



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 29, 2014 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
BARRY WINICK, *Vice-Chair*
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
BILL MAHAN
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
DONALD SHARPE

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Mahan, Murray, Shallanberger (at 1:38 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding (until 4:02 and again at 4:07 p.m.), and Winick.
Members absent: Drury, La Voie, and Orías.
Staff present: Hernández, Gantz and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Election of Vice-Chair for 2014.

Chair Suding opened nominations for office of Vice-Chair.

1. Nomination for Vice-Chair: **Winick**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Winick was elected as Vice-Chair.

B. Appointments to vacant Subcommittee positions.

Appointments were made to fill the following subcommittees:

1. **Visual Art in Public Places: Winick.** Alternate: Suding.
2. **Historic Resource Guidelines:** La Voie, Murray and Shallanberger

C. Public Comment:

No public comments.

D. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **January 29, 2014.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 15, 2014, with correction.

Action: Sharpe/Mahan, 5/0/1. (Winick abstained. Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

E. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item A, Mission Creek project, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Winick/Murray, 5/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Drury, La Voie and Orías would be absent from the meeting.
2. Commissioner Mahan announced he would be stepping down from Item 6 at 107 Jorgensen Lane.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT1. **1930 EMERSON AVE**

R-2 Zone

(1:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-401-015
 Application Number: MST2013-00522
 Owner: Leech, Jonathan V
 Architect: Wade Davis Design
 (Historic Structures Report for 1930 Emerson Avenue.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D. The original report, accepted by the Commission on Jan 15, 2014, found that the residence does not meet any of the City's criteria for historic or architectural significance. Additional analysis was requested for the existing masonry garage, steps and stone retaining wall.)

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Urban Historian reviewed the report and supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA.

Public comment opened at 1:43 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Mahan/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. LOWER RIVIERA

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-ORD-0ZO
Application Number: MST2013-00175
Staff: Nicole Hernández, City Urban Historian
(Proposal to update Potential List of Historic Resources and identify various Historic Districts.)

(Recommended actions: 1) Presentation and acceptance of Lower Riviera Survey Phases 2-3 results for "Area Two, Three, Four, and Five" of the Lower Riviera Historic Resource Survey completed by Post/Hazeltine Associates.; and 2) Consider properties identified as individually eligible as Structures of Merit or City Landmarks through the Lower Riviera Historic Resources Survey in Area 1 (43 Properties as per exhibit), Areas 2-3 (54 properties as per exhibit), Area 4 (18 properties as per exhibit); and Area 5 (44 properties as per exhibit).)

Actual time: 1:44 p.m.

Present: Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultant

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has been working closely with the HLC Survey Subcommittee and Post/Hazeltine Associates that conducted the Survey. All properties were to be found individually significant and the proposed historic district boundaries have been reviewed. Properties of owners who have called with concerns have been re-reviewed to confirm whether they still retain significance. Five of those properties initially recommended to be included on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources have been removed from the list.

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

Michael Marzolla, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concerns with a building that is being constructed within his neighborhood that is out of character and other issues.

Stephanie Morrett, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concern with same issues as Mr. Marzolla. [Staff responded that the property in construction has been investigated by City staff and complaints have been addressed. Further concerns can be voiced by contacting Nicole Hernández at NHernandez@SantaBarbaraCA.gov.]

Victor Schumacher, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concerns with a neighboring property at 414 Donze Avenue that was not included on the list, but has been rehabilitated recently by the owners. [Staff agreed to re-evaluate the property.]

Mary Louise Days, local historian, spoke on corrections needed to be made to the Lower Riviera Survey, such as street names, park names, and park backgrounds.

Monica Jones, property owner within proposed historic district, questioned why the adjacent property to hers at 431 E. Pedregosa Street has been determined to be conditionally eligible. She also asked for the advantages and disadvantages of a historic district.

Randy Fox, property owner within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, expressed concern that his property is already part of EPV and requested that those properties not be included in the newly proposed historic district. [The historical consultant responded that El Pueblo Viejo is a design district, not a historic district.]

Wyman Bradbury, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concerns with a property that has a mixed architectural style located at 421 Montgomery, 419 and 419 ½ Montgomery. He questioned the limitations the owner would have in future construction if the properties were to be included on the Potential Historic Resources List.

Betsy Ingles, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concerns with restrictions placed at the property located at 1408 Grant Avenue, the property losing value, and loss of privacy.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of letters from Ken Guest and Royd Handlemen.

