



# City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

## HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, November 18, 2015**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*  
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*  
MICHAEL DRURY  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
BILL MAHAN  
FERMINA MURRAY  
JUDY ORÍAS  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER  
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian  
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician  
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Interim Commission Secretary

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

---

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan (1:31 p.m.), Murray, Orías (until 4:45 p.m.), Shallanberger (1:36 p.m.), Suding, Veyna (1:32 p.m.), and Winick

Members absent: None

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Sanchez

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments from Virginia Rehling regarding the motion from Item 2 of the November 4, 2015 Historic Landmarks Commission meeting. Ms. Rehling supports the designation of 29-37 East Victoria Street as a Structure of Merit.

Mr. Limón stated that the applicant is not interested in seeking Structure of Merit designation, and the HLC will need to determine if it will move forward on the designation over the owner's objection.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 4, 2015, with corrections.**

Action: Winick/La Voie, 5/0/4. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Item B-D, F) and Julio Veyna (Item A, C-E).**

Action: Winick/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced the following:

- a. Commissioners La Voie and Suding are stepping down on Item 3, the Archaeology Report for the Lower Milpas Area.
- b. The submittal deadline for non-noticed items to be reviewed by the HLC at the December 2 meeting is Monday, November 23 at 4 p.m.

2. Mr. Limón announced the following:

- a. Mr. Limón informed the Commission of a notification he received from the City Arborist regarding a stone pine tree at 428 East Anapamu Street. A power pole needs to be replaced near this tree, and to make room, a 4-inch diameter branch of the tree must be trimmed. The date for the trimming is November 24, and it will be monitored to ensure no consequent imbalance to the tree.
- b. Mr. Limón spoke about the City Council meeting of November 17. Councilmembers Hotchkiss and Francisco initiated a discussion about the need to make changes to the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program Ordinance. After public input, Council chose not to make any changes at this time. The program will continue to be monitored, as there is concern about its impacts. As soon as the test phase of 250 units is completed, program analysis will determine if any adjustments are needed. Council also indicated that there has been only one appeal of an AUD project and that the Boards and Commissions are doing a fine job reviewing these projects.

3. Commissioner Winick stated that he attended this meeting and advocated for the design boards. He expressed that the HLC has done well in its AUD project reviews, providing the scrutiny needed to maintain historic guidelines and neighborhood compatibility. At the meeting, Commissioner Winick heard that the design boards should not be wary of the appeal process and should follow their mandates. Overall, he expressed that it was a productive discussion.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Limón mentioned a memorandum that was circulated that provided a status report on the work of the Multi-Unit/Mixed-Use Guidelines Subcommittee. He stated that the subcommittee has identified

several options, which include design guidelines that may be consolidated or updated. The consensus of the subcommittee is that there is an immediate need to update several guidelines, and to approach it in phases and obtain a funding commitment from City Council.

1. Commissioner Mahan reported that the Multi-Unit/Mixed-Use Guidelines Subcommittee commended the HLC guidelines for their readability and discussed the need for the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) guidelines to be consolidated and updated to be made easier to understand.
2. Commissioner Orías stated that she had read the status report and praised the subcommittee for its work. She requested a discussion item on a future HLC agenda to discuss how to push this important matter forward to City Council.
3. Commissioner Shallenberger reported that the Citywide Wayfinding Sign Program received final approval at the Sign Committee joint meeting of November 18.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**

#### **1. SELECTION OF HLC MEMBER AND SIGN COMMITTEE MEMBER FOR SIGN ORDINANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**(1:45)** Staff: Ariel Calonne, City Attorney

**The new Committee will review the City's sign regulations in order to assure compliance with the First Amendment.**

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Ariel Calonne, City Attorney, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

1. Bob Cunningham, Vice-Chair of the Sign Committee, stated that it would be preferable to have two members of the Sign Committee appointed to the Sign Ordinance Review Committee. If not, then the member representing the HLC on the Sign Committee should be appointed.
2. Natalie Cope, Chair of the Sign Committee, concurred that two members of the Sign Committee would be useful, and she would like to participate. If only one member is allowed, she would prefer Mr. Cunningham be the representative.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Limón mentioned that signage content issues have come up in the past involving whether a website address or what is being sold at a location may be included on a sign. These are among the examples that will be discussed by the Sign Ordinance Review Committee.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Orías nominated Commissioner Mahan as the committee member, stating that his extensive architectural experience and knowledge of planning qualify him for the position.
2. Chair Suding nominated Commissioner Shallenberger, who currently represents the HLC on the Sign Committee, for the purpose of continuity.

3. Commissioner Mahan expressed appreciation for his nomination by Commissioner Orías but, citing his existing obligations, he recommended Commissioner Shallanberger. He also emphasized that the selection of members of the public to serve on this committee should be carefully considered.
4. Commissioner Murray volunteered to serve as an alternate committee member.

