



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 24, 2014 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MICHELLE BEDARD, Assistant Planner
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:37 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: La Voie, Orías, Shallanberger, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Drury, Mahan, Murray, and Sharpe.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:00 p.m. and again at 5:15 p.m.), Hernández (until 4:00 p.m.), Bedard (until 2:38 p.m. and again at 4:00 p.m.), and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 10, 2014, with corrections.

Action: Orías/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Agenda as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Winick/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:

a. Commissioners Drury, Mahan, Murray, and Sharpe would be absent.

b. The City Council appeal hearing of the Cajun Kitchen “Gator boy” mural will be held on Tuesday, October 14, 2014.

Commissioner Shallanberger agreed to attend in representation of the HLC in support of the temporary, one-year approval.

c. The bicycle corral at the 100 Block of E. Cañón Perdido Street (previously approved by the Commission) was installed on Monday, September 22, 2014.

2. Commissioner Orías announced that at the September 18, 2014, Joint City Council/Planning Commission Meeting she spoke about the need for a more timely implementation of the Historic Resources Element. Commissioner Shallanberger added that the HLC would like a defined timeline as to when the implementation would occur. He also spoke on concerns regarding recent field inspection issues and the enforcement of approved designs versus what is actually constructed. Although the Community Development Director had already addressed these issues before the HLC Commission representatives spoke, there is good indication that the HLC’s concerns are being considered and addressed.

Mr. Limón responded that the City Attorney’s Office will provide a draft of the proposed historic districting ordinance that has been on the pending list for quite some time. Staff will keep the Commission informed.

Mr. Limón announced that a new City Building Official, Andrew Stuffer, has been appointed by George Buell, Community Development Director. He explained that Mr. Buell is taking the “as-built” inspection concerns (previously expressed by Commissioner Mahan) very seriously and has started conversations with the Building Official and Inspection Staff regarding this issue.

3. Commissioner Shallanberger announced that the Victoria Theatre proposed Sign Program is being referred to the Full Commission from the Sign Committee Consent Agenda.

4. Commissioner Winick announced the AIA Santa Barbara Chapter’s self-guided 2014 ArchitectTours of local sustainable architecture to be held on Saturday, October 4, 2014, from 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

5. Commissioner Orías announced that former Planning Commission member and civic leader Joanne (Maureen) Miller passed away recently.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**1. 931 LAS ALTURAS RD**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-141-002
Application Number: MST2014-00478
Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the building located at 931 Las Alturas Road known as the "Mont Joie.")

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the property with the HLC Designations Subcommittee for possible landmark recommendation to City Council. The property owner was informed via certified letter. Designed by Chicago architect Edwin H. Clark for James Ward and Narcissa Thorne and constructed by Snook and Kenyon in 1928, Mont Joie is one of Santa Barbara's architectural gems that is a significant part of the heritage of the City. (Mont Joie was designed using elements of the Italian Renaissance, Beaux Arts, and French Eclectic styles.) The key character-defining features will be identified before the public hearing.

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2014-10 of Intent to hold a Public Hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider recommending to City Council that the "Mont Joie", located at 931 Las Alturas Road, be designated a City Landmark.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 116 - 120 E VALERIO ST**

(1:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-191-012
Application Number: MST2014-00477
Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the building located at 116-120 Valerio Street known as the "First Church of Christ, Scientist.")

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the property with the HLC Designations Subcommittee for possible landmark recommendation to City Council. The property owner was informed via certified letter. Designed by renowned architect Henry Gutterson and construction was completed in 1932. The First Church of Christ, Scientist, is one of Santa Barbara's architectural gems that is a significant part of the heritage of the City. (The First Church of Christ, Scientist, was designed in the Byzantine and Romanesque styles with Spanish Colonial Revival elements.)

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he wanted to assure that the landscaping is included with the designation because his father Lockwood de Forest was the landscape architect. [Staff responded that character defining features of the original landscape will be included in the designation.]

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2014-09 of Intent to hold a Public Hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider recommending to City Council that the “First Church of Christ, Scientist”, located at 116-120 E. Valerio Street, be designated a City Landmark.

