



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 4, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
JENNIFER SANCHEZ, Interim Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Vice-Chair Winick.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: La Voie, Mahan, Shallanberger, Veyna, and Winick

Members absent: Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment.

Kellam de Forest commented on what he thought was a missing part of the motion of Item 7 in the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting minutes of October 21.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 21, 2015, with correction.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 4/0/1. (Winick abstained/Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan & Julio Veyna; Item C reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: La Voie/Veyna, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced the following:

- a. Commissioners Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding will be absent.
- b. Item 5, 203 Chapala Street, is postponed at applicant's request.

2. Ms. Hernández provided an update on the restoration of the Masonic Temple at 16 East Carrillo Street, a designated City landmark. The craftsman has progressed to the cast stone restoration of the loggia and found paint failure on the ceiling. Underneath the paint, he discovered gold leaf and the original paint scheme. He will seek to reproduce the original paint colors.

3. Commissioner Mahan called the Commission's attention to a new book, *Spanish Colonial Style: Santa Barbara and the Architecture of James Osborne Craig and Mary McLaughlin Craig*, by Pamela Skewes-Cox and Robert Sweeney. He highly recommended it.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Shallenberger announced that the Citywide Wayfinding Sign Program has incorporated the design comments from the ABR and HLC reviews of the project, and he has worked with the design team regarding the HLC's specific comment about the ogees. He stated that the program will soon be ready for final approval.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**1. FINAL REVIEW OF DRAFT HISTORIC RESOURCE DESIGN GUIDELINES. REQUEST A RECOMMENDATION TO CITY COUNCIL TO ADOPT THE DESIGN GUIDELINES.**

(1:45) Staff: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández announced that she had addressed the feedback she received from the Commission's review of the guidelines.

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner La Voie stated that the revision of the guidelines represents incredible effort and dedication by staff.

Motion: Refer to the City Council with highest commendation.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

2. CITY'S POTENTIAL HISTORIC STRUCTURES/SITES LIST

29-37 EAST VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009

Owner: Radius Group Commercial Real Estate

(Hold a Public Hearing to consider adding the Spanish Colonial Revival commercial building designed by noted architects Soule, Murphy and Hastings in 1922 based on the recommendation of the HLC Designation Subcommittee. The structure is eligible as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Ms. Hernández stated that the item was reprocessed according to the Administrative Regulations. The Designation Subcommittee reviewed the item on October 21 and recommends, along with staff, that it be added to the City's Potential Historic Structures/Sites List, as it is eligible as a Structure of Merit under Criteria D and F.
2. Mr. Limón wished to clarify points raised by the appellant Virginia Rehling. The City follows a process that was created partly by the Demolition Review Ordinance, which requires staff to assess the historical significance of every structure that comes forward for review in the downtown Demolition Review area. On occasion, the Urban Historian makes a recommendation for a property to be added to the City's Potential Historic Structures/Sites List, and/or a property owner may request a review, as in this case. As this structure is eligible, it was placed on the list. The technicality raised by Ms. Rehling is that the ordinance does not specify that individual properties may be processed in this manner. Rather, the ordinance refers to Administrative Regulations that specify a method of group surveys, whereby the HLC receives a recommendation for inclusion from the Designation Subcommittee. To prevent placing an undue burden on the Designation Subcommittee, staff believes it is prudent that the HLC review single properties based on the Urban Historian's recommendation. Staff intends to change the Administrative Regulations to clarify this process. Mr. Limón expressed the hope that the HLC will act today to confirm its understanding of this process going forward.

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m.

1. Roy Harthorn, historian, made comments about the historical importance of the owners, architect, and builders of this structure. On these grounds, he believes the structure should be added to the list.
2. Vice-Chair Winick acknowledged public comment in opposition from Virginia Rehling.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Shallenberger voiced support for the proposed process of the Urban Historian making recommendations directly to the HLC for the inclusion of individual properties on the list.
2. Commissioner La Voie also voiced support, noting that the Urban Historian puts great effort into providing sufficient information on such properties to the HLC.
3. Commissioner Mahan emphasized that it is important to protect single-story buildings on corners, such as this one, in the El Pueblo Viejo area.

