



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 23, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Orías, Sharpe, Suding (until 3:53 p.m. and again at 4:12 p.m.), and Winick.

Members absent: Boucher, Drury and Shallenberger.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:15 p.m. and again at 3:00 p.m.), Hernández (until 2:15 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 9, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 9, 2013, as corrected.

Action: Sharpe/Winick, 4/0/2. (Suding/Murray abstained. Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/Murray, 6/0/0. (La Voie abstained on Item F, 1500 State Street, due to a potential conflict of interest. Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Commissioners Boucher, Drury and Shallanberger would be absent from today's meeting.
- b. The HLC decision on the Arlington Village project (to be located at 1330 Chapala Street) was appealed. Commissioners La Voie and Orías agreed to represent the Commission at the City Council hearing that is scheduled to occur on Tuesday, October 29, 2013.

2. Commissioner Sharpe announced that the HLC Annual Holiday Party will be on Sunday, December 15, 2013, in conjunction with the Santa Barbara Conservancy holiday party.

3. Chair Suding reported he met with Cameron Benson, Creeks Restoration/Clean Water Manager, to look at potential locations for installation of permeable pavers. It will be used as a demonstration project for the public.

4. Chair Suding reported he met with Bob Cunningham (Landscape Architect), Victor Garza (Parking/TMP Superintendent), Dion Tait (Parking Supervisor), and Teri Green (Assistant Transportation Planner) regarding the paseo off of Figueroa Street adjacent to Parking Lot 3. He advised them as to what the HLC would be looking for on its improvements.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Winick reported on the Arts Commission and Visual Arts in Public Places (VAPP) Committee meeting that was held on Thursday, October 17, 2013. A project of interest for the HLC is a proposed temporary mural installed on the north side of the Hotel Indigo. It is being sponsored by Museum of Contemporary Arts and will be painted by Rafael Vargas-Suárez.

Commissioner Murray reported on the Designation Subcommittee meeting that met in the morning. Part of the discussion included proposed Landmark and Structure of Merit designations for 2014.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. **2112 SANTA BARBARA ST** E-1 Zone
(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
Application Number: MST2013-00097
Owner: Santa Barbara Restore, LLC
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal for a voluntary lot merger of Assessor Parcel Numbers 025-252-006 and -007 and change of use from commercial to residential use. This is the site of the former Fielding Institute. The proposal includes the restoration of an existing 6,167 square foot, two-story building to a single-family residence and exterior alterations to remove awnings, skylights, staircases, and an accessible ramp. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 1,809 square foot detached commercial building to an additional dwelling unit and alterations to incorporate a two car garage within the existing building footprint. Site improvements will include removal of existing paved parking spaces, restoration of historic site walls, a new swimming pool and spa, and new landscaping. Total development on this merged 49,810 square foot parcel will be 8,178 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Performance Standard Permit for the additional dwelling unit and zoning modifications. *This parcel is eligible for National Register listing, California Register of Historical Properties listing, and for City Landmark status: "Hodges House."*)

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing at 1:45 p.m. on November 6, 2013, to consider recommending to City Council that the entire parcel at 2112 Santa Barbara Street be designated a City Landmark.)

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the entire parcel is significant both historically and architecturally for its influence on the heritage of Santa Barbara. The Historic Structure Report found that the property meets the City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment criteria for designation. The property owner has agreed to the designation.

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to the swimming pool addition.

Public comment closed at 1:54 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2013-05 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing on November 6, 2013, to consider recommending to City Council that the entire parcel located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street be designated as a City Landmark, as determined to be eligible for designation, excluding the swimming pool addition that was found to be non-contributing.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. 2112 SANTA BARBARA ST** E-1 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-007
 Application Number: MST2013-00430
 Owner: Santa Barbara Restore, LLC
 Architect: Harrison Design

(The Commission is requested to recommend that the City Council authorize the execution of a Mills Act contract. The Historic Landmarks approved a project in August of 2013 consisting of the rehabilitation and restoration of a 6,167 square foot residence, 1,809 square foot accessory unit, and site improvements. *This structure is eligible for listing on the National Register and the California Register of Historical Properties and is eligible for City Landmark status: "Hodges House."*)

(Requires a recommendation to City Council for approval of an exception to exceed contract limits.)

