



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 18, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:34 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger (until 1:45 p.m.; again at 1:47 p.m. until 4:30 p.m.), Sharpe (until 4:30 and again at 4:34 p.m.), Suding (until 4:30 and again at 4:35 p.m.), and Winick.

Staff present: Hernández, Bedard and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 4, 2014, with corrections.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 5/0/4. (La Voie/Murray/Orías/Suding abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernández announced that on June 10, 2014, the City Council held a hearing and adopted resolutions to designate three buildings as City Landmarks: The Santa Barbara Club, The Masonic Temple and The Unitarian Church.

Appreciation was expressed for the property owners' support of designation and their stewardship.

2. Commissioner Drury announced he would be leaving by 5:00 p.m.
3. Commissioner Orías requested a discussion regarding lighting on roof tops.
4. Commissioner Orías thanked Ms. Hernández with respect to the follow-up work on the Lower Riviera Stone Pier and Cap Walls (formerly referred to as the Altar Rail Walls). They will now be protected to the extent possible.
5. Commissioner La Voie announced he was appointed to the City of Palm Springs Historic Sites Preservation Board.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **505 E LOS OLIVOS ST** E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-150-009

Application Number: MST2013-00248

Owner: St. Mary's Retreat House

(Proposal for a new 19'-3" tall cross to be erected in the lawn area. This cross will be relocated from Mount Calvary. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mission Hill, St. Mary's Retreat House, aka Dial Residence.")

(Review of Phase 3 Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: David Stone, Archaeological Consultant
Susette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects

Staff comments: Michelle Bedard, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. Further, the authors addressed all previous comments of the earlier draft.

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern that moving the cross would have an impact on the two adjacent properties' cultural landscape.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with appreciation expressed for the report preparer's thoroughness.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. **2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00116
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Engineer: Flowers & Associates

(Proposed Master Plan for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History to carry out the following improvements anticipated in the next 15 years: improved accessibility and ADA compliance; full renovations to the Marine Paleo Exhibit Hall and restrooms, including an 82 square foot addition; replacement of the butterfly exhibit; rehabilitation of Gould Hall; relocation of trash and recycling; new fencing; enhancements to existing outdoor activity areas; landscape improvements; native habitat restoration; mechanical equipment upgrades; and interior repairs to existing buildings. The project includes Planning Commission review and annexation of parcels 023-250-039, -066, and -068.)

(Review of Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Ann M. Munns and Leeann G. Haslouer of Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Actual time: 1:55 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, Senior Planner, SEPPS
 Ann Munns, Archaeological Consultant

Staff comments: Michelle Bedard, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. However, he added that the redeposited human remains southeast of the Education Center ought to be formally recorded as an archaeological site so that a permanent record of their existence is on file at the Central Coast Information Center. As it is, information about the location of these remains exists only in the memories of certain museum personnel, and their existence again will be lost once these people retire.

Motion: To accept the report as presented and appreciation was expressed for the archaeological consultants' sensitivity with respect to the remains found.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 22 W PADRE ST**

E-3 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-241-016
Application Number: MST2014-00255
Owner: Peter Becker & Julie Nakagama
Architect: Peter Becker Architect
Engineer: Ashley-Vance

(Proposal to construct a new, 452 square foot, second floor addition to an existing, one-story, 1,176 square foot, single-family residence. The proposal includes a new 51 square foot, uncovered balcony. No alterations are proposed to the existing, 302 square foot, legal non-conforming, two-car garage. The proposed total of 1,930 square feet, located on a 5,046 square foot lot, is 79% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Recommendation to consider adding the vernacular English Cottage house, constructed in 1930, to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Peter Becker, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that, constructed in 1930, the English Vernacular house retains all the original materials on the front elevation. The house retains a high degree of integrity and conveys its original appearance. The house is eligible as a Structure of Merit for its architectural style.

