



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 11, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
JULIO JUAN VEYNA

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
JOANNA KAUFMAN, Planning Technician
AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: La Voie (2:40 p.m.), Mahan, Murray, Orías, Suding, Veyna, and Winick.

Members absent: Drury and Shallenberger.

Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Kaufman, and Flemmings.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There was an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, February 11, 2015, in the Community Development 2nd Floor Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Brian Miller presented the Commissioners and staff with copies of the book *Pearl Chase, First Lady of Santa Barbara*.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 28, 2015, with corrections.

Action: Murray/Mahan, 3/0/3. (Orías/Winick/Murray abstained, Shallanberger/Drury/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill Mahan and Chair Suding.

Action: Winick/Murray, 6/0/0. (Shallanberger/Drury/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Kaufman announced that Commissioners Drury and Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.
2. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:
 - a) The revised version of the HSSR for 121 East Mason and 121 Santa Barbara Street by James Sved has been submitted. The revision includes the proper citation that the history section, images and bibliography were quoted from a "History Report" written on the site by Post/Hazeltine.
 - b) The new proposed sculpture at the Airport is in front of the new terminal, 48 feet away from the side of the original terminal. Because it does not block or impact the original terminal, the sculpture was evaluated at ABR as part of the new terminal section of the airport.
 - c) The three landmarks, the Joseph Knowles Mural, First Church of Christ, Scientist, and Mont Joie were each designated City Landmarks at City Council on February 3, 2015.
 - d) The City Landmark known as the Franceschi Flame tree has fallen and cuttings will be propagated. However, it will be removed from the list of Designated City Landmarks.
 - e) There has been a nomination to expand the boundaries of the City Landmark, Mission Park to include the walls, the Designation Subcommittee reviewed the proposal this morning and will report to you during Subcommittee reports.
3. Commissioner Mahan announced that he will not be able to attend the Consent meeting held on February 25, 2015.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Veyna reported that a meeting was held to discuss the various issues regarding historic resources. The Subcommittee selected three properties from the Potential Historic Resources List to be designated as City Landmarks for the next round of designations. In addition, City Council accepted the request to make the Mission Park to Mission Canyon Multimodal Improvements Plan a Project in the City's Capital Improvement Program and Direct Public Works Staff to Work with the County of Santa Barbara to Seek Funding for Design and Construction. A request to expand the boundaries of the Mission Park City Landmark, boundaries to include the stone walls in Mission Canyon was reviewed by the Subcommittee. The Subcommittee decided to wait to move forward on the designation until the HSSR that evaluates the wall (which has been drafted) is reviewed and accepted by the HLC. The HSSR will provide the factual information researched by a professional historian on the significance of the walls that can be the basis for the expansion of the City Landmark boundaries.
2. Commissioner Murray addressed the poor attendance from the Commission at the City Council meeting regarding the City Landmarks designations and requested there be more participation in the future to include the Commissioners, community and the owners.
3. Commissioner Mahan reported on the recipients who received the historic landmarks design awards at the City Council meeting; **Saint Barbara Award** – Brian Cearnal, Architect, **George Washington Smith Award** – Architects: PMSM Architects and Building Lessee: Ensemble Theatre Company (ETC) – New Vic, **Lockwood de Forest Award** - Belmond El Encanto Hotel located at 800 Alvarado Place – Completed 2013 and Landscape Architects: Katie O'Reilly Rodgers and Courtney Jane Miller and Owner: Belmond Ltd., **Edwards/ Plunkett Award** - Crocker House located at 2050 Garden St. Completed 2013 and Architects: Harrison Design Associates.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. NOTICING PROCEDURES**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
(Discussion of public noticing procedures for design review projects.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m.

1. Kellam de Forrest was interested in how one is included on the interested parties list as well as who could be considered as an interested party.

Public comment closed at 2:07 p.m.

Discussion held.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. CITYWIDE NEWS RACKS**

ROW Zone

(2:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 000-000-0RW
Application Number: MST2014-00599
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: John Ewasiuk, Principal Civil Engineer

(Proposal to update the city's news rack ordinance in order to provide more effective news rack management and maintenance.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: John Ewasiuk, Principal Civil Engineer

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m.

