



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 14, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Absent
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- BARRY WINICK – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor – Present
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Absent
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:37 p.m.), and Suding.

Members absent: Boucher, Sharpe and Winick.

Staff present: Limón (1:40 p.m. to 1:52 p.m. and 4:00 p.m. to 4:47 p.m.), Gantz and Feliciano (until 5:45 p.m.).

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the previous minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 31, 2013, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray abstained. Orías abstained from Items 1-3, Suding from Item 8 and Shallenberger on Items 5-7. Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie; with the exception of Item E, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Orías/Drury, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Boucher, Sharpe, and Winick would be absent from the meeting. Chair Suding would be stepping down from Item 4 at 35 State Street.
- b) Item 3 at 224 Chapala Street was withdrawn at the applicant's request. Item 4 would then begin at approximately 2:30 p.m. instead of 3:00 p.m.
- c) The August 28, 2013, HLC Full Commission agenda is full and the agenda for the next meeting after that on September 11 has tentatively scheduled a review of the Library Plaza project. The HLC would then need to leave the meeting at 3:30 p.m. for the 4:00 p.m. Walkabout tour of the Safe Passage corridor with Don Olson. That would leave very little time for other projects to be reviewed on that agenda. Therefore, Staff requested a Special Meeting of the HLC on a different day of the week so as to not impact the regularly scheduled meeting agenda.

The majority of the Commission agreed to have the Walkabout tour of the Safe Passage corridor on a different date. Staff also agreed to provide information on the Walkabout in advance.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

FINAL REVIEW**1. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
Application Number: MST2010-00261
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: John Ewasiuk

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. Overall existing bridge width is 33.4 feet and is proposed to be 49.5 feet.)

(Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137. Project was last reviewed on July 31, 2013.)

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: John Ilasin, Project Engineer
David Black, Landscape Architect
Tom Conti, Project Engineer, Bengal Engineering
Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would prefer pilasters at the ends of the proposed bridge as being essential? 3/3. (Orías/Murray/Drury opposed.)

How many Commissioners would prefer no pilasters at the ends of the proposed bridge? 5/0. (Unanimous.)

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for final working drawings with comments:

1. The bridge railing should be without bollards at either end.
2. Color is acceptable as submitted.
3. The design is acceptable. Once complete working drawings are provided, final approval may be given.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 11 GARDEN ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-017
 Application Number: MST2013-00301
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Theresa Lawler, Engineering Technician II

(Proposal to slurry seal and restripe the public parking lot at Garden Street and E. Cabrillo Blvd. Also included is to provide three additional accessible parking spaces, an ADA path of travel, and the removal of 350 square feet of planting area. The project will decrease the number of total parking spaces by 10, from 207 to 197 spaces in this 73,343 square foot parking lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:01 p.m.

Present: Karl Treiberg, Waterfront Facilities Manager
 Theresa Lawler, Engineering Technician
 Henry Lenny, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with comments:

1. The project is supportable.
2. Rehabilitate the existing landscape to offset loss and fill in bare areas.
3. Wheelchair pullout space shall be designed to be more usable.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. 224 CHAPALA ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-012
 Application Number: MST2013-00314
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Alelia Parenteau

(Proposal for an electric vehicle charging station to be installed in the railroad station parking lot. The "Southern Pacific Railroad Station" located on this parcel is a City Landmark and is listed on the National Register. The proposed project area is to the north of the former "Railroad Express Agency Building" which is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Requires Historic Resource Findings and Findings for Alterations to a City Landmark.)

This project was withdrawn by the applicant.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:22 P.M. TO 2:32 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
Application Number: MST97-00357
Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
Agent: Ken Marshall
Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Suding Design, Inc.
Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.
Business Name: Entrada de Santa Bárbara

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area and approximately 264 parking spaces. Area A (35 State Street) includes 64 hotel rooms and approximately 4,584 square feet of commercial space. Area B (36 State Street) includes 59 hotel rooms and approximately 6,437 square feet of commercial space. Area C (118 State Street) includes approximately 11,305 square feet of commercial space.)

(Project Design Approval of the revised project is requested for Areas A, B, and C. The City Council approved the project on December 11, 2001, and a Substantial Conformance Determination was issued by the City Administrator on June 27, 2013. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103. The last review was on July 31, 2013.)

Actual time: 2:32 p.m.

Present: Melissa Cinarli, Project Manager, DesignARC
Mark Shields, Senior Designer, DesignARC
Philip Suding, Landscape Architect, Suding Design
Allison De Busk, Project Planner

Commissioners Murray and Shallenberger announced that they reviewed the previous hearing video and minutes on this project.

State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that the City Attorney's office has determined that sole proprietors are allowed to prepare professional documents and make project presentations before a board they serve on based on an exception to the Political Reform Act and Fair Political Practices Commission rulings. The limitation is that they are not to unduly influence their fellow board members on a decision by advocating for their clients. The exception allows board members to continue practicing their profession in the City while volunteering on a board.