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To place the property located at 22 W. Padre Street on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for Structure of Merit status.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Staff note: Placing the property on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources will give the HLC purview of the project's design review. Pursuit of Structure of Merit designation will be evaluated by the HLC Designations Subcommittee.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 22 W PADRE ST**

E-3 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-241-016
 Application Number: MST2014-00255
 Owner: Peter Becker & Julie Nakagama
 Architect: Peter Becker Architect
 Engineer: Ashley-Vance

(Proposal to construct a new, 452 square foot, second floor addition to an existing, one-story, 1,176 square foot, single-family residence. The proposal includes a new 51 square foot, uncovered balcony. No alterations are proposed to the existing, 302 square foot, legal non-conforming, two-car garage. The proposed total of 1,930 square feet, located on a 5,046 square foot lot, is 79% of the maximum required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The residence is proposed to be added to the City's Potential Historic Resource List.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:06 p.m.

Present: Peter Becker, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has evaluated the proposed addition and found that the proposal meets the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines and City Standards. An Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR) is not necessary at this time as the proposed addition of the dormers do not have a negative impact to the potential historic significance as it meets the evaluation design guidelines. The project, therefore, may qualify for a categorical exemption if the Commission agrees with Staff's evaluation and conclusions. Should the project significantly change, the preparation of an HSSR may be required.

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether the addition of a dormer in the front would significantly change the established streetscape.

Public comment closed at 2:10 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with comments:

1. The applicant was commended for the artful way of preserving the reduced mass of the building while still meeting the current need of additional space.
2. The design does not detract from the home's historic interpretation and complies with all City Regulations.
3. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and found that the project is consistent with the required Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings (per SBMC §22.69.050) as follows:
 - a. **Consistency and Appearance:** The proposed development is consistent with the architectural character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. **Compatibility:** The proposed development is consistent with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk and scale are appropriate to the site and the surrounding neighborhood.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 100 BLK E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST 1571 SEG ID**

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-571
 Application Number: MST2014-00282
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Peter Brown

(Proposal to revise the street vehicle parking configuration, located within the 100 Block of East Cañón Perdido Street, for the purpose of adding a new bicycle corral to provide 14 new bicycle parking spaces. The bicycle corral will be 39-feet long by 7-feet wide and is proposed in the location of two existing vehicle parking spaces. The proposal involves extending the green painted curb 7.5-feet into the existing red zone, towards Santa Barbara Street, to provide one new automobile parking space (overall net loss of one vehicle parking space).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:33 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner
 Peter Brown, Associate Transportation Planner
 Laura Yanez, Project Engineer
 Katherine Klein, Outreach Coordinator

Public comment opened at 2:41 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on whether the proposed corral would distract from El Presidio.

Chair Suding acknowledged the receipt of a letter from businesses expressing support for in-street bike racks at the proposed location, including the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation.

Public comment closed at 2:43 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The concept of bicycle corrals is supportable.
2. Consider other locations with a less sensitive historic context.
3. Since this is a pilot program, permanent elements mounted on the street is of concern.
4. Return with a design that is consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines and that softens the impact on surrounding historic resources.
5. Racks should be more artistic with a traditional design, including color and materials.
6. A simple solution subservient to the surrounding architecture may be more appropriate.
7. An option similar to the pots on either end of the corral as shown in the Queens, NY example would be more supportable as it is simple and uncluttered.
8. Study the layout to avoid reduction of parking spaces.

