



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 13, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present until 3:14 p.m.
- BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor – Present until 2:21 p.m. and 3:00 p.m.
- HEATHER WIDEN, Project Planner – Present 3:00 p.m. to 4:03 p.m.
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 3:10 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (until 3:14 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Drury.

Staff present: Limón (until 2:21 p.m. and at 3:00 p.m.), Widen (3:00 p.m. to 4:03 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:10 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 27, 2013.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 27, 2013, with correction.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/1. (Sharpe abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Items F and G, which were reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Drury would be absent and Commissioner Murray would be stepping down from Items 2, 3, and 4 at 25 E. Mason Street.
- b) The Annual Statement of Economic Interests Form 700 is due from all HLC members on March 26th.
- c) Items 2, 3, and 4 on the agenda at 25 E. Mason Street were agendized under the incorrect Master Application number so the correct project description was emailed to the Commissioners on Monday. Additionally, the project was originally reviewed by the ABR and was granted Project Design Approval. This was an honest mistake because the Historic Structures/Sites Report that would have determined that the project be reviewed by HLC instead of ABR was accepted by the HLC in 2003. After acceptance of that report, no tag was placed on the parcel because the parcel had not been formally added to the City's Potential List by HLC action. Had a project come in a bit sooner after the HSSR was accepted in 2003, Staff would have easily recognized that it would come under HLC purview. So Item 3 on the agenda is a request to place the parcel on the Potential List, and Item 4 will be the first HLC review of the project itself, with no action to be taken on the project and comments only requested. The applicant also brought to Staff's attention that the owner's name on the agenda was the previous owner, so that has been updated.
- d) Commissioner Murray had requested information regarding the re-roofing project at the Covarrubias Adobe at 715 State Street. The HLC Consent Calendar reviewer on May 26, 2010, approved re-roofing and replacement of the plaster finish, the white-wash, gutters and downspouts with new to match existing.

2. Commissioner Orías requested once again that the criteria for stop sign/traffic signal warrants for the City in general be provided. Mr. Limón explained that the request has been made to the Public Works Department and Design Review Staff is awaiting a response.

3. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

- a) The Stark House at 1709 Overlook Lane and the Veterans Memorial at 112 W. Cabrillo Blvd. will be considered for landmark designation at the April 9, 2013, City Council meeting.
- b) Staff will attend the Ordinance Committee on April 9, 2013, to propose revisions to the HLC Ordinance for designation of Historic Districts.

4. Commissioner Shallanberger announced he would be leaving at 3:15 p.m.

5. Commissioner Murray announced she would like to make sure that the change of use at the Covarrubias Adobe will not require ADA upgrades.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Murray reported on the Survey Subcommittee meeting that was held in the morning. She announced there will be two community meetings to inform the public regarding the creation of Historic Districts. They will be held on Thursday, May 9 and Saturday, May 11, 2013, with locations and times to be determined.

PUBLIC HEARING

1. **800 ALVARADO PLACE (FORMERLY 1900 LASUEN)**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council that El Encanto Hotel Site, located at 800 Alvarado Place, be designated a City Historic District.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian
Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

Trevor Martison, local resident, commented on concerns raised prior to the final approval of the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke in favor of the designation and inquired as to whether Charles Frederick Eaton was actually a landscape architect.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2013-04 and forward the Historic District designation request of the El Encanto Hotel site located at 800 Alvarado Place (formerly 1900 Lasuen Road) to City Council for consideration.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. **25 E MASON ST**

OC/HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-012

Application Number: MST2012-00058 (agendized as MST2012-00088 in error)

Owner: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP

Architect: AB Design Studios

(Conversion of existing 12,705 square foot of light industrial or storage use on second floor and conversion of 10,541 square feet of light industrial or storage use to office use on third floor.)

(Review of Addendum letter to previously prepared Historic Structure Report prepared by Alex Cole.)

Actual time: 2:08 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that the project meets State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA.