Public comment opened at 2:58 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, made positive comments on the project's improvement. He questioned if the fountain at Area B has been designed and where the raised lawn area access will end.

Public comment closed at 3:00 p.m.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The proposed architecture and landscape design are commendable and supportable.
2. Provide refinement of detailing.
3. Restudy the plain Moorish arch on the corner of Helena and Mason Streets.
4. Restudy the restaurant column at State and Mason Streets.

Action: Drury/Murray, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:25 P.M. TO 3:45 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

5. 1936 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00167
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Applicant: Cadence Development
 Agent: Lucy Dinneen
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,500 square foot, approximate 21 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. The entry tower portion of the building is proposed at 32 feet. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires Compatibility Criteria Analysis and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on December 19, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect, Banyan Architects
 Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect, Common Ground
 Rob Beery, Development Partner, Cadence Capital Investments
 Scott Schell, Associated Transportation Engineers
 Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner
 Steven Foley, Supervising Transportation Planner

Public comment opened at 3:55 p.m.

Fred Sweeney, Upper East Association, commented on potential tenants with respect to the introduction of another national chain developer and having a 24/7 operation at the corner of the property that is not compatible with the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:58 p.m.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with comments, conditions of approval and findings:

1. The project design is commendable.
2. Transportation Division and Engineering Department Staff shall look at the circulation operational element, specifically the ingress/egress and flow of traffic at the State Street and Mission Street access.
3. Providing a Memorandum with Staff's recommendations on the same day of the hearing is problematic when the Commission is being asked to make findings.
4. Update the conditions to require street sweeping and include Planning Division staff contact information on the construction sign.
5. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and **Compatibility Analysis Criteria** have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - 1) The project's design is compatible with El Pueblo Guidelines and Urban Design Guidelines.
 - 2) The project's design is compatible with the desirable architectural qualities and characteristics which are distinctive to the City and the neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - 3) The project size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its location and do not adversely affect the neighborhood or the zone.
 - 4) The project design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks and surrounding historic district.
6. **Development Plan Approval Findings, CEQA Finding, and Conditions of Approval** are made as per Staff Memorandum dated August 14, 2013.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

Commission direction to Staff: Provide training as to the extent of the Commission's purview in setting conditions and findings as well as the Average Unit Density program.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:31 P.M. TO 4:47 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 1330 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00169
 Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation
 Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Business Name: Arlington Village

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a new, three-story, 40'-2" tall mixed-use development on a 91,000 square foot parcel located at the corner of W. Sola and Chapala Streets. The project will comprise 33 residential apartments (totaling 28,302 square feet) and two commercial units (931 net square foot). The new building will total 52,945 square feet, including a 534 square foot exercise room and a 13,400 square foot partially below-grade parking garage. The parking garage will contain 42 spaces, and a surface lot will contain 49 spaces for a total of 91 spaces, with 33 spaces allocated to the residential units, two spaces allocated to the commercial units and 56 spaces allocated to the Arlington Theatre. Also proposed is the removal of eight mature trees including four grevillea, two pittosporum, one solanum and one ficus, with 6 mature palm trees to be relocated on site. Grading excavation will total 3,400 cubic yards. A detached trash enclosure for the theater is proposed to replace an existing trash enclosure and will be constructed near the northwest corner of the Arlington Theatre. A waiver of parking lot interior planter requirements is requested. This parcel is within the 10% Parking Zone of Benefit and *contains a designated Structure of Merit: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch."*)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a waiver of parking lot landscape standards, Development Plan Approval findings, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Historic Resource Findings. Project was last reviewed on June 19, 2013. Note: the project activity is within the scope of the 2011 General Plan and the Program EIR analysis for the General Plan. No further environmental document is required for this project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code section 21083.3 and Code of Regulations section 15183). City Council environmental findings adopted for the General Plan remain applicable for this project.)

Actual time: 4:47 p.m.

Present: Bruce Corwin, Property Owner, Metropolitan Theatres
 Detlev Peikert and Gordon Brewer, Architects, Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Lisa Plowman, Planning Manager, Peikert + RRM Design Group
 Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA
 Steven Foley, Supervising Transportation Planner

Public comment opened at 5:32 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the Commission's request that the design be special due to the uniqueness of the adjacent landmark, the Commission mandate to review the design without consideration of the applicant's budgetary constraints, and the need of a visual celebration of the Arlington Theatre.

Public comment closed at 5:33 p.m.

A letter was acknowledged from Paula Westbury expressing opposition to the project.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners think that story poles are essential? 2/4. (Drury/Orías/Shallanberger/Suding opposed.)

How many Commissioners would agree with the finger planter waiver? 5/1. (La Voie opposed.)

How many Commissioners think that the form of the building needs to be modified so that there is a view of the Arlington Theatre's north balcony? 2/4. (Drury/Orias/Shallanberger/Suding opposed.)

