



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 24, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 3:23 p.m. and again at 3:31 p.m.
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 3:25 p.m.
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 3:25 p.m.
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 1:58 p.m. until 3:45 p.m.
- BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE – Present until 2:19 p.m.

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor – Present until 2:19 p.m.
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 3:45 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:34 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher (until 3:25 p.m.), Drury, La Voie, Orías, Sharpe (until 3:25 p.m.), Shallanberger (1:58 to 3:45 p.m.), Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Murray.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:19 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:45 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 10, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 10, 2013, with correction.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item 4. Shallanberger/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar. (4:07 p.m.)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Items I and J, which were reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Drury/Winick, 5/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item H. Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Commissioner Murray would be absent from the meeting.
- b. Commissioners Boucher and Sharpe would be leaving at the conclusion of Item 5, and Commissioner Shallanberger would leave at 4:00 p.m.

2. Bettie Weiss, City Planner, announced that a joint City Council and Planning Commission worksession regarding the Planning Division program activities was held on Wednesday, April 17, 2013. Part of the discussion included the status of the General Plan implementation and proposed amendments to the City's hedge ordinance, whose temporary suspension of certain regulations is due to expire.

3. Ms. Hernández announced that:

- a. Staff attended the second Ordinance Committee with respect to proposed amendments to the historic resources section of the City's Municipal Code that was held on Tuesday, April 16, 2013. An outline of the new ordinance will be drafted.
- b. Notices have been mailed to property owners of homes located within the proposed Historic Districts that will be discussed during HLC public hearings on May 22, June 5 and June 19, 2013. In addition, public workshop meetings will be held on Thursday, May 9 from 5:30 to 7:00 p.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room and on Saturday, May 11 from 10:00 to 11:30 a.m. in the Main Library's Faulkner Gallery. Commissioners Murray and Winick will attend those neighborhood meetings and will meet in advance on May 8 with Staff to prepare.
- c. The formation of a new HLC Subcommittee for the review of the newly-drafted Historic Districts Guidelines was requested. Commissioners Murray, Shallanberger and Drury will participate with Commissioner La Voie as an alternate.

4. Mr. Limón announced plans to revise the book entitled "Santa Barbara El Pueblo Viejo A Walking Guide to the Historic Districts of Santa Barbara" as recommended by Commissioner Sharpe. Commissioner Sharpe stated that the Santa Barbara Conservancy discussed the need to update and prepare a second addition of this book. Commissioner Boucher and Chair Suding expressed the desire to be included in this process.

5. Chair Suding announced that the annual workshop for City Advisory Groups will be held on Wednesday, May 8, 2013, at 4:30 p.m. at the Main Library's Faulkner Gallery.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. **COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT BUDGET**

(1:45) Staff: Bettie Weiss, City Planner

(Overview of the proposed Financial Plan for Fiscal Years 2014 and 2015 with highlights for the Community Development Department (CDD). On April 16, 2013, the City Administrator presented the proposed Financial Plan to the City Council. A Council hearing to review the CDD budget is scheduled for Thursday May 2, 2013.)

Actual Time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Bettie Weiss, City Planner
Paul Casey, Community Development Director/Assistant City Administrator

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m. and, since no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

The Commission requested a discussion item to be held during a future HLC meeting with respect to identifying priorities.

Discussion held.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 34 E MISSION ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-005
Application Number: MST2013-00131
Owner: Catherine Compere
Applicant: Jarrett Gorin
Contractor: Robert Taylor
Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to demolish an existing 667 square foot, detached three-car garage and construct a new 643 square foot, detached three-car garage with a 472 square foot second story accessory space. Also proposed is to construct a new 11'-0" x 6'-0" driveway gate. The project will result in 4,776 square feet of development on an 18,750 square foot parcel. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be .25 or 108% of the maximum FAR. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for the garage to exceed the 500 square foot maximum. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources, "Kinney House,"* and was found to be *eligible for City Structure of Merit status and listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.*)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Dudek.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Representing Ownership
Robert Taylor, Contractor

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the potential to encounter unknown but potentially significant subsurface prehistoric remains is considered very unlikely, project impacts on prehistoric resources are less than significant. However, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources applies to the project and shall be reproduced on the plans prior to final design review approval.

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 34 E MISSION ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-005
 Application Number: MST2013-00131
 Owner: Catherine Compere
 Applicant: Jarrett Gorin
 Contractor: Robert Taylor
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to demolish an existing 667 square foot, detached three-car garage and construct a new 643 square foot, detached three-car garage with a 472 square foot second story accessory space. Also proposed is to construct a new 11'-0" x 6'-0" driveway gate. The project will result in 4,776 square feet of development on an 18,750 square foot parcel. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be .25 or 108% of the maximum FAR. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for the garage to exceed the 500 square foot maximum. This structure is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources, "Kinney House,"* and was found to be *eligible for City Structure of Merit status and listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.*)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 2:22 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Representing Ownership
 Robert Taylor, Contractor

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m. and reopened at 2:36 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of the building, inquired as to whether the design would change the existing structure's eligibility status, and as to what was there previous to the garage.

