



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 15, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
WILLIAM MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
PHILIP SUDING
JULIO JUAN VEYNA
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie (until 5:22 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding (until 5:14 p.m.), Veyna, and Winick.

Members absent: Shallanberger.

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 1, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Veyna, 5/0/3. (Drury, La Voie, and Orías abstained / Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A & B) and Phil Suding (Item C).

Action: Winick/Murray, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Shallenberger will be absent.
- b) Commissioner Suding will be stepping down from item 10, 100 Block of State Street, and will be absent for item 11, 1117 State Street.

2. Ms. Hernández announced that the draft of the Historic Resource Design Guidelines is available for the public to comment. There will be a public meeting held for feedback and questions on August 4th at 5:30 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.

3. Commissioner Mahan inquired about weighing in on the Solar Ordinance. Commissioner Orías requested that a discussion be held at the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting with involvement from the City Attorney and staff.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:51 P.M. TO 1:54 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. NEW EPV GUIDELINES FOR PUBLIC ART ON PRIVATE PROPERTY**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Límon, Senior Planner

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Jaime Límon, Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m.

1) Kellam de Forest sought clarification on the difference between art and signage.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Discussion held.

Commissioner's Comments:

Chair Suding stated that art is important for the community. There should be more flexibility with the guidelines, and he requested that Mr. Limón revise them for further commentary.

Commissioner La Voie suggested that art created on buildings be presented in an architectural context.

Commissioner Murray reiterated that the Historic Landmarks Commission has the right to protect the El Pueblo Viejo district and the context of the history when considering art proposals.

Commissioner Winick acknowledged that having a way of controlling the art so it's appropriate to the architecture and is contained would be a good approach to a proposal.

Commissioner Drury suggested all art be initially presented before the Visual Arts in Public Places.

Commissioner Mahan affirmed that the art proposals would be judged on their compatibility with the architecture, not whether the art was good or bad.

CONT. CONSIDERATION**2. 715 ANACAPA ST**

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-036

Owner: 715 Anacapa, LLC (CA)

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council for City Landmark Designation of the Santa Barbara News-Press Building located at 715 Anacapa Street.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt the resolution recommended by City Council for City Landmark Designation of the Santa Barbara News-Press Building located at 715 Anacapa Street.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONT. CONSIDERATION**3. 1129 STATE ST (1119-1137 STATE ST & 9-15 W ANAPAMU ST)**

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037

Owner: 1129 State Street

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council for City Landmark Designation of the San Marcos Building located at 1129 State Street, including 1119-1137 State Street and 9-15 West Anapamu Street.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Public comment opened at 2:25 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt the resolution recommended by City Council for City Landmark Designation of the San Marcos Building located at 1129 State Street, including 1119-1137 State Street and 9-15 West Anapamu Street.

Action: Murray/ Orías, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 100 BLK W GUTIERREZ ST 2035 SEG ID

(2:25)

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-035
Application Number: MST2013-00312
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Public Works Department
Engineer: Drake Haglan & Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to remove and replace the Gutierrez Street Bridge over Mission Creek. The existing bridge is 37 feet long and 36 feet wide and was constructed in 1926. The new bridge will be approximately 62 feet long and 43 feet wide.)

(Review of Historic Structure/Sites Report and memorandum prepared by Applied Earthworks. The report concludes that 123 West Gutierrez Street is eligible to be a Structure of Merit. Report last reviewed on June 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Aubrie Morlet, Architectural Historian, Applied EarthWorks, Inc.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated her support of the conclusions of the revised report and found that the report followed the CEQA Guidelines.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

1) Kellam de Forest reiterated the importance of the Talk of the Town restaurant to the culture of Santa Barbara.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Murray/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 25 W COTA ST****C-M Zone**

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-011
 Application Number: MST2015-00330
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to renovate a historic industrial building for commercial/office use. The existing building would be converted from light industrial to office use. New second and third story additions and a roof deck are proposed. Four new parking spaces are proposed inside the building. The building is listed as potentially historic as the "Hendry Brothers Blacksmith and Welding Shop." Additions to the building will be a maximum of 3,000 square feet. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Designer, DMHA; Ed DeVicente, Architect, DMHA; and David Barr, Property Owner, TPG Chapala, LLC.

Public comment opened at 2:48 p.m.

