



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 10, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 4:45 p.m. and again at 4:58 p.m.
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
 BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE – Present until 5:00 p.m.

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review/Historic Preservation Supervisor – Absent
 BETTIE WEISS, Commission Secretary – Present until 3:20 p.m.
 NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 2:48 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.
Members absent: Shallanberger.
Staff present: Weiss (until 3:20 p.m.), Hernández (until 2:48 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Gene Tyburn, local resident/certified arborist, spoke against the City's restrictions on tree pruning.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 13, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 13, 2013, as presented.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 7/0/1. (Drury abstained. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 27, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 27, 2013, with correction.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe abstained from Items 4 and 5. Shallanberger absent.). Motion carried.

D. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item C, which was also reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Orías/Murray, 8/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item B. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Commissioner Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.

b) The City's semiannual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is in progress with the following schedule as noticed on the City Council Agenda for the meeting of April 9, 2013:

- Resignation Deadline for current members is Wednesday, April 17, 2013.
- Application Deadline for new members is Monday, May 6, at 5:30 p.m.
- Interviews by the City Council will be held on Tuesday, May 21, at approximately 4:00 p.m.; Tuesday, June 4, 2013, at approximately 4:00 p.m.; and Tuesday, June 18, at 6:00 p.m.
- Appointments will be made on Tuesday, June 25, 2013. Please note that resignations must be received by the City Clerk's Office no later than Wednesday, April 17, in order for the position to be included in this recruitment process.

2. Commissioner Sharpe announced that on April 2, 2013, the Santa Barbara Conservancy presented the "John Pitman Award" to local resident and dedicated preservationist Kellam de Forest.

3. Ms. Hernández reported that:

a) At its meeting of April 9, 2013, the City Council designated as City Landmarks the Stark House located at 1709 Overlook Lane and The Veterans Memorial building at 112 W. Cabrillo Blvd.

b) Staff attended the first Ordinance Committee with respect to proposed amendments to the historic resources section of the City's Municipal Code was held on April 9, 2013. Commissioner Murray attended the meeting in support of staff's proposals. The second meeting will be held in the Council Chamber, 735 Anacapa Street, on Tuesday, April 16, 2013, at 12:00 p.m.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 240 W ALAMAR AVE**

E-3/R-3/SD-2 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-283-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00022
 Owner: City Ventures Urban Land LLC
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects, LLP
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.

(Proposal for a new three-story four-unit condominium building totaling 7,925 square feet including the three attached two-car garages. Mission Creek crosses the rear of the property and the building is proposed to encroach into the front setback. Staff Hearing Officer review of a front setback modification and a Tentative Subdivision Map is requested.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Dudek.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the potential to encounter unknown but potentially significant subsurface prehistoric remains is considered very unlikely, project impacts on prehistoric resources are less than significant. However, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources applies to the project and shall be reproduced on the plans prior to final design review approval.

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Eddie Harris, Santa Barbara Urban Creeks Council. Staff pointed out that it does not address cultural resource issues or the accuracy of the report.

Motion: To accept the report with the following recommendation to be forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review: Seriously consider the compatibility of the proposed structure with the surrounding neighborhood.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING**2. CITY'S POTENTIAL HISTORIC STRUCTURES/SITES LIST UPDATE**

(1:50) Staff: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Hold a Public Hearing to consider staff report and recommendations to update Appendices B and C of the *City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites* with proposed additions, deletions and errata to the following:

1. Appendix B, City of Santa Barbara Designated Historic Structures/Sites List (Landmarks and Structures of Merit); and
2. Appendix C, City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures/Sites List.

The structure at 2190 Alston Road (listed under a previous Public Notice as 801 Alston Road) will be considered at a future Historic Landmarks Commission public hearing.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, City Urban Historian

Staff comment: Ms. Hernández explained that, at its meeting on March 13, 2013, the full Commission voted to include the property at 25 E. Mason Street on the City's Potential Historic Structures/Sites List; therefore, no further action is needed for that property. Ms. Hernández stated that the Commission is requested to accept the recommended changes to Appendices B and C of the Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites (MEA) that was last updated in January 2002 for the following reasons: 1) Some properties were approved to be added or deleted from the lists as individual properties by previous actions in 2007 and 2009, but have yet to be updated; 2) The Urban Historian determined removal of structures as required (usually because the structure had been demolished or substantially altered), 3) there have been recent status changes due to designations, 4) parcel or address revisions, and 5) other various errata corrections.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from the 25 Arlington Avenue property owner objecting to its inclusion on the Potentials List; and a letter from Paula Westbury expressing opposition.

