



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 30, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie (at 1:44 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Member absent: Murray and Shallanberger.

Staff present: Limón (until 3:30 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:30 p.m.), Bedard, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 16, 2014, with correction.

Action: Drury/Mahan, 5/0/1. (Sharpe abstained. LaVoie/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

The Commission tabled the Consent Calendar until after the review of Item 1.

The Commission untabled the review of the Consent Calendar at 1:56 p.m.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill La Voie.

Action: Winick/Oriás, 6/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard announced that Commissioner Shallanberger would either be absent or attend the meeting briefly.
2. Mr. Limón announced that a historic structures/sites report for the proposed Cabrillo Arts Pavilion rehabilitation project will be scheduled for the HLC meeting of August 27, 2014.
3. Commissioner Winick announced that he will be absent from the August 13 meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Ms. Hernández reported on the Designations Subcommittee. Proposed errata changes to the current City's List of Potential Historic Resources were discussed and they will be presented to the HLC in the near future. Also discussed were proposed Landmark Designations that will be presented in the Fall.

Mr. Limón reported that the HLC Award plaques design has been approved, is ready to be ordered, and will be presented in September.

DISCUSSION ITEM1. **ROOFTOP LIGHTING**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

(Discussion of rooftop lighting guidelines in various jurisdictions and opportunity for revisions of the City of Santa Barbara current *Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines*.)

Actual time: 1:36 p.m.

Present: Olivia Offutt, Design Review Intern
Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor /

Staff comments: A draft will be prepared incorporating suggested revisions to the *Guidelines*, to be presented to the HLC, followed by a public hearing to gather input. The Commission's concerns will also be shared with the Architectural Board of Review. The intent is to finish the process of amending the guidelines by the end of the calendar year.

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with lights on roof parking, roof gardens, umbrellas, heat lamps and other equipment that can be seen off the parapet.

Public comment closed at 1:55 p.m.

Comments or suggestions made during the discussion:

1. Consistent policies should be established.
2. Use stronger language, enforceable restrictions or lighting controls to the wording "encourage lights to be turned off when not in use."
3. Differentiate between "festival" lighting versus building mounted light fixtures.
4. Where the guidelines state that "lighting shall be designed to effectively eliminate glare", perhaps add language that states that "light sources shall be installed that are visually desirable."
5. As long as dwellings in the downtown area are encouraged, they should be livable without the nuisance of bright lighting.

Discussion held.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:05 P.M. TO 2:14 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

- | | | |
|--------|--|----------|
| 2. | 1330 CHAPALA ST | C-2 Zone |
| (2:15) | Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001 | |
| | Application Number: MST2013-00169 | |
| | Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation | |
| | Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group | |
| | Business Name: Arlington Village | |

(Proposal for a new, three-story, 41'-5" tall mixed-use development on a 91,000 square foot parcel located at the corner of W. Sola and Chapala Streets. The project will comprise 33 residential apartments (totaling 28,049 square feet) and two commercial units (895 square feet). The new building will total 61,456 square feet, including a 665 square foot exercise room and a 13,884 square foot partially below-grade parking garage. The parking garage will contain 42 spaces, and a surface lot will contain 49 spaces for a total of 91 spaces, with 33 spaces allocated to the residential units, two spaces allocated to the commercial units and 56 spaces allocated to the Arlington theatre. Also proposed is the removal of nine mature trees, with six mature palm trees to be relocated on site. Grading excavation will total 3,400 cubic yards. A detached trash enclosure for the theater is proposed to replace an existing trash enclosure and will be constructed near the northwest corner of the Arlington theatre. A waiver of parking lot interior planter requirements is requested. This parcel is within the 10% Parking Zone of Benefit and contains a designated Structure of Merit: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch.")

(In-Progress Review. The project requires compliance with Findings and Conditions of Resolution No. 13-091, adopted by City Council on December 10, 2013. The project was last reviewed by HLC on August 14, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:14 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert and Gordon Brewer, Architects, Peikert + RRM Design Group
Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m. and reopened at 2:45 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with the view from Sola Street, as well as the elevator tower height and its impact on the view of the adjacent historic resource. He questioned whether there is a minimum square footage of commercial space for a mixed-use project. He requested clarification with respect to the landscape plan for the corner of Sola and Chapala Streets. He asked if parking lot screening is a requirement and whether the historic Arlington Hotel Arch will have planting.

Public comment closed at 2:37 p.m. and reclosed at 2:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

Architecture:

1. The attention to detail of the tile work is appreciated and the palette is traditional/acceptable. The choice of tile is appropriate for the adjacency of the project to the historic resource.
2. The roofing details should also be a traditional Spanish Colonial Revival style.
3. Consider adding curtains on the balconies of some selected windows.
4. Consider turning the tile medallions on the diagonal.
5. Consider providing renderings of the elevations; and make sure that the CAD (Computer Aided Design) matches the presentation drawings so that what is eventually constructed reflects the artistic integrity of the project.
6. Show the gate on the garage door.
7. Show any proposed furniture.
8. Show any proposed lighting to be located on the roof. The lighting should be low intensity. The applicant was advised to check with staff on in-progress rooftop lighting design guidelines.
9. Show a solar panels system; the system shall not be visible from the streetscape.
10. Show the proposed location for the directory.
11. The paseo that is perpendicular to Sola Street should relate better to the project due to its importance. Study making it a pleasant pedestrian experience.
12. The height of the elevator tower should be reduced in height to the extent possible to lessen the negative visual impact on the adjacent historic resource.
13. The new accessibility guidelines should be resolved with the Building and Safety Division to avoid necessary redesign of site plans in order to achieve compliance.
14. Simplify the scalloped design on the south elevation walls to avoid having them both above and below (page A5.20 on plans).
15. An open space area should provide the opportunity for children's recreation.