Action: Orías/Winick, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION

3. **34 W VICTORIA ST**

(1:51) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-610-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00476
 Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the mural located at 34 W. Victoria Street known as “The Joseph Knowles Mural.”)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff reviewed the mural with the HLC Designations Subcommittee for possible landmark recommendation to City Council. The property owner was informed via certified letter, and the property owner sent a letter supporting the City Landmark designation. The mural was designed by the noted artist Joseph Knowles in 1958 and is significant for the historical and cultural influence on the heritage of the City. (The mural was made out of polychromatic tiles. The panels depict six historic epochs in the history of Santa Barbara County. It is one of the few prominent and noteworthy historic murals in the City)

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether only the tiles or the entire expanse on Chapala Street would be designated. He also asked who would be responsible to rehabilitate the faded mural. He commented that the HLC should be credited for its preservation. [Staff responded that only the mural with six panels and tiles would be included in the designation. The property owner will be responsible for its maintenance.]

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2014-08 of Intent to hold a Public Hearing on October 8, 2014, to consider recommending to City Council that “The Joseph Knowles Mural”, located at 32 W. Victoria Street, be designated a City Landmark.

Action: Winick/Orías, 4/1/0. (Shallanberger opposed. Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 340 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-036
 Application Number: MST2012-00295
 Owner: George Dumas, Trustee
 Applicant: Tesoro Refining
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Engineer: A & S Engineering, Inc.
 Business Name: USA Gas

(Proposal to permit the as-built conversion of an existing automobile service station to a mini-mart. The proposal includes minor exterior alterations, removal of the auto service bays, and increasing landscaping planter areas. Nine parking spaces will be provided and no new floor area is proposed on the 15,600 square foot parcel. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit is requested.)

(Review of Historic Site/Structures Report prepared by Alexandra Cole. The report concluded that the building is not historically significant.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Jeff Gorrell, LMA Architects

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the report found the Mid-century Modern Standard Gas Station prototype to have missing key character defining features. Staff agrees with the report that the gas station does not meet the criteria to qualify as a historic resource as it does not convey its original appearance or the original intent of the Standard Stations without its flat roof and character defining pumps.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that even minor changes to the façade could have visual impacts due to its location and visibility. He emphasized that proposed design changes should be reviewed by the HLC.

Public comment closed at 2:12 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comments:

- The exhaustive survey found in the report is appreciated.
- Gratitude was expressed for the report preparer's thoroughness.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 3626 SAN REMO DR**

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2013-00440
Owner: Nancy and Robert Madsen
Applicant: Capital Pacific Development Group
Designer: Kate Svensson, KSD

(Lot 3: Proposal to demolish an existing two-story, 2,907 square foot single-family dwelling and construct a new two-story, 2,767 square foot single-family dwelling and an attached 443 square foot garage. (The original four-lot subdivision project proposed a restoration of the dwelling at 3626 San Remo Drive. The proposal has been revised to demolish and reconstruct the dwelling because the existing building was structurally unstable, as per the engineering report.) The proposed development total of 3,210 square feet, located on a 14,810 square foot lot, is 74% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The front facade, which was found to be eligible as a Structure of Merit, would be reconstructed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction, as per the Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates that was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on February 12, 2014. A Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole of Preservation Planning Associates was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission in March of 2010 for the subdivision of the property. This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14. The project was last reviewed on March 26, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:13 p.m.

Present: Robert Adams, Landscape Architect
Kate Svensson, Designer, KSD
Vincent Amore, Project Manager, CPDG, Inc.
Dan Gullett, Project Planner

Staff comments: Mr. Gullett stated that the design review for the building on Lot 3 is under the HLC purview. The other three lots, creek restoration plan, the driveway, landscaping, and lighting are under review by the Single Family Design Board.

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned how this proposal fits into the overall proposed development and whether the creek setback issues have been resolved. He would be interested in seeing what the four facades of the proposal look like. [Staff responded that on August 14 the Planning Commission approved the revisions to the previously approved four-lot subdivision, including a change in the condition which would have required an additional 10-foot creek setback for the building on Lot 3 that is under HLC review. Therefore, the setback from the creek is shown in the applicant's presentation as was approved.]

Public comment closed at 2:21 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Agenda with comments:

1. Provide variation in the roof tile and a color blend.
2. Provide a sample of the tile. It should be identified on the plans as a cap and pan terracotta tile.
3. Show the terracotta tile with grouting at the ridge and grouted bird stops at the eaves.
4. Provide detail of pilaster capital.
5. Provide details of door and window seal and head jam. Detail 9 as indicated in the drawings does not look like an historic application.
6. In the construction drawings, notes should read “doors and frames to be replicated,” not just “doors.”
7. Make sure the photographic evidence matches what is proposed to be replicated, including Detail 4 (historic eave).
8. In Detail 15 (weep screed), the plaster needs to be shown going into the ground as required.

