



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 7, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Orías, Suding, Veyna, and Winick

Members absent: Murray and Shallenberger

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Jennifer Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest commented that the home and garden of his father, Lockwood de Forest, at 2659 Totos Santos Lane is for sale. There will be an open house this Sunday from 1-3 p.m.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 23, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan. (Item B also reviewed by Julio Veyna.)

Action: Winick/Drury, 5/0/2. (Suding and La Voie abstained on Item A. Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a. Commissioner Murray will be absent.
- b. Jennifer Sanchez is the new Administrative Assistant to the Commission Secretaries.

2. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

- a. The Designation Subcommittee will meet on October 21, 2015 at 1 p.m. in the Director's Conference Room.
- b. The three historic landmarks that went before the City Council on September 29 were designated as City Landmarks, as recommended by the HLC: the Santa Barbara News-Press building, the Peter Grant House, and the San Marcos Building.

3. Commissioner Orías mentioned the October 8 Joint Meeting of the Planning Commission and City Council, at which the AUD project at 800 Santa Barbara Street will be reviewed. Commissioner Drury will attend as a representative of the HLC.

4. Commissioner Winick announced that his term as a Commissioner will expire at the end of this year, and he will be vacating the position. He stated that it was a pleasure working with the Commission. Chair Suding acknowledged Commissioner Winick's contribution and thanked him for his service.

5. Chair Suding re-opened announcements later to address the correspondence received from Virginia Rehling. Mr. Limón stated that concerning Ms. Rehling's letter, the item will be re-heard due to an incorrect process. The decision is not vacated, but will be re-heard according to the correct process.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. HISTORY OF TREES**

(1:45) Staff: Amanda Burgess, Parks & Recreation
(Presentation on the history of trees in Santa Barbara's five oldest parks.)

Actual time: 1:38 p.m.

Present: Amanda Burgess, Administrative Analyst, Parks & Recreation, City of Santa Barbara;
and Alena Werth, Parks & Recreation, City of Santa Barbara

Discussion held.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest thanked the Parks & Recreation Department for cataloging trees and recognizing their importance. He inquired whether the presentation would be available online, and if so, how it could be accessed. He also questioned if there are any exotic trees in jeopardy, and if treatment would help, could the public be involved in a save-a-tree program. He also mentioned the grove of olive trees planted in Mission Historical Park after World War II. The Santa Barbara branch of the Garden Club of America is working with the Mission Heritage Trail Association to clean up those trees and resuscitate them.

Ms. Burgess replied that the presentation is a public document but is not available online. She can provide an electronic version if requested. She stated that no trees are in jeopardy at this time and mentioned several new plantings. Parks & Recreation continues to examine all City trees on a regular basis. Ms. Burgess appreciated the public support idea and stated that the Department does not hesitate to ask for public contribution when needed.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. Commissioner Drury highly commended the work. He mentioned that Orpet Park is in distress and could use maintenance.
2. Commissioner La Voie remarked that this is valuable information, and he appreciated the research. He stated that it needs to be readily available for public access with changes: include plans/maps of where original trees were located, as well as any photos that show the trees; sort the information into clear groupings; cut repetitive information; and arrange in sequential order. This will improve the presentation visually and thus make it more accessible to designers and the public.
3. Commissioner Orías expressed appreciation for the document. She stated that it is a wonderful first step and asked that Parks & Recreation please expand by highlighting significant trees in other areas of the City. She expressed that the stability of City creeks and wildlife depends upon the trees, and that the City's trees need to be documented so that they are saved.
4. Chair Suding questioned if there are any plans in the future to do a more comprehensive inventory of urban trees, outside of the parks. Burgess responded that several forms of documentation have taken place. In 2008, all street and park trees were documented. Canopy cover of the entire city was captured using satellite imagery and GPS technology. Random

sample studies of street trees have been conducted to evaluate their health and document their value.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 530 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00006
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Owner: Post Oak, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to rehabilitate a historic commercial building for commercial/office use. The project would preserve the existing 3,810 square foot building while adding a 2,565 square foot second story. The proposal includes reconfiguring the parking lot for 11 spaces, and installing new landscaping. A total of 2,565 square feet of nonresidential additions are proposed. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Dal Pozzo's Tire Corporation Building.")

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone/Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:09 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 25 W COTA ST

C-M Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00330
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to rehabilitate a historic industrial building for a commercial/office use. The existing building would be converted from light industrial to office use. New second- and third-story additions and a roof deck are proposed. Four new parking spaces are proposed inside the building. A total of 2,969 square feet of non-residential additions is proposed for a total of 12,717 square feet of floor area. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Hendry Brothers Blacksmith and Welding Shop.")