**Action: Appoint Craig Shallanberger as primary member and Fermina Murray as alternate member of the Sign Ordinance Review Committee.**

## **ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

### **2. 2217 OAK PARK LN**

**R-3 Zone**

**(2:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-009  
 Application Number: MST2014-00544  
 Owner: Dawn Close Living Trust  
 Architect: Native Son Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a new 665 square foot residential unit above a new 1,056 square foot garage/accessory building. The approximately 11,000 square foot parcel is currently developed with two existing one-story residential units [Unit 1 is 1,000 square feet and Unit 2 is 700 square feet], with the existing units to remain unaltered. The project will provide two parking spaces for each unit (three covered, three uncovered) for a total of six spaces. A 62 square foot exterior stair and 341 square foot upper level deck is also proposed. Total development on site will be 3,421 square feet. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00959.)

**(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone/Dudek.)**

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek; and Chris Cottrell, Architect, Native Son Design Studio

Staff comments: Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**

Action: La Voie/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****3. ROW FROM E CABRILLO TO INDIO MUERTO****C-2/SD-3 Zone****(2:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-010-065  
 Application Number: MST2015-00550  
 Owner: James & Joan Dixon, Trustees  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Public Works

(Proposal for right-of-way improvements under the Lower Milpas Pedestrian Improvement Project. The proposal includes the installation of 700 linear feet of sidewalk along the east side of S. Milpas Street beginning at E. Cabrillo Boulevard and continuing to the US Highway 101 on-/off-ramp north of the Union Pacific Railroad. The project also includes ten new light poles, a center median island, and curb and gutter improvements. An additional sidewalk infill of 565 linear feet is also proposed along Calle Puerto Vallarta, connecting S. Milpas Street to Dwight Murphy Park and the Santa Barbara Zoo. The project will require the relocation of a private driveway into Tri-County Produce as well as a reconfiguration of its parking lot. Improvements will be made on the following streets: S. Milpas Street, Calle Puerto Vallarta, Por La Mar, and Corona Del Mar. Project requires Coastal Review.)

**(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by Dudek.)**

Actual time: 2:11 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

**Staff comments:**

1. Ms. Kaufman stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the proposed sidewalk improvements along lower Milpas and adjacent streets. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.
2. Mr. Limón informed the Commission that this project is scheduled for review by the ABR at its next meeting.

Public comment opened at 2:12 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Commissioner comments:** Commissioner Orías pointed out the missing word “lot” on page 1 of the report. The revised sentence should read, “Other improvements include a 5,000 square foot parking lot located north of Corona del Mar . . . .”

**Motion: To accept the report as amended.**

Action: Shallanberger/Orías, 7/0/2. (La Voie and Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****4. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

**(2:10)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003  
Application Number: SGN2015-00132  
Applicant: Heidi Jones, SEPPS  
Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History

(Conceptual review of a wayfinding sign program for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. This location is a Designated Structure of Merit.)

**(Conceptual review; comments only.)**

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Dylan Johnson, Schacht Aslani Architects; Wayne Hunt & Emily Morishita, Hunt Design; and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Mr. Limón explained that this sign program was referred to the HLC because the location is a Designated Structure of Merit; it is appropriate for the program to begin with the HLC, which can take action or refer it to the Sign Committee.

Public comment opened at 2:33 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged e-mailed comments of concern from Paulina Conn.

Public comment closed at 2:34 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. The Commission finds the proposed signage to be incompatible with this unique building and site.
2. Commissioner Shallenberger complimented the study that has gone into the proposal. He suggested that the main entry parking sign might include the international "P" symbol, as used by the City Wayfinding Signage Program. He encouraged the use of natural materials. He also advised reconsideration of the signage font to be more unique to the site.
3. Commissioner Orías is not in favor of pole signs, stating that they are inappropriate for El Pueblo Viejo.
4. Commissioner La Voie stated that for the transparent exhibit banners in the corridors, the plastic material is not appropriate; a fabric like canvas is more suitable.
5. Commissioner Winick suggested that the applicants review the El Presidio signage program, as this site is also historic and campus-style, and its signage utilizes natural materials. He further suggested that if a banner sign is to be used, it might be placed near the entrance instead of the front of the building.
6. Commissioner Drury stated that some signs are too large and intrusive. He emphasized that the proposed red color is too aggressive, and a more recessive value should be used. He also expressed disfavor of welcome banner signs with vertical text.
7. Commissioner Veyna suggested that the existing accessible pole signs may be modified by removal of galvanization.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:01 P.M. TO 3:09 P.M. \*\***

**FINAL REVIEW****5. 203 CHAPALA ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

**(2:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-001  
Application Number: MST2007-00634  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP  
Owner: Urban Pacific, LLC

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to demolish 9,909 square feet of an existing 11,211 square foot commercial building and construct a 12,277 square foot addition, resulting in 13,579 square feet of residential floor area. The building would change use from commercial to residential, resulting in seven new three-bedroom residential condominiums. Zoning Modifications were approved for the encroachment of the existing structure into the front setback on Yanonali Street upon the change of use, and the encroachment of the van-accessible parking access aisle into the front setback on Los Aguajes Avenue. The maximum building height is proposed to be 33'-0". Sixteen parking spaces are proposed in seven private garages, two carports, and two uncovered surface guest spaces.)