Action: Mahan/Winick, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Commission comments: The design should be sensitive to Santa Barbara's intent to avoid assimilating to major metropolitan urbanized areas. A location with a street 'indentation', not within the flow of vehicular traffic on the street, would make it obvious that it is meant for bicycle parking and safer for bicycle users while mounting and dismounting.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:19 PM TO 3:27 PM ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 40 E ANAPAMU ST

C-2 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
 Application Number: MST2011-00428
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Irene Macias, Library Director
 Landscape Architect: Campbell & Campbell
 Business Name: Central Library

(Proposal to upgrade both landscape and hardscape areas in the plaza and around the perimeter of the Santa Barbara Public Library and the Faulkner Gallery. The improvements would include approximately 3,200 square feet of additional hardscape, 750 cubic yards of imported fill, a reduction in turf area, and a reduction in total trees from 75 to 56, a new water feature, artwork display areas, lighting, and an approximately 4,500 square foot activity space. An ADA-compliant access would be added to the south Library entrance and all other hardscape, both new and existing, would be ADA compliant. No changes to the buildings are proposed. The Central Library building, constructed in 1917, the Faulkner Gallery, constructed in 1931, and five Eucalyptus Citriodora trees planted in 1931 are designated City Landmarks. Also, the Central Library is listed on the State Historic Resources Inventory.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. The project requires Findings for Tree Removal pursuant to SBMC § 15.24.090. The project was last reviewed on February 12, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:27 p.m.

Present: Scott Love, Central Library Services Manager
 Regula Campbell, Principal Architect, Campbell & Campbell
 Douglas Campbell, Landscape Architect, Campbell & Campbell
 Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Public comment opened at 3:54 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke in support and commented the proposal solves all previous problems. He suggested adding a species of tree in the area between the plaza and blank museum east elevation wall.

Eric Kelley, Owner of The Book Den, spoke in support of the design and commented that spaces like these are very important to the community. The changes to traffic flow are important. The nearby parking makes it a desirable location. Knowing where the Library entrance is located will make it easier to direct people.

Eik Kahng, Santa Barbara Museum of Art Chief Curator, spoke in support and commented on the openness of the design that will enhance community interaction and audience experience. The new transformer above ground is appreciated. The use of plantings will not interfere with the museum's eastern wall night time entertainment.

Lea Williams, local resident, spoke in support and commented she was impressed with the changes in the walkways and the functional ADA compliance. She appreciates that the junipers will no longer block the gorgeous architectural features. The openness will be an asset to the community.

Chair Suding read comments from Elizabeth Bowman, Friends of the Library, in support of the project. There is keen interest in the library's safety and accessibility as well as it being welcoming and providing needed space for popular programs. She felt the proposal accomplishes those objectives.

Public comment closed at 4:00 p.m.

Motion: **To table a decision until after the review of the proposal for the Santa Barbara Museum of Art.**

Action: Orías/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Shallanberger/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

(Actual time item was untabled at 5:29 p.m.)

Motion: **Project Design Approval with the following comments and conditions:**

1. Appreciation was expressed for the applicant's response to previous comments and for the design, specially the openness and fountain restoration; and in particular the emphasis to the historic entrance to the Library and Faulkner Gallery.
2. Restudy the light fixtures to look less oriental and more Hispanic.
3. Restudy the lantern located at the plaza towards the museum. It was suggested that it be larger than the other lanterns.
4. Add a step wall at the all-access ramp on the south elevation of the library, placing the rail on the back side of the wall.
5. Continue studying the paving material. Provide a color rendering representing the materials.
6. Consider using flagstone versus sandstone for paving.
7. Provide either a location at another site where they have been installed or a mock-up of the proposed step stone permeable pavers.
8. The color of the Step Stone Pavers should be consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District colors.
9. Study the placement and type of trunk (multi versus single) of the kentia palms. Perhaps different height palms would be a good solution.
10. Tree removal findings are made based on the principal of good forest management and will best be served by the proposed removal. The removal will potentially enhance the viability of the existing oak trees. A reasonable and practical development of the property requires such removal.
11. More informal planting with elements of taller scale shall be installed along the east side facing the art museum. The installation that allows placement of art on the major access of the plan should be more like the existing pattern and shall allow the potential use of the wall as a movie screen.
12. It was suggested that the library and museum work together in terms of the cost of enhancing the landscaping at the east elevation, including trees.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 1130 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-020
 Application Number: MST2013-00237
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Kupiec Architects
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Art