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the Letter Addendum with the request that the report be amended to state that the antenna towers, added to the elevator tower in the year 2001, are non-historical and non-contributing to the historic structure.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

3. 25 E MASON ST

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-012

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Request by Staff to add the building at 25 E. Mason Street to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Resources List.)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To add the building located at 25 E. Mason Street to the City of Santa Barbara Potential Historic Resources List.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained because he did not read the original 2003 HSSR. Murray stepped down. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**4. 25 E MASON ST**

OC/HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-082-012

Application Number: MST2012-00058 (agendized as MST2012-00088 in error)

Owner: East Mason Santa Barbara, LLC ~~Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP~~

Architect: AB Design Studios

~~(Conversion of existing 12,705 square foot of light industrial or storage use on second floor and conversion of 10,541 square feet of light industrial or storage use to office use on third floor.~~ Proposal for alterations to the existing 46,785 square foot, three story commercial building located on two separate parcels totaling 26,136 square feet in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. Alterations include a new 7,250 square foot raised platform roof deck, a new enclosed roof access stairway, replacement of an existing freight elevator with two new elevators, 6,200 square feet new roof landscape planters, and a total of 300 square feet of rooftop areas for a new photovoltaic solar panel system. Project also includes new windows and doors on the first floor, new windows on all elevations of the second and third floors, an alteration to the existing roof stairway enclosure to meet ADA requirements, and new windows and doors in each stairway enclosure. Parking includes 21 on-site parking spaces and 12 off-site parking spaces. No new additional floor area is proposed.)

(Exterior alterations previously approved by the Architectural Board of Review by mistake under MST2012-00058. Project should be added to the City's Potential Historic Resources List.)

Actual time: 2:21 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:37 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the former Bekins Building is a highly visible feature in Santa Barbara and commended the applicant for the adaptive reuse of the building. He expressed concern with the visual impact of the proposed roof deck.

Public comment closed at 2:39 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The conceptual massing is acceptable.
2. The adaptive reuse of this building and its conversion is supportable.
3. A roof garden could be an asset for the building.
4. The proposed roof garden could have its own set of concerns and needs to be studied. A view study was suggested to determine what it may look like from the Riviera.
5. Option A on the south elevation is the preferred fenestration.
6. The proposed windows should match the existing (i.e., steel with awning/hopper type windows).
7. Study the mechanical equipment early on in the process along with the ducting for the mechanical equipment.
8. Try to avoid the urban heat island effect from the roof; for example, minimizing dark roof material.
9. Study placing more tree canopy at the parking lot and proposing vines on the existing wrought iron fence.
10. The building should remain simple.
11. Minimize the structures on the roof.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. (Murray stepped down. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:10 P.M. TO 3:15 P.M. ****

TRAINING AND DISCUSSION ITEM

5. DESIGN REVIEW MEETING EFFICIENCIES

(3:00) Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor
(Training on improving Design Review meeting efficiencies and discussion regarding Commission comments/motions.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor
Heather Widen, Project Planner

Training and discussion held with the following comments/suggestions made:

Meeting Efficiencies:

1. In the case of larger projects, a staff report would be helpful, and possibly an applicant report providing context and background. Staff should point out what part or phase of the project the Commission is actually reviewing, particularly when projects have been prolonged for many years.
2. In addition to verbally explaining their response to Commission comments, applicants could be required to submit it in writing as part of a summary.
3. When requested by the Commission, a recess could be taken to allow review of the plans without distractions, especially on larger projects.
4. Applicants could be required to provide a PDF version of the plans upon submittal of an application for Commissioners to have the option of viewing the plans from the City's FTP Folder (File Transfer Protocol) accessible over the Internet prior to each meeting.
5. An additional set of full sized plans would be helpful since the Commission has more members than the other design review boards.
6. It would help the Chair if Staff could highlight the most recent comments and motion printed in the "Case Summary" which is read out loud prior to the applicants' presentations.
7. Items will not be agendaized beyond 5:30 p.m. to avoid taking a dinner break.

Comments/Motions Worksheet:

8. Direction to the applicant should be included in the comments within the motion. If a request is being made to staff, a separate area below the project's motion can state so.
9. A vote against a motion does not need to be explained; a vote abstaining should be. In case of an appeal, a Commissioner voting against a project should be prepared to present his/her case before the City Council.
10. Staff could briefly alert the Commission of pertinent guidelines before the applicant presentation.

Responding to Public Comments:

11. The Chair should direct Staff to respond.
12. Staff will only respond to written questions/inquiries if the Commission gives direction to do so, since they are actually directed to the HLC, not Staff.

