



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 8, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 3:37 p.m. and again at 3:43 p.m.  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Absent  
MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present  
FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
JUDY ORÍAS – Present  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present  
BARRY WINICK – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor – Present until 2:55 p.m. and again at 3:20 p.m.  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 3:40 p.m.  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

**Members present:** Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Shallanberger, Suding (until 3:37 p.m. and again at 3:43 p.m.), and Winick.

**Members absent:** Boucher.

**Staff present:** Limón (until 2:55 p.m. and again at 3:20 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:40 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 24, 2013.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 24, 2013, with correction.**

Action: La Voie/Winick, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item D, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.**

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a. Commissioner Boucher would be absent and Chair Suding would step down from Item 5 at 902 Chapala Street.

b. Item 7 at 1601 State Street has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

2. Chair Suding and Commissioner Orías announced they will review the Draft Safety Element (General Plan update) that is available for public review from until June 6, 2013.

3. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

a. Public workshop meetings will be held regarding Potential Historic Districts on Thursday, May 9 from 5:30 to 7:00 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room and Saturday, May 11 from 10:00 to 11:30 a.m. in the Main Library's Faulkner Gallery.

b. The City Council hearing with respect to the final landmark designation of the El Encanto Site will be held on June 18, 2013.

4. Commissioner Murray announced that the 2013 Pearl Chase Society Historic Homes Tour will be on May 19 from 11:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. in honor of National Preservation Month.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Suding reported on the May 7, 2013, Street Tree Advisory Committee meeting with respect to co-designation on West Cañón Perdido Street to be the fern pine (*Podocarpus*) and evergreen pear (*Pyrus kawakamii*). The fern pine may not be an appropriate request due to the location of high voltage wires above the street tree planters.

## **DISCUSSION ITEM**

### **1. CITY BUDGET PRIORITY**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor  
(Historic Landmarks Commission recommendation for City budget priority.)

Actual Time: 1:47 p.m.

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor, stated that this discussion was agendaized at the Commission's request. City Planner Bettie Weiss had explained at a previous meeting that specific measures are being recommended to City Council for funding. At that time, it was requested that the HLC recommend additional funding supports, such as stipends and possibly zoning enforcement. The Commission raised questions on whether additional funding requests should be considered to be taken from a surplus for the 2013-2014 fiscal year.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The use of the proposed stipends for provision of additional hourly support to assist the City Urban Historian would be supportable.
2. The stipend amount could simply be \$1, which would allow commission members to include their volunteer service as a tax-deductible business expense.
3. Hiring a paid intern would increase the number of surveys leading to the creation of historic districts, completion of design guidelines, and processing of six designations per year as part of the five-year goals that the Commission began recommending in 2007 (1-3 year, 3-5 year, and long-term goals).
4. Matching funds from the Pearl Chase Society should continue beyond the City's web enhancements. (Staff explained that a Memorandum of Understanding would report to the Society how their matched funds were used to meet specific goals.)
5. The element of volunteers is another option.
6. Chair Suding agreed to meet with Mr. Limón to draft a letter directed to City Council regarding the Commission's recommendation for budget priority.

**Discussion held.**

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

### **2. 1807 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-041-008  
 Application Number: MST2013-00109  
 Owner: Robert Brace Residence Trust  
 Applicant: DesignARC

(Proposal for some minor window and door alterations and exterior hardscape and landscape improvements including a new swimming pool, 2,000 square feet of stone decks, half-bathroom, spa, trellis, fire pit, barbeque, pizza oven, and landscaping. There will be 120 cubic yards of grading excavation and 230 cubic yards of fill.)

**(Second review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report found the building is not considered a historic resource. Report was last reviewed on April 24, 2013.)**

Actual time: 2:00 p.m.

Present: Mark Shields, Architect

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor, stated that the premise of all surveys is to consider the historical consultant conclusions on the significance of a site. If the Commission does not accept the report, specific reasons must be given. The main question before the Commission is to determine if the structure/site is a historic resource and whether it should be listed as such. He reminded the Commission that the purpose of the City's List of Potential Historic Resources was to identify resources believed to be worthy of designation.

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on an email he provided to the Commission relating to his research. He inquired as to whether the fact that the famous concert violinist Roderick White and Sambo's restaurant chain co-founder Sam Battistone having resided on the property would change the conclusion of the report. He stated he did not see why the structure could not be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment closed at 2:09 p.m.

Failed

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 4/4/0. (La Voie/Murray/Orías/Sharpe/Winick opposed.) Motion failed.

