



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, February 27, 2013**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- BARRY WINICK – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW  
**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO – Present at 2:00 p.m.  
**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 1:47 p.m. and again at 2:24 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

---

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

#### **CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

#### **ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger, Suding, and Winick.  
Members absent: Sharpe.  
Staff present: Limón, Hernández (until 1:47 p.m. and again at 2:24 p.m.) and Feliciano.

#### **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:  
  
None.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 13, 2013.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 13, 2013, with correction.**

Action: Boucher/Drury, 7/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie; with the exception of Item G, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.**

Action: Orías/Drury, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a) Item 3 at 9 W. Victoria St. was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.
- b) Chair Suding would be leaving the meeting by 3:45 p.m., and Commissioner Sharpe would be absent.
- c) City Urban Forest Superintendent Tim Downey has been working with Ann Marx of City Fire and Patrick Gladden of Southern California Edison to come up with a plan for pruning some mature Eucalyptus trees along Alvarado Place that were determined to be a fire hazard. Mr. Downey has come up with an acceptable pruning plan for the trees, taking into account the sensitivity and aesthetics of the site.
- d) The El Encanto Hotel representatives have been requested to propose either a replacement of or mitigation measures for the Eucalyptus trees that were removed for emergency purposes at the beginning of this year.

2. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements:

- a) The HLC hearing to consider recommending to City Council that the El Encanto Hotel Site be designated as a Historic District will take place on March 13.
- b) The Survey Subcommittee held a meeting on February 6 and will have a follow-up meeting on March 13 at 11:00 a.m. in the Community Development Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room.

3. Chair Suding announced that an efficiency discussion meeting will be planned in the near future. He also reminded the Commissioners that the City Clerk's office has requested that the Statement of Economic Interests disclosures (Form 700) be completed by March 26.

4. Commissioner Shallenberger requested a future discussion on an applicant's reference to funding for a project, which is outside the Commission's scope, and the effect on the decision-making process.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****1. CITY BOARD AND COMMISSION MEMBER CODE OF CONDUCT**

(1:45) Staff: Steve Wiley, City Attorney; and Paul Casey, Community Development Director  
 (Discussion on conflict of interest and a revised code of conduct as recommended by the City Attorney that was incorporated into the *Guidelines for the City of Santa Barbara Advisory Groups* and adopted by the City Council on February 12, 2013.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Steve Wiley, City Attorney  
 Paul Casey, Community Development Director

When an HLC Commission member will be presenting a project, the Chair will read a pre-written statement after the agenda item is called and before the applicant presentation begins. A State Political Reform Act Sole Proprietor Advisory is now part of all design review agendas.

**Discussion held.**

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:22 P.M. TO 2:27 P.M. \*\***

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT****2. 1676 FRANCESCHI RD**

A-1 Zone

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-102-004  
 Application Number: MST2012-00493  
 Owner: B & B SB Trust  
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to demolish an existing 5,124 square foot single-family residence and construct a new 6,496 square foot three-story single-family residence located on a 2-acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes an attached 750 square foot three-car garage, two-uncovered parking spaces, a 200 square foot detached accessory building, new site walls and gates, new site landscaping, and a new pool. A total of 351 cubic yards of site grading is proposed, including 201 cubic yards of grading within the proposed building footprint and 150 cubic yards of grading elsewhere on site. The project is 113% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) and includes a 50% reduction of basement level square footage.)

**(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post Hazeltine Associates. The report determined the house is not eligible for listing as a significant historic resource at the City, State, or National level.)**

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Historical Consultants  
Kirk Gradin, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to the structure's architect and site's landscape architect.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report with the following revision and recommendations:**

1. Coordinate the project description so that it is consistent throughout the document.
2. The Commission recommends to subsequent review bodies that the applicant incorporate a substantial portion of the Oswald "Ozzie" Da Ros stonework into the plan.
3. The applicant is encouraged to retain significant and large plant materials in their current locations to the extent possible; and to incorporate other existing plant material into the landscape design of the site, perhaps relocation to more favorable locations as necessary for plant viability.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe absent.)

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

#### **3. 9 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001  
Application Number: MST2013-00024  
Owner: 1221 Victoria Ct  
Architect: Thomas McMahan, AIA  
Business Name: Bouchon

(Proposal to remove an existing unpermitted 400 square foot patio cover and construct a 400 square foot addition with new copper entry fascia. Also proposed are new heaters and lighting.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)****REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2007-00140  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
 Architects: Gensler and Henry Lenny  
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in Cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath Cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

**(Review After Final of proposal to remove two existing brick columns at the driveway exit on Alvarado Place.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****B. 715 SANTA BARBARA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-007  
 Application Number: MST2010-00150  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Historical Society  
 Applicant: Frank Schipper Construction

(These two buildings are City Landmarks: "Historic Adobe (1825) and Covarrubias Adobe (1830)." Proposal to remove the existing plaster finish and apply new lime plaster coat and whitewash. Also proposed is to remove the existing clay tile roofing, apply new underlayment, and reinstall the original clay tiles. Existing copper gutters and downspouts will be replaced in kind, like-for-like in material and configuration.)

**(Review After Final to change approved paint color.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****C. 416 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-023  
Application Number: MST2013-00061  
Owner: Hughes Land Holding  
Agent: Sherry & Associates  
Business Name: Killer Shrimp

(Proposal for dining furniture to be placed in the existing front and rear patios, built-in booth seating in the rear patio, restriping the parking lot, and a new trash enclosure at the northeast corner of the parcel.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**FINAL REVIEW****D. 1117 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030  
Application Number: MST2012-00256  
Owner: 1129 State Street  
Applicant: Richard Six

(Proposal to demolish the existing façade and construction of a new façade on the State Street elevation including a 231 square foot addition and exterior alterations to include a new roof, window, wood corbels, plaster moldings and wrought iron work to an existing commercial building.)

**(Final Approval of architectural details is requested.)**

**Final Approval of details as noted on Sheet A3.0.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****E. 128 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004  
Application Number: MST2003-00243  
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.  
Agent: Suzanne Elledge  
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval is requested to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications are requested to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

**(Review After Final of changes to add a wood trellis over the trash enclosure, relocate site walls at the Santa Barbara Street entry, and add an outdoor dining area. This change was granted a Planning Commission Substantial Conformance Determination and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-07.)**

**Continued two weeks with comments.**

**NEW ITEM**

**F. 1624 GARDEN ST**

**R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-201-015  
Application Number: MST2013-00073  
Owner: 1624 Garden Street, LLC

(Proposal to relocate 11 eleven electrical meters from within 11 dwelling units to a single location at the southwest corner of the parcel. This multi-family dwelling motor court is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "La Cumbre Vista Court.")

**Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions:**

1. The meter structure shall begin at the southernmost wall of Unit 2 adjacent to the walkway and continue behind that unit with sufficient area behind to maintain the existing hedge;
2. The supporting structure shall be designed in a manner appropriate to the existing architecture, a fence/trellis grid structure, painted dark green, is suggested; and
3. Revised plan shall be submitted at the Planning and Zoning Counter to the attention of Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor Jaime Limón.

**NEW ITEM**

**G. 15 W CARRILLO ST**

**C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-005  
Application Number: MST2013-00075  
Owner: 15 W Carrillo Street, LLC  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to remove an existing 56 foot tall, 24" diameter eucalyptus tree and low shrubs and construct a new 21'-11" linear foot trash enclosure at the rear of an existing office building. This is a designated Structure of Merit: "office Building.")

**Continued two weeks with comments:**

1. Restudy alternate locations or reconfigure the trash area to allow the tree to be retained.
2. If applicant cannot preserve the tree with an reconfigured trash area design, propose an alternate replacement tree with similar body mass.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:50 P.M. \*\***