



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 8, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MARCK AGUILAR, Project Planner
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:40 p.m.), Suding, and Winick (at 1:34 p.m.).

Members absent: La Voie and Veyna.

Staff present: Aguilar (until 2:30 p.m.), Hernández, Kaufman, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the previous Historic Landmarks Commission meeting.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 25, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Orías/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger/Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the review of the Consent Agenda as reviewed by Bill Mahan.

Action: Drury/Winick, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger/Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman made the following announcements:

a) Commissioners La Voie and Veyna would be absent.

b) Item 3 on the agenda, 901 E. Cabrillo Blvd., would be postponed at the applicant's request.

Motion: Indefinitely postpone the review of Item 3, 901 E Cabrillo Blvd.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger/Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

2. Ms. Hernández announced that the home located at 720 De La Vina Street has been restored. In the summer of 2012 the structure was proposed to be demolished. It was determined that the house is a significant contributing structure to the Lower De la Vina Historic District. The front home was restored and units were placed in the back to help maximize the number of units under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). Chair Suding commented that it turned out extremely well and commended the owner of the property for the effort.

3. Commissioner Winick announced that he attended the Chair/Vice-Chair Advisory Groups semi-annual meeting that was held on March 18, 2015. An issue brought up by Matt LaBrie, Downtown Parking Commissioner, was the Southern California Edison (SCE) transformers as the new requirement is that transformers be placed above ground rather than beneath sidewalks in vaults. It was suggested that downtown parking lots could be studied as a possible solution.

Mr. Aguilar cited Parking Lot 7 as an example of how transformers can be handled when they are unable to be placed underground. He stated that parking lots are an acceptable option, but the need for accessibility with a crane could be an issue for future proposals. Staff is having conversations with SCE with respect to locations.

Commissioner Orías requested that a policy be established so that the public is made aware of possible placement of more above-ground electrical transformers in the community. Chair Suding requested that staff agendize a future discussion.

4. Commissioners Mahan and Winick announced they would not be attending the next HLC meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Mahan announced that the New Courthouse Building Advisory Committee met on Monday, April 6, 2015. The landscape architect Pamela Burton was present along with staff from Sacramento and the architects. Mayor Helene Schneider, Paul Casey (City Administrator) and George Buell (Community Development Director) were also in attendance. The architecture will be contemporary, but the intent is to use some of the elements found on the landmarked courthouse for inspiration. The footprint has been reduced somewhat as well as the floor-to-floor heights. The building height will be reasonably compatible with the surrounding neighborhood. It will now have a sloping roof with tile instead of a flat roof as previously proposed. Changes were requested to be made to the proposed windows and roof tile. Commissioner Mahan concluded that the Mayor and City Administrator agreed with him that a courtesy review by the Historic Landmarks Commission would be appropriate as a special meeting.

Commissioner Orías suggested that geothermal heating be addressed at the beginning of the project, which would be more efficient and financially sound, rather than it being an afterthought. Commissioner Mahan responded that the architectural firm is cognizant of green architecture and environmental issues. He agreed to bring up the subject.

Chair Suding requested information on how the construction of a State-owned structure can be in compliance with minimizing impacts to a National Historic Landmark; namely, the Santa Barbara County Courthouse. Although the HLC does not have purview, the Commission would like to know what its role will be during the future special meeting that was suggested by Commissioner Mahan. Ms. Hernández responded she will speak with the Design Review Supervisor and report back.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. **STATE STREET BENCH REMOVALS**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
(Discussion of removal of public benches on State Street in the downtown area.)

Time: 1:57 p.m.

Present: Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Staff comments: Mr. Aguilar made a staff presentation and provided a handout with a current inventory of benches on State Street. He explained that Staff added language with respect to the addition, relocation and removal of public benches to the *HLC General Design Guidelines and Meeting Procedures* as per the Commission's direction during a previous discussion.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m.

Bob Cunningham, local resident, commented that he provided photographs of areas on State Street that are now empty where benches used to be located. He requested that City Council set a policy to give specific direction as to how removal, replacement and relocation should be handled. The benches were part of an approved design within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and the HLC should be made aware when changes are made. He also mentioned that benches are an integral part of the design although the condition of the State Street Project has deteriorated. [In response to a question posed by the Commission, Mr. Cunningham said it was his opinion that benches that were removed without replacement resulted from them being heavily used for unintended purposes.]