Action: Shallanberger/Winick, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:38 P.M. TO 2:51 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6 1118 E CABRILLO BLVD**

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-353-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00248
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicants: Jill Zachary and Justin Van Mullem
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer, Inc.

(This is a City Structure of Merit: Cabrillo Pavilion and Stoa. The proposal includes facade repair/renovation, and changes to existing windows and doors, structural upgrades, and upgrading of mechanical, plumbing and electrical systems. Also proposed are site improvements including: improvements to meet accessibility (ADA) requirements, restoration of the beach level promenade, installation of a boardwalk connecting the promenade to the beach, installation of a walkway along the west parking lot, renovation of site landscaping, addition of new outdoor showers, replacement of playground equipment, restoration of the stoa (covered walkway), removal of approximately 16 trees, relocating approximately 32 trees, and 8 new trees, enlargement of the trash enclosure, and addition of a mechanical equipment enclosure. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review of a Coastal Development Permit. The project was last reviewed on September 10, 2014.)

Actual time: 2:51 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks & Recreation Director
 Joe Wilcox and Mark McFarlin, Architects, KBZ Architects
 Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect, Earthform Design
 Allison De Busk, Project Planner, Planning Division

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m. regarding landscaping.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented the landscape should not be completely “planted out”, causing it to compete with the building, and that the proposed landscaping is too much. He showed a photograph from 1940 to illustrate that the landscaping should not hide the building.

Public comment closed at 2:58 p.m.

Public comment opened at 3:12 p.m. regarding architectural design.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether the architecture on the north side on the Cabrillo Blvd. side is being considered. He expressed concern for the loss of the arches that were part of the original design. He expressed appreciation that the symmetry is being retained. [It was clarified that the building’s south side terrace is the focus of the applicants’ presentation during this review.]

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks with comments:

Landscaping:

1. The number of trees proposed to be removed is problematic and of concern. Provide equal number of trees for replacement and of equal aesthetic/biomass value. Replacement trees could be located in the parking lot or along Cabrillo Blvd. Because most of the Palm trees along Cabrillo Blvd. are mature, a new generation of trees may be appropriate.
2. The Commission looks forward to seeing how the applicant will meet the City’s Landscape Design Standards for the parking lot.

Architecture of Terrace:

3. The concept of the proposal is supportable and the additional studies performed by the applicant are appreciated.
4. The hip roof solution at the ends of the roof terrace structure is an improvement and acceptable.
5. Exposure of the pre-existing windows is greatly appreciated.
6. Study extending the eave to protect the windows.
7. Consider larger rafter tails expressed at the columns.
8. Consider integrating the window sills with the existing railing.
9. If plaster columns are the solution, they need more detailing. The upper corners of the terrace structure are problematic where the window meets the stucco. The plaster appears too thin.
10. Plain pilasters are not acceptable on the building or within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. A wood material would be preferred with appropriate articulation and traditional detailing and in an appropriate color (not quite as dark as shown in one of the studies).

First Floor Columns:

11. The first floor columns color should be restored to the original/historic (darker) color.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Additional individual comment:

- Consider a bicycle corral such as the one recently installed at the 100 Block of E. Cañón Perdido Street.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. **116 CASTILLO ST** HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-061-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00388
 Owner: Adi and Santy Kazali, Trustees
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Concept review proposal to demolish the existing 8,612 square foot, one-story hotel and construct a new, 14,475 square foot, three-story, 38 room hotel, with a total of 38 parking spaces (20 covered and 18 uncovered parking spaces), located on a 24,956 (gross) square foot lot in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit, Development Plan Approval, and a requested Zoning Modification.)

(Concept review; comments only. Project requires Compatibility Analysis Criteria, Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit, Development Plan Approval, and a requested Zoning Modification.)

Actual time: 3:31 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m. and reopened at 3:42 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned the maximum height and whether the site is outside the proposed West Beach Historic District. [Staff responded that it is outside the proposed historic district boundaries; yet, what is being proposed would be more compatible with its Spanish Colonial Revival style than what is existing. The surrounding neighborhood has two to three story buildings. The applicant responded that the maximum height for the proposed building is 30 feet.]