(Proposed addition and alterations to the Santa Barbara Museum of Art consisting of a 7,444 net square foot one- and two-story addition (primarily within the existing building volume) and the renovation of an existing two-story 64,510 net square foot building. Also proposed is a new approximately 1,420 unenclosed square feet public rooftop pavilion, garden and terrace area with associated access elevator and stairway and new art receiving facility adding 670 square feet to the building footprint. Miscellaneous site structure demolition will occur to support implementation of the proposed design. The net new square feet of new floor area will result in 71,954 square feet of development. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Santa Barbara Museum of Art.")

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. The project was last reviewed on June 4, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Robert Kupiec, Kupiec Architects PC
 Marck Aguilar, Project Planner

Commissioners Murray, Orías, and Suding stated they reviewed the previous meeting minutes for this proposal and were familiar enough to comment on the project.

Public comment opened at 4:45 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, suggested either a clump of kentia palm trees or a different type of plant that might grow taller at the location of the proposed movie screen wall. He questioned whether the Lockwood de Forest plant list includes the use of natal (kiefer) plums. He commented the elevator tower for the roof garden is problematic and suggested it be simply a tower rather than an elevator tower.

Scott Love, Central Library Services Manager, spoke in support and commented on the collaboration between the museum and the library.

Public comment closed at 4:48 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:**
1. **Design:**
 - a. Provide a plan of the truck turning radii on Anapamu Street into and out of the ARF loading area.
 - b. Study the door material on the ARF loading area. Although wood plank doors are classic, perhaps there is a metal solution that is more sophisticated.
 - c. Start to show the roof top terrace lighting on the plans.
 - d. Show a comprehensive proposal of the roof top terrace elevator.
 - e. The same height cornice at the connection of the Sterling Morton Gallery to the tower is preferred (as shown on Page 7, top simulation).
 - f. Study the vent on the tower to be less prominent.
 - g. Option 2 on Sheet 6 is the preferred treatment of the tower where it meets the roof behind.
 - h. The blank wall on the east elevation could become a lost opportunity to do something wonderful. It should be softened with landscaping or an art element, such as a sculpture.
 - i. It was suggested that the library and museum work together in terms of the cost of enhancing the landscaping at the east elevation, including trees.
 2. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and renewed the Compatibility Analysis Criteria previously found to have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. **Compliance:** The project is generally in compliance with the City Charter and Municipal Code and in general compliance with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines.
 - b. **Compatibility:** The project's design is compatible with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood.
 - c. **Appropriateness:** The project's size, bulk, height and scale design are appropriate for its neighborhood with some reservations for the elevator tower and how the ARF loading area is accessed from the street.
 - d. **Sensitivity:** The project's design is sensitive to adjacent landmarks and historic resources.
 - e. **Public views:** The proposed design does not affect public views of the ocean and mountains.
 - f. **Open Space/Landscaping:** The proposed design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscape.
- Action:** Winick/Mahan, 6/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 34 W VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
 Application Number: MST2009-00266
 Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
 Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (formerly Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 26,538 square feet of commercial/retail space, 37 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 81 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height.)

(Review After Final for proposal to screen the roof top mechanical equipment with potted plantings.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**B. 728 STATE ST B C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-025
 Application Number: MST2014-00266
 Owner: 728 State Moreau Limited Partnership
 Engineer: Windward Engineering

(Proposal for minor interior remodel and facade alteration to include window and door alterations and modify the interior finished floor elevations in order to comply with ADA requirements. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-01144. A Public Works encroachment permit for a new outdoor dining area and furniture is proposed under a separate application (PBW2014-00605).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 621 ANACAPA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-036
 Application Number: MST2014-00284
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studios

(Proposal to install new 30-inch tail guardrails to be on top of an existing 18-inch stone wall located around the existing planter and to connect to the existing railing at the stairs for City Parking Lot #10.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.