Motion: To add the structure located at 29-37 East Victoria Street to the City's Potential Historic Structures/Sites List and proceed with Structure of Merit designation.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:03 P.M. TO 2:15 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM

3. BIKE CORRAL PROGRAM UPDATE

(2:20) Staff: Peter Brown, Transportation Planner
(Update on the existing bicycle corral program.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Peter Brown, Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m.

1. Ed France, of the Transportation Circulation Committee and the Downtown Parking Committee, emphasized that the pilot period of the project should be closed and a formal process to take action begun.
2. Kellam de Forest stated that the placement of bike corrals needs to be carefully considered. He expressed concern about the aesthetics and visual clutter of the streetscape.

Public comment closed at 2:27 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Shallenberger agreed there is a need for this program and would like to see maintenance priority for El Pueblo Viejo corrals.
2. Commissioner La Voie supports ending the pilot program. He stated that the corrals should be proposed to the HLC on an individual basis, with this same template of approach.
3. Commissioner Mahan believes a corral in front of El Paseo is not appropriate, and he suggested other sites. He supports installing the corrals in red curb zones and agreed that they should be developed on a project-by-project basis.

Staff comments: Mr. Limón clarified that this is a discussion item. If Transportation staff would like to have an action item crafted and present a proposal for bringing future corral locations before the Commission, they may return at a later date.

Commission Request: That staff add the 100 Block of Canon Perdido Street item to the next meeting's agenda and provide direction on how future locations will proceed.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 1200 BLK QUINIENTOS ST 1373 SEG ID

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-373
Application Number: MST2014-00387
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Landscape Architect: David Black & Associates

(Proposal to replace the Quinientos Street Bridge over Sycamore Creek. The existing single span bridge is approximately 36 feet long and 38 feet wide and was constructed in 1930. A new single span concrete bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation officials [AASHTO].)

(Review of a Historic Resources Evaluation Report and Memorandum prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc. Report last reviewed on October 21, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:42 p.m.

Present: Colleen Hamilton, Historical Archaeology Program Manager, Applied Earthworks; and Tom Conti, Project Engineer, Bengal Engineering

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández stated that staff agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines. She also stated that she conducted a site visit at the owner's request of 1211 East Cota Street, one of the properties being considered for historical significance. After doing a closer historic resources evaluation, she found it was not the best example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style for small houses in the area and would not qualify on an individual level as a historic resource. Upon her evaluation, Applied Earthworks, Inc., the historic consultant that prepared the report, removed it from the list of properties that may be eligible for inclusion on the City's Potential Historic Structures/Sites List.

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m.

Kellam de Forest asked if any structures will be impacted by the widening of the bridge and if sycamores would be considered for new plantings.

Public comment closed at 2:54 p.m.

Public comment re-opened at 3:02 p.m.

Kellam de Forest suggested that the bridge plaque make reference to the 1925 earthquake, which flooded Sycamore Creek and took out all the bridges in Sycamore Canyon, as the current bridge resulted from that cataclysmic event.

Public comment closed at 3:03 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with comments forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review:

1. Give consideration to the placement of a plaque with information about the old and new bridges in a visible location on the bridge, as well as to the loss of major trees.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW

5. 203 CHAPALA ST

R-4/SD-3 Zone

(3:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00634
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 Owner: Urban Pacific, LLC

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to demolish 9,909 square feet of an existing 11,211 square foot commercial building and construct a 12,277 square foot addition, resulting in 13,579 square feet of residential floor area. The building would change use from commercial to residential, resulting in seven new three-bedroom residential condominiums. Zoning Modifications were approved for the encroachment of the existing structure into the front setback on Yanonali Street upon the change of use, and the encroachment of the van-accessible parking access aisle into the front setback on Los Aguajes Avenue. The maximum building height is proposed to be 33'-0". Sixteen parking spaces are proposed in seven private garages, two carports, and two uncovered surface guest spaces.)

(Final approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 026-09. Project last reviewed on September 9, 2015.)

Item is postponed at the applicant's request.

Motion: To postpone the item.

Action: Mahan/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:05 P.M. TO 3:16 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 530 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone**

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00006
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Owner: Post Oak, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to renovate a historic commercial building for commercial/office use. The project would preserve the existing 3,810 square foot building while adding a 2,565 square foot second story. Four parking spaces are required. The proposal includes reconfiguring the parking lot for 11 spaces and installing new landscaping. A total of 2,565 square feet of nonresidential additions are proposed. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Dal Pozzo's Tire Corporation Building.")