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of letter from Calvin Rossi expressing opposition to the project as he feels it greatly impacts his adjacent property, will block mountain views, and will have a negative visual impact in the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:38 p.m. and reclosed at 3:43 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposed modification is supportable.
2. The project's concept, architectural design, and size, bulk and scale are supportable.
3. Provide renderings and/or visual simulations with mountains shown behind the building.
4. Rooftop amenities are discouraged.
5. Study making the secondary driveway not so close to the residences.
6. It would be better if there was only one driveway entrance, not two.
7. The arch leading into the parking lot should be thick and emphasized.
8. If the parking lot must be in the front, it should be more special, particularly at the lobby, with more of a plaza/front door feel to it.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:51 P.M. TO 3:58 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. **915 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-041
 Application Number: MST2014-00437
 Owner: David and Susan Hughes Family Trust
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposed demolition of an existing 3,722 square foot commercial building and construction of a new one-story, 3,898 square foot commercial building. This project was previously approved under MST2008-00245.)

(Project Design and Final Approvals requested. Project requires an environmental finding for CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis and Rogelio Solís, Architects, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 David Hughes, Property Owner

Public comment opened at 4:02 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with findings and comment/condition:

1. **CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption:** The HLC finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA certificate of determination on file for this project.
2. There is support for re-approval of the project.
3. Add a small tree to the rear planter.

Action: Shallanberger/Winick, 4/1/0. (La Voie opposed because he felt that the existing arch has more character than what is proposed and that the rear elevation as proposed has too many different elements that are not tied well together. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:10 P.M. TO 4:16 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. **518 STATE ST** C-M Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046
 Application Number: MST2013-00140
 Owner: Charles C. and Georgetta M. Craviotto
 Architect: Tod Stockwell

(Revised proposal to install one freestanding, permanent canvas tent canopy (1,509 square feet) with oval steel pole frame. The original proposal involved three (3) separate canopies and a new 138 square foot storage enclosure. The proposed storage enclosure has been eliminated from the scope of work. This application addresses violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-01002.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. The project was last reviewed on July 17, 2013.)

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: Tod Stockwell, Designer
Krishan Gupta, Business Owner

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned the permanent nature of a tent structure, and the planned use for the former storage structure.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The materials are appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District; however, the details should better conform to the design guidelines.
2. A cloth type canopy is generally acceptable.
3. No plastic sides will be allowed (i.e., curtains hanging from the awning).
4. Provide more information as to how the trellis will be treated.
5. The vertical text sign is not approvable.
6. Use of pots and plants is appropriate.
7. The applicant is encouraged to improve the paving.
8. The storage building upgrade and maintenance is important and essential.
9. Any proposed outdoor furniture is subject to HLC review.
10. Resolve Building & Safety issues and Zoning violations prior to returning to the HLC.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Staff notes:

- Any unapproved signage shall be removed; an application for Sign Committee review shall be submitted for any proposed new signage; and vertical signage is prohibited.
- If the applicant proposes outdoor furniture at a later time, design and materials shall be submitted for HLC review.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:40 P.M. TO 4:41 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**10. 719 PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2014-00417
 Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
 Applicant: Fancher Development
 Architect: Aria Group Architect, Inc.
 Business Name: California Pizza Kitchen

(Proposal for exterior façade alterations to the existing California Pizza restaurant located within the Paseo Nuevo Mall. The proposal includes replacing the existing tile finish below windows with a new wood finish, replace all exterior patio furniture (tables, chairs, and umbrellas), railing, benches, planters and landscaping, replace the main entry door and refinish all existing doors and frames, and replace all awnings with new fabric (existing hardware to remain). A separate application will be submitted for Sign Committee review to replace existing signage.)

(First Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Nina Raey, CPK Representative, Fancher Development

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the proposed outdoor furniture is modern and not appropriate within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The yellow color sample is too bright.

Public comment closed at 4:46 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The proposal is lovely, but the contemporary design and accent colors do not belong at this location found within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Study a revised design proposal that complies with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. The proposed colors, in particular the yellow and grey colors, are not appropriate; with the exception of the awning color that was found to be acceptable.
3. The use of a railing is preferred over planter pots, but the railing design should be more traditional.
4. The proposed patio furniture is not supportable, with the exception of the wood waiting bench that was found to be acceptable.
5. The wood bulkhead is not a good design solution.
6. Use more vertical landscaping, instead of succulents.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:58 P.M. TO 5:04 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**11. 631 GARDEN ST**

C-M Zone

(5:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-028
Application Number: MST2014-00448
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative
Architect: David Shelton

(Proposal to replace the existing chain link fence and install two new decorative fences and gates located along both the Garden and Ortega Street frontages of the Community Arts Workshop. The proposed designs have been reviewed by the Visual Arts in Public Places (VAPP). Other site and building alterations were approved under a separate application (MST2014-00256) on July 2, 2014.)