Actual time: 1:57 p.m.

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, stated that City Council approved the Mills Act Historical Property Contract (reduced property tax incentive) Program and placed maximum limits to 8 contracts per year and only for properties with a total assessed cap value of 1.5 million dollars. Since 2009 when this provision was initiated, it was thought that applicants would not qualify for the program if they did not meet the property value maximum requirement. However, there is an allowed exception that grants the City Council authorization to approve a contract that exceeds the property value limit. The Commission is being requested to recommend such action.

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To recommend that the City Council authorize the execution of a Mills Act contract for the structure known as the "Hodges House" located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street and approve an exception to exceed contract limits.

Action: Winick/Orías, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 117 W MASON ST** R-4/SD-3 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
 Application Number: MST2013-00254
 Owner: Arthur W. Toga

(The Commission is requested to recommend that the Community Development Director authorize the execution of a Mills Act contract. The Historic Landmarks approved a project in April of 2012 consisting of alterations and a 618 square foot, second-story addition and a 30 square foot lower level addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. *This is a Structure of Merit: "1931 Spanish Colonial revival and contributing structure to the West Beach Historic District."*)

(Requires a recommendation to the Community Development Director.)

Actual time: 2:05 p.m.

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, stated that this property was recently designated as a Structure of Merit and now qualifies for the Mills Act Historical Property Contract (reduced property tax incentive) Program. The owners have spent a considerable amount of money to rehabilitate the historic property.

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To recommend that the Community Development Director authorize the execution of a Mills Act contract for the designated Structure of Merit known as the “1931 Spanish Colonial revival and contributing structure to the West Beach Historic District” located at 117 W. Mason Street.

Action: Orías/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

4. 101 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:10) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-075-006
 Application Number: MST2011-00171
 Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to demolish an existing 714 square foot laundry building and 40 space parking lot and construct a new 22,133 square foot, three-story hotel with 34 guest rooms and a 33 space, at-grade parking garage totaling 9,943 square feet.)

(In-Progress Review of refined exterior elevations and landscape plan. Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination approved on August 8, 2013. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 002-13. Project was last reviewed on July 17, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:15 p.m.

Present: Cearnal Andrulaitis and Matthew Gries, Architects

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired on whether trees would be placed in the parking area.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The grille solution at the garage fenestration is an acceptable solution.
2. The canvas at the wrought iron balcony is appropriate. Provide samples of proposed color scheme.
3. Provide a photometric analysis to understand the effect of lighting from the garage on the creek.
4. Provide a schedule of light fixtures, including those for the parking garage.
5. Carefully consider use of a water feature at the corner. The City’s Guidelines encourage the use of water features.
6. Restudy planting on the north side to avoid conflict with the building, but provide screening or relief of that elevation.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:55 P.M. TO 3:00 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM/TRAINING:

5. AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY INCENTIVE PROGRAM

(2:30) Presenter: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

(First of a two-part training on the relationship between Design Review and the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive program. This training will focus on the role of the HLC, key design issues, and examples of past projects.)

Actual time: 3:00 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Design Review / Historic Preservation Supervisor
Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Staff comments: Mr. Limón and Ms. Weiss gave a Staff PowerPoint presentation. Staff's proposal is that very early on in the review process an internal Land Development Team review would be conducted in order to provide Staff comments for HLC consideration. During the HLC hearing, the HLC/Public would then be encouraged to ask questions and make comments for Staff to return at the next hearing with answers. Expression of Staff recommendation for a project would be a critical change in the process to provide sufficient information for appropriate decision-making by the HLC.