- 1) Joan Rothenberg, President of the Jewish Federation of Greater Santa Barbara, expressed concerns regarding security measures relating to the atrium, the open stairway and the third floor deck allowing access to children on the playground, the parking impact around Chapala Street, and the noise pollution caused by poor insulation.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:11 P.M. TO 3:16 P.M. ****

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commissioners appreciate the adaptive reuse of the existing structure.
2. Show the footprint and uses of the adjacent properties.
3. Provide context photos of the adjacent properties.
4. The Commissioners finds that the changes to the approach of the project are an improvement.
5. Address the security issues presented in public comment by meeting with the neighbor.
6. Restudy the size and detailing of the roof deck.
7. Provide a Historic Structures Report to address specific detailing.
8. Maintain the existing size of the parking opening.
9. Restudy the second floor above the cornice line, using the Riley Machine Shop on Salsipuedes Street as a model.
10. The Commissioners find that the square footage on second and third floors is acceptable.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Shallenberger and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 530 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone****(2:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00006
 Owner: TPG Chapala, LLC
 Owner: Post Oak, LLC
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal to renovate a historic commercial building for commercial/office use. The project would preserve the existing building while adding a second story. The proposal includes reconfiguring the parking lot for 11 spaces, and installing new landscaping. The building is listed as potentially historic as "Dal Pozzo's Tire Corporation Building." Additions to the building will be a maximum of 3,000 square feet. The project requires Development Plan findings for the new nonresidential floor area.)

(Conceptual review; comments only. Project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 3:21 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Designer, DMHA; Ed DeVicente, Architect, DMHA; and David Barr, Property Owner, TPG Chapala, LLC

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest inquired if it would be necessary to include landscaping when parking is necessary. He mentioned that the spatial relationship of the existing building to the surrounding area changed dramatically concerning the addition of the second story.

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. Screen the parking lot facing Chapala Street.
2. Consider adding trees and consolidating the four landscape strips.
3. The second story is appropriate.
4. The Commissioners appreciate the preservation of the building.
5. The site layout is problematic.
6. Since the Chapala Street Guidelines were developed for newer projects, not reuse projects, the Urban Design Guidelines are a more appropriate approach.
7. Consider enhancing the parking lot paving in the likeness of a plaza.
8. Demonstrate the impact of the second floor addition on mountain views.
9. Emulate the details from the "Dal Pozzo" building for the second story elevation.
10. The size, bulk, and scale are appropriate.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 407 E PADRE ST****E-1 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-021
Application Number: MST2015-00285
Owner: Christine Garvey
Applicant: Mark Morando

(Proposal for two single-story additions totaling 55 square feet on the rear of an existing 2,090 square foot single-family residence, the removal of two windows on rear east elevation to be replaced with wood, French doors with side lights. The rear patio will be surfaced with 396 square feet of Saltillo tile. The installation of a Juliette balcony railing over the original double French doors at the porte cochere, installation of gates at the front elevation at the arch of porte cochere. A wrought iron guardrail is proposed at front along the stone wall. The total of 2,478 square feet of development on a 5,996 square foot lot is 91.8 percent of the required maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This residence is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is a contributing structure in the Mission Gardens Potential Historic District.)

(Concept review; action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings and an administrative exception for fence heights are required. Project was referred from Consent on July 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:52 p.m.

Present: Mark Morando, Applicant, Morando Planning and Design; and Christine Garvey, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest sought clarification on when the house was built, who the architect was, and why the height of the porte cochere was so high.

Public comment closed at 4:00 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Consent with comments:

1. Simplify the ironwork at the gate entrance of the porte cochere and over the French doors under the porte cochere to be consistent with the existing ironwork on the right hand window.
2. The gate at the entrance of the porte cochere is appropriate as long as the design is simplified.
3. The infill addition at the rear and the installation of French doors with side lights at the rear are appropriate.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:12 P.M. TO 4:22 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**8. 15 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone****(3:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-111-012
 Application Number: MST2010-00033
 Owner: Virginia Castagnola-Hunter Trust
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Business Name: Lighthouse Restaurant

(The project consists of the partial demolition of an existing 142-seat restaurant building; construction of an approximately 1,020 square foot second story addition, 250 square foot second story balcony, and 150 square foot trash enclosure; remodel; and new creekside landscaping. The project is associated with the previously approved Cabrillo Bridge Replacement Project (MST2004-00878, PC Resolution 029-07), which includes demolition of 447 square feet of the restaurant building and the 350 square foot exterior patio over Mission Creek to facilitate replacement of the Cabrillo Bridge and to provide for Mission Creek flood control improvements.)

(Final approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-10. Project last reviewed February 11, 2015.)