Public comment closed at 2:18 p.m.

Commissioner Murray stated that the Survey Subcommittee will reconsider the properties addressed during public comment.

Motion: To accept Staff’s recommendation to:

1. Accept the Lower Riviera Survey Phases 2-3 results for Areas 2-5 by Post/Hazeltine Associates.
2. Place the individually eligible properties on the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources for the potential creation of the new Lower Riviera Historic District.

Action: Murray/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Sharpe abstained from Area 3. Winick abstained from Area 5. Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The following one-hundred fifty-four (154) properties, as recommended by the HLC Historic Surveys Subcommittee, **shall be included** on the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List:

Area 1 (42 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
1	1226 Alta Vista Rd	029-150-038	Individually Eligible
2	1415 Alta Vista Rd	029-033-011	Individually Eligible
3	1419 Alta Vista Rd	029-033-010	Individually Eligible
4	1423 Alta Vista Rd	029-033-009	Individually Eligible
5	1426 Alta Vista Rd	029-100-002	Individually Eligible
6	322 E Arrellaga St	027-251-004	Individually Eligible
7	326 E Arrellaga St	027-251-005	Individually Eligible
8	334 E Arrellaga St	027-251-007	Individually Eligible
9	434 E Arrellaga St	027-252-005	Individually Eligible
10	504 E Arrellaga St	027-760-001	Individually Eligible

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
11	508 E Arrellaga St	027-760-002	Individually Eligible
12	512 E Arrellaga St	027-760-003	Individually Eligible
13	627 Colina Ln	029-033-013	Individually Eligible
14	410 Donze Ave	029-133-003	Individually Eligible
15	415 Donze Ave	029-132-014	Individually Eligible
16	416 Donze Ave	029-133-005	Individually Eligible
17	417 Donze Ave	029-132-013	Individually Eligible
18	421 Donze Ave	029-132-011	Individually Eligible
19	432 Donze Ave	029-133-008	Individually Eligible
20	1514 Laguna St	027-252-037	Individually Eligible
21	1520 Laguna St	027-252-039	Individually Eligible
22	1524 Laguna St	027-252-042	Individually Eligible
23	416 E Micheltorena St	029-022-003	Individually Eligible
24	423 E Micheltorena St	027-252-031	Individually Eligible
25	431 E Micheltorena St	027-252-028	Individually Eligible
26	612 E Micheltorena St	029-033-003	Individually Eligible
27	1525 Olive St	027-252-007	Individually Eligible
28	1235 N Salsipuedes St	029-141-022	Individually Eligible
29	401 E Sola St	029-022-024	Individually Eligible
30	411 E Sola St	029-022-022	Individually Eligible
31	419 E Sola St	029-022-020	Individually Eligible
32	424 E Sola St	029-085-006	Individually Eligible
33	430 E Sola St	029-085-007	Individually Eligible
34	431 E Sola St	029-022-017	Individually Eligible
35	433 E Sola St	029-022-018	Individually Eligible
36	413 E Victoria St	029-085-017	Individually Eligible
37	414 E Victoria St	029-132-002	Individually Eligible
38	616 E Victoria St	029-450-001	Individually Eligible
39	702 E Victoria St	029-150-001	Individually Eligible
40	707 E Victoria St	029-100-016	Individually Eligible
41	712 E Victoria St	029-150-003	Individually Eligible
42	728 E Victoria St	029-150-006	Individually Eligible

Areas 2-3 (51 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
43	1438 Alameda Padre Serra	029-150-038	Individually Eligible
44	1445 Alameda Padre Serra	029-060-009	Individually Eligible
45	1507 Alameda Padre Serra	029-060-030	Individually Eligible
46	1520 Alameda Padre Serra	019-183-008	Individually Eligible
47	1538 Alameda Padre Serra	019-183-009	Individually Eligible
48	1554 Alameda Padre Serra	019-183-011	Individually Eligible
49	1923 Alameda Padre Serra	025-404-008	Individually Eligible
50	856 Arguello Rd	029-060-002	Individually Eligible