Landscaping:

16. The trash enclosure is not acceptable as it is a negative visual impact to the adjacent historic resource (Arlington Theatre).
17. Address a walk through the existing historic arch at the corner of Sola and Chapala Streets.
18. The paving patterns throughout the project should relate to their use, whether it is pedestrian or vehicular scale.

19. The paving pattern should serve to make the urban design environment more cohesive at the paseo that leads from Sola Street to Victoria Street. It was suggested that it match the existing as close as possible.
20. Reconsider the use of the Mexican Fan Palm (*Washingtonia robusta*) and instead replace with a shorter palm at the proposed locations to avoid eventually dwarfing the buildings once the palms mature.
21. Consider using a more rounded canopy tree such as *cassia notabilis* throughout the project.
22. The garden design that is between the Arlington Theater and the project should be more traditional.
23. Provide a guarantee that proposed street trees will be planted once the current drought crisis ends.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 517 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: H & R Investments, LP
 Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group

(Proposal to construct a new three-story, mixed-use development (19,691 square feet) on an 11,500 square foot lot, with six residential condominium units (totaling 10,119 square feet) and two commercial condominium spaces (totaling 2,711 square feet). One of the residential units would be affordable. The proposal includes a voluntary lot merger of two lots.)

(Review After Final for reconfiguration of residential units and commercial spaces, resulting in six residential condominium units (totaling 10,485 square feet net) and two commercial condominium spaces (totaling 1,897 square feet net). Project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination. Project requires compliance with City Council decision of June 22, 2010. The project was last reviewed by HLC on February 15, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:32 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect, Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Bonnie Sangster, Designer, Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 2:41 p.m.

Kate Dole, adjacent neighborhood business owner, commented on the project's proximity to the Brinkerhoff neighborhood and expressed opposition to the mass, bulk and scale. She suggested staggering the roofline and making changes to the patios.

Tony Vassallo, immediately adjacent property owner, questioned whether the garage plate line and the overall height have changed. He also commented on the drainage.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the lengthiness of the proposed project and the outdated concept of giant condominiums on Chapala Street. He suggested the impact on the historic landmark Victorian style buildings on Haley Street be differentiated.

Public comment closed at 2:48 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final changes as they were found to be in substantial conformance with the approved project.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Chair Suding announced the ten day appeal period.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:00 P.M. TO 4:04 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 608 & 614 CHAPALA ST

C-M Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00397
 Owner: Figueroa Investors, Ltd.
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Shubin + Donaldson Architects, Inc.

(Proposal to infill 5,402 square feet under an existing roof area attached to a 20,859 square foot commercial building and to add a 187 square foot restroom addition to an existing 179 square foot detached commercial building. No change in use is proposed and no grading is required. This parcel is in the 50% parking Zone of Benefit and the parking requirement is 27 spaces, with 33 proposed. Total development on this 42,972 square foot parcel will be 26,440 square feet. The project obtained Development Plan Approval by the Planning Commission on May 15, 2014. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is included in the State Historic Resources Inventory: "Former C & H Chevrolet constructed in 1946.")

(The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-14. The project is requesting design waivers of the Parking and Landscaping Design Standards (SBMC §28.90.050). The project was last reviewed by HLC on July 16, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:04 p.m.

Present: Steven Welton, Senior Planner, SEPPS
 Jim van Order, Architect, Shubin + Donaldson Architects, Inc.
 Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 4:12 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals accepting the design waiver for the Parking and Landscaping Design Standards with comments and condition:

1. The applicant's response to the Commission's previous comments is appreciated.
2. The enhanced and enlarged landscape areas are greatly appreciated.
3. Enlarge the planters where the existing palm trees are located at back-of-curb on Chapala Street. It was suggested that they be twice as long as they are wide. Provide to staff for verification.

Action: La Voie/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period applies to this project.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 24 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-051
 Application Number: MST2013-00349
 Owner: Rycama, LLC
 Applicant: Lynx Property Management
 Architect: Wayne Labrie Architect

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to an existing courtyard patio. The project includes a new plaster and wrought iron enclosure, infill of a pair of existing French doors, new paving, planters, and awnings. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Old Livery Stable & Carriage Factory, Sprague Livery Stable.")

(Review After Final for revised wrought iron details.)

Approval of Review After Final details as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 12 E MONTECITO ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-016
 Application Number: MST95-00044
 Owner: Rodney James Shull Memorial Foundation
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal to construct an 11,091 square foot two-story youth hostel with 100 beds and 60 parking spaces on a vacant parcel.)