Actual time: 4:22 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, Architect, Lenvik & Minor Architects; and Virginia Hunter, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the following details continued two weeks to Consent:

1. Include landscaping at the trash enclosure and the tower at Helena.
2. Restudy the light fixtures in the planter box and the eave.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**9. CITYWIDE****(4:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-MS-C-OPD
 Application Number: MST2014-00568
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Environmental Services
 Agent: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a new Public Container Master Plan. Over the next 31 years, the plan will standardize public trash and recycling containers throughout the City by transitioning from 26 style types to four within Landmark Districts, and six within the remaining City areas.)

(Review After Final for proposed changes to the Public Container Master Plan. Project last reviewed on November 19, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Matthew Fore, Environmental Services Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Lorraine Cruz-Carpenter, Environmental Services Specialist, City of Santa Barbara.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:57 P.M. TO 4:59 P.M. ****

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m.

- 1) Kellam de Forest was concerned that the thirty year time frame would restrict future proposals that may offer improved solutions. He inquired about an alternative to the appearance of the plastic containers.

Public comment closed at 5:01 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. The Barco style containers should have the same container color with different color lids to indicate trash and recycling bins.
2. The balance of trash container styles would be per staff recommendation.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**10. 100 BLK STATE ST****(4:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-066
 Application Number: MST2015-00331
 Applicant: M4G Youth Interactive Santa Barbara
 Owner: Woodbridge Capital, LLC

(Proposal for a temporary mural exhibit on existing temporary pedestrian protection siding spanning 500 linear feet along the 100 block of State Street separating the public right-of-way from the ongoing construction at the "La Entrada de Santa Barbara" project. The exhibit titled "Postcards of Santa Barbara" will include 16 eight foot by eight foot art pieces. Review by the Visual Arts in Public Places Committee is required. The art installation would be removed along with the pedestrian protection.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:14 p.m.

Present: Nathalie Gensac, Founder, M4G Youth Interactive Santa Barbara; and Robert Adams, Representative, City Arts Advisory Commission.

Public comment opened at 5:21 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallenberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**11. 1117 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030
Application Number: MST2015-00298
Owner: 1129 State Street
Applicant: Kyle Ashby
Architect: Dan Weber

(Proposal for a 172 square foot addition to an existing 10,227 square foot three-story commercial building on State Street. The ground level front façade will be remodeled to remove existing windows and install bi-fold doors. A new three and a half foot tall wrought iron security gate will be installed at the rear of the parcel. The proposed outdoor dining, improvements in the right-of-way, and signage will be approved under a separate permits.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project last reviewed on July 1, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:27 p.m.

Present: Steve Willson, Designer, Dan Weber; and Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz, Architect, Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz Architectural Design Services

Public comment opened at 5:33 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following details continued two weeks to Consent:

1. Provide a darker stain or color on the doors.
2. Study the hardware on the doors for consistency with the El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) Design Guidelines.

Action: Mahan/Orías, 6/0/0. (La Voie, Shallenberger, and Suding absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:37 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 206 E ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-039
 Application Number: MST2015-00342
 Owner: Storke, LLC
 Applicant: Traci Taitt

(Proposal to demolish the wooden members of an existing 720 square foot trellis for safety measures at the front of an existing commercial development. The existing trellis is failing. The existing stucco columns are proposed to remain. A separate application will be submitted at a later date to replace the trellis with a new design. No new non-residential square footage is proposed.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 202 STEARNS WHARF HC/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-022
 Application Number: MST2015-00327
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Waterfront

(Concept review of a proposal to replace an existing 35 square foot parking attendant kiosk with an 85 square foot, pre-manufactured, ADA compliant kiosk at Stearns Wharf. The project will include an accessible ramp connecting the wharf walkway to the kiosk. Requires Coastal Review in the Permit Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Courtesy comments are requested to be provided to the ABR; comments only. Project requires ABR review.)

Comments only:

1. The preferred kiosk design is acceptable.
2. Consider the addition of a decorative element on the roof such as finneals or a weather vane.
3. Relate the colors of the kiosk more to that of the brown on the wharf architecture.

NEW ITEM**C. 655 DEL PARQUE DR C R-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-410-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00318
 Owner: East Beach Homeowners Association
 Applicant: Arbor Services, Inc

(Proposal to remove two (2) Monterey Pines and replace with two (2) 24-inch Queen Palms in an existing condominium development in the El Pueblo Viejo.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks with the following comment:

1. Provide a more appropriate tree selection which achieves equivalent biomass to the trees being removed.