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
51	1918 Emerson Ave	025-401-013	Individually Eligible
52	1924 Emerson Ave	025-401-014	Individually Eligible
53	2000 Emerson Ave	025-401-003	Individually Eligible
54	1406 Grand Ave	029-042-017	Individually Eligible
55	1408 Grand Ave	029-042-018	Individually Eligible
56	1620 Grand Ave	027-153-048	Individually Eligible
57	1630 Grand Ave	027-153-047	Individually Eligible
58	1640 Grand Ave	027-153-043	Individually Eligible
59	1723 Grand Ave	027-141-014	Individually Eligible
60	1740 Grand Ave	027-153-037	Individually Eligible
61	1746 Grand Ave	027-153-038	Individually Eligible
62	2010 Grand Ave	025-346-015	Individually Eligible
63	512 E. Islay St	027-064-005	Individually Eligible
64	802 Jimeno Rd	029-042-001	Individually Eligible
65	825 Jimeno Rd	029-051-014	Individually Eligible
66	854 Jimeno Rd	029-042-005	Individually Eligible
67	860 Jimeno Rd	029-110-037	Individually Eligible
68	885 Jimeno Rd	029-051-012	Individually Eligible
69	925 Jimeno Rd	029-051-010	Individually Eligible
70	1616 Loma St	027-152-016	Individually Eligible
71	1622 Loma St	027-152-018	Individually Eligible
72	1650 Loma St	027-152-025	Individually Eligible
73	1709 Loma St	027-153-009	Individually Eligible
74	1723 Loma St	027-153-045	Individually Eligible
75	1727 Loma St	027-153-046	Individually Eligible
76	1733 Loma St	027-153-005	Individually Eligible
77	1808 Loma St	027-071-007	Individually Eligible
78	1811 Loma St	027-072-006	Individually Eligible
79	1828 Loma St	027-071-012	Individually Eligible
80	645 E. Micheltorena St	029-041-004	Individually Eligible
81	703 E. Micheltorena St	029-042-012	Individually Eligible
82	731 E. Micheltorena St	029-042-009	Individually Eligible
83	804 Moreno Rd	027-151-001	Individually Eligible
84	817 Moreno Rd	027-071-003	Individually Eligible
85	820 Moreno Rd	027-151-003	Individually Eligible
86	834 Moreno Rd	027-151-005	Individually Eligible
87	1736 Olive Ave	027-064-002	Individually Eligible
88	1740 Olive Ave	027-064-011	Individually Eligible
89	1560 Oramas Rd	029-060-015	Individually Eligible
90	1585 Oramas Rd	029-151-004	Individually Eligible
91	1600 Oramas Rd	029-060-023	Individually Eligible
92	1637 Oramas Rd	027-152-005	Individually Eligible
93	634 Sierra St	025-404-007	Individually Eligible

Areas 4 (18 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
94	527 E Micheltorena St	027-260-019	Individually Eligible
95	800 E Micheltorena St	029-100-026	Individually Eligible
96	1232 N Nopal St	029-150-033	Individually Eligible
97	1238 N Nopal St	029-150-009	Individually Eligible
98	1218 Olive St	029-140-017	Individually Eligible
99	518 E Pedregosa St	027-062-012	Individually Eligible
100	519 E Pedregosa St	027-401-008	Individually Eligible
101	814 E Pedregosa St	027-071-015	Individually Eligible
102	1739 Prospect Ave	027-142-006	Individually Eligible
103	1744 Prospect Ave	027-141-028	Individually Eligible
104	1748 Prospect Ave & A	027-141-030	Individually Eligible
105	1774 Prospect Ave	027-061-013	Individually Eligible
106	1814 Prospect Ave	027-062-006	Individually Eligible
107	610 Sierra St	025-404-002	Individually Eligible
108	618 Sierra St	025-404-006	Individually Eligible
109	510 E Valerio St	027-132-002	Individually Eligible
110	612 E Valerio St	027-270-002	Individually Eligible
111	615 E Valerio St	027-142-009	Individually Eligible

Areas 5 (43 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
112	958 Alameda Padre Serra	019-242-015	Individually Eligible
113	1014 Alameda Padre Serra	019-242-017	Individually Eligible
114	1019 Alameda Padre Serra	029-341-003	Individually Eligible
115	1102 Alameda Padre Serra	019-242-006	Individually Eligible
116	1120 Alameda Padre Serra	019-242-023	Individually Eligible
117	1334 Alameda Padre Serra	019-201-011	Individually Eligible
118	2207 Alameda Padre Serra	025-281-033	Individually Eligible
119	975 Carrillo Rd	029-322-007	Individually Eligible
120	1311 E De La Guerra Rd	031-141-008	Individually Eligible
121	822 De La Guerra Terrace	031-071-016	Individually Eligible
122	825 De La Guerra Terrace	031-071-009	Individually Eligible
123	830 De La Guerra Terrace	031-071-015	Individually Eligible
124	1002 East St	029-323-005	Individually Eligible
125	1015 East St	029-322-004	Individually Eligible
126	1016 East St	029-323-003	Individually Eligible
127	1020 East St	029-201-005	Individually Eligible
128	1138 Ferrelo Rd	029-321-001	Individually Eligible
129	1221 Ferrelo Rd	029-271-012	Individually Eligible
130	1234 Ferrelo Rd	029-342-018	Individually Eligible
131	1240 Ferrelo Rd	029-342-009	Individually Eligible
132	1246 Ferrelo Rd	029-342-010	Individually Eligible