(Review of a Phase I Archeological Resource Report prepared by David Stone/Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:10 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Dudek

Staff comments: Joanna Kaufman, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the archaeological report pertaining to the above-mentioned property. He concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 530 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(2:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00006
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Owner: Post Oak, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to rehabilitate a historic commercial building for commercial/office use. The project would preserve the existing 3,810 square foot building while adding a 2,565 square foot second story. The proposal includes reconfiguring the parking lot for 11 spaces, and installing new landscaping. A total of 2,565 square feet of nonresidential additions is proposed. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Dal Pozzo's Tire Corporation Building.")

a) (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra Cole. The report concludes the project has no significant impact on the significant historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:11 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Preservation Planning Associates

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and CEQA guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:13 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Drury commented that the addition will have a more than significant impact to the historic resource, and he disagrees with the conclusions of the report.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 6/1/0. (Drury opposed. Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

b) (Second concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and development plan findings. Project last reviewed July 15, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, DMHA; Edward de Vicente, DMHA; and Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest stated that though he understands adding a second floor will increase usable space, it compromises the design of the original building, whose significant feature was the tower.

Public comment closed at 2:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The project is an appropriate improvement to the historical resource in size, bulk, scale, and detail. It has the Commission's full support as currently designed.
2. The Chapala Street King Palm sidewalk planters should be elongated to a length of six feet.
3. Adequate screening for the fire backflow preventers is required. If necessary, raise the wall to accommodate; otherwise, three feet is acceptable.
4. The 6" planter along the Chapala Street sidewalk is acceptable to screen the wall with vine planting as proposed.
5. The balconies should not cantilever more than 18 inches from the face of the wall.
6. Reconsider the adequacy of the planters for the species proposed.
7. The distance between the tower and the addition is adequate.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:58 P.M. TO 3:09 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 314 W ORTEGA ST

R-4 Zone

(2:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-073-012
 Application Number: MST2015-00128
 Owner: KC Young, LLC
 Agent: Dudek & Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,070 square foot, two-story single-family dwelling and reconstruct a new 2,526 square foot, two-story single-family dwelling, including an attached two-car tandem garage. The building's façade will be reconstructed per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction. Also proposed are two terraces (one on the ground floor and one on the second floor) totaling approximately 275 square feet, and the replacement of existing concrete hardscape with permeable pavers. Siding and trim from the original structure will be recycled and reused to the extent possible. The proposed development of 2,526 square feet on a 9,533 square foot lot is 71% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project site is located adjacent to lower Mission Creek, and the residence to be demolished is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a contributing structure to the proposed Castillo Street Historic District.)

(One-time concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 3:09 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández reiterated some points from her memo for the benefit of the public. The goals of the project are to rehabilitate and expand the building as a contributing structure to the proposed Castillo Street Historic District. Because the existing building may not have the structural stability to be restored with an addition, Ms. Hernández suggested using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction to reconstruct the front elevation with an addition to the rear. She recommended that the applicant submit for a concept review to the HLC for direction, as it is a complicated project. Once the applicant has incorporated the HLC's comments into the design, a Historic Structures/Sites Report will be completed to ensure the project will meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Present: Jane Gray, Dudek; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m.

Marta Cruz-Concepcion is a neighbor and expressed concern about the bank of Mission Creek. She wanted to know what foliage is proposed to preserve and protect that part of the creek, especially with floodplain concerns. She also wanted to ensure that the project complies with neighborhood ordinances related to size, bulk, and scale, as well as the historic character of the neighborhood. Overall, she would like to ensure the project preserves the cultural heritage and the environment.

Public comment closed at 3:19 p.m.

Public comment reopened at 3:47 p.m.

Marta Cruz-Concepcion commented about the garage. She speculated that it was once a carriage house. If the applicant designs a carriage house with the features of that period, it may be acceptable.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Commissioner comments:

1. The carport with a portion of the addition above is not appropriate.
2. The addition should be set far back from the reconstructed façade.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The project in size, bulk, and scale as submitted is not acceptable.
2. The Commission does not support building into the creek setback.
3. The Commission does not support the encroachment of the carport in the front and side setback or support building on top of the carport.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 5/2/0. (Orías and Winick opposed. Murray and Shallenberger absent.)
Motion carried.

Substitute Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Study the appropriateness of the project in size, bulk, and scale.