(Review After Final for revised and new site and building lighting.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REFERRED BY FULL COMMISSION**C. 100 BLK E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST 1571 SEG ID**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-571
 Application Number: MST2014-00282
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Peter Brown, Associate Transportation Planner

(Proposal to revise the street vehicle parking configuration, located within the 100 Block of East Cañón Perdido Street, for the purpose of adding a new bicycle corral to provide 14 new bicycle parking spaces. The bicycle corral will be 39-feet long by 7-feet wide and is proposed in the location of two existing vehicle parking spaces. The proposal involves extending the green painted curb 7.5-feet into the existing red zone, towards Santa Barbara Street, to provide one new automobile parking space (overall net loss of one vehicle parking space).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on July 16, 2014.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 34 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
 Application Number: MST2014-00330
 Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
 Architect: Brian Cearnal, Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to provide a new outdoor patio dining area for the Santa Barbara Public Market.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**E. 924 GARDEN ST B****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-030
 Application Number: MST2014-00336
 Owner: Madeline Stuart
 Applicant: Jarrett Gorin

(Proposal to add one new window, remove one window and add a new exterior light fixture to an existing, one-story, single-family residence. Site alterations include replacing an existing wood fence and construction of a new 8-foot tall, 22 linear foot masonry wall with stucco finish, and two new entry gates. The proposal will include the demolition of an existing 80 square foot garden shed. This residence is a designated City Landmark: "El Caserío.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with comments:

1. Provide more elevations from the southeast and northwest.
2. Simplify curves on the wall leading to steps.
3. Provide details of the wall, the top of fireplace and sconce.
4. Provide window detail.

NEW ITEM**F. 1235 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-161-002
 Application Number: MST2014-00347
 Owner: Russian Nazarene Church - Holy Resurrection

(Proposal to repaint the existing church with new building and trim colors. The building is listed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and on the State Historic Resources Inventory: "Holy Resurrection; Russian Nazarene Church.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on plans with the following color palette:

1. Cupola shall be "Glorious Gold" # 300B-6.
2. Trim shall be "New Brick" # S-H-200 and "Pine Grove" # 460B-7.
3. Body shall be "Weathered Sandstone" # 290E-1.

NEW ITEM**G. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
Application Number: MST2014-00351
Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
Applicant: Gary Robinson

(Proposal to reroof two buildings at the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. The reroof will occur on two existing flat roof buildings and will be replaced with a new sprayed polyurethane foam roofing material. The Museum of Natural History is a designated Structure of Merit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**H. 21 W MONTECITO ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-005
Application Number: MST2014-00352
Owner: Paul Uyesaka
Architect: Thomas Ochsner

(Proposal for site alterations to include new outdoor dining, a revised pedestrian walkway, a new parking plan with five proposed parking spaces, a new trash enclosure, and addition of plantings (trumpet vines) located on the existing perimeter fencing. This proposal does not involve any exterior alterations to the existing building. The building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. The outdoor dining/patio furniture shall be either black, dark green or dark brown; white is not acceptable.
2. It was noted that no new exterior lighting was approved as part of this application.

NEW ITEM**I. 815 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-008
Application Number: MST2014-00298
Owner: Mark J. Melchiori
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal for site alterations and an interior remodel to an existing two-story building. The proposed site alterations includes demolishing an "as-built" shed, and requesting to permit the "as-built" reconfiguration of the parking lot, "as-built" permeable pavers, an "as-built" air conditioning unit, and new site landscaping. The proposal will address zoning violations identified within enforcement case ENF2013-01234 and Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00158. "As-built" interior alterations converted the original mixed-use building to an exclusive residential use, with seven residential units (eliminating the commercial units and adding one illegal residential unit). The proposal will involve interior alterations to return the building configuration back to the last legal use of three commercial and three residential units. An existing, detached, two-car garage, with an attached accessory building, and a detached accessory building at the rear of the parcel will remain. The building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was found to be eligible for designation as a City Landmark.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Provide a 24" box tee in the lawn area to the north of the building.
2. Provide four 15-gallon trees in the parking lot perimeter planters.

NEW ITEM**J. 1554 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-183-011
Application Number: MST2014-00260
Owner: Fred J. Krupica
Contractor: Paragon Builders

(Proposal to construct a new 35 linear foot CMU and stone veneer site wall with a maximum of 8'-7" in height. The proposal also includes replacing the existing wrought iron railing with new glass panels at the deck above the existing two-car garage, and adding two new water fountain features at the existing lawn area. No alterations are proposed to the existing two-story, single-family residence. The parcel is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was found eligible for designation as a Structure of Merit in the Lower Riviera Survey.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Agenda with comments:

1. The fountain is acceptable.
2. Place the proposed new wall behind the existing stone wall and retain the existing stone wall.
3. The new wall should be a plaster finish to match the residence.
4. Adding glass sound panels to be placed within the existing wrought iron frame, at the deck above the attached two-car garage, is acceptable.
5. Provide sections and details of the existing (possibly as-built) site walls in front.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 P.M. ****