Motion: **Project Design Approval making the CEQA Finding** as per Staff Memorandum dated August 14, 2013; and including **suggested amendments on the conditions of approval as listed below. Project is continued indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. Design Comments:

- a) Architecture needs to be more breathtaking and special.
- b) Architecture needs to be simpler and less adorned.
- c) Provide an access through the historic gate.
- d) Trash enclosure location at the *paseo* is not appropriate and modification request is not supportable.
- e) Traffic Department needs to deal with the truck management plan.
- f) Study using less fenestration.
- g) The Commission is supportive of the requested waiver for parking lot finger planters based on the alternative landscaping provided.

2. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:

- 1) The project's architectural character is in a Hispanic style consistent with the character of the City.
- 2) The height, scale and massing will be compatible with adjacent developments in the sense that it is far under the allowable height and massing for the zoning.
- 3) The development will have sufficient open space and landscaping as it exceeds the requirements per the ordinance and zoning.
- 4) The project is consistent with the Urban Design Guidelines and El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
- 5) The project has been designed to be sensitive to the adjacent City Landmarks and Historic Resources.

3. Conditions of Approval: The Draft Conditions of Approval dated August 14, 2013, are approved with the following suggested additions:

- a) To facilitate construction, study closing Sola Street temporarily.
- b) Show where enhanced pavement is in the project.
- c) Address stormwater management and quality.
- d) Solar heating and panels should be identified.
- e) Acoustics should not exceed 45 dB.
- f) Provide directory for project after it is built.
- g) All roadways, driveways and sidewalks shall be paved as soon as possible and kept clean.
- h) Reword the ground disturbance condition to be less restrictive (e.g., in excess of 12" below grade).

Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Murray/La Voie opposed because they believe the project is not sufficiently sensitive to the adjacent historic landmark. Boucher/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 35 W HALEY ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-028
 Application Number: MST2013-00317
 Owner: Gem Investments Group, LLC
 Architect: DMHA
 Business Name: Alchemy Arts

(Proposal for two wrought iron posts and flags to be attached to two existing second floor balconies on Chapala and Haley Streets. This is on the *City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Former Salvation Army Building."*)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 1936 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00322
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Applicant: Cardno ERI
 Architect: Michael Burnell

(Proposal to install a temporary soil remediation system and related plumbing lines prior to redevelopment of the site. A new 173 square foot concrete block equipment enclosure will be located in the southeast corner of the parcel.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the metal gate shall be finished per the architectural drawings for MST2011-00167 with a wood facing, and as noted on Sheet 7.

NEW ITEM**C. 1015 DE LA VINA ST A C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025
 Application Number: MST2013-00318
 Owner: Carrillo Holdings LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.
 Business Name: Carrillo Laundromat

(Proposal for a minor addition and exterior alterations to an existing commercial building including the enclosure of an existing 20 square foot recessed entry fronting De la Vina Street and alterations to existing doors and windows.)

(Note: the project activity is within the scope of the 2011 General Plan and the Program EIR analysis for the General Plan. No further environmental document is required for this project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code section 21083.3 and Code of Regulations section 15183). City Council environmental findings adopted for the General Plan remain applicable for this project.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with Staff to verify the following on the resubmitted plans:

1. Infill on northeast elevation should be held back six inches from the face of the building.
2. An alternate window should be used that does not match the immediately adjacent window.
3. CEQA findings made.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 32 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-028
 Application Number: MST2013-00285
 Owner: Carrillo Pacific, LLC
 Applicant: Shubin Donaldson

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for the removal of existing concrete curbs and chain link fence and the construction of a 420 linear foot, 8'-0" tall site wall. This parcel is within the 100% parking Zone of Benefit and the area of work is located to the north of the former Greyhound Bus station.)

(Moved to the Consent Calendar due to reduction in scope of work. Project was last reviewed on July 17, 2013.)

Continued two weeks.

NEW ITEM**E. 100 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-272-023
 Application Number: MST2013-00325
 Owner: Ralphs Grocery Company
 Contractor: Bartlett Tree Experts

(Proposal to replace 18 existing olive trees located primarily in the Ralph's upper parking lot. The trees are approximately 15-20 feet in height and would be replaced with 15 gallon sized "Forest Pansy" Red Bud trees. The replacement would occur over an extended period of time as the existing trees decline from disease.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with conditions:

1. Resubmit a revised landscape plan to staff.
2. Replace 18 Olive trees (as they decline) with 15 gallon and 24" box sized Magnolia "Little Gem." The six at the arbor and the four fronting Chapala Street shall be 24" box; the remainder shall be 15 gallon.
3. Replace eight *Washingtonia Robusta* "Mexican Fan Palms" with 24" box *Trachycarpus Fortunei* "Chinese Windmill Palm" at the curved drive leading down to the parking garage.
4. Obtain a tree/landscape removal permit prior to commencement of removal.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:35 P.M. ****