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested. Project requires environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan and Development Plan findings. Project last reviewed on October 7, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:16 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills & Edward de Vicente, DMHA Architecture; and Katie Klein & Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architects, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted:

1. The Commission commends the design team for an appropriate addition to the historic resource.
2. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project, and makes the findings that this development is consistent with Planning Commission approvals and conditions.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE ITEM WAS RE-OPENED 4:33 P.M. ****

Motion: To re-open the item in order to amend the motion.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

Amended Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted:

1. The Commission commends the design team for an appropriate addition to the historic resource.
2. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on City Staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
3. The proposed development (a) complies with all provisions of this Title; and (b) is consistent with the principles of sound community planning; and (c) will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community’s aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk, or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code; and (d) is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy (as approved by City Resolution No. 13-010 dated as of March 12, 2013) as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 28.85.050 (Ord. 5609, 2013).
4. Applicant to reproduce project’s Conditions of Approval on the plans.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:40 P.M. TO 3:46 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 329 E CANON PERDIDO ST

C-2 Zone

(3:55) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-301-048
 Application Number: MST2015-00483
 Owner: Kenneth Olsen
 Architect: John Beauchamp

(Proposal for the demolition of an existing 683 square foot single-family residence, and the construction of a new three-story, 2,167 square foot single-family residence. No parking spaces exist onsite, and two parking spaces are required. An attached 576 square foot two-car garage is proposed on the ground level to back out into Canon Perdido Street. The total of 2,167 square feet of development is 99% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio [FAR]. This project addresses violations in enforcement case ENF2015-00115 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00023. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for front setback, two interior setbacks, and open yard modifications.)

(Second concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested interior, front setback, and open yard modifications. Project last reviewed on October 21, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:46 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning; and John Beauchamp, Architect, Eleven Modern

Public comment opened at 4:09 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forest expressed disfavor of the proposed architecture and concern about the number of feet that it has been lowered and stated that it needs a more harmonious design.
2. Joseph Moticha, neighbor, spoke in support of the project, as he wishes to do something similar on his lot.
3. Sally Terrell, neighbor, expressed frustration about the examples shown by the applicant to compare structure height in the neighborhood and the project's incompatibility with El Caserio.
4. Wendy Foster, neighbor, also expressed concern about the examples shown of the neighborhood structures and emphasized that the proposed structure is not suitable for the lot size.
5. Jon Terrell, neighbor, is opposed to the project and has neighborhood compatibility concerns related to the quality of architecture, size, and height of the proposal.

Public comment closed at 4:18 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Restudy the plate heights to lower the height of the building further. The front room with the 17 foot plate height should be reconsidered in particular.
2. The architectural style and expression is too vertical; it is too complicated, lacking the simplicity of Spanish Colonial architecture; it is too contemporary and thus inappropriate for the district.
3. Consider removing the balcony on the west side of the building.
4. Restudy the garage door fenestration.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 1020 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-040
 Application Number: MST2015-00540
 Owner: Santa Barbara Metropolitan Transit
 Architect: Richard Six

(Proposal for exterior renovations at the existing Santa Barbara Metropolitan Transit District bus depot. Proposed changes include accessibility improvements, removal and replacement of the concrete drive, right-of-way improvements, removal and replacement of the bus loading areas, updated landscaping, window glazing replacement, new window configuration, new condenser units, mechanical equipment screening, additional minor site work, and replacement site furnishings.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:36 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, LMA Architects; Brad Davis, Assistant General Manager, Metropolitan Transit District; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:54 p.m.

Kellam de Forest questioned if the multi-story transit depot project has been abandoned. He also questioned when the depot was built, if the remodeling must conform to El Pueblo Viejo guidelines, if new bus design has been considered in the plans, and where the bus schedules will be displayed.

Public comment closed at 4:56 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent calendar with comments:

1. There is insufficient change to the building to require compliance with the Historic Landmarks Commission guidelines.
2. The proposed changes to the building are appropriate and have the support of the Commission.
3. The landscape plan is generally acceptable.
4. The Commission prefers the existing concrete exterior of the building be deep cleaned.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 5/0/0. (Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:15 P.M. ****