1. Elizabeth Wright, local resident, recommended there be an "adopt-a-news-rack" program allowing business owners and/or the community to be involved with improving the condition of the news racks.
2. Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned the upkeep of the news racks, including the color and location policies.

Public comment closed at 2:24 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. Commissioner Mahan considered it best for the Boards to first weigh in on the location of the news racks and to concentrate on uniformity, design, and color.
2. Commissioner Orías suggested that a joint meeting with ABR and HLC be held to get efficient results.
3. Chair Suding recommended that there be a limit to the amount of advertising to help reduce clutter and to consider a sponsored news rack program.

FINAL REVIEW / HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT ADDENDUM**3. 1130 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00237
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permit
 Architect: Kupiec Architects
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Art

(Proposed addition and alterations to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art consisting of a 7,944 net new square foot one- and two-story addition (primarily within the existing building volume) and the renovation of an existing four-story 64,511 net square foot building. Also proposed is a new approximately 1,420 unenclosed square feet public rooftop pavilion, garden and terrace area with associated access elevator and stairway, new rooftop mechanical equipment and skylights. A new art receiving facility will add 402 square feet to the building footprint and a 5-foot long low curb wall at the northerly corner of the building will encroach onto City Central Library grounds. Miscellaneous site structure demolition will occur to support implementation of the proposed design. Two oak trees are proposed for removal with replacement of one oak tree on site and two others off site. A new electrical power transformer would be located on City property at Public Parking Lot No. 7. The net new square feet of new floor area will result in 72,455 net square feet of development. Construction staging would occur on the adjacent City library property. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Santa Barbara Museum of Art.")

a) HSSR Addendum (Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report found that the revised design would have a less than significant impact on the significant historic resources.)

Actual Time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Dr. Pamela Post, Historical Consultant, Post/Hazeltine Associates; and Marck Aguilar, Project Planner.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff agrees with the conclusion of the report in that it meets the CEQA Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, and that implementation of the proposed project would have a less than significant impact on significant historic resources (Class III). Staff recommends the HLC accept the report.

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, reported to the Commission that the seating area near the museum was meant to be available for a bus stop and to eliminate clutter, he believed the necessity of that bus stop should be explored.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with corrections reviewed by staff:

1. Clarify the vague wording relating to the roof and cornice structure in Section 5.2.1 (page 16) that reads “to the maximum extent possible,” to state that the character defining historic materials will be retained.
2. Provide elevation of the bus stop features to be moved and installed and evaluate them in relation to any possible impact to view of Myron Hunt building or the new proposed plaza that is restoring elements of the Myron Hunt fountain.
3. Evaluate the revised material and treatment of the retaining walls facing Library Plaza.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed, Shallanberger/Drury absent.) Motion carried.

b) Final Review (Final approval requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-14. Project was last reviewed on January 14, 2015.)

Actual Time: 2:51 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS; Bob Kupiec, Architect, Kupiec Architects; and Jaime Palencia, Designer, Kupiec Architects; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studios.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, was concerned that the east glass entrance did not conform to the EPV guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:19 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Commission:

1. Restudy the museum entrance facing Library Plaza including the detailing and material of the stone surround.
2. Study the panelization of the transom at the entrance, and beneath the doors and side lights.
3. Consider an alternate material on the door-pull hardware other than stainless steel.
4. Restudy the lights on the roof.
5. The proposed metal on the barrel tile of the roof is acceptable.
6. The landscape plan is acceptable with the condition that taller plants or vines be included along the service area wall for screening.
7. Provide alternatives for the lighting including the wall sconce and the pole lights.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed, Shallanberger/Drury absent.) Motion carried.

THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:38 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:46 P.M.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 15 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-111-012
 Application Number: MST2010-00033
 Owner: Virginia Castagnola-Hunter Trust
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Business Name: Lighthouse Restaurant

(The project consists of the partial demolition of an existing 142-seat restaurant building; construction of an approximately 1,020 square foot second story addition, 250 square foot second story balcony, and 150 square foot trash enclosure; remodel; and new creekside landscaping. The project is associated with the previously approved Cabrillo Bridge Replacement Project (MST2004-00878, PC Reso. 029-07), which includes demolition of 447 square feet of the restaurant building and the 350 square foot exterior patio over Mission Creek to facilitate replacement of the Cabrillo Bridge and to provide for Mission Creek flood control improvements.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-10. Project last reviewed May 26, 2010.)

Actual time: 3:46 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, Architect, Lenvik & Minor Architects, Virginia Castagnola, Owner; and Daniel Gullett, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval continued indefinitely to Full Commission with comments:

1. The Commission supports the project and finds it acceptable and commendable.
2. At the lighthouse tower, consider putting in a sill that slopes to the windows and move the window sash to the midpoint of the wall where the existing door is being replaced.
3. Study the condition on the southwest elevation of the spandrel panels. Examine their proportions and possibly infilling the panels to allow the door on the south elevation nearest the sidewalk to have a different height.
4. Study an alternative configuration of the window fenestration on the west elevation.
5. Maximize the landscaping near the trash enclosure and on Helena at the tower. Note: The remainder of the landscape is a handled by the Cabrillo Bridge Project.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 6/1/0. (Suding opposed, Shallenberger/Drury absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

FINAL REVIEW**5. 715 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00510
 Owner: Nancy Brock Trust
 Applicant: Don and Ra Disraeli/Kanaloa Seafood
 Architect: Michael Holliday

(Proposal for Phase 2 tenant improvement including a change of use for the existing 1,956 square foot building from automotive to restaurant use for Kanaloa Seafood. The proposal includes 28 outdoor dining seats, 7 tables and umbrellas. Signage will be submitted under separate permit. Phase 1 site and parking improvements are being reviewed under a separate application (MST2014-00320).)

(Final approval of architectural details is requested. Project last reviewed December 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:22 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect, DMHA; and Jerry Rocci, Project Manager, DMHA.

Public comment opened at 4:26 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

1. The mechanical equipment screening return to Consent.
2. The approval does not include the fish graphic.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 5/0/2. (Veyna/Orías abstained, Shallenberger/Duruy absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 1220 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-019
 Application Number: MST2015-00061
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Peter Brown, Mobility Coordinator

(Proposal to replace existing hitching post style bicycle racks with new hoop style bicycle racks at City Parking Lot #5 and in sidewalk location at the intersection of Chapala Street and De La Guerra Street, to increase capacity of bicycle parking and to consider hoop style bicycle racks as a secondary city-approved bicycle rack design in areas of high demand.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Peter Brown, Mobility Coordinator

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m.

1. Hillary Blackerby, a member of the Transportation Circulation Committee in addition to speaking on behalf of Assembly member Das Williams' office, is in support of the bike racks and the proposed locations. She requests it not be a case by case basis if it's an improvement to the existing conditions.
2. Kellam de Forest, local resident, suggested that pedestrian traffic be considered in lieu of the new bike racks.

Letters of support from Cynthia Boche, acting chair of the Transportation Circulation Committee, and Jacqui Armstrong, general manager of Eureka, were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:41 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. The pedestrian way will not be less than 8 feet clear.
2. Study several alternate colors including a dark grey or dark brown.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger/Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

Consent Agenda was reviewed by Bill Mahan (Items A-E) and Philip Suding (Items F-G).

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 9 W VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00359
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court
 Architect: Richard Six
 Engineer: John Maloney

(Proposal for site alterations to the north courtyard to include revised stairs and landings, new railings to match existing, new potted plants, a new wall fountain, resurfacing of various areas of courtyard and revised site lighting in various courtyards and paseos.)

(Review After Final for changes to courtyard fountain details. Project last reviewed November 19, 2014.)

Time: 11:12 a.m.