Second

Motion: To request that Staff proceed with investigation of the site walls and landscape elements as identified by Commissioner Murray as having historical significance in order to place them on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

Third

Motion: To reconsider the second motion in order to address the historic structures report.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.)

**Substitute**

**Motion Continued two weeks to allow the report preparer to amend the report as requested with direction to Staff:**

1. Consider including a description of the sandstone walls facing the street and the significant landscape materials as being identified by Commissioner Murray as having historical importance.
2. The Battistone Family era should be included in the report.
3. Staff is requested to proceed to begin the process to add the site walls and landscape elements as identified by Commissioner Murray as having historical significance in order to place them on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: Commissioner Murray emphatically stated the Commission would be concerned with any future applications for demolition of the structure. A restoration of the building would be requested instead. Commissioners La Voie and Shallanberger clarified that such historic restoration could possibly lead to a historic designation in the future.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:47 TO 2:51 P.M. \*\***

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM****3. 1318 MORRISON AVE**

R-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-021  
Application Number: MST2013-00138  
Owner: Christian Hill & Hope Firestone  
Architect: Bryan Pollard, AIA

(Proposal to construct a 31 square foot first floor addition and 305 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,030 square foot one-story residence on a 4,500 square foot parcel. The existing 395 square foot detached one-car garage with accessory space will remain unchanged. A zoning modification is requested for alterations to openings within the interior setback. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be 0.39 or 76% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Request by Staff to add the building at 1318 Morrison Avenue to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Resources List.)**

Actual time: 2:51 p.m.

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect  
Hope Firestone and Chris Hill, Owners

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the property was identified in the Lower Riviera Survey as having historic significance as a contributing structure to the Potential Bungalow Haven Historic District. The applicant agreed that a historic structure/site report would therefore not be necessary at this time.

Public comment opened at 2:54 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

Cheri Rae, local resident, commented on the mailed notice that does not specify that the site is located in the Lower Riviera Special Design District.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of the agenda correctly stating that the property is within the Lower Riviera Special Design District.

Public comment closed at 2:57 p.m.

**Motion: To accept Staff's recommendation of placing the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.**

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****4. 1318 MORRISON AVE**

R-2 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-021  
Application Number: MST2013-00138  
Owner: Christian Hill & Hope Firestone  
Architect: Bryan Pollard, AIA

(Proposal to construct a 31 square foot first floor addition and 305 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,030 square foot one-story residence on a 4,500 square foot parcel. The existing 395 square foot detached one-car garage with accessory space will remain unchanged. A zoning modification is requested for alterations to openings within the interior setback. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be 0.39 or 76% of the maximum FAR.)

**(Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer review.)**

Actual time: 2:58 p.m.

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect  
Hope Firestone and Chris Hill, Owners  
Danny Kato, Senior Planner/Zoning Supervisor

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the Lower Riviera Special Design District Guidelines are applicable to this site: The applicant was directed to keep the second story stepped back away from the front façade so as to not significantly impact the streetscape and the original façade features would then remain.

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged the receipt of the following letters:

1. Paula Westbury, local resident – in opposition.
2. Cheri Rae, neighborhood resident – expressed concerns: modification to add a second story to a modest bungalow as being out-of-character in the neighborhood.
3. Karen Boyer, neighbor across the street – expressed concern: second-story addition may obstruct her views.
4. Blake and Gina Andrews, neighbor – in support.
5. Nancy Hirsch, neighbor – in support.
6. Randy Wright, local resident – in support.
7. Rick and Wendy Mokler, neighbors – in support.

Cheri Rae, neighborhood resident, expressed concern with respect to the proposed second-story addition and modifications throughout that neighborhood that affect the historical integrity.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to whether the second-story addition would affect the designation of the neighborhood as a historic district.

Public comment closed at 3:15 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:**

1. The modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with the Lower Riviera Special Design District Guidelines and Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings.
2. Add depth to the two-dimensional drawings, show sections or show both.
3. Provide more photographs of adjacent properties.
4. Work with the neighbor across the street to minimize visual impacts.
5. Study the depth of the eave located on the second story at the southwest elevation.
6. Study the relationship of the rafter tails on the proposed addition as they relate to the first-floor top of windows.
7. The proposed addition lacks the simplicity of a craftsman style home.
8. Change the orientation of the roof plane on the second floor.
9. Portray a horizontal massing feel from the front. The width of the proposed addition as presented seems to span close to the whole width of the property. It is awkward, not integrated with the existing structure, and the top looks heavy and out-of-scale.
10. Explore more cantilever at the south wall of the proposed addition. Perhaps introduce brackets.
11. Study the relationship of the chimney to the second-story windows with respect to ventilation.
12. Study keeping the foundation line at the same datum around the base of the building.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

**5. 902 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-321-019  
 Application Number: MST2012-00149  
 Owner: Cynthia Howard Trust  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP  
 Contractor: Signs By Ken, Inc.