(First Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:04 p.m.

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect, Poirier + Associates Architects
Leon Olson, Santa Barbara Arts Collaborative

Public comment opened at 5:15 p.m.

Judy Nilsen, VAPP Chairman, expressed support for the proposal and commented that in 2008 the design was approved and two weeks ago the proposed gates were met with the same enthusiasm.

Robert Adams, Arts Advisory Commission Chair, expressed support for the project and commented that it is partially funded by Santa Barbara Beautiful.

Ginny Brush, Santa Barbara County Arts Commission Executive Director, expressed support and commented on the art representation as well as the proposed landscaping that complements the design.

Claudia Bratton, Summer Solstice Executive Director, expressed support and spoke on the use of the facility and how remarkable the design will make the building.

Public comment closed at 5:21 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals.

Action: Shallenberger/La Voie, 5/0/0. (Drury/Mahan/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 1554 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-183-011
Application Number: MST2014-00457
Owner: Fred J. Krupica
Applicant: Paragon Builders

(Proposal to construct two new 5'6" driveway entry pillars with approximately 9" stone cap, and a new 6' tall wrought-iron gate for the existing two-story, single-family residence. The maximum height of the wall and pillars will not exceed 8' in height. The parcel is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was found eligible as a Structure of Merit in the Lower Riviera Survey. A separate application (MST2014-00260) was recently approved for a new site wall, railing changes, and two new fountain features.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. The gate shall be the black color to match existing one on the property.
2. Pillow cap on pillars shall be sandstone to match existing.

NEW ITEM**B. 800 GARDEN ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-014
Application Number: MST2014-00451
Owner: Islay Investments
Applicant: Howard Kantor

(Proposal to replace all of the existing aluminum frame windows with bronze trimmed Styleline Milgard vinyl retrofit windows.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Provide further information.
2. Clad aluminum is acceptable.
3. The window shall be set back in the plaster.
4. Provide detail of materials and they shall be metal rather than vinyl.

NEW ITEM**C. 530 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-026
Application Number: MST2014-00459
Owner: McColm Family Trust 8/13/99
Architect: Windward Engineering
Business Name: Samy's Camera

(Proposal to upgrade existing HVAC roof top equipment with new equipment, to include the removal of four (4) roof equipment units, and installation of five (5) new rooftop mechanical units at new roof locations. The proposed new units will be shorter in height than the original existing units.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with comments:

1. The project is sufficiently screened.
2. The screen is detailed in A501 and it is optional, not required.

NEW ITEM**D. 21 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-002
Application Number: MST2014-00460
Owner: Hollister Building Partners
Applicant: Campbell-Geo, Inc.

(Proposal to install a temporary soils and groundwater remediation system, including vapor extraction in the underground parking garage of the Spectrum Athletic Club. The proposal will include an exterior mounted exhaust stack at the rear of the building facing the alley.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. The approval shall be for 2 ½ years as a temporary installation.
2. The existing shrub shall be allowed to grow over the installation to shield the pipe.

CONTINUED ITEM**E. 333 JUNIPERO PLAZA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-261-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00436
 Owner: Barbara Rosenblum Trust 5/5/89
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for minor site and landscaping alterations to a parcel developed with an existing, single-family residence. The property is a designated City Landmark: Francisca de la Guerra Dibblee Residence. The site alterations include the removal of an existing 18-inch site wall and replacement with a new 6-inch stone curb; add a new 18-inch tall wall to connect portions of two existing walls; add a new pilaster, add stone veneer to two existing walls. Also proposed is to paint the existing garage door to match the color of other existing doors. The landscaping alterations include the removal of a variety of six (6) existing trees, the addition of two (2) new Oak trees, removal of existing Italian Cypress hedges and replacement with a new hedge material (*Laurus nobilis*) species.)

(Continued from September 10, 2014. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

This project was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 1936 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00167
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Applicant: Cadence Development
 Agent: Lucy Dinneen
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,500 square foot, approximate 21 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. The entry tower portion of the building is proposed at 32 feet. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 17 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

(Review After Final for revised landscaping to include two new trees to replace two existing Washingtonia palm trees which are requested to be removed due to safety concerns.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:33 P.M. ****