray and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:01 P.M. \*\***