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned the proposed criteria for removal and replacement of benches.

Public comment closed at 2:13 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The inventory list provided by Staff is appreciated.
2. Benches are an important part of the atmosphere in the downtown area and should remain.
3. There should also be a future discussion on the condition of the sidewalk where benches have been removed and suitable public improvements proposed to fill in those areas.
4. The decision of installation, removal and replacement of benches should not be an administrative decision, but rather remain within the HLC's purview. The Commission would like to have City Staff make recommendations, but ultimately have the HLC make the final decision.
5. The Commission's hesitance on action in January (when reviewing proposed bench removals fronting 821 & 825 State Street) was that there is a larger community-wide issue (homelessness and/or aggressive panhandling) and it was suggested that City Council take action or adopt a policy that would not create conflict between homelessness/aggressive panhandling and benches on State Street.
6. The wording for the draft proposed amendments to the *HLC General Design Guidelines and Meeting Procedures* under the **Administrative Staff Review** heading, section **1.3.4.A. Benches, Public**, shall change from "the addition, relocation or removal of public benches in the public right of way shall be at the discretion of the Community Development Director" and instead reflect that review of bench removals will remain under the purview of the Historic Landmarks Commission on a case-by-case basis just as with any other design review proposal.

(Staff note: This discussion is related to Application Number MST2015-00076. On February 5, 2015, the Commission provided supportive comments to the draft proposed amendments to the *HLC General Design Guidelines and Meeting Procedures* giving the Community Development Director purview over State Street benches located in the public right-of-way. That direction has been retracted as noted above.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 1626 SANTA BARBARA ST**

R-3 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-192-024
Application Number: MST2014-00469
Owner: Fulmer Family Trust
Architect: Amy Von Protz
Architect: Patrick Marr

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct a new two-story attached 719 square foot, three-car garage with a 687 square foot residential unit above. The proposal includes the addition of a new one-story, 457 square foot master bedroom and additions to the first and second floor of the existing single-family residence totaling in 200 square feet. The site is already developed with an existing, 2,301 square foot, two-story residence. The proposal will include a total of three-covered parking spaces. A modification is being requested to allow for a parking reduction of one space for a total of three (3) parking spaces. The proposed site development is 4,405 square feet, located on a 20,900 square foot lot. The proposal includes the relocation of the driveway and a new curb cut. Staff Hearing Officer review for the requested zoning modification is required. This structure is a Potential Historic Structure of Merit.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply by Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 018-14 and requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project last reviewed December 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:30 p.m.

Present: Bob Fulmer, Owner
Patrick Marr, Architect/Civil Engineer

Public comment opened at 2:39 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The architecture and proposed colors are acceptable as presented.
2. Provide an arborist report that specifically addresses how the driveway's northern edge will impact the roots of the Morton Bay fig tree.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Other individual comments:

Commission Mahan recommended that individual site visits be conducted to see the tree roots first-hand in preparation for the next design review of the project.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:55 P.M. TO 3:01 P.M. ****

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
Application Number: MST2008-00313
Owner: Richard Gunner
Applicant: Michael Gunner
Architect: William La Voie
Architect: John Von Doren
Architect: Marks Bloxom Architects, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Suding Design
Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal for a major façade remodel to the existing four-story, 43,354 square foot Santa Barbara Inn. The project will consist of the following: change the exterior façade design, enlarge the main entry, remove and relocate two units, relocate existing bar and restaurant, relocate existing hotel rooms, replace existing swimming pool and spa, remove existing equipment shed and replace it with a new, partial below-ground vault, redesign the landscape and hardscape, remove the entry area drive and two curb cuts and replace with landscaping, install new sidewalk on the Milpas Street side, and repave and landscape the parking area. The proposal will result in 508 square feet of new floor area; however, there is a net decrease of 1,082 square feet of commercial floor area. The project will result in a 43,191 square foot structure. The original project approval was granted under application MST2004-00052. The project is currently under construction under BLD2012-00380.)

