



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 9, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Mahan, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.
Members absent: Shallanberger
Planning Commission
Member present: Thompson
Staff present: Limón (until 2:07 p.m. and again at 2:59 p.m.), Hernández, Bedard, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Wanda Livernois, Brinkerhoff Landmark District resident, expressed concern with the cinderblock wall being built at the 720 De La Vina Street, a mixed-use development, and how it may affect the adjacent residential properties.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 26, 2014, with amendments.

Action: Drury/Winick, 7/0/1. (Sharpe abstained. Suding abstained from Items 6, 7 & 8. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Murray/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Bedard announced that Chair Suding would be stepping down from Item 2, 35 State Street.
2. Mr. Limón announced that Staff presented the idea to other boards of having half-size plans for review of projects as proposed by the HLC at a previous meeting. He related the board members' concerns. Chair Suding highlighted that the less paper would be used and the cost lowered. Although half-sheets are often difficult to see, the Commission agreed that three half sheet sets and one large sheet set would be an improvement during HLC design review hearings.
3. Commissioner Drury announced he would be leaving by 5:00 p.m.
4. Commissioner Murray announced she would not be attending the next HLC meeting.
5. Ms. Bedard announced that Commissioner Shallenberger would be absent today.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported on the La Entrada de Santa Bárbara *Ad hoc* Subcommittee meeting that was held on Wednesday, April 2, 2014.

Mr. Limón reported on a ground sign, located at the corner of Mission and State Streets, proposed to sit nine feet above the existing planter/sidewalk. The Commission requested Full Commission review.

Commissioner Murray reported on the Designation Subcommittee.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**1. 525 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-002
Application Number: MST2014-00072
Owner: John R. Lindgren
Architect: AB Design Studio
Business Name: Baja Sharkeez

(Proposal to construct a new shed structure of 180 square feet in size, and remove the two "as-built" shed structures located at the rear of the existing commercial building. There is an existing 3,710 square foot restaurant/bar on the 5,000 square foot parcel located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. This project will address violations in Enforcement Case ENF2013-01292.)

(Project Design and Final Approval requested. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

Time: 2:05 p.m.

Present: Glen Deisler, Project Manager, AB Design Studio
Aramis Arciga, Designer, AB Design Studio

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. The approval is valid provided the wood fence was approved under a separate application and a building permit was issued.
2. Consider pitching the roof in the other direction to abate water damage.
3. Add a gutter to the eave to control water.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 6/2/0. (Drury/La Voie opposed. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period was announced.

This item was reopened at 2:34 p.m.

Motion: CEQA Findings were made: The Historic Landmarks Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA certificate of determination on file for this project.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 6/2/0. (Drury/La Voie opposed. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**2. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
 Business Name: Entrada de Santa Bárbara

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(In-progress review for Area B, for proposed revisions to the south building (south elevation) and for the relocation of two hotel rooms. A Substantial Conformance Determination was issued by the City Administrator on June 27, 2013. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103. The project received Project Design Approval on August 14, 2013, and was last reviewed on March 12, 2014.)

Time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Melissa Cinarli Turner, Project Manager, DesignARC
 Mark Shields, Senior Designer, DesignARC
 James Jones, Owner Representative
 Allison DeBusk, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Great enthusiasm for this project was expressed.
2. The Commission accepted the recommendations of the Entrada de Santa Bárbara *Ad hoc* Subcommittee with respect to approved revisions to the second floor south element of the building in Area B.
3. The *paseo* entrance to State Street is greatly improved and appreciated.
4. The shape of the fountain should not be square.
5. Consider infilling the railing panel above the central arch with a solid panel at the lower level of the south elevation.
6. Consider the addition of two chimneys to the roof in a random pattern to break the long roof line.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**3. MISSION CREEK****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-012
 Application Number: MST2008-00360
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Ilasin, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jon Frye, Flood Control Engineering Manager, County of Santa Barbara
 (Proposal to widen Mission Creek between Cabrillo Boulevard and Highway 101 and replace existing bridges. This is part of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. Bridges to be reviewed under separate Master Applications. Reach 1A (phase 1) creek widening between Cabrillo Boulevard and W. Mason Street has been constructed. Reach 1B, located between W. Mason Street and W. Yanonali Street, includes creek widening, new channel walls, an expanded habitat zone, rip-rap revetment, ornamental fencing, and landscaping. Changes to the 115 and 135 Kimberly Avenue parcel include a reduction in the number of parking spaces from nine to six and the construction of a new ADA ramp.)

(Request for Final Approval for Reach 1B. Vegetation removal portion received Final Approval on January 29, 2014. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 036-08. Overall Reach 1B project was last reviewed on July 31, 2013.)