Public comment opened at 2:18 p.m.

1. Sue Carter, representing the property owner at 25 Arlington Avenue, spoke against the inclusion of the building on the Potentials List.
2. Bernard Unterman, 14 W. Micheltorena Street property owner, inquired as to the consideration of his home to be added to the Potentials List when homes built in the same period flanking his property are not proposed to be included. He also inquired as to the possibility of the City's financial assistance in the conservation of such buildings.
3. Mary Louise Days, local historian, spoke in support of the inclusion of most buildings proposed to be added to the Potentials List. She also stated that 223 E. De la Guerra Street has already been determined to be significant in a past survey and disagreed that the property located at 227 N. Nopal Street should be removed from the Potentials List.
4. Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke in support of adding the proposed sites to the Potentials List.

Public comment closed at 2:29 p.m.

Commissioner Murray expressed appreciation, in addition to the Staff involved, for Mary Louise Days' assistance in the consideration of properties during recent HLC Designations Subcommittee meetings.

Motion: **The Commission adopts the recommended updates to Appendices B and C of the *Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites (MEA)* as outlined in the Staff Report:**

1. To update the Designated Historic Structures/Sites Lists (Structures of Merit and City Landmarks) (Appendix B) to assure the most current lists are accurate.
2. To exclude the four properties recently recommended ***to be removed** from the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures/Sites List (Appendix C) with the exception of the buildings located at 2525 Santa Barbara Street and 227 N. Nopal Street which shall remain on the list.

3. To add the nineteen properties recently recommended **** to be included** on the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Structures/Sites List (Appendix C) with the exception of 900-1100 Las Positas Road, whose public hearing and noticing are yet to be scheduled, and noting that a motion to add 25 E. Mason Street was already made at a previous hearing.

Action: Murray/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (La Voie abstained on 2132 Mission Ridge Rd. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

*The following (4) properties, as recommended by the HLC Designations Subcommittee, **shall be removed** from the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List:

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	
1	1921 Bath Street	027-162-012	
2	2031 De la Vina Street	025-301-003	
3	1822 De la Vina Street	027-022-023	
4	529 W. Junípero Street	025-090-031	
	227 N. Nopal Street	017-042-017	<i>Building shall remain on the list.</i>
	2525 Santa Barbara Street	025-041-010	<i>Building shall remain on the list.</i>

The following (19) properties, as recommended by the HLC Designations Subcommittee, **shall be included on the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List:

	<u>Site Address</u>	<u>Parcel Number</u>	
	900-1100 Las Positas Rd.....	047-010-016.....	<i>Public Notice and Public Hearing to be scheduled.</i>
1	117 Rametto Road	015-211-025	
2	2127 De La Vina Street.....	025-232-003	
3	117 W Mason Street	033-101-003	
4	931 Las Alturas Road.....	019-141-002	
5	1801 Las Tunas Road.....	019-101-016	
6	14 W Micheltorena Street.....	027-231-013	
7	1235 Veronica Springs Road ...	047-010-039	
8	34 W Victoria Street.....	039-131-016	
9	1555 Alameda Padre Serra	027-151-008	
10	3626 San Remo Drive.....	053-231-011	
11	1130 N Milpas Street (walls) ...	029-201-004	
12	653 Mission Canyon Road.....	023-272-002	
13	2132 Mission Ridge Road.....	019-071-016	
14	223 E De La Guerra Street.....	031-012-027	
15	1295 Coast village Road	009-293-007	
16	125 W Anapamu Street.....	039-222-001	
17	126 E Cañón Perdido Street	031-011-003	
18	25 Arlington Avenue	039-132-011	
19	1914 Santa Barbara Street	025-382-023	
	25 E Mason Street.....	033-082-014.....	<i>Already added by HLC at previous public hearing.</i>

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:40 P.M. TO 2:48 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM**3. URBAN FOREST MANAGEMENT PLAN PROJECT**

(2:35) Staff: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director
(Status report on the development of the Urban Forest Management Plan that will guide efforts to protect and enhance the City's urban forest. The Plan will address long-range objectives, infrastructure constraints, community education and outreach programs, habitat, species diversity and program funding.)

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director

Discussion held.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 35, 36 & 118 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-018, 033-111-013 & 033-081-013
Application Number: MST97-00357
Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
Agent: Ken Marshall
Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Suding Design
Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area and 264 parking spaces.)