Public comment closed at 2:37 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The project meets the Compatibility Criteria Analysis, but the building needs to be simplified and be subservient to the main house.
2. The design is overly complex. Simplify the gable and hip mix as well as the roof form and details.
3. The project should reflect a design that is appropriate to an accessory building of the period.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:40 P.M. TO 2:48 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 1807 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-041-008
 Application Number: MST2013-00109
 Owner: Robert Brace Residence Trust
 Applicant: DesignARC

(Proposal for some minor window and door alterations and exterior hardscape and landscape improvements including a new swimming pool, 2,000 square feet of stone decks, half-bathroom, spa, trellis, fire pit, barbeque, pizza oven, and landscaping. There will be 120 cubic yards of grading excavation and 230 cubic yards of fill.)

(Review of an Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report found the building is not considered a historic resource.)

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant
 Mark Shields, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff supports the report's conclusions that the project in its current condition does not qualify as a historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of the White family's sons to Santa Barbara that is not reflected in the report. He noted that what affected the house's integrity was the addition of the garage and carport. He inquired as to what would be allowed to be done to the important streetscape on the Santa Barbara Street side if the structure/site is not considered a historic resource.

Public comment closed at 2:53 p.m.

Failed

Motion: The report is not accepted for the following reasons:

1. The Commission disagrees with the report's findings on Criterias C and R.
2. While the building has been altered and the alterations are accurately described in the report, the Commission does not believe it denies the building its significance with respect to the streetscape and its original design.
3. If the applicant wishes to have the report prepared by another consultant, continued indefinitely.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 3/4/1. (Drury/Boucher/Shallanberger/Suding opposed. Sharpe abstained. Murray absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute

Motion: Continued two weeks to allow Commissioner Murray to review the report.

Action: Shallanberger/Winick, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 900 CHANNEL DR**

R-1/SD-3 Zone

(2:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
Application Number: MST2011-00246
Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
Applicant: Tricia Knight
Architect: SAC Wireless

(Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 50 foot tall tower pole structure and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower inside a monopole. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification. *This parcel contains a City Landmark: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain."*)

(Compatibility Criteria Analysis only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Planning Commission review, and Findings of No Visual Impact. Project was last reviewed on October 24, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that the Criteria Analysis was inadvertently omitted at the last review and requested the HLC Comment with respect to the Compatibility Criteria Analysis.

Motion: **The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:**

1. Based on previous comments, the project design is acceptable because the applicant has pursued a design in its simplicity to minimize the impacts of the installation. The monopole is the least intrusive design.
2. The project size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its location and do not adversely affect the neighborhood or the zone.
3. The project design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent to Federal, State, or City Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources, including City structures of merit, sites, or natural features.
4. Public views of the ocean and mountains are not greatly impacted.
5. Appropriate amount of open space and landscaping are sufficient.
6. Carry forward previous comments to the Planning Commission.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 836 BATH ST**

R-4 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-001
Application Number: MST2012-00385
Architect: Acme Architecture
Owner: Arthur Louie
Consultant: Post/Hazeltine Associates

(Proposal for a two-unit subdivision to include the following: demolish two detached single-car garages, a 383 square foot, one-bedroom cottage, an attached 102 square foot service porch, and two detached storage sheds. Structurally upgrade an existing three-bedroom, one-story house and foundation and replace windows and roof. Construct a new attached two-story, three-bedroom dwelling unit and two attached two-car garages to create a two-unit condominium. Also proposed is associated new landscaping and paving. Staff Hearing Officer review is required. This is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Residence: Constructed in 1912."*)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer Review. Project was last reviewed on January 16, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:25 p.m.

Present: Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner
Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect
Keith Rivera, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with comments:

1. The project generally meets the Compatibility Criteria Analysis per SBMC 22.22.145(B) and 22.68.045(B).
2. The hedge is supportable at its existing height. A waiver for the removal of the five foot fence requirement is supportable.
3. The applicant is commended for the architectural style and renderings.
4. Pursue street tree co-designation on West Cañón Perdido Street to be the fern pine (*Podocarpus*) and evergreen pear (*Pyrus kawakamii*).

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 1000 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
Application Number: MST2012-00330
Applicant: Public Works - Streets Division
Owner: City of Santa Barbara PW - Streets

(Proposal to install a 200 square foot prefabricated bikestation module in City Parking Lot #3 near the current MTD bus station. This project is being funded by a Measure A grant.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on August 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:45 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner
Tim O'Brien, Architect
Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent
Todd Boulanger, Bikestation
Laura Yáñez, Project Engineer

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission supports the location and the intent of the project.
2. The flat roof continues to be supportable.
3. Remove the window surrounds, but keep the belly band.
4. Simplify the building corner details, particularly at the parapet. It was suggested to make them a square box.
5. Provide traditional hardware and fixtures.
6. Provide for graffiti removal.
7. Provide a landscape plan showing existing and proposed landscaping.
8. There should be a minimal gap where the stucco meets hardscape of 1/8 inch.
9. Match the surrounding sidewalk paving for the ADA curb cut on the 16 W. Carrillo Street side.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Shallanberger/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 634 SANTA BARBARA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-001
Application Number: MST2013-00133
Owner: Shalvera Investments
Architect: Studio R