**(Final approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 026-09. Project last reviewed on September 9, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal & Rogelio Solis, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP; and Katie Klein & Courtney Jane Miller, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 3:26 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Final Approval with the following to return to the Consent calendar:**

1. The Commission commends the architect and landscape architect for their designs and drawings.
2. Consider a larger, single-module permeable paver in the driveway.
3. Aluminum-clad windows shall be used with a variance in colors, and a variance in colors of the door wood stain, so there is a variety indicative of a village.
4. The white body color of the building is to return to the Consent calendar.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****6. 209 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

**(3:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-012  
Application Number: MST2015-00193  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Brian D'Amour, Public Works  
Owner: Ken Oplinger

(On behalf of the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force [NITF], the project proposes to install the brick bench sculpture titled "Crescent Crossing," by Donald Davis, on the west side of the train station in an existing scored concrete sidewalk area. The bench will have a brick crescent-shaped surround with a header course border and herringbone field pattern. This project is adjacent to the designated City Landmark: Southern Pacific Railroad Station.)

**(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on October 21, 2015.)**

Actual time: 3:42 p.m.

Present: Brian D'Amour, Principal Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:45 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged public comment in opposition from Kellam de Forest.

Public comment closed at 3:45 p.m.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted:**

1. The Commission finds that the proposal enhances the City Landmark site with an artistic feature.
2. Include a plaque at the new location to memorialize the move, with the design and verbiage to return to the Consent calendar.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.



**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****7. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID****(3:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035  
 Application Number: MST2013-00312  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Public Works Department  
 Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 62 feet long and 43 feet wide.)

**(Conceptual review of proposed bridge railing; comments only.)**

Actual time: 3:57 p.m.

Present: Craig Drake, Design Engineer, Drake Haglan & Associates; Jim Colton, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and John Ewasiuk, Principal Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:02 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with positive comments:**

1. The Commission appreciates the diligence of the design team in its study.
2. Follow the original bridge railing design, with the panels to be proportioned to accommodate the new bridge length.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 8/0/1. (La Voie abstained). Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****8. 621 E SOLA ST****R-2 Zone****(4:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-033-016  
 Application Number: MST2015-00369  
 Owner: John & Karen Abraham Trust  
 Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal for a new 830 square foot one-story addition and 406 square foot detached accessory building with loft space on a 7,500 square foot parcel located in the Hillside Design District and the Lower Riviera Special Design District. One new uncovered parking space is proposed, and seven linear feet of a sandstone wall along the front property line and driveway will be removed. The existing 1,045 square foot single-family residence will be increased by more than 50% in floor area with the addition, triggering the need to update the parking to meet the current requirement of two covered parking spaces. The existing one-car garage will need to be enlarged to meet current parking design standards. The total of 2,425 square feet of development on a 7,500 square foot lot is 79% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. There will be 25 cubic yards of grading excavation. Staff Hearing Officer Review is requested for a modification to allow one uncovered parking space. This residence is a contributing historic resource to the Potential Bungalow Haven Historic District.)

**(Second concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project last reviewed on August 26, 2015.)**

Actual time: 4:17 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; and John Abraham, Owner

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernández stated that she prepared a Staff Evaluation of the addition. She found the project will not have a negative impact to the contributing structure of the historic district, and that it meets the evaluation design guidelines, with the exception of the proposed standing-seam metal roof.

Responding to a question from the applicant about the necessity of keeping the inoperable shutters, Ms. Hernández stated that the historical survey found the existing shutters to be a character-defining feature of the house, though that issue could be re-examined by the historians that wrote the survey.

2. Ms. Kaufman pointed out that this project has been in flux. The project has not received a full plan check yet, but if the parking issue is settled, it would no longer need a modification.

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent calendar with positive comments:**

1. The proposed standing-seam roof is not acceptable; use a composition shingle roof.

Action: Winick/Drury, 7/0/2. (Mahan and Murray abstained.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

**9. 329 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

**C-2 Zone**

**(4:50)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-048  
 Application Number: MST2015-00483  
 Owner: Kenneth Olsen  
 Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal for the demolition of an existing 683 square foot single-family residence and the construction of a new three-story, 2,167 square foot single-family residence. No parking spaces exist onsite, and two parking spaces are required. An attached 576 square foot two-car garage is proposed on the ground level to back out into Canon Perdido Street. The total of 2,167 square feet of development is 99% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project addresses violations in enforcement case ENF2015-00115 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00023. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for front setback, two interior setbacks, and open yard modifications.)

**(Third concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested interior, front setback, and open yard modifications. Project last reviewed on November 4, 2015.)**

Actual time: 4:42 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:**

1. The Commission finds that the modifications to the two interior and front setbacks and open yard are aesthetically appropriate, do not pose consistency issues with the HLC Design Guidelines, and have an appearance of uniformity of development.
2. Step the lower railing.
3. Restudy the gate to the front entrance to be more traditional.
4. Provide enhancing detail for the small window.
5. Keep the chimney flush with the east wall.
6. Restudy the large window.
7. Examine the spiral stair to ensure landings meet code requirements.
8. Add dimensions to future drawings.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:07 P.M. \*\***