Action: Orías/Winick, 2/5/0. (Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Suding, and Veyna opposed.
Murray and Shallenberger absent.) Motion failed.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 501 BRINKERHOFF AVE****C-2 Zone**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-162-008
 Application Number: MST2015-00111
 Applicant: Jarrett Gorin
 Owner: Ryan & Jil Bell
 Architect: Gordon Brewer

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to replace a shed roof with a gabled roof at the north elevation and replace selected windows and doors of a 708 square foot, one-story, single-family residence in the Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District. The proposed changes alter the existing fenestration and the replacement of the roof of an existing non-historic elevation, including the replacement of doors and windows. No square footage changes are proposed. This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification to allow alterations in the front setback. This residence is a designated Structure of Merit and a contributing property to the Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District.)

- a) **(Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report concludes the project will have a less than significant impact to the resource and the surrounding Brinkerhoff Ave Landmark District.)**

Actual time: 3:56 p.m.

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that she agrees with the conclusions of the report that the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the project will have a less than significant impact to the resource and the surrounding Brinkerhoff Avenue Landmark District. Although the project will result in a design that will be more compatible and benefit the historic resource, a Historic Structures/Sites Report was required because of the drastic alteration to the public elevation facing Brinkerhoff Avenue.

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Commissioner comments: Commissioner Drury remarked that the report was well done.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shalanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- b) **(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Historic Resource Findings required for alterations to a designated Structure of Merit.)**

Actual time: 3:59 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Vanguard Planning

Public comment opened at 4:09 p.m.

Kellam de Forest did not see the issue behind retaining the shed roof and stated that this type of addition was common in the past.

Public comment closed at 4:10 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The Commission supports the modification in that it is not a further encroachment but an improvement of an existing historic site.
2. The modification as proposed is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with design guidelines that require findings for yard, lot, or floor area modification.
3. It promotes an appearance of uniformity of development with the neighborhood.
4. It is an appropriate and supportable design and modification to a historic resource.
5. Remove the external water heater compartment and any structures like the existing non-conforming pergola.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:13 P.M. TO 4:24 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

7. 316 W FIGUEROA ST

R-4 Zone

(3:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-024
 Application Number: MST2014-00565
 Owner: Darrel Leclair
 Architect: Pujo & Associates, Inc.

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for two-story additions and alterations to an existing 3-unit residential development on a 7,555 square foot parcel. The work at Unit 1 will attach it to Unit 2 with a two-story addition comprised of a 378 square foot 1-car garage/workshop and laundry on the ground floor and a 443 square foot Master suite on the second story, making the total size of Unit 1 1,861 square feet. Demolition of a 90 square foot rear porch and a new 53 lineal foot wood fence is also proposed. Two "as-built" sheds located within the interior setback will be removed from the west side of the property. Also proposed is a new fence on top of a curb that will be approximately 7 ft. high along the Curley Avenue frontage of the property. Staff Hearing Officer approval was granted for zoning modifications, including a fence and trellis that exceed the maximum allowable height, distance between buildings to allow a conforming addition to an existing building that is non-conforming to the interior setback, and a proposed new window in the front setback. This residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Project Design and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 011-15. Project last reviewed on January 28, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:24 p.m.

Present: Alex Pujo, Architect; and Darrel Leclair, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 6/0/1. (Orías abstained. Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 36 W GUTIERREZ ST

C-M Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-021
Application Number: MST2015-00467
Owner: Mark Vestal
Applicant: Michelle Lang

(Proposal for a tenant improvement to convert an existing auto service building to an office use. Changes include refinishing the existing masonry walls with stucco, repairing and replacing the existing tile roof, installing new skylights, replacing gutters and downspouts, removing the existing auto service doors to be replaced with bifold doors, and replacing the existing windows and exterior door. A new handicap space will be provided for a total of one parking space. One parking space is required. No new non-residential square footage is proposed.)

(Concept review; action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:37 p.m.

Present: John Gragg and Michelle Lang, Santa Barbara Design and Build; and Mark Vestal, Owner

**** The Commission recessed from 4:42 p.m. to 4:43 p.m. to check the proposed colors in the sunlight. ****

Public comment opened at 4:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest was concerned about the design changing the streetscape of Gutierrez Street but stated that the applicant answered those concerns in the presentation.

Public comment closed at 4:44 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. Change the garage doors to have the ten-inch required bottom kickplate and an added mullion, emulating the mullions on the replacement windows.
2. The Commission encourages the use of steel doors for the three bays; however, aluminum clad would be acceptable.
3. Existing planters are to be re-planted with new plant material.
4. Provide in-pot plantings at any opportunity.
5. The colors as submitted are acceptable.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 7/0/0. (Murray and Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:59 P.M. ****