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
133	1255 Ferrelo Rd	029-271-010	Individually Eligible
134	1256 Ferrelo Rd	029-342-012	Individually Eligible
135	1277 Ferrelo Rd	029-271-005	Individually Eligible
136	918 Garcia Rd	029-252-003	Individually Eligible
137	930 Garcia Rd	029-252-005	Individually Eligible
138	941 Garcia Rd	029-202-009	Individually Eligible
139	946 Garcia Rd	029-262-001	Individually Eligible
140	975 Garcia Rd	029-202-005	Individually Eligible
141	1036 Garcia Rd	029-271-001	Individually Eligible
142	1086 Garcia Rd	029-283-009	Individually Eligible
143	1095 Garcia Rd	029-282-011	Individually Eligible
144	1101 Garcia Rd	029-282-010	Individually Eligible
145	1132 Garcia Rd	029-283-003	Individually Eligible
146	1609 Laguna St	027-201-010	Individually Eligible
147	1615 Laguna St	027-201-010	Individually Eligible
148	1718 Loma St	027-152-001	Individually Eligible
149	1040 N Milpas St	019-242-020	Individually Eligible
150	1110 N Milpas St	029-202-024	Individually Eligible
151	870 Paseo Ferrelo	029-272-004	Individually Eligible
152	878 Paseo Ferrelo	029-272-001	Individually Eligible
153	907 Roble Ln	019-252-007	Individually Eligible
154	25 Rubio Rd	029-341-013	Individually Eligible

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. PROPOSED HISTORIC DISTRICTS

(2:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 099-ORD-0ZO

Application Number: MST2013-00175

Staff: Nicole Hernández, City Urban Historian

(Proposal to update Potential List of Historic Resources and identify various Historic Districts.)

(Recommended actions: 1) Mission Gardens: a) Consider and accept proposed Mission Gardens Historic District and Boundaries; and b) Consider properties identified as contributing structures within the proposed Mission Gardens Historic District, as per exhibit, to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. 2) Plaza Bonita: a) Consider and accept proposed Plaza Bonita Historic District and Boundaries; and b) Consider properties identified as contributing structures within the proposed Plaza Bonita Historic District, as per exhibit, to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultant

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the Survey identified two potential historic districts in Area 2 of the Lower Riviera. This is the first step in establishing the historic districts. The property owners have been notified of the Survey, the identified potential historic districts, and the individually significant properties. Once the contributing buildings are added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources, Staff will propose a new ordinance for review by the City Council's Ordinance Committee to establish the final criteria and logistics of historic districts. The final decision as to the creation of a new historic district ordinance will be made by the City Council.

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m. and reopened at 2:52 p.m.

Richard Warren, property owner of 2024 Grand Avenue, requested an extension for the review of his property due to the changes made to the outside.

Mary Louise Days, local historian, pointed out that the Plaza Rubio street properties (located within the proposed Mission Gardens Historic District) are within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and the architectural guidelines would pertain primarily to that street. She also stated that corrections should be made to the summary, DPR forms, and references. She expressed support for the creation of the Plaza Bonita Historic District.

Randy Fox, property owner within proposed historic district, expressed concern that his property is located within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District that is already in place protecting Plaza Rubio with its own distinct architecture. He requested that the Plaza Rubio street not be "lumped" within a historic district with a different architectural style.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Moorea Warren.

Betsy Calson, historical consultant, expressed support for the creation of historic districts.

Public comment closed at 2:42 p.m. and reclosed at 2:53 p.m.