(Comments only; this is the second concept review of a revised project associated with a Substantial Conformance Determination request. Project requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-103. Project was last reviewed on January 30, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:21 p.m.

Present: Melissa Cinarli and Mark Shields, Architects, DesignARC
Philip Suding, Landscape Architect, Suding Design
Michael Rosenfeld, Representing Ownership
Allison De Busk, Project Planner

Chair Suding read the State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory disclaimer before stepping down from the review of this item.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

1. Lynette Paul, local resident, spoke in support of the project.
2. Michelle Hunter, former resident, spoke in support of the project.

3. Valerie Banks, local resident, spoke in support of the project.
4. Ingrid Biancone, local resident, spoke in support of the project.
5. Sheila Lodge, Planning Commission Liaison, commented on the Planning Commission's April 4, 2013, meeting comments and the Substantial Conformance Determination of the 2001 and 2010 project approvals.
6. Bonnie Donovan, local resident, commented on applicant meetings with the neighbors and issues related to open space and benches.

Public comment closed at 4:10 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The Commission would like to forward its consensus to the City Administrator that narrowing the State Street width is not supportable.
2. Simplify the arches.
3. Some areas are still too contemporary in both the architecture and site plan.
4. The practicality of identifying the parking structure is of concern.
5. Refine the scale and avoid large buildings that, because of their mass, appear to be parking structures.
6. The details will be of extreme importance. Look to the Biltmore as an example of large buildings whose detailing works towards balancing the landscaping and architecture.
7. The hotel entry should make a statement. Create a visual focal point for visitors to identify that they have reached their destination.
8. Indicate what distinguishes an area as one unit and avoid the grouping of buildings that do not relate to each other.

Action: Winick/Drury, 7/0/0. (Suding stepped down. Shallenberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. **9 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001
 Application Number: MST2013-00024
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court
 Architect: Amy Taylor
 Business Name: Bouchon

(Proposal to remove an existing unpermitted 247 square foot canvas patio cover and construct a 353 net square foot, one-story, 16'-0" tall addition at the front of an approximately 3,550 square foot building. There are four buildings on this site.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 4:46 p.m.

Present: Mitchell Sjerven, Business Owner
 Amy Taylor, Architect

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The design is generally acceptable as presented.
2. Some simplification is desirable, but not required.
3. The proposed wood shutters are inappropriate per El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines, but canvas would be acceptable.
4. The project should be as appealing from the sidewalk as possible, making the outside dining area the character-defining element for the building.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 7/0/1. (Suding abstained on the grounds that he was not present during the applicant presentation. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 700 E ANAPAMU ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-009
 Application Number: MST2013-00126
 Owner: Santa Barbara High School District
 Applicant: Jack Huffard

(Courtesy review of a proposal to restore the decorative terracotta surround at the main entry of the school building. This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara High School Building, ~~Peabody Stadium, Stadium Ticket Booth, Manual Training Building, Gymnasium.~~")

Positive comments given and noting a correction to the landmark description.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 35, 36 & 118 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-018, 033-111-013 & 033-081-013
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Owner: 35 State Street Hotel Partners, LLC
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes construction of 123 hotel rooms, 22,326 square feet of commercial floor area and 264 parking spaces.)

(Review After Final of changes to the specification type of 25 wood benches to be placed on State and Mason Streets.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted as the new design maintains the continuity with State Street benches.

NEW ITEM**C. 2410 STATE ST****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-072-017
Application Number: MST2013-00128
Owner: Lester Knispel
Applicant: LL Engineering Group, Inc.
Contractor: James Dean

(Proposal to replace an existing multi-trunk Melaleuca tree in the front yard of a parcel on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Freeman House." The diameter of the trunks is as follows: two at 12", two at 18", one at 21", and one at 33". The height of the tree is unavailable due to excessive pruning.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on the plan.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 700 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-015
Application Number: MST2012-00230
Owner: Ortega Pacific, LLC
Applicant: Tony Stogsdill, Associate AIA
Business Name: Panera Bread Bakery

(Proposal to restripe an existing parking lot, adding an accessible space and path of travel, and construct a new trash enclosure. This parcel is in the 85% parking zone of benefit.)

(Review After Final of change to outdoor dining floor material.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheet A-2.2. Tile finish to be determined by Commissioner Donald Sharpe in the field.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:08 P.M. ****