(Review After Final for minor exterior changes to a previously approved plan for a remodel of the Santa Barbara Inn. Changes include revisions to the mullions at the lobby windows, enclosing the fire sprinkler room, the addition of a 16 square foot chemical storage room, reduce balconies to be inaccessible with reduced doors and fixed windows, alterations to windows at the fourth floor suite, the addition of vents and decorative covers at the boiler room, revise one second floor window. Project was last reviewed on August 27, 2014.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

4. **1130 N MILPAS ST** R-3 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Agent: Susan Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: DesignARC

(Proposal to construct a new, 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Review After Final of "as-built" revision from sandstone to concrete bollards at the Santa Barbara Bowl. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 015-12.) The 1915 sandstone wall adjacent to the bollards is listed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 3:01 p.m.

Present: Steve Carter, DesignARC Architects
 Erik Lassen, Santa Barbara Bowl
 Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that building the bollards before going through the design review process sets a bad precedent. Although the sandstone turned out to be impractical, it would have tied-in well with the history of the walls that were in existence before the County Bowl was constructed.

Public comment closed at 3:14 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Shallanberger, 6/0/0. (Murray stepped down. La Voie/Veyna absent.) Motion carried.

Other individual comments:

1. The majority of the Commission does not agree with applicants requesting design review after-the-fact as it sets a bad precedent.
2. Some of the Commissioners thought the design seemed more of an after-thought.
3. Commissioner Shallanberger pointed out that the applicant has been cooperative throughout the review process of other areas on the site.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 A.M.)

Consent Agenda was reviewed by Bill Mahan and adjourned at 11:35 a.m.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**A. 1800 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-020
 Application Number: MST2014-00086
 Owner: Suzanne J. Finamore Revocable Living Trust
 Agent: Mark Lloyd

(The project consists of the conversion of three existing detached residential units to condominiums. There are currently two (2) two-bedroom units and one (1) four bedroom unit and two three-car garages accessed off of Mira Vista Avenue. No new development is proposed. The project site is 37,000 square feet in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a request for a modification to allow a portion of an existing stone wall to be more than 3.5' within the front setback on El Encanto Road. The main house and garage are on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Spanish Colonial Revival residence designed by Edwards and Plunkett and constructed in 1930 and 1935.)

(Project Design and Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-15. Project last reviewed January 14, 2015.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 3626 SAN REMO DR E-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
 Application Number: MST2013-00440
 Owner: Nancy and Robert Madsen
 Applicant: Capital Pacific Development Group
 Designer: Kate Svensson

(Lot 3: Proposal to demolish an existing two-story, 2,907 square foot single-family dwelling and construct a new two-story, 2,767 square foot single-family dwelling and an attached 443 square foot garage. (The original four-lot subdivision project proposed a restoration of the dwelling at 3626 San Remo Drive. The proposal has been revised to demolish and reconstruct the dwelling because the existing building was structurally unstable, as per the engineering report.) The proposed development total of 3,210 square feet, located on a 14,810 square foot lot, is 74% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The front façade, which was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit, would be reconstructed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction, as per the Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates that was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on February 12, 2014. A Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission in March of 2010 for the subdivision of the property. This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Review After Final for revised exterior lighting details, roof elevation, and window removal. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14. The project was last reviewed by the Full Commission on October 22, 2014.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. The flat roof shall be a terracotta color or return with a different proposed color for review.
2. The light fixtures shall have a rusted finish.
3. Remove both light fixtures on the east elevation but retain the original light fixture, which is to be reinstalled at the original location as noted on plans.
4. Remove the light fixture on the west elevation above the mechanicals and the storage under the stairs. Only two lights should be shown on the west elevation plans.
5. There shall be no lights on the north elevation.
6. The changes to the roof elevation and window are acceptable.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1224 LAGUNA ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-132-016
Application Number: MST2015-00072
Owner: Michael Stewart Hynds
Designer: Jason Carter

(Proposal for a new 255 square foot veranda including a 36 square foot exterior half-bath and fireplace. A new 96 square foot deck and minor site alterations are also proposed.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present. Project last reviewed on February 25, 2015.)

Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Show new gutters and downspouts.
2. The new roof shall match the existing shingles.
3. Wall color and trim for the new veranda shall match the existing duplex's gray wall and white trim.
4. The five-panel stile and rail doors shall match existing door in color and design.
5. Return with up-to-date pictures showing existing doors and details on what is being proposed.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:31 P.M. ****