The historical consultant responded to public comment by explaining that changing the boundaries to not include Plaza Rubio would lessen the ability of the district to convey the story of how the Lower Riviera developed over the period between the last quarter of the 19th century to the 1940s. EPV is not a historic district, but rather a design review district that does not have a list of contributing and non-contributing properties within it. It was initially created to allow the City to review changes to buildings to make sure the historic character of Santa Barbara was not diminished.

Commissioner Murray reiterated the advantages to individual properties by the creation of historic districts as mentioned in the *Historic Districts Most Frequently Asked Questions* document that was provided to the public at the Potential Historic District Workshops held on January 29, 2014.

Motion: **To accept Staff's recommendation to:**

1. Accept proposed Mission Gardens Historic District and Boundaries; and place the following structures on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources for the potential creation of the new Plaza Bonita Historic District.
2. Accept proposed Plaza Bonita Historic District and Boundaries; and place the following structures on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources for the potential creation of the new Plaza Bonita Historic District.
3. The review of the property located at 2024 Grand Avenue will be continued two weeks.

Action: Shallenberger/Winick, 6/0/0. (Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The following fifty-two (52) properties, as recommended by the HLC Historic Surveys Subcommittee, **shall be included** on the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List:

Mission Gardens (44 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
1	1915 Emerson Ave A	025-393-008	Contributing
2	1939 Emerson Ave	025-392-008	Contributing
3	1910 Laguna St	025-393-013	Contributing
4	1920 Laguna St	025-393-014	Contributing
5	1936 Laguna St	025-393-001	Contributing
6	2100 Laguna St	025-263-016	Contributing
7	405 Montgomery St	025-392-003	Contributing
8	407 Montgomery St	025-392-002	Contributing
9	410 Montgomery St	025-393-002	Contributing
10	413 Montgomery St	025-392-004	Contributing
11	416 Montgomery St	025-393-003	Contributing
12	417 Montgomery St	025-392-005	Contributing
13	420 Montgomery St	025-393-004	Contributing
14	421 Montgomery St	025-392-006	Contributing
15	422 Montgomery St	025-393-005	Contributing
16	423 Montgomery St	025-392-007	Contributing
17	426 Montgomery St	025-393-006	Contributing
18	429 Montgomery St	025-392-010	Contributing
19	431 Montgomery St	025-392-009	Contributing
20	434 Montgomery St	025-393-007	Contributing
21	404 E Padre St	025-264-001	Contributing
22	407 E Padre St	025-263-021	Contributing
23	410 E Padre St	025-264-002	Contributing
24	416 E Padre St	025-264-003	Contributing
25	421 E Padre St	025-263-013	Contributing
26	422 E Padre St	025-264-004	Contributing
27	425 E Padre St	025-263-019	Contributing
28	426 E Padre St	025-264-005	Contributing
29	429 E Padre St	025-263-020	Contributing
30	436 E Padre St	025-264-007	Contributing
31	401 E Pedregosa St	025-393-012	Contributing
32	433 E Pedregosa St	025-393-010	Contributing
33	435 E Pedregosa St	025-393-009	Contributing
34	402 Plaza Rubio	025-263-001	Contributing
35	408 Plaza Rubio	025-263-023	Contributing
36	414 Plaza Rubio	025-263-003	Contributing
37	420 Plaza Rubio	025-263-004	Contributing
38	424 Plaza Rubio	025-263-005	Contributing
39	430 Plaza Rubio	025-263-017	Contributing
40	434 Plaza Rubio	025-263-007	Contributing
41	502 Plaza Rubio	025-281-030	Contributing

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
42	520 Plaza Rubio	025-281-003	Contributing
43	524 Plaza Rubio	025-281-027	Contributing
44	530 Plaza Rubio	025-281-006	Contributing

Plaza Bonita (8 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
45	2103 Alameda Padre Serra	025-345-002	Contributing
46	2109 Alameda Padre Serra	025-345-001	Contributing
47	2117 Alameda Padre Serra	025-281-026	Contributing
48	2001 Grand Ave	025-343-004	Contributing
49	2018 Grand Ave	025-346-012	Contributing
	2024 Grand Ave	025-346-001	Contributing
50	2102 Grand Ave	025-345-003	Contributing
51	2019 Plaza Bonita	025-343-002	Contributing
52	2025 Plaza Bonita	025-281-034	Contributing

Continued for further review.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. EAST BEACH AND HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORTS

(2:15) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 099-ORD-0ZO
 Application Number: MST2013-00175
 Staff: Nicole Hernández, City Urban Historian
 (Proposal to update Potential List of Historic Resources.)