Staff Respond to Commission Requests:

13. Staff will make every effort to follow-up, but reminders may be needed.

Commissioners Drury and Shalanberger absent.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 128 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2003-00243
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval is requested to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications are requested to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

(Review After Final of changes to add a wood trellis over the trash enclosure, relocate site walls at the Santa Barbara Street entry, and add an outdoor dining area. This change was granted a Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-07.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 410 W SOLA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-051-010
Application Number: MST2013-00037
Owner: Veronica Gray
Applicant: REC Solar

(Proposal to install a 3.43 kw photovoltaic roof-mounted solar energy system. A total of 14 solar panels are proposed.)

(Second Concept Review. Final approval is requested.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 26 CHAPALA ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-001
Application Number: MST2010-00176
Owner: Dario Pini
Architect: Bryan Murphy

(The 10,000 square foot project site is currently developed with a 5,602 square foot, 11-unit apartment/hotel complex. The proposed project involves exterior alterations including the replacement of all existing windows, extending an existing second-floor balcony corridor and adding a 36" porch wall, a facade remodel, relocation of an as-built trash enclosure, and a revised landscape plan including the replacement of two existing 12 foot tall palm trees with canopy trees. The discretionary applications required for this project are zoning modifications to allow alterations within the required 10 foot front setback on Mason Street and a reduction of the required outdoor living space. No additional square footage is proposed. The parcel is non-conforming with 11 existing parking spaces to remain, but the parking lot will be repaved with permeable pavers and reconfigured to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act. This application addresses violations called out in ENF2010-00250.)

(Review After Final of changes to update the floor plan to match the approved elevation at the column bases, revise windows at units 9 & 10, revise roofing details.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 2311 CHAPALA ST****E-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-113-012
Application Number: MST2013-00098
Owner: Standford Glasgow
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a 60 square foot second-story addition on rear, new second-story windows on rear, a new roof cover over an existing second-story deck on rear, and an interior remodel to an existing 1,700 square foot single family residence with a attached 400 square foot carport. The proposed total of 2,160 square feet is 79% of the maximum floor to lot area ratio.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 101 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-071-013
Application Number: MST2011-00204
Owner: Dehlsen Associates, LLC
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(This project involves two separate parcels at 101 E. Victoria Street and 109 E. Victoria Street. Proposal for alterations at an existing two-story commercial building including a new two-story entry, door and window replacement, partial new roof, new gutters and downspouts, renovation of exterior grilles, new planter areas, new trash enclosure, and modification of one existing parking space to make it van-accessible. (The trash enclosure and modified parking space are on the 109 E. Victoria Street parcel.) The proposal also includes the removal of 50 square feet of floor area, a 42-inch high perimeter wall around the parking lot, four new rooftop HVAC units, and a 30-panel rooftop photovoltaic system which will not be visible from the street.)

Public comment: Rob Chyla and Rolf Kowal

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 800 ALVARADO PLACE (FORMERLY 1900 LASUEN RD)****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Gensler
Architect: Henry Lenny
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in Cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath Cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Review After Final revision to landscape plan to replace eucalyptus trees with different tree species that were unsafe and previously removed and proposed minor plant changes.)

Public comment: Kellam de Forest

Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. At least one of the two proposed trees shall be a vertical skyline tree, have close to the equivalent replacement value of biomass as the eucalyptus trees that were removed, and be a 24-inch box. The other tree can be a jacaranda.
2. In the southern planting areas, the taller shrubs shall be located in the gaps of the existing material. The intent is to not raise the skirt of the existing material more than is absolutely necessary.

CONTINUED ITEM**G. 15 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-005

Application Number: MST2013-00075

Owner: 15 W Carrillo Street, LLC

Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to remove an existing 56 foot tall, 24" diameter eucalyptus tree and low shrubs and construct a new 21'-11" linear foot trash enclosure at the rear of an existing office building. This is a designated Structure of Merit: "office Building.")

Project Design and Final Approval of floor plan Option 1, Option 2, or Option C, which preserve the existing eucalyptus tree. The Commissioner reviewing this Consent Calendar item does not approve the removal of the eucalyptus tree.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:22 P.M. ****