(Proposal for a facade remodel to replace the existing storefront window system, remove the existing eave, fascia, and parapet, and add new copper gutter and downspouts. Parking lot work and a new trash enclosure will be reviewed under separate application MST2012-00217.)

**(Referred to the Full Board from the Consent Calendar on April 24, 2013. Review After Final to add 1/4" flat black aluminum panels to all four elevations. Signage will be reviewed under a separate application.)**

**This item was continued indefinitely due to applicant’s absence.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****6. 34 E MISSION ST**

E-1 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-005  
 Application Number: MST2013-00131  
 Owner: Catherine Compere  
 Applicant: Jarrett Gorin  
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza  
 Contractor: Robert Taylor

(Proposal to demolish an existing 667 square foot, detached three-car garage and construct a new 643 square foot, detached three-car garage with a 472 square foot second story accessory space. Also proposed is to construct a new 11'-0" x 6'-0" driveway gate. The project will result in 4,776 square feet of development on an 18,750 square foot parcel. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be .25 or 108% of the maximum FAR. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for the garage to exceed the 500 square foot maximum. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources, "Kinney House," and was found to be eligible for City Structure of Merit status and listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.*)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on April 24, 2013.)**

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Robert Taylor, General Contractor  
 Jarrett Gorin, Land Use Consultant  
 Jose Luis Esparza, Architect

**Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. Restudy the corbels.
2. The large overhangs of the windows sitting directly on top of the roof are excessive.
3. Although the simplification is appreciated, the detailing and the bulk of the building are awkward. Look to similar accessory building architectural styles within historic neighborhoods for inspiration as to the massing and detailing.

Action: Suding/Winick, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****7. 1601 STATE ST**

C-2/R-4 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-008  
 Application Number: MST2013-00172  
 Owner: 1601 State Street Hotel Investors  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP  
 Business Name: El Prado Inn

(Proposal to change the exterior building color and replace the existing front and rear lobby doors with new frameless glass storefront. Color scheme was previously reviewed under a separate active application MST2012-00429 for exterior renovations and alterations proposed to this building.)

**This item was postponed indefinitely at the architect's request.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR****NEW ITEM****A. 1117 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030  
Application Number: MST2013-00157  
Owner: 1129 State Street  
Architect: LMA Architects

(Proposal to permit an as-built exterior staircase to the basement level and to bring existing stair railings and gates into Building Code compliance at an existing retail building.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheet A2.2.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****B. 901 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-015  
Application Number: MST2013-00013  
Owner: Philinda Properties/Sierra Management  
Applicant: Brent Thompson  
Architect: Garcia Architects  
Business Name: Sublime

(Proposal for the following exterior changes: remove an existing 370 square foot deck and refurbish an entry door to comply with ADA accessibility standards, restripe an existing parking space for ADA accessibility, construct a water heater enclosure, and provide a new bicycle parking space. A Public Works variance is requested to encroach into the street setbacks. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.*)

**(Third review.)**

**Continued two weeks due to applicant's absence.**

**NEW ITEM****C. 25 E DE LA GUERRA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-032  
Application Number: MST2013-00165  
Owner: SIMA El Paseo LP  
Applicant: Wade Davis Design

(Proposal for new exterior door hardware at two locations, removal of a portion of an existing concrete step to comply with ADA requirements, and to install new privacy panels at the interior existing windows along the paseo. This is a *City Landmark: "El Paseo."*)

**Continued indefinitely to Staff.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****D. 1604 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-020  
Application Number: MST2011-00226  
Owner: Max Drucker  
Designer: Adam Cunningham

(This is a *designated Structure of Merit: "Olive House."* Proposal to convert 215 square feet of floor area back to permitted garage space at the rear of an existing single-family residence and convert the detached carport back to a legally permitted two-car garage. Door and window changes are also proposed, as well as the removal of an unpermitted storage shed and lattice partition wall from the carport roof deck. Hardscape installed without a permit will be removed and replaced with grass in accordance with the last-approved site plan. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2011-00233 and zoning information report ZIR2011-00097.)

**(Second Review. Review After Final of changes to approved landscape and hardscape plan.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as presented.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:54 P.M. \*\***