(Recommendation to consider adding the following properties to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: 1) Nine individually significant properties found to meet the criteria as Structures of Merit or City Landmarks in East Beach section identified in the Waterfront Survey (accepted by the Historic Landmark Commission on June 5, 2013, as per exhibit); and 2) Individually significant properties found to be eligible as City Landmarks identified in Historic Structures Reports (previously accepted by the Historic Landmark Commission, as per exhibit).)

Actual time: 2:57 p.m.

Staff comment: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the Waterfront Survey was divided into two groups (West Beach and East Beach). The West Beach individually significant properties and the Waterfront Survey were adopted by the HLC in the Spring 2013.

Public comment opened at 3:02 p.m.

Frank and Victor Evarone, property owners (429 Orilla del Mar), questioned how the inclusion of the property on the Potential’s List would affect future proposals.

Public comment closed at 3:10 p.m.

Motion: To accept Staff’s recommendation to place the following structures on the City’s List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Mahan/Murray, 6/0/0. (Murray abstained from 420 E. Anapamu Street. Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

The following eleven (11) properties, as recommended by the HLC Historic Surveys Subcommittee, **shall be included** on the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List:

East Beach (9 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
1	127 Anacapa St	033-082-010	Structure of Merit (SOM) Eligible
2	428 Corona Del Mar Dr	017-321-005	SOM Eligible
3	431 Corona Del Mar Dr	017-322-019	SOM Eligible
4	415 Orilla Del Mar Dr	017-321-012	SOM Eligible
5	1045 Orilla Del Mar Dr	017-322-011	SOM Eligible
6	429 Orilla Del Mar Dr	017-321-009	SOM Eligible
7	136 State St	033-081-001	SOM Eligible
8	225 State St	033-042-010	SOM Eligible
9	10 E Yanonali St	033-081-002	SOM Eligible

Miscellaneous (2 properties)

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>Eligibility</u>
1	27 East Cota Street	037-132-033	City Landmark Eligible
2	420 East Anapamu Street	029-173-005	City Landmark Eligible

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:11 PM TO 3:17 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. **1003 SANTA BARBARA ST A** C-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-211-013
 Application Number: MST2013-00418
 Owner: Robert Dibley
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning LLC
 Architect: Arketype Architects Inc.

(Proposal for a 1,731 square foot two-story addition to be constructed on top of an existing 1,489 square foot, one-story commercial building. The commercial building will be converted to residential use and will be used as a four-car garage and storage. The resulting three-story single-family dwelling unit will be 40'-6" tall on an approximately 2,000 square foot parcel. Total floor area on site will be 3,312 square feet, or a 1.65 floor-to-lot-area ratio. A total of 969 square feet of outdoor decks and landings is also proposed. There will be 124 square feet of permeable paving installed in the driveway. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications for setback encroachments and open yard area. The project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.)

(Second concept review. Project requires environmental assessment, Staff Hearing Officer Review, and environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption. The project was last reviewed on November 20, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant, Vanguard Planning, LLC
 David Ferrin, Principal Architect, Arketype-Architect, Inc.
 Robert Dibley, Property Owner

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The overall presentation was very helpful.
2. The building is still too contemporary and lacking a sense of identity. It is whimsical, contemporary and traditional all at the same time. There needs to be more cohesion.
3. Details need to be refined and enhanced, specifically the window details.
4. Façades should be more consistent with each other.
5. Resolve the rail and wall connections.
6. Corners of the roof deck parapet need refinement.
7. Although the linear windows on the lot line are recognized as necessary, the design is not yet acceptable; and they are definitely not acceptable on the other walls.
8. Glass block windows need to be reconciled with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines. Perhaps it can be resolved with clever use of the material.
9. Windows and breakups need to be more consistent.
10. Windows and doors need to be more compatible with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: Shalanberger/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/La Voie/Oriás absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

6. 107 JORGENSEN LN

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-110-037
 Application Number: MST2013-00515
 Owner: Leach-Goodstein Family Trust
 Architect: Paul Poirier

(Proposal to demolish 616 square feet of an existing 2,148 square foot single-family residence and construct a one-story, 1,096 (616 square foot reconstructed + 480 square foot new addition) square foot addition, which will attach the currently detached 458 square foot two-car garage. An existing 356 square foot accessory structure currently attached to the garage and 753 square feet of existing covered porches will remain unaltered. Total square footage on site will be 3,442 square feet. This is a designated Structure of Merit: "Jorgensen Ranch House.")