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building as follows: repaint the building exterior, install new wrought iron rails at the front and rear, remove an entry door at the rear and infill and patch to match existing, stripe the rear stair nosings, and replant existing landscaped areas.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the landscape match the landscape plan that was approved on June 11, 2008.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 901 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-015
Application Number: MST2013-00013
Owner: Philinda Properties/Sierra Management
Applicant: Brent Thompson
Architect: Gilbert García
Business Name: Sublime

(Proposal for the following exterior changes: rebuild an existing 370 square foot deck and replace an entry door to comply with ADA accessibility standards, construct a level landing at the entry, restripe an existing parking space for ADA accessibility, construct a water heater enclosure, and provide a new bicycle parking space. A Public Works variance is requested to encroach into the street setbacks. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Second review. Comments only; a Public Works Variance is requested.)

Continued two weeks.

NEW ITEM**C. 350 CHAPALA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-450-004
Application Number: MST2013-00041
Owner: Gary and Sherry Petersen
Architect: Alexa Schloh

(Proposal to permit as-built improvements including the installation of a 186 square foot trash enclosure and a rolling gate located several feet inside the property line rather than at the approved location at the property line. This work will reduce the number of existing parking spaces by two; 33 parking spaces are currently provided and 17 are required. This will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2012-00840.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 436 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-001
Application Number: MST2013-00151
Owner: Diane Baskin Trust
Applicant: Robert Kaplan

(Proposal to remove four existing security gate doors at auto bays and replace with new roll-up doors. Also proposed is to alter the storefront entrance.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 117 W MASON ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
Application Number: MST2011-00123
Owner: Arthur Toga
Architect: Dawn Sherry
Consultant: Post/Hazeltine Associates

(Proposal for alterations and a 618 square foot, second-story addition and a 30 square foot lower level addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed to the detached 666 square foot garage with an 824 square foot duplex above, nor to the 156 square foot storage/laundry room. No ground disturbance will occur on the site. The ground surface will be covered with a moisture barrier prior to pouring the concrete slab and if it becomes necessary to pour concrete on a level surface, clean fill such as sand will be used to create such a surface. Archeological and Chumash monitoring will be conducted per the Extended Phase 1 report dated 12-1-11. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of approximately 3,409 square feet and is proposed to address violations called out in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00416). This parcel is *identified as a "Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District."*)

(Review After Final of change to approved window on the front elevation.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 800 CALLE PUERTO VALLARTA P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-311-001
Application Number: MST2012-00167
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Parks & Recreation Department
Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Public Works Department

(Proposal for removal of existing light poles and replacement with energy efficient light poles in the Cabrillo ball field as follows: remove four 50-foot tall poles and four 70-foot tall poles and replace them with four 60-foot tall poles and two 70-foot tall poles. Also proposed is 800 linear feet of trenching at a depth of 24 inches for new underground electrical circuits.)

(Review After Final for reconsideration of condition of approval to paint the light poles and fixtures which was changed to Malaga Green.)

Final Approval of Review After Final to not paint the poles.

NEW ITEM**G. 509 STATE ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-009
Application Number: MST2013-00150
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Applicant: Alpha Enterprises
Architect: Michael De Rose

(Proposal for a new awning over the front entry of an existing restaurant.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**H. 902 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
Application Number: MST2012-00149
Owner: Cynthia Howard Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Contractor: Signs By Ken, Inc.

(Proposal for a façade remodel to replace the existing storefront window system, remove the existing eave, fascia, and parapet, and add new copper gutter and downspouts. Parking lot work and a new trash enclosure will be reviewed under separate application MST2012-00217.)

(Review After Final to add 1/4" flat black aluminum panels to all four elevations. Signage will be reviewed under a separate permit.)

Continued two weeks to the Full Board.

NEW ITEM**I. 322 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-028
Application Number: MST2013-00148
Owner: Craddock Living Trust
Applicant: Peter Becker

(Proposal to relocate an existing mature olive tree that is damaging an existing stone perimeter wall at the street. The stone planter wall will be repaired in a like-for-like manner. This is *on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pedotti House."*)

Project Design and Final Approval as noted on the landscape plan.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL (1:15)**J. 1604 OLIVE ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-020
Application Number: MST2011-00226
Owner: Max Drucker
Designer: Adam Cunningham

(This is a *designated Structure of Merit: "Olive House."* Proposal to convert 215 square feet of floor area back to permitted garage space at the rear of an existing single-family residence and convert the detached carport back to a legally permitted two-car garage. Door and window changes are also proposed, as well as the removal of an unpermitted storage shed and lattice partition wall from the carport roof deck. Hardscape installed without a permit will be removed and replaced with grass in accordance with the last-approved site plan. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2011-00233 and zoning information report ZIR2011-00097.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved landscape and hardscape plan.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:09 P.M. ****