Ms. Weiss clarified that any time the HLC reviews a project that is going to the Planning Commission, the HLC has the purview of challenging the design considerations and development. The HLC has Charter and Ordinance authority and responsibility for review of buildings found within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District (EPV).

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired whether the AUD Incentive Program has a cap as an experimental project and only allows up to certain units. He also asked if proposed project plans are reviewed by the HLC first or if Staff does the initial review.

Public comment closed at 4:07 p.m.

Ms. Weiss responded to public comment by saying that the 250 unit cap is in the high density zone. Much of the EPV area was specifically excluded from the high density zone. Staff will continue to review plans for basic submittal and zoning compliance standards before the first HLC concept hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. More complicated projects should have Staff recommendations as is done for the Planning Commission.
2. Inquired as to whether a recommendation could be made by the HLC to the Planning Commission with respect to residential lot line subdivisions/mergers that may affect historic resources.
3. Considered whether it would be better for the Planning Commission to review these projects instead of the HLC. The AUD Incentive Program will result in a workload increase for the HLC.
4. It would be helpful during the concept review process to ask Staff to address HLC concerns.
5. The comprehensive Staff review as early in the process would be helpful for HLC's evaluation.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 731 DE LA GUERRA PLAZA****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-026
Application Number: MST2011-00436
Owner: Richard Schmidt and Gwen Buswell
Applicant: Gloria Gonzalez
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: Tony Ray's

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a 1,413 square foot retractable awning with wrought iron posts to be installed over the rear patios of 731 and 732 State Street, and an on-grade stage and musical equipment area. Also proposed are tables, chairs, and heaters.)

(Review After Final of change to previously-approved patio improvements.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. The heaters shall be in a black color.
2. The rope lights shall be removed.
3. The awning support shall be deleted as noted on Sheet A-3.

NEW ITEM**B. 1002 ANACAPA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-024
Application Number: MST2013-00421
Owner: Channel Islands YMCA
Architect: Elisa Garcia Architects
Business Name: Channel Islands YMCA

(Proposal to install two new windows on the Anacapa Street elevation, three new windows on the E. Carrillo Street elevation, and remove an entry door and install one new window on the E. Carrillo Street parking lot elevation. Also proposed are five new window awnings with wrought iron frames in Sunbrella "Tresco Brick" color.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheets A-1 and A-2.

NEW ITEM**C. 514 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
Application Number: MST2013-00431
Owner: Greg Newman
Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.
Business Name: Sandbar

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations to replace three pair of existing patio entry doors with Lani system accordion-style doors. Also proposed is to permit as-built improvements within the front dining patio including wall-mounted televisions, wall-mounted lighting, wall-mounted and free-standing heaters, umbrellas, and artwork. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement case ENF2013-00134.)

Project Design and Final Approvals of door changes with the condition that the as-built alterations for unapproved work shall return to the Consent Calendar in two weeks.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 825 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2012-00430
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties Ltd.
Architect: Michael Patrick Porter Architect
Business Name: C'est Cheese

(Proposal for entry door, window, and rooftop mechanical equipment changes.)

(Review After Final of added guidepost accessibility standard with push panel to be installed at the front entry.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**E. 11 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
Application Number: MST2013-00434
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court
Architect: DesignARC
Business Name: Olio Crudo Bar

(Proposal to replace an existing unpermitted awning and surface-mounted, under awning lights with new awning and LED strip lights, surface-mounted to the wall under the awning. Existing conduit will be removed.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on detail sheet.

CONTINUED ITEM**F. 1500 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-008
Application Number: MST2013-00266
Owner: Trinity Episcopal Church
Applicant: Patsy Price
Business Name: Trinity Episcopal Church

(Proposal to alter the existing landscape plan including replacement of existing groundcover and shrubs with water-wise ground cover and shrubs. This is a *Structure of Merit*: "Trinity Episcopal Church." Designated: February 27, 1991.)

(Second Review. Requires an exception to the Landscape Design Standards for Water Conservation.)

Continued two weeks.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:12 P.M. ****