(Final Approval is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 15, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect
 Richard Goodstein and Joy Leach, Owners
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Public comment opened at 3:52 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with comments:

1. The response to the Commission's previous comments is appreciated and requests were met.
2. The applicant was encouraged to study better consistency between the two large windows.

Action: Winick/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. (Mahan stepped down. Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 25 E MASON ST**

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00029
 Owner: East Mason SB, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for tenant improvements to existing 3-story building for offices and lab facilities, project consists of window and doors changes, new trash enclosure, EV charging, landscape alterations and exterior site improvements and reconfiguration to the parking lot including a new fence. No new square footage is proposed. The structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Previous proposal under MST2012-00088 was withdrawn by applicant.)

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect, AB Design Studio, Inc.
 Adam Grosshans, Designer, AB Design Studio, Inc.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks with comments:

1. The handrail/guardrail need to be more consistent with the style and period of the building.
2. Proposed windows should be more consistent with original windows.
3. Detailing on the building should not be overdone.
4. Where windows are proposed to be removed, infill the façade to carefully match surrounding surfaces.
5. Maximize the landscaping both in the ground and in containers.

Action: Sharpe/Murray, 6/0/0. (Drury/La Voie/Orías absent.) Motion carried.

Chair Suding announced that this decision is appealable to the City Council within ten days of this meeting.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**CONTINUED ITEM****A. MISSION CREEK****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-012

Application Number: MST2008-00360

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: John Ilasin, Project Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Jon Frye, Flood Control Engineering Manager, County of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to widen Mission Creek between Cabrillo Boulevard and Highway 101 and replace existing bridges. This is part of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. Bridges to be reviewed under separate Master Applications. Reach 1A (phase 1) creek widening between Cabrillo Boulevard and W. Mason Street is complete. Reach 1A (phase 2) creek widening is part of the Mason Street Bridge Replacement project (MST2010-00261). Reach 1B is located between W. Mason Street and W. Yanonali Street.)

(Request for Final Approval for existing vegetation removal plan prior to final approval of project for Reach 1-B site. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 036-08. Project was last reviewed on January 15, 2014.)

Final Approval of details for the existing vegetation removal plan.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 0 BLK W MASON ST (2096 SEG ID)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096

Application Number: MST2010-00261

Applicant: Linda Sumansky

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. Overall existing bridge width is 33.4 feet and is proposed to be 49.5 feet.)

(Review After Final revisions to adjust parking space realignment, landscape plan, new pad-mounted electrical transformer and review of sandstone channel wall texture sample.)

Approval of Review After Final of the adjustment to the parking space realignment and landscape plan. (Site visit to review sandstone sample was held.) Continued two weeks to the Full Board for review of the new pad-mounted electrical transformer.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 135 E ORTEGA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-021
Application Number: MST2013-00446
Owner: Refugio Properties, LLC
Applicant: Charles Gandolfo

(Proposal for additions to enclose covered loading dock area: 127 square foot addition and 333 square foot as-built addition, which results in a 360 net square foot additions to an existing commercial building. Minor exterior work including parking reconfiguration and screening.)

(Project was last reviewed January 15, 2014.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 1026 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-019
Application Number: MST2014-00007
Owner: Victoria Kearny
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Application to legalize an as-built arbor at the front lot line, for an existing restaurant in the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with condition that all unapproved lights and signs be removed, including all light ropes and the spotlight sign projected on to the sidewalk after dark.

NEW ITEM**E. 36 W VALERIO ST R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-022
Application Number: MST2014-00014
Owner: Dunstan, Inc.
Applicant: Dwight Gregory

(Proposal for voluntary accessible barrier removal and installation of a wheelchair lift. Project also includes remodel of a guest room for ADA compliance. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Eberle House.")

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM

- F. **318 E CARRILLO ST** **C-2 Zone**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-003
Application Number: MST2014-00025
Owner: Joseph H. Moticha, Trustee
(Proposal to install a new wrought iron railing at the front wall, and following the front stair to the sidewalk.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM

- G. **118 E ISLAY ST** **E-1 Zone**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-002
Application Number: MST2014-00031
Owner: Finegold Family Trust
Landscape Architect: S.A. Fausset-Landscape Architect, Inc.
(Proposal to replace existing landscaping with new landscaping, and expand an existing deck and patio area in the back yard. Property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Howard House.")

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:34 PM ****