Present: Richard Six, LMA Architects

Final Approval as Submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 514 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
 Application Number: MST2013-00431
 Owner: Greg Newman
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.
 Business Name: Sandbar

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to replace three pair of existing patio entry doors with Lani system accordion-style doors. Also proposed is to permit as-built heaters and umbrellas in the front dining patio. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement case ENF2013-00134.)

(Review After Final for minor "as-built" changes to the façade and flooring of a previously-approved plan for minor exterior alterations. Project last reviewed February 26, 2014.)

Time: 11:09 a.m.

Present: Glen Deisler, AB Design and Aron Ashland, Applicant

Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. The new egress door shall have a traditional handle.
2. Replace the concrete floor with the terracotta tile as shown.
3. The new stucco wall shall have bullnose edges per the detail shown on sheet A9.0 and the color shall match the existing light beige in the front of the building.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 621 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-036
 Application Number: MST2014-00284
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studios

(Proposal to install new 30-inch tall guardrails to be on top of an existing 18-inch stone wall located around the existing planter and to connect to the existing railing at the stairs for City Parking Lot #10.)

(Conceptual review of proposed alterations to an approved planter guardrail; comments only. Project last reviewed June 18, 2014.)

Time: 11:20 a.m.

Present: Teri Green, Associate Transportation Planner

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 202 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-018
Application Number: MST2015-00016
Owner: Howe Family Partnership
Applicant: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for exterior tenant improvements to an existing restaurant. Exterior alterations include relocation and replacement of windows and doors, new planters, and the removal of awnings. Patio improvements include the new landscaping, removal of existing bar space to accommodate for new plaster walls, and relocation and replacement of fireplace. Two existing wrought iron gates are being removed and replaced with 8 foot-high plaster walls.)

(Final approval of architectural details is requested. Project last reviewed January 28, 2015.)

Time: 11:25 a.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Cearnal Andrulaitis

Final Approval with conditions:

1. The hearth shall be six inches thick and surfaced with terracotta tile.
2. The mantle shall have an ogee form.
3. The fireplace shall be constructed of stucco and have rounded corners.
4. Place the proposed calavera ivory and blue cross tile around the fireplace.
5. The pergola is acceptable as submitted.

NEW ITEM**E. 324 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
Application Number: MST2015-00060
Owner: 318 State Street Properties, LLC

(Proposal to permit "as-built" outdoor dining tables, chairs, and planters in an outdoor patio at an existing restaurant. This building is a designated Structure of Merit: Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom, AKA Andalucía Building.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Time: 11:32 a.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect, Cearnal Andrulaitis

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Remove the bamboo screens.
2. "As-built" terracotta planter boxes are acceptable.
3. Remove the wooden boards and replace with planter boxes to match the existing terracotta planters.
4. Replace "as-built" planter landscaping with low-water using plants such as succulents.
5. Chairs and tables are acceptable as submitted.

NEW ITEM**F. 924 GARDEN ST B****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-030
Application Number: MST2015-00041
Owner: Madeline Stuart
Applicant: Ryan Cunningham

(Removal of a tree and replacement with one new olive tree to a parcel with a designated City Landmark: El Caserío.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Time: 1:03 p.m.

Present: Forbes Perkins, Applicant Representative

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**G. 27 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-033
Application Number: MST2015-00059
Owner: The Lyon Building

(Proposal to install a new accessible door and related hardware on the easterly wing of the building; install new heat pump within existing screened mechanical area and removal of an existing 8-inch trunk diameter Chinese Twisted Juniper. The portion of the building that is eligible to be a City Landmark, the Lyons Building, will not be altered.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is present.)

Time: 1:08 p.m.

Present: Adam Grosshans, AB Design

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Replace the removed Hollywood Twisted Juniper with a new planting to be a minimum of 15 gallons in size.
2. Screen the reduced pressure backflow device with two 5 gallon carissa macrocrapa or similar landscaping.
3. The reduced pressure backflow device shall be no more than 18 inches off grade.
4. The vent stack, outlet, and mechanical heat pump are acceptable as proposed.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:54 P.M. ****