Time: 2:35 p.m.

Chair Suding disclosed that he met with Creeks Division staff three weeks ago and reviewed some of the plans in advance of the hearing.

Present: Linda Sumansky, Principal Engineer
 John Ilasin, Project Engineer
 David Black, Landscape Architect
 Matt Griffin, County Flood Control
 Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the building's function, questioned why it needs to be removed, and suggested additional Sycamore trees be planted.

Public comment closed at 2:54 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of Reach 1B with comments:

1. At least one Sycamore tree shall be added to off-set the loss of vegetation below the bridge.
2. The Sycamores shall not be spaced evenly in order to create a more natural planting plan.
3. The Sycamore trees shall be increased to a minimum of 15-gallon containers.
4. The base of the handrail post shall be galvanized instead of painted so that it blends with the concrete and to avoid rusting.
5. Staff has found the project in compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 036-08.

Action: Winick/Sharpe, 6/0/2. (Mahan/Murray abstained. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

The ten day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:06 PM TO 3:13 PM ****

TRAINING/DISCUSSION ITEM

4. PRESERVATION FOUNDATION WORKSHOP

(3:00) Application Number: MST2014-00211

Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor

(Training and debriefing on California Preservation Foundation Workshop on two subjects: 1) Integrity: Landscapes, Districts and Buildings. 2) California Historical Building Code.)

Time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m. and reopened at 4:07 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on making the report available about the Los Angeles Marconi wireless station site report. He also mentioned the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden is carrying out the restoration of the original design as described in the Cultural Landscape Report that was prepared. He inquired whether the Alice Keck Park could be designated as a City Landmark.

Public comment closed at 3:45 p.m. and reclosed at 4:08 p.m.

Training/discussion held.

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00)

REFERRED FROM FULL COMMISSION

A. 25 E MASON ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-014

Application Number: MST2014-00029

Owner: East Mason SB, LLC

Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for tenant improvements to an existing three-story building for offices and lab facilities. Project consists of window and doors changes, new trash enclosure, EV charging, landscape alterations and exterior site improvements, and reconfiguration to the parking lot including a new fence. No new square footage is proposed. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is eligible for listing on the California Register of Historic Properties.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on January 28, 2014. Project was last reviewed on March 26, 2014.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A9.01 (#2 railing detail).

REFERRED FROM FULL COMMISSION**B. 900 CHANNEL DR**

R-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
Application Number: MST2011-00246
Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
Applicant: Tricia Knight
Architect: SAC Wireless

(Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 50 foot tall tower pole structure and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower inside a monopole. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification. This parcel contains a City Landmark: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain.")

(Final Approval requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 016-13. Project Design Approval was granted on March 12, 2014.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**C. 101 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-004
Application Number: MST2014-00081
Owner: Anthony Schirillo
Architect: Studio 1030 Architects
Business: FisHouse

(Proposal to construct a new 345 square foot trellis for an existing restaurant. The trellis will be located on the western side of the building at an existing outdoor patio area. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and to return to Consent with comments:

1. The proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with el Pueblo Viejo Guidelines or the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance.
2. Provide an increase in the width of the beam and other trellis materials.
3. The continued use of umbrellas is appreciated.

NEW ITEM**D. 500 BLK E LOS OLIVOS ST & ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA, NEAR MISSION SANTA BARBARA**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-000-404 (near 025-273-002)

Application Number: MST2014-00160

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Parks and Recreation Department

Presenter: Tim Downey, Urban Forest Superintendent

(Proposal for review of the placement of a new dedication memorial plaque honoring Huell Howser for placement at the base of the Cota Street Sycamore tree. The tree is a designated historic tree.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Of the two options presented, the preferred location is the south side of the tree.
2. The plaque shall be placed a minimum of 2.5' from the visible aqueduct and mounted on a rod that is in a location that will not impact the aqueduct or tree roots.
3. In the future, it would be appreciated if there was a greater amount of time to review prior to installation.

NEW ITEM**E. 215 E FIGUEROA ST****R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-037

Application Number: MST2014-00139

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Architect: KBZ Architects

(Proposal for construction of three new automatic vehicular security gates, new fencing, associated electrical improvements, and minor landscape alterations.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with condition:

1. The Anapamu and Figueroa Streets frontage gates, fencing and landscaping are acceptable as proposed.
2. The Figueroa Street frontage shall have the existing chain link fence replaced along both the east and west properties to match the fence materials at the adjacent residence (to the east). The distance shall be 27' on the east property line and 34'-